

*****DRAFT MINUTES*****

Alexandria Board of Architectural Review
Old & Historic Alexandria District

Wednesday, February 15, 2012
7:30pm, City Council Chambers, City Hall
301 King Street, Alexandria, Virginia 22314

Members Present: Tom Hulfish, Chairman
Chip Carlin
Oscar Fitzgerald
Art Keleher
Wayne Neale
Peter Smeallie
John von Senden

Staff Present: Planning & Zoning
Michele Oaks, Historic Preservation Planner
Courtney Lankford, Historic Preservation Planner

The meeting was called to order at 7:39 p.m. by Chairman Hulfish.

I. MINUTES

1. Consideration of the minutes of the public hearing of February 1, 2012.
BOARD ACTION: Approved, as submitted, 7-0.

On a motion by Mr. Smeallie, seconded by Dr. Fitzgerald, the minutes were approved, as submitted, 7-0.

II. DISCUSSION ITEMS

1. **CASE BAR2012-0015**
Request for signage at **277 S Washington St**, zoned CD Commercial
APPLICANT: Society Fair by Paul Beckmann, AIA
BOARD ACTION: Approved, as submitted, 6-1.

SPEAKERS

Meshelle Beckmann, applicant, spoke on behalf of the application. She noted that she did not support the staff recommendation and requested that the Board consider allowing the use of all four of the window decals. She explained that the use of only two window decals in the four windows on the storefront would be an inconsistent and unbalanced sign program.

BOARD DISCUSSION

The Chairman opened the Board discussion expressing that he supported the use of the decals on all four windows.

Mr. Smeallie concurred with the Chairman's finding.

Dr. Fitzgerald noted that the window decals might not be as visible as illustrated in the photo mock-up, however supported the staff recommendation.

Mr. von Senden expressed that he would not object to four window decals, yet noted he had concern about the general design.

Mr. Carlin identified that the building was designed as a monolithic, atrium building and found that the canopy, signage and banner helped to create a sense of excitement on the façade and therefore supported the application as submitted.

Mr. Keleher noted that he had recently patronized the establishment and found that during his recent visit one of the entrances in question was locked. The applicant responded they were waiting for the sign program to be approved before opening all of the doors to the business.

Mr Neale noted his support for all four window decals and made a motion to approve the application, as submitted.

Mr. Smeallie seconded the motion. The motion passed 6-1. Mr. Fitzgerald voted in opposition to the motion.

REASON

The Board found that the proposed signage was compatible with the existing building and the character of the George Washington Memorial Parkway.

2. CASE BAR2012-0016

Request for demolition/encapsulation at **211 Gibbon St**, zoned RM Residential

APPLICANT: Alabama Ave. LC by Stephen Kulinski, AIA

BOARD ACTION: **Deferred for restudy, 6-1.**

This item was combined with Item #3 for discussion purposes.

3. CASE BAR2012-0017

Request for addition/alterations at **211 Gibbon St**, zoned RM Residential

APPLICANT: Alabama Ave. LC by Stephen Kulinski, AIA

BOARD ACTION: **Deferred for restudy, 6-1.**

SPEAKERS

Stephen Kulinski, architect, spoke on behalf of the application. Mr. Kulinski summarized the application and noted that the applicant has agreed to the staff recommended conditions.

John Hynan, representing the Historic Alexandria Foundation, favored the portions of the application which rehabilitated and salvaged the historic fabric of the building. He noted that the Foundation did not believe that there was a strong enough delineation between the historic house and the addition.

Ellen Holland, owner at 215 Gibbon Street, expressed her concern with the size of the addition as she felt it would overwhelm her front entry. She requested that the two-story porch be reduced to a one-story porch and that the side yard setback be increased. She also suggested that a high hedge-row could be planted between the properties to buffer the new addition. Ms. Holland concluded by stating concern for her existing trees and the potential impacts the construction would have on their health.

Mark Spartan, owner at 209 Gibbon Street, expressed support for the relocation of the front door. He questioned the exterior siding which would adjoin his property at the rear. Mr. Kulinski confirmed that the siding would be 5" reveal, HardiePlank fiber cement siding. Mr. Spartan concluded with supporting the proposed water drainage plan.

BOARD DISCUSSION

Mr. Neale began the discussion by stating that the addition was well designed and felt that the mass was not overwhelming. He noted that it was well removed from the street. He supported the selection of materials, but questioned the need for the retention of the fireplace and relocation of the front door.

Mr. Keleher would like to see the addition reduced in size but supported the staff recommendation to retain the chimney.

Mr. Smeallie supported the design, however he was concerned about the impact of the addition on the neighbor. He encouraged the architect to restudy and provide additional room at the neighbor's front entrance.

Dr. Fitzgerald favored the design as submitted. He supported the staff recommendation to retain the chimney and commended the applicant's proposal to restore the original house.

Mr. von Senden supported staff recommendations and felt that the proposal would be consistent with the rhythm of the streetscape.

Mr. Carlin expressed concern with the massing and favored reducing the two-story porch to a one-story porch.

Mr. von Senden made a motion to approve the Staff recommendation. Mr. Fitzgerald seconded the motion. Mr. Smeallie offered a friendly amendment requesting that the Board defer the motion and that the applicant work to alter their design of the two-story porch to a one-story porch. Mr. Carlin also offered a friendly amendment adding that the architect should have the opportunity to change the design with aesthetics not necessarily volumetric changes. The Board motion for restudy was 6-1.

REASON

The Board felt that the proposed two-story addition should be reduced in scale to a one-story porch to offset the impact of the new addition on the adjacent neighbor.

III. OTHER BUSINESS

None

IV. ADMINISTRATIVE APPROVALS

The following items are shown for information only. Based on the Board's adopted policies, these have been approved by Staff since the previous Board meeting.

CASE BAR2012-0024

Request for roof replacement at **1100 W Abingdon Dr**, zoned RM Residential
APPLICANT: James Miller

CASE BAR2012-0025

Request for window replacement at **928 St Asaph St**, zoned RM Residential
APPLICANT: Lauren Kramer

CASE BAR2012-0027

Request for siding replacement at **413 S Fairfax St**, zoned RM Residential
APPLICANT: David Arnaudo

CASE BAR2012-0028

Request for roof replacement at **118 Gibbon St**, zoned RM Residential
APPLICANT: James & Marilyn Kott

V. ADJOURNMENT

Chairman Hulfish adjourned the meeting at approximately 8:38pm.

Minutes submitted by,

Michele Oaks, Historic Preservation Planner
Boards of Architectural Review