Docket Item #19
SPECIAL USE PERMIT #2006-0038

Planning Commission Meeting
June 6, 2006

ISSUE: Consideration of a request for a special use permit for a parking reduction.

APPLICANT: St. Paul's Episcopal Church
by Duncan Blair, attorney

LOCATION: 228 South Pitt Street

ZONE: RM/Residential

PLANNING COMMISSION ACTION, JUNE 6, 2006: On a motion by Mr. Jennings, seconded by Ms. Fossum, the Planning Commission voted to recommend approval of the request, subject to compliance with all applicable codes, ordinances and staff recommendations and to amend condition #2 and to delete conditions #3 and #4. The motion carried on a vote of 5-0-1. Mr. Dunn was absent, and Mr. Leibach abstained.

Reason: The Planning Commission agreed with the staff analysis, but deleted conditions requiring that the church maintain off-site parking arrangements.

Speakers:

Duncan Blair, attorney, spoke in support of the application, and requested that conditions requiring an off-site parking arrangement be removed.

Tatyana Schriempf, neighbor, had no objections to the proposal, but had concerns about potential noise from mechanical equipment.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: Staff recommends approval subject to compliance with all applicable codes and ordinances and the recommended permit conditions found in Section III of this report.
I. DISCUSSION

REQUEST
The applicant, St Paul’s Episcopal Church, requests special use permit approval for a parking reduction.

SITE DESCRIPTION
The subject property is one lot of record with 200 feet of frontage on South Pitt Street, 110 feet of frontage on Duke Street, and a total lot area of just over a half acre. The site is occupied by St. Paul’s Episcopal Church and accessory buildings.

The surrounding area is occupied by residential uses.

BACKGROUND
St. Paul’s Church was founded in 1809. The church building at 228 South Pitt Street was constructed in 1817-1818. Wilmer Hall was constructed at the corner of South Pitt and Duke Streets in 1955. Damascus House, located at 413 Duke Street, a two story brick building with a third story in the mansard, attained its present appearance around 1905.

On February 10, 1955, the Board of Architectural Review approved the design for Wilmer Hall, the new educational building, as well as the design for the arcade and courtyard between Wilmer Hall and the sanctuary and renovations to Norton Hall. A number of other relatively minor projects including signs, fencing and handicapped accessibility have been approved by the Board for St. Paul’s over the years.

On September 14, 1955, Special Use Permit #210 was approved by City Council for a day and Sunday school at St. Paul’s Church. On March 28, 1968, Special Use Permit #731 was approved by City Council for operation of a private school for up to 36 students on the third floor of St. Paul’s Parish House. Off-street parking was not required since the property was located in the Central Business District.
PROPOSAL
St. Paul's Church is in the process of undertaking a substantial alteration of their buildings at 228 South Pitt Street and 413 Duke Street, known respectively as Wilmer Hall and Damascus House. These are the first major renovations of these buildings in more than 50 years. The buildings will be completely rehabilitated with all new major systems, including electrical, plumbing and HVAC and will also include renovated classrooms, office and meeting spaces, and improved ADA accessibility to all church buildings. The project also includes minor renovations to the Church Sanctuary and Norton Parish Hall, however, there is no increase in capacity of either the Sanctuary or classroom space.

Because of the “significant alterations” mentioned above, the church is subject to off-street parking requirements. The applicant is requesting a Special Use Permit to allow these improvements without providing off-street parking.

As a separate matter, the applicant is requesting approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alterations at Wilmer Hall, the education building located to the south of St. Paul’s Episcopal Church sanctuary on Pitt Street and for an elevator and stair tower addition between Wilmer Hall and Damascus House, a former residence now used for church meeting space and located at 413 Duke Street. The work is part of a major renovation of those two facilities intended to improve functionality and provide handicapped accessibility.

