

*****DRAFT MINUTES*****

Alexandria Board of Architectural Review
Old & Historic Alexandria District

Wednesday, July 11, 2012

7:30pm, City Council Chambers, City Hall
301 King Street, Alexandria, Virginia 22314

Members Present: Tom Hulfish, Chairman
Oscar Fitzgerald, Vice Chairman
Peter Smeallie
Wayne Neale
John von Senden
Art Keleher
Chip Carlin

Staff Present: Planning & Zoning
Al Cox, FAIA, Historic Preservation Manager
Michele Oaks, Historic Preservation Planner

The meeting was called to order at 7:32 p.m. by Chairman Hulfish.

I. MINUTES

Consideration of the [minutes](#) of the public hearing of June 20, 2012.

BOARD ACTION: Approved as submitted, 7-0.

On a motion by Mr. von Senden, seconded by Dr. Fitzgerald, the minutes were approved, as submitted, 7-0.

II. CONSENT ITEMS

Items on the Consent Calendar are those where the applicant has agreed to all conditions of approval shown in the staff reports. Without objection, the staff recommendation for these cases will be approved as a group by unanimous consent of the Board at the beginning of the meeting. When announced by the Chairman, any member of the Board or of the public may ask that one of these cases be removed for full discussion.

1. **CASE BAR2012-0117**

Request for alterations at **630, 632, & 634 S Fairfax St and 213 Franklin St**, zoned RM Residential and CL Commercial Low

APPLICANT: Mr. & Mrs. Paul Stevens by Eleanor F. Krause, AIA

BOARD ACTION: Approved as submitted, 7-0.

III. DISCUSSION ITEMS

2. CASE BAR2012-0198

Request for signage & alterations at **277 S Washington St**, zoned CD Commercial Downtown

APPLICANT: EagleBank by Jeffery Stoiber

BOARD ACTION: **Deferred for restudy, 7-0.**

SPEAKERS

Jeffery Stoiber, AIA, spoke in support of the application and outlined the scope of the project.

BOARD DISCUSSION

Dr. Fitzgerald expressed concern about the location of the ATM on Washington Street. He suggested that the ATM would be more appropriate if it was located on the Duke Street elevation.

Mr. Smeallie stated that he agreed with the comments made by the National Park Service regarding the location of the ATM and the use of halo-lit signage on the Parkway.

Mr. von Senden shared other Board members concerns with the proposed location of the ATM. He suggested that a design solution could be developed for the Duke Street elevation which incorporated lighting and a brick walkway.

Mr. Keleher had questions regarding the ATM's backplate material and agreed with the staff recommendation to utilize a matte finish.

Mr. Neale also shared the other Board members concerns about the proposed location of the ATM. He stated that he has previously worked on this building and has found the corner office space was not a prime location for an office due to traffic noise and direct sunlight and, therefore, the ATM relocation to this area would not be removing a prime office for the bank.

On a motion by Mr. Carlin, seconded by Mr. Smeallie, the Board voted to defer the application for further study. Mr. Carlin recommended that the architect look at installing canopies on the windows similar to what was previously approved by the BAR on Society Fair, relocate the ATM to the Duke Street elevation or within a vestibule on Washington Street, add additional lighting for security at the ATM and eliminate the halo lighting on the signage. The motion passed, 7-0.

REASON

The Board was concerned about the ATM and sign lighting and their potential adverse impacts on Washington Street.

3. CASE BAR2012-0204

Request for signage at **825 N Washington St**, zoned CDX Commercial Downtown

APPLICANT: PNC Financial Services by M. Catharine Puskar

BOARD ACTION: Approved as amended, 5-2.

CONDITON OF APPROVAL: That the sign be mounted on the building utilizing the existing mortar joints.

SPEAKERS

Elizabeth McKeeby, agent for the applicant spoke in support of the application and outlined the scope of the project.

BOARD DISCUSSION

Mr. Smeallie noted that he recalled when this project had originally been heard by the Board and the concerns previously expressed that four signs were too much for a building on Washington Street. He concurred with the National Park Service’s assessment that the proposed sign was a billboard and noted that the Board has attempted to minimize signage on Washington Street.

Dr. Fitzgerald stated that he agreed with Mr. Smeallie’s comments and noted his opposition to a sign on the south gable of the building.

Mr. von Senden did not have any opposition to relocation of the sign to the south gable and made a motion to approve the application, submitted. The motion was seconded by Mr. Keleher and passed, 5-2, with Dr. Fitzgerald and Mr. Smeallie in opposition.

