

*****DRAFT MINUTES*****

Alexandria Board of Architectural Review
Old & Historic Alexandria District

Wednesday, November 2, 2011
7:30pm, City Council Chambers, City Hall
301 King Street, Alexandria, Virginia 22314

Members Present: Tom Hulfish, Chairman
Chip Carlin
Oscar Fitzgerald
John von Senden
Arthur Keleher
Wayne Neale
Peter Smeallie

Staff Present: Planning & Zoning
Courtney Lankford, Historic Preservation Planner
Al Cox, FAIA, Historic Preservation Manager

The meeting was called to order at 7:32 p.m. by Chairman Hulfish.

I. MINUTES

Consideration of the [minutes](#) of the public hearing of October 5, 2011.

BOARD ACTION: Approved, as submitted, 7-0.

On a motion by Mr. Fitzgerald, seconded by Mr. Keleher, the minutes were approved, as submitted, 7-0.

II. CONSENT CALENDAR

Items on the Consent Calendar are those where the applicant has agreed to all conditions of approval shown in the staff reports. Without objection, the staff recommendation for these cases will be approved as a group by unanimous consent of the Board at the beginning of the meeting. When announced by the Chairman, any member of the Board or of the public may ask that one of these cases be removed for full discussion.

1. [CASE BAR2011-0287](#)

Request for stoop repair at **510 Prince St**, zoned RM Residential

APPLICANT: James & Alexandra Hartz

BOARD ACTION: Approved, as amended, on the Consent Calendar, 7-0.

CONDITION OF APPROVAL:

1. That the step repair retains the existing footprint.

On a motion by Mr. von Senden, seconded by Mr. Smeallie, the Consent Calendar, consisting of case BAR2011-0287 was approved, 7-0.

III. DISCUSSION ITEMS

2. [CASE BAR2011-0272](#)

Request for window replacement at **800 S Saint Asaph St**, zoned RC Residential
APPLICANT: Saint Asaph Square Condominiums Unit Owners Association by Patrick M. Mazzei

BOARD ACTION: **Approved, as amended, 6-0-1.**

CONDITION OF APPROVAL:

1. That the applicant will install only the Anderson Fibrex casement and double hung windows in accordance with Alexandria's Window Performance Specifications;
2. That the applicant use full frame replacement windows rather than insert or pocket replacements;
3. That the applicant submit full specifications for each of the two window types prior to BAR Staff sign-off of any individual unit;
4. That the condominium owners submit an application and fee for administrative approval and receive approval from the Condominium Association and BAR Staff prior to installation at individual condo units or of each construction phase.
5. That only full screens be used, when needed.

SPEAKERS

Mr. Mazzei, authorized agent, spoke in support of the application.

Mr. Tom Godbout, the rep for Anderson windows, showed a window sample and spoke on behalf on the proposed Anderson Fibrex window.

Mr. Tony Head, the rep for Long windows, showed a window sample and spoke on behalf on the proposed Long Vinyl window.

Ms. Debbie Bowan, resident at 800 S Saint Asaph, spoke in support of the application.

BOARD DISCUSSION

Mr. Neale stated that he thought only one window type should be approved in order to achieve a consistent façade on the building. He stated that he supported the Anderson Fibrex window since it was made partially of wood and because he felt it would last longer than the Long vinyl window. Mr. Neale thought the Anderson window was more appropriate for the historic district as a whole.

Mr. Keleher stated that he prefer only one window be approved and that he supported the Anderson Fibrex window.

Mr. Smeallie stated that the uniform fenestration of the building necessitated one type of window. He stated that he supported the Anderson Fibrex window due to its aesthetics.

Mr. von Senden stated that hollow vinyl windows do not comply with the Boards adopted *Window Policy* and that he was concerned with the longevity of the vinyl windows and the precedent approval of these windows could set in other parts of the district. Based on his concern for a consistent look on the building, Mr. von Senden made a motion for the Staff recommendation, with the condition that only full screens be used, when needed.

Mr. Carlin seconded the motion, but then Mr. Fitzgerald opened public comment in order for Mr. Ralph Rosenbaum, Vice President of Saint Asaph Condominium, to speak in support of the application and the applicants request for the approval of both window types. Mr. Fitzgerald responded that the Board did not like to approve vinyl and that was part of the reason behind the Board's support of the Anderson Fibrex window.

Mr. Carlin stated that vinyl windows are not a preferred material in the historic district and that he felt approval of only one window type would achieve a more cohesive appearance. He stated that the more traditional look of the Anderson Fibrex window was a good fit for the simple, monolithic building.

Mr. Fitzgerald restated the motion and the second, which was then approved, as amended, 6-0-1 with Chairman Hulfish abstaining.

REASON

The Board was not comfortable approving the Long vinyl window as the *Window Policy* specifically states that vinyl windows "are not considered appropriate or compatible." The Board felt that the Anderson Fibrex window was a much more appropriate material and look for the condominium and the historic district. The Board also felt that only one window type should be approved in order to provide a cohesive look on the building.

3. CASE BAR2011-0288

Request for demolition/encapsulation at **807 Oronoco St**, zoned RB Residential

APPLICANT: Joseph & Ann Shumard

BOARD ACTION: **Approved, as amended, 6-1.**

This item was combined with item #4 for discussion purposes.