The applicant has submitted plans for the above referenced building alterations to the Old and Historic Alexandria District Board of Architectural Review (BAR). A hearing on the alterations was held on May 17, 2006 at which time the applicant agreed to defer the request and revise their plans in response to comments received from staff and the BAR. The Planning Department has received revised drawings for the alterations and they now address the concerns of staff, neighbors and the BAR. A hearing on the revised plans is scheduled for June 7, 2006.

The proposed alterations, as revised, are as follows:

**Wilmer Hall** - A new entrance will be created on the south side of the building facing Duke Street. The existing window and arched entrance vestibule will be replaced with a new, larger accessible entrance. The new entranceway will be trimmed with a wood surround and entablature. It will be accessed by both a handicapped ramp and a set of stairs. The ramp will extend along the south wall of the building, approaching the entranceway from the west. It will be approximately 18′ long, 4′ wide and will have a 1/12 slope. The steps will share the landing with the handicap ramp and will approach the landing from the east. The ramps and steps will be of limestone. A grey painted metal railing will extend along the ramp across the landing and down the stairs. the railing will have an Episcopal shield motif at the landing. The applicant is requesting approval of an encroachment for the ramp and landing (see Encroachment #2006-0001).
Duke Street Elevation, Original Proposal
proposed alterations included new bay window and new large institutional entry

Duke Street Elevation, Revised Proposal
bay window eliminated and entry revised in response to staff/community concerns
A new doorway will be inserted in the westernmost bay of the south wall facing Duke Street on the first story where there is now a window. The wood paneled door will have wood louvers above.

The existing primary entrance on the west side of the building facing Pitt Street will be retained.

As part of the renovation, a new HVAC system will be installed. A roof top unit, anticipated to be approximately eight foot tall, and duct work will be located on the roof of Wilmer Hall, toward the northeast corner. The equipment will be screened by an nine foot high screen wall. The screen wall will extend around all four sides of the equipment area, with an opening on the north side toward the east end.

Damascus Hall - The existing basement level windows are currently covered with wood panels. Painted metal louvers will be placed in these openings, with decorative metal grills over the louvers.

Proposed Addition - A new three story elevator and stair tower will be constructed in the private alleyway between Wilmer Hall and Damascus House. The 32' long addition will fill the full width of the approximately 7.5' wide alley. It will be set back approximately two feet from the face of Wilmer Hall and slightly more from the face of Damascus House. Only the south facade of the addition, facing Duke Street, will be visible from the public right-of-way. The addition will be clad in dark brick and the mansard like roof will have metal shingles similar to those on Damascus House. The addition will have a wood panel egress door on the first level and a window on the second and third levels.

The Church buildings primarily serve church related uses, such as Sunday services and Bible study, but also provide space for a variety of community related uses. The church holds four services on Sundays between 8 A.M. and 6 P.M. Approximately 500 parishioners altogether attend the four church services on Sundays. The proposed improvements to the church buildings will not increase the capacity of the church. The capacity of the Sanctuary and classroom space will remain the same. The improvements are intended to improve circulation within the church and provide handicap access.

Parking
According to Section 8-200(F)(1)(B) of the Zoning Ordinance, any building that is significantly altered after January 27, 1987 shall comply with the parking requirements of the Ordinance. Significantly altered means:

“the reconstruction, remodeling or rehabilitation of, or other physical changes to, a structure or building, or a portion thereof, over any two-year period, whether or not involving any supporting members of the structure or building and whether altering interior or exterior components of the structure or building, which involves expenditures amounting to 33 1/3 percent or more of the market value of the structure or building, or portion thereof, at the time of the application for an alteration permit.”

6
According to the applicant, the projected cost for the improvements exceeds 33 1/3 of the market value of the buildings comprising the St. Paul’s Church. Based on the code requirements for one space for each five seats in a church sanctuary, a total of 120 parking spaces would be required. The church does not currently provide off-street parking spaces and is therefore requesting a Special Use Permit for a parking reduction of 120 spaces.

The applicant indicates that there are approximately 500 members of St. Paul’s Church who attend services on a regular basis. There are also 12 full and part-time staff persons.

