

\*\*\*\*\***APPROVED MINUTES**\*\*\*\*\*

Alexandria Board of Architectural Review  
Old & Historic Alexandria District

**Wednesday, March 17, 2010**

7:30pm, City Council Chambers, City Hall  
301 King Street, Alexandria, Virginia 22314

Members Present: Tom Hulfish, Chairman  
Oscar Fitzgerald  
Arthur Keleher  
Wayne Neale  
John von Senden  
Peter Smeallie  
James Spencer

Staff Present: Planning & Zoning  
Meredith Kizer, Historic Preservation Planner  
Al Cox, FAIA, Historic Preservation Manager

The meeting was called to order at 7:35 p.m. by Chairman Hulfish.

1. Consideration of the minutes of the public hearing of March 3, 2010.

**BOARD ACTION: Approved as submitted, 7-0.**

On a motion by Mr. Fitzgerald, seconded by Mr. Spencer, the Board voted to approve the minutes, as submitted, with a vote of 7-0.

**DISCUSSION ITEMS**

**2. CASE BAR2009-0176 & 0150**

Request for approval of demolition & alterations at **620 & 605 Jefferson Street, 724A & 724B S St. Asaph Street, 800A, 800B, 800C, & 800D S Washington Street**, zoned RCX Residential Commercial Mixed Use.

**APPLICANT:** Scott Management Inc.

**BOARD ACTION:** **Approved as submitted, 4-3. Mr. von Senden, Spencer, Fitzgerald and Hulfish were in support. Mr. Neale, Keleher and Smeallie were opposed.**

**SPEAKERS**

Harald Mangold, President of Scott Management, presented for the owner. He explained that their present heating system was an aging boiler in the basement and that they either needed to replace 100% of the window units with heat pumps or they would need to retain the boiler and add even more window units to provide cooling to all of the bedrooms.

Poul Hertel, representing himself, said the issue of what is “historic” warrants further discussion on Washington Street. He supports no thru-wall units on Washington St. and staff recommendation for the remainder.

John Hynan, representing the HAF, opposed all thru-wall hints because of the Parkway frontage and said these were historic buildings in a historic district and that the loss of this amount of historic fabric was unacceptable.

### **BOARD DISCUSSION**

Mr. von Senden confirmed with the applicant that the drawings were slightly inaccurate and that the thru-wall units would not cut through the window sills, as shown.

Mr. Fitzgerald agreed with the staff analysis that these were architecturally plain background buildings and not within the period of significance of the Old and Historic Alexandria District. He believed thru-wall units would be substantially more attractive than window units and that split HVAC systems would require the loss of interior fabric and open space on the ground.

Mr. Smeallie pointed out that the survey research demonstrated that the BAR did not approve most of the previous thru-wall units on the surrounding complexes but that City Council had done this appeal. He opposed thru-wall units anywhere on the buildings.

Mr. Keleher felt strongly that thru-wall units should not be seen from the parkway but agreed that the window units were much uglier than what was proposed.

Mr. Spencer agreed that window units were less attractive than thru-wall units and leaned toward approval for uniformity.

Mr. Neale agreed with the applicant that replacing only half of the window units did not eliminate the boiler and was not practical. However, he felt that thru-wall units were no different than visible rooftop HVAC condensers. He believed that the wall louvers were unattractive and diminished the streetscape and was, therefore, opposed.

On a motion by Mr. Fitzgerald and seconded by Mr. Spencer, the application was approved as submitted by roll call vote, 4-3.

### **REASON**

The Board generally believed that the proposed thru-wall heat pumps would be more attractive than the existing window units and that the precedent for approval of thru-wall units on the 20<sup>th</sup> century garden apartments on the Parkway had already been established, as demonstrated by Staff’s research and a brief survey of the surrounding buildings.

### **3. CASE BAR2010-0015**

Request for approval of demolition at **217 N Columbus St**, zoned RM Residential.

**APPLICANT:** Andrew H. Macdonald

**BOARD ACTION:** **Approved, as amended, by unanimous roll call vote, 7-0.**

### **SPEAKERS**

Andrew Macdonald, owner, presented. He represented that he will demolish the garage by hand and reuse the framing material where possible.