CONDITION OF APPROVAL:

1. That the applicant work with Staff to determine if historic wood siding exists and can be salvaged and if replacement siding is necessary, in whole or in part, that it be historically appropriate wood siding.
2. That any replacement windows be in conformance with the Alexandria Replacement Window Performance Specifications.
3. The statements in archaeology conditions below shall appear in the General Notes of all site plans and on all site plan sheets that involve demolition or ground disturbance (including Basement/Foundation Plans, Demolition, Erosion and Sediment Control,

Grading, Landscaping, Utilities, and Sheeting and Shoring) so that on-site contractors are aware of the requirements:

- a. The applicant/developer shall call Alexandria Archaeology immediately (703-838-4399) if any buried structural remains (wall foundations, wells, privies, cisterns, etc.) or concentrations of artifacts are discovered during development. Work must cease in the area of the discovery until a City archaeologist comes to the site and records the finds.
- b. The applicant/developer shall not allow any metal detection to be conducted on the property, unless authorized by Alexandria Archaeology.

4. CASE BAR2011-0289

Request for alterations at **807 Oronoco St**, zoned RB Residential

APPLICANT: Joseph & Ann Shumard

BOARD ACTION: **Approved, as amended, 6-1.**

CONDITION OF APPROVAL:

1. That the applicant work with Staff to determine if historic wood siding exists and can be salvaged and if replacement siding is necessary, in whole or in part, that it be historically appropriate wood siding.
2. That any replacement windows be in conformance with the Alexandria Replacement Window Performance Specifications.
3. The statements in archaeology conditions below shall appear in the General Notes of all site plans and on all site plan sheets that involve demolition or ground disturbance (including Basement/Foundation Plans, Demolition, Erosion and Sediment Control, Grading, Landscaping, Utilities, and Sheeting and Shoring) so that on-site contractors are aware of the requirements:
 - a. The applicant/developer shall call Alexandria Archaeology immediately (703-838-4399) if any buried structural remains (wall foundations, wells, privies, cisterns, etc.) or concentrations of artifacts are discovered during development. Work must cease in the area of the discovery until a City archaeologist comes to the site and records the finds.
 - b. The applicant/developer shall not allow any metal detection to be conducted on the property, unless authorized by Alexandria Archaeology.

SPEAKERS

Mr. Shumard, applicant, spoke in support of the application and the Staff recommendation.

BOARD DISCUSSION

Mr. Fitzgerald inquired as to how the property came to such disrepair. Mr. Shumard stated that the property was actually in worse shape when he and his wife purchased it in 2000 and that they have worked to try and repair and maintain it since then. He stated that they plan to build a rear addition in the future. Mr. Shumard also answered questions in regards to the reconfiguration of

the rear first floor window to a rear first floor door and the future addition.

Mr. von Senden moved the Staff recommendation, which was seconded by Mr. Neale and approved, by a roll call vote, 6-1 (with Mr. Fitzgerald voting in opposition).

REASON

While the Board was disappointed to see the rear of the building in such bad condition, they generally felt that the proposed demolition and alterations were acceptable given the simple architectural character of the rear ell and the minimal amount of historic materials remaining.

IV. DEFERRED

5. CASE BAR2011-0260

Request for awnings with signage at **610 Madison St**, zoned CDX Commercial.
APPLICANT: Kamizaki LLC by Robert Blumel & Justin Yoon
Deferred pending resolution of outstanding issues.

V. WITHDRAWN

6. CASE BAR2011-0271

Request for fence enclosure for trash area at **1206 S Washington St**, zoned RC Residential
APPLICANT: Virginia Department of Transportation by Grady Management
Withdrawn by applicant prior to hearing.

VI. OTHER BUSINESS

- Status of sign enforcement within historic district

VII. ADJOURNMENT

Chairman Hulfish adjourned the meeting at approximately 8:15pm.

VIII. ADMINISTRATIVE APPROVALS

The following items are shown for information only. Based on the Board's adopted policies, these have been approved by Staff since the previous Board meeting.

CASE BAR2011-0298

Request for tuckpointing at **510 Prince St**, zoned RM Residential.
APPLICANT: Alex & James Hartz

CASE BAR2011-0299

Request for window replacement at **821 S Columbus St**, zoned RM Residential.
APPLICANT: Thomas Dougherty

CASE BAR2011-0300

Request for window replacement at **727 S Alfred St**, zoned RM Residential.
APPLICANT: Robert & Martine Irmer

CASE BAR2011-0307

Request for roof & gutter replacement at **1315 Duke St**, zoned CO Commercial.
APPLICANT: Northern Virginia Urban League

CASE BAR2011-0308

Request for window replacement at **827 S Fairfax St**, zoned RM Residential.
APPLICANT: Linda Mierke

CASE BAR2011-0309

Request for window replacement at **509 S Saint Asaph St**, zoned RM Residential.
APPLICANT: John & Marjorie Lewis

CASE BAR2011-0310

Request for storm door at **318 Franklin St**, zoned RM Residential.
APPLICANT: Gary & Linda Pinkham

CASE BAR2011-0312

Request for window replacement at **323 N Royal St**, zoned RM Residential.
APPLICANT: Charles Porter

CASE BAR2011-0313

Request for window replacement at **717 S Royal St**, zoned RM Residential.
APPLICANT: Stephen Gallagher

CASE BAR2011-0314

Request for exterior lighting at **320 S Fairfax St**, zoned RM Residential.
APPLICANT: Sam & Ashley Chamberlain

Minutes submitted by,

Al Cox, FAIA, Historic Preservation Manager
Boards of Architectural Review