St. Paul’s Church has maintained a voluntary parking program in conjunction with APCOA, Inc. to provide parking in the City owned garage in the Courthouse Building on the 100 block of South Pitt Street. This arrangement has been in place for approximately 15 years. The program is a voucher system which allows St. Paul’s parishioners to present a coupon at the garage for free parking during Sunday Services. APCOA, Inc. redeems the coupons at St. Paul’s for one dollar. In addition, the Church rents six off-street parking spaces from St. Mary’s Church on the lot on the 300 block of South Pitt Street on week days for staff parking.

ZONING/MASTER PLAN DESIGNATION
The subject property is located in the RM zone. Section 3-1102 of the Zoning Ordinance allows a church in the RM zone as a permitted use.

The proposed use is consistent with the Old Town Small Area Plan chapter of the Master Plan which designates the property for institutional use.

II. STAFF ANALYSIS

The church has been an integral part of the Alexandria community since it was built in the early 1800's. It is used for church as well as for community activities.

The proposed improvements will not increase the capacity of the church or classrooms, but will enhance the circulation and handicap access of the church. The proposed addition is for a stairwell and elevator. There is no impact on parking from the proposed improvements.

The church will maintain its parking arrangement with the Courthouse garage to provide Sunday parking to parishioners and will maintain its arrangement to provide staff parking on the lot on the 300 block of South Pitt Street.

Revised plans for the design of the addition and other exterior improvements have been submitted to staff and will be considered by the Old and Historic Alexandria District Board of Architectural Review on June 7, 2006. The plans submitted by the applicant address concerns expressed previously by staff and the BAR. Staff has added a condition requiring that the alterations be in conformance
with the description of work to be performed, as indicated on pages 4 and 5 of this report and the revised drawings made a part of this report and subject to approval by the Old and Historic District Board of Architectural Review.

Staff has no objection to the requested parking reduction under the following conditions:

III. RECOMMENDED CONDITIONS

Staff recommends approval subject to compliance with all applicable codes and ordinances and the following conditions:

1. The special use permit shall be granted to the applicant only or to any corporation in which the applicant has a controlling interest. (P&Z)

2. CONDITION AMENDED BY PLANNING COMMISSION: The applicant shall conduct employee training sessions on an ongoing basis, including as part of any employee orientation, to discuss all SUP provisions and requirements, and on how to prevent underaged sales of alcohol. (P&Z) (PC)

3. CONDITION DELETED BY PLANNING COMMISSION: The applicant shall maintain a parking arrangement with the garage at Courthouse Square by which parking is made available for free to parishioners during Sunday services. (T&ES)

4. CONDITION DELETED BY PLANNING COMMISSION: The applicant shall maintain an arrangement to provide six parking spaces for employees at St. Mary’s Church. (T&ES)

5. The applicant shall post signs inside the building indicating the location of the off-street parking, inform its congregants about other off-site parking alternatives such as Market Square and encourage them to use off-street parking as a church policy through the use of publications and bulletins. (T&ES)

6. The applicant shall encourage its congregants and staff to use mass transit when traveling to and from the church, by posting information regarding DASH and METRO routes, the location where fare passes for transit are sold. (T&ES)

7. The applicant shall monitor and enforce the provision of parking at Courthouse Square and St. Mary’s Church. (T&ES)

8. The applicant shall inform its visitors and congregation of the availability of off-street parking and shall encourage its use. (T&ES)
9. The proposed alterations shall be in conformance with the description of work to be performed, as indicated on pages 4 and 5 of this report and the revised drawings made a part of this report and subject to approval by the Old and Historic District Board of Architectural Review. (P&Z)

10. The Director of Planning and Zoning shall review the special use permit after it has been operational for one year, and shall docket the matter for consideration by the Planning Commission and City Council if (a) there have been documented violations of the permit conditions which were not corrected immediately, constitute repeat violations or which create a direct and immediate adverse zoning impact on the surrounding community; (b) the director has received a request from any person to docket the permit for review as the result of a complaint that rises to the level of a violation of the permit conditions, (c) the director has determined that there are problems with the operation of the use and that new or revised conditions are needed. (P&Z)