John Hynan, representing the HAF, supports the application based on Staff's analysis and quoted from the report: "While Staff normally supports the retention of Alexandria's vernacular accessory buildings, in this case, what remains is not of unusual or uncommon design and its preservation would not preserve historic interest in the City."

#### **BOARD DISCUSSION**

On a motion by Mr. von Senden and seconded by Mr. Spencer, the application was approved as amended by unanimous roll call vote, 7-0.

#### **REASON**

The Board generally agreed with the analysis in the staff report.

#### **4. CASE BAR2010-0025**

Request for approval of demolition at **1126 & 1128 Prince St**, zoned RM Residential.

**APPLICANT:** Sean & Helen Vermillion

**BOARD ACTION:** **Approved, as amended, by unanimous roll call vote, 7-0.**

#### **SPEAKERS**

Steve Kulinski, architect, presented for the owner. He said that a two story townhouse will replace the existing units and that this would be presented to the Board next month.

Jeannine Mantz, 1124 Prince St., was concerned with current foot traffic in the alley and on the street and the safety hazard of an open site. She asked that the site be fenced and secure. She asked that there be no work performed on the weekend and that they clean up their dirt. Staff responded that the standard conditions for demolition were governed by Code Administration at the time of permit.

John Hynan, representing the HAF, complemented the staff report and supported the application as submitted.

#### **BOARD DISCUSSION**

On a motion by Mr. Fitzgerald, seconded by Mr. Smeallie, the application was approved as amended by unanimous roll call vote.

#### **REASON**

The Board generally agreed with the analysis in the staff report.

#### **5. CASE BAR2010-0026**

Request for approval of demolition at **214 S Henry St**, zoned CL Commercial.

**APPLICANT:** Edmund Miller

**BOARD ACTION:** **Approved as submitted, by unanimous roll call vote, 7-0.**

#### **SPEAKERS**

Mr. Miller, owner, presents the application. He said they would replace the wall with a wood fence to match the existing fence in the remainder of the yard.

**BOARD DISCUSSION**

On a motion by Mr. and seconded by Mr., the application was approved as submitted, 7-0.

**REASON**

The Board generally agreed with the analysis in the staff report.

**END DISCUSSION ITEMS**

**DEFERRED ITEMS:**

**6. CASE BAR2010-0035**

Request for approval of alterations at **217 N Columbus St**, zoned RM Residential.

**APPLICANT:** Andrew H. Macdonald

**BOARD ACTION:** **The Board noted the deferral.**

Deferred pending submission of additional materials.

**OTHER BUSINESS**

1. The roofing appeal of 211 N. Patrick St., heard by City Council on March 13, 2010, was remanded to the Board for consideration of synthetic slate shingles and will be docketed for April 7, 2010.
2. Staff will bring a draft policy to the Board at the next meeting to clarify that landscape materials do not limit visibility from a public street, way, or place for the purposes of BAR review.

**ADMINISTRATIVE APPROVALS**

The following items have been administratively approved by BAR Staff since the last Board meeting:

**CASE BAR2010-0036**

Request for approval of signage at **632 N Washington St**, zoned OC Commercial.

**APPLICANT:** Bella West

**CASE BAR2010-0037**

Request for approval of signage at **1511 King St**, zoned KR King Street Retail.

**APPLICANT:** Suann Song

**CASE BAR2010-0038**

Request for approval of signage at **128 N Pitt St**, zoned CD Commercial.

**APPLICANT:** Helen Olivia

**CASE BAR2010-0039**

Request for approval of cornice alterations at **311 S Columbus St**, zoned RM Residential.  
**APPLICANT:** Melinda Thomson

**CASE BAR2010-0040**

Request for approval of new gas lantern at **325 S Lee St**, zoned RM Residential.  
**APPLICANT:** Mitchell Bober

**CASE BAR2010-0041**

Request for approval of replacement siding on rear and south elevations at **310 N Payne St**, zoned RB Residential.  
**APPLICANT:** Christina Stephens

**CASE BAR2010-0043**

Request for approval of a replacement fence at **825 N Washington St**, zoned CD-X Commercial.  
**APPLICANT:** M. Catherine Puskar

**7. ADJOURNMENT**

The Chairman adjourned the meeting at approximately 8:40 pm.

Minutes submitted by,

Al Cox, FAIA, Historic Preservation Manager  
Boards of Architectural Review