REASON

The Board generally found that relocation of the sign from the front elevation to the south gable end would not negatively impact Washington Street.

4. **CASE BAR2012-0196**

Request to partially demolish & capsulate at **312 Queen St**, zoned RM Residential

APPLICANT: Miguel & Patricia Estrada by Robert Bentley Adams, AIA

BOARD ACTION: Approved as submitted, by roll call vote, 7-0.

The Board combined this case with item #5 for discussion purposes.

5. **CASE BAR2012-0197**

Request for an addition & alterations at **312 Queen St**, zoned RM Residential

APPLICANT: Miguel & Patricia Estrada by Robert Bentley Adams, AIA

BOARD ACTION: Approved as submitted, by roll call vote, 7-0.

SPEAKERS

Bud Adams, AIA, representing the applicant, spoke in support of the application and responded to questions.

BOARD DISCUSSION

Mr. Smeallie requested a clarification of the staff report, noting that the location of the windows to be installed will be on the building’s east elevation, instead of the south elevation as identified in the report. The architect responded that the windows will be installed on the east elevation.

Without further Board discussion, on a motion by Dr. Fitzgerald, seconded by Mr. Carlin, the Board voted to approve the application as submitted 7-0, with a roll call vote.

REASON

The Board found the proposed demolition, alterations and addition to the rear elevation of the building appropriate and felt that it would not have a negative impact on this historic character of the building nor diminish its historic integrity.

6. **CASE BAR2012-0199**

Request for alterations at **917 S Saint Asaph St**, zoned RM Residential

APPLICANT: Sarah Bobbin by Golden Touch, Inc.

BOARD ACTION: **Approved, as amended, 7-0.**

CONDITION OF APPROVAL: That the proposed fence between the sunrooms may be increased to 8' in height from grade.

SPEAKERS

Sarah Bobbin, applicant, requested that the Board consider the use of an 8' high fence or at least an 8' high fence between the sunrooms on the adjoining properties for privacy and provided photos of the existing conditions.

BOARD DISCUSSION

The Board felt that the applicant made a compelling argument for an 8' tall fence between the existing sunrooms but agreed that it should curve or step down to 7' in height immediately beyond the sunroom, so that it aligns with the existing fence in the rear.

On a motion by Mr. Keleher, seconded by Mr. Carlin, the Board voted to approve the application with the modification to allow for an 8' fence between the sunroom, 7-0.

REASON

The Board found that a new wood fence 7' in height, with an 8' section between the sunrooms, to be appropriate and compatible at this location in the historic district.

7. **CASE BAR2012-0202**

Request to partially demolish & capsulate at **204 S Saint Asaph St**, zoned RM Residential

APPLICANT: Kaj D. & Laura F. Vetter by Stephanie R. Dimond, Dimond Adams Design Architecture

BOARD ACTION: **Approved as submitted, by roll call vote, 7-0.**

The Board combined this case with item #8 for discussion purposes.

8. **CASE BAR2012-0203**

Request for an addition & alterations at **204 S Saint Asaph St**, zoned RM Residential

APPLICANT: Kaj D. & Laura F. Vetter by Stephanie R. Dimond, Dimond Adams
Design Architecture

BOARD ACTION: **Approved as submitted, by roll call vote, 7-0.**

SPEAKERS

Stephanie Dimond, representing the applicant, spoke in support of the application and responded to questions.

BOARD DISCUSSION

The Board commended the design of the addition.

On a motion by Mr. von Senden, seconded by Mr. Neale, the Board voted to approve the application as submitted, 7-0, with a roll call vote.

REASON

The Board found the proposed demolition, addition and alterations to be appropriate for the building.

IV. OTHER BUSINESS

1. 220 S Union, Board responded to Bert Ely, Friends of Alexandria Waterfront's request
 - Mr. Ely requested that Board defer their consideration of the hotel at their July 25, 2012 hearing as the proposal is not in align with the City regulations and zoning.
 - The Board noted the request but unanimously responded that they believed it appropriate that they have an opportunity to review and comment on applications prior to those cases being reviewed by the Planning Commission and City Council.