**STAFF:**
Eileen Fogarty, Director, Department of Planning and Zoning;
Richard Josephson, Deputy Director

**Staff Note:** In accordance with section 11-506(c) of the zoning ordinance, construction or operation shall be commenced and diligently and substantially pursued within 18 months of the date of granting of a special use permit by City Council or the special use permit shall become void.
IV. CITY DEPARTMENT COMMENTS

Legend:  C - code requirement  R - recommendation  S - suggestion  F - finding

Transportation & Environmental Services:

R-1 The applicant shall maintain a parking arrangement with the garage at Courthouse Square by which parking is made available for free to parishioners during Sunday services.

R-2 The applicant shall maintain an arrangement to provide six parking spaces for employees at St. Mary's Church.

R-3 The applicant shall post signs inside the building indicating the location of the off-street parking, inform its congregants about other off-site parking alternatives such as Market Square and encourage them to use off-street parking as a church policy through the use of publications and bulletins.

R-4 The applicant shall encourage its congregants and staff to use mass transit when traveling to and from the church, by posting information regarding DASH and METRO routes, the location where fare passes for transit are sold.

R-5 The applicant shall monitor and enforce the provision of parking at Courthouse Square and St. Mary's Church.

R-6 The applicant shall inform its visitors and congregation of the availability of off-street parking and shall encourage its use. (T&ES)

F-1 Although available on-street parking in the immediate area is limited, T&ES believes the proposed renovations and improvements will have a negligible impact on existing parking conditions. T&ES has no objections to the request for parking reduction. (T&ES)

Code Enforcement:

F-1 No Comment
Health Department:

F-1 No Comment
APPLICATION for SPECIAL USE PERMIT #2006-0038

PROPERTY LOCATION: St. Paul's Episcopal Church Alexandria, Virginia

TAX MAP REFERENCE: 074.02 05 01 ZONE: RM/Residential Medium

APPLICANT Name: St. Paul's Episcopal Church Alexandria, Virginia
Address: 228 South Pitt Street, Alexandria, Virginia 22314

PROPERTY OWNER Name: The Trustees of St. Paul's Episcopal Church, Alexandria, Virginia
Address: 228 South Pitt Street, Alexandria, Virginia 22314

PROPOSED USE: Special Use Permit to Section 8-100(A)(4) to waive required parking for the existing church use of the property.

THE UNDERSIGNED hereby applies for a Special Use Permit in accordance with the provisions of Article XI, Section 11-500 of the 1992 Zoning Ordinance of the City of Alexandria, Virginia.

THE UNDERSIGNED, having obtained permission from the property owner, hereby grants permission to the City of Alexandria to post placard notice on the property for which this application is requested, pursuant to Article XI, Section 11-301(B) of the 1992 Zoning Ordinance of the City of Alexandria, Virginia.

THE UNDERSIGNED hereby attests that all of the information herein provided and specifically including all surveys, drawings, etc., required to be furnished by the applicant are true, correct and accurate to the best of their knowledge and belief. The applicant is hereby notified that any written materials, drawings or illustrations submitted in support of this application and any specific oral representations made to the Planning Commission or City Council in the course of public hearings on this application will be binding on the applicant unless those materials or representations are clearly stated to be non-binding or illustrative of general plans and intentions, subject to substantial revision, pursuant to Article XI, Section 11-207(A)(10), of the 1992 Zoning Ordinance of the City of Alexandria, Virginia.

Land, Clark, Carroll, Mendelson & Blair, P.C.
Duncan W. Blair, Esquire
Print Name of Applicant or Agent
Signature

524 King Street
Mailing/Street Address

(703) 836-1000 (703) 549-3335
Telephone # Fax #
dblair@landclark.com

Alexandria, Virginia 22314 April 18, 2006
City and State Zip Code Date

DO NOT WRITE BELOW THIS LINE - OFFICE USE ONLY

Application Received: Date & Fee Paid: $________________________

ACTION - PLANNING COMMISSION:

ACTION - CITY COUNCIL:

12
Special Use Permit #2006-0038

All applicants must complete this form. Supplemental forms are required for child care facilities, restaurants, automobile oriented uses and freestanding signs requiring special use permit approval.

1. The applicant is (check one) [X] the Owner [ ] Contract Purchaser

[ ] Lessee or [ ] Other: ______________________ of the subject property.

State the name, address and percent of ownership of any person or entity owning an interest in the applicant, unless the entity is a corporation or partnership in which case identify each owner of more than ten percent.

St. Paul's Episcopal Church Alexandria, Virginia is a parish of the Protestant Episcopal Church in the Diocese of Virginia.

If property owner or applicant is being represented by an authorized agent such as an attorney, realtor, or other person for which there is some form of compensation, does this agent or the business in which the agent is employed have a business license to operate in the City of Alexandria, Virginia?

[X ] Yes. Provide proof of current City business license

[ ] No. The agent shall obtain a business license prior to filing application, if required by the City Code.

2. Submit a floor plan and a plot plan with parking layout of the proposed use. One copy of the plan is required for plans that are 8½" x 14" or smaller. Twenty-four copies are required for larger plans or if the plans cannot be easily reproduced. The planning director may waive requirements for plan submission upon receipt of a written request which adequately justifies a waiver. This requirement does not apply if a Site Plan Package is required.

Not applicable.

NARRATIVE DESCRIPTION

3. The applicant shall describe below the nature of the request in detail so that the Planning Commission and City Council can understand the nature of the operation and the use, including such items as the nature of the activity, the number and type of patrons, the number of employees, the hours, how parking is to be provided for employees and patrons, and whether the use will generate any noise. (Attach additional sheets if necessary)
St. Paul’s Episcopal Church Alexandria, Virginia, a parish of the Protestant Episcopal Church in the Diocese of Virginia (“St. Paul’s”) is in the process of undertaking the substantial alteration as defined in Section 8-200(F)(1)(B) of the Alexandria Zoning Ordinance, 1992, as amended (the “Ordinance”), of two of the church’s buildings, Wilmer Hall located at 228 South Pitt Street and Damascus House located at 413 Duke Street. These are the first major renovations of the buildings in more than fifty years. The buildings will be completely rehabilitated with all new major systems, renovated classroom, office and meeting spaces, and enhanced ADA accessibility to all the church buildings.

The project also includes minor renovations to the Church Sanctuary and Norton Parish Hall. The budget for the project exceeds 33 1/3% of the market value of the four structures forming the curtilage of St. Paul’s. Pursuant to Section 8-200(F)(4) of the Ordinance, St. Paul’s losses its existing grandfathered status with regard to the provision of offstreet parking, and is required, as a result of the renovation, to provide the code required parking. Under the Ordinance, St. Paul’s is required to provide one on-site offstreet parking space with access from an interior court or an alley for each five (5) seats in the church’s sanctuary. Based upon the Ordinance, St. Paul’s is required to provide 120 parking spaces.

St. Paul’s is requesting the parking reduction special use permit because: (i) it is physically impossible to provide the 120 off-site and offstreet parking spaces if the church had additional property on which all or part of the parking could be provided, and (ii) required parking could not be accessed by an interior court or alley as required by the RM zone regulations governing offstreet parking in the Old & Historic Alexandria District.

USE CHARACTERISTICS

4. The proposed special use permit request is for:  (check one)

[ ] a new use requiring a special use permit,

[ ] a development special use permit,

[ ] an expansion or change to an existing use without a special use permit,

[ ] expansion or change to an existing use with a special use permit,

[X] other. Please describe: Parking reduction required by substantial renovation and loss of grandfathered rights.

| ]
5. Please describe the capacity of the proposed use:

A. How many patrons, clients, pupils and other such users do you expect? Specify time period (i.e., day, hour, or shift).