V. DEFERRED CASES

CASE BAR2012-0205

Request for alterations at **119 N Washington St**, zoned CD Commercial Downtown

APPLICANT: Jemal's First Federal LLC by Kathleen O'Hearn

Deferred prior to hearing at the applicant's request

VI. WITHDRAWN CASES

CASE BAR2012-0200

Request to partially demolish & capsulate at **723 S Lee St**, zoned RM Residential

APPLICANT: Arthur Fox by Stephen Kulinski
Withdrawn by applicant

CASE BAR2012-0201

Request for an addition & alterations at **723 S Lee St**, zoned RM Residential

APPLICANT: Arthur Fox by Stephen Kulinski
Withdrawn by applicant

VII. ADMINISTRATIVE APPROVALS

The following items are shown for information only. Based on the Board's adopted policies, these have been approved by Staff since the previous Board meeting.

CASE BAR2012-0206

Request for vent installation at **139 S Fairfax St**, zoned RM Residential

APPLICANT: Robert Adams

CASE BAR2012-0211

Request for window replacement at **806 Duke St**, zoned RM Residential

APPLICANT: Nicolas Dufour

CASE BAR2012-0213

Request for siding replacement at **409 N Saint Asaph St**, zoned RM Residential

APPLICANT: Rochelle Gray

CASE BAR2012-0214

Request for siding replacement at **404 Gibbon St**, zoned RM Residential

APPLICANT: Sarah Mankowski

CASE BAR2012-0215

Request for fence replacement at **203 S Payne St**, zoned RM Residential

APPLICANT: Margaret Tennant

CASE BAR2012-0216

Request for fence replacement at **205 S Payne St**, zoned RM Residential

APPLICANT: Michael & Alison Santore

CASE BAR2012-0217

Request for fence installation at **207 S Payne St**, zoned RM Residential

APPLICANT: Edward Meyers

CASE BAR2012-0218

Request for fence replacement at **1300 Prince St**, zoned RM Residential

APPLICANT: W.M. Turner

CASE BAR2012-0219

Request fence replacement at **1304 Prince St**, zoned RM Residential

APPLICANT: Chantal Dussuel & Janice Hughes

CASE BAR2012-0220

Request for fence replacement at **1306 Prince St**, zoned RM Residential

APPLICANT: Dolores Viehman

CASE BAR2012-0221

Request for signage at **101 King St**, zoned KR King Street Retail

APPLICANT: The Luck Know by Andrea Ploutis

CASE BAR2012-0222

Request for storm door at **422 Gibbon St**, zoned RM Residential

APPLICANT: Nancy Ramsey

CASE BAR2012-0223

Request for masonry repairs at **117 N Fairfax St**, zoned CD Commercial

APPLICANT: Burke & Herbert Bank & Trust Co.

CASE BAR2012-0224

Request for signage at **1117 King St**, zoned KR King Street Retail

APPLICANT: Red Barn Mercantile by Amy Rutherford

CASE BAR2012-0225

Request for light fixture replacement at **717 Queen St**, zoned RC Residential

APPLICANT: City of Alexandria by Curtis Clemons, Rush Electrical

CASE BAR2012-0226

Request for antenna replacement at **110 S Union St**, zoned CD Commercial

APPLICANT: T-Mobile

CASE BAR2012-0227

Request for decal at **101 N Alfred St**, zoned KR King Street Retail

APPLICANT: Pure Prana, LLC

CASE BAR2012-0234

Request for shed at **612 S Lee St**, zoned RM Residential

APPLICANT: Sarah Lipsan

CASE BAR2012-0235

Request for window replacement at **201 N Washington St**, zoned OCM (50) Office Commercial Medium

APPLICANT: Glenda Dacosta

CASE BAR2012-0236

Request for railing replacement at **1714 Carpenter Rd**, zoned CDD #10 Coordinated Development District #10

APPLICANT: Kim Choate

CASE BAR2012-0237

Request for signage at **1429 Duke St**, zoned CD Commercial

APPLICANT: Jeffrey Peterson, Minuteman Press of Alexandria

CASE BAR2012-0238

Request for signage at **117 S Columbus St**, zoned CD Commercial

APPLICANT: Elinor Coleman

CASE BAR2012-0239

Request for fence replacement at **915 S Saint Asaph St**, zoned RM Residential

APPLICANT: Kenneth & Shelly Miller

CASE BAR2012-0240

Request for shutter installation at **412 Pitt Mews**, zoned RM Residential

APPLICANT: Paulina Orlikowski

VII. ADJOURNMENT

Chairman Hulfish adjourned the meeting at approximately 8:37pm.

Minutes submitted by,

Michele Oaks, Historic Preservation Planner
Boards of Architectural Review