There are approximately 500 members of St. Paul’s who attend services on a regular basis and a full and part-time staff of twelve (12). Attached as Exhibit A are copies of the prior twelve months calendars of activities that occur in St. Paul’s.

B. How many employees, staff and other personnel do you expect? Specify time period (i.e., day, hour, or shift).

No change from current practices and operations.

6. Please describe the proposed hours and days of operation of the proposed use:

Day:

Hours:

See Exhibit A.

7. Please describe any potential noise emanating from the proposed use:

A. Describe the noise levels anticipated from all mechanical equipment and patrons.

No change from current practices and operations.

B. How will the noise from patrons be controlled?

No change from current practices and operations.

8. Describe any potential odors emanating from the proposed use and plans to control them:

No change from current practices and operations.

9. Please provide information regarding trash and litter generated by the use:

A. What type of trash and garbage will be generated by the use?

No change from current practices and operations.
B. How much trash and garbage will be generated by the use?

No change from current practices and operations.

C. How often will trash be collected?

No change from current practices and operations.

D. How will you prevent littering on the property, streets and nearby properties?

No change from current practices and operations.

10. Will any hazardous materials, as defined by the state or federal government, be handled, stored, or generated on the property?

[ ] Yes. [X] No.

If yes, provide the name, monthly quantity, and specific disposal method below:

11. Will any organic compounds, for example paint, ink, lacquer thinner, or cleaning or degreasing solvent, be handled, stored, or generated on the property?

[ ] Yes. [X] No.

If yes, provide the name, monthly quantity, and specific disposal method below:

12. What methods are proposed to ensure the safety of residents, employees and patrons?

No change from current practices and operations.

ALCOHOL SALES

13. Will the proposed use include the sale of beer, wine, or mixed drinks?

[ ] Yes. [X] No.

If yes, describe alcohol sales below, including if the ABC license will include on-premises and/or off-premises sales. Existing uses must describe their existing alcohol sales and/or service and identify any proposed changes in that aspect of the operation.
Special Use Permit #2006-0038

PARKING AND ACCESS REQUIREMENTS

14. Please provide information regarding the availability of off-street parking:

A. How many parking spaces are required for the proposed use pursuant to section 8-200 (A) of the zoning ordinance?

No change from current practices and operations. 120 parking spaces are required by the Ordinance if the Church undertakes the substantial alteration of its building; otherwise, St. Paul’s is grandfathered from providing required parking.

B. How many parking spaces of each type are provided for the proposed use:

-0- Standard spaces
-0- Compact spaces
-0- Handicapped accessible spaces.
-0- Other.

C. Where is required parking located? [ ] on-site [ ] off-site (check one)

NONE.

If the required parking will be located off-site, where will it be located:

Pursuant to Section 8-200 (C) of the Zoning Ordinance, commercial and industrial uses may provide off-site parking within 500 feet of the proposed use, provided that the off-site parking is located on land zoned for commercial or industrial uses. All other uses must provide parking on-site, except that off-street parking may be provided within 300 feet of the use with a special use permit.

D. If a reduction in the required parking is requested, pursuant to section 8-100 (A) (4) or (5) of the zoning ordinance, complete the PARKING REDUCTION SUPPLEMENTAL APPLICATION.
15. Please provide information regarding loading and unloading facilities for the use:

A. How many loading spaces are required for the use, per section 8-200 (B) of the zoning ordinance? **No change from current practices and operations.**

B. How many loading spaces are available for the use?

**No change from current practices and operations.**

C. Where are off-street loading facilities located?

**No change from current practices and operations.**

D. During what hours of the day do you expect loading/unloading operations to occur?

**No change from current practices and operations.**

E. How frequently are loading/unloading operations expected to occur, per day or per week, as appropriate?

**No change from current practices and operations.**

16. Is street access to the subject property adequate or are any street improvements, such as a new turning lane, necessary to minimize impacts on traffic flow?

**SITE CHARACTERISTICS**

17. Will the proposed uses be located in an existing building? 

[X] Yes   [ ] No

Do you propose to construct an addition to the building? 

[X] Yes   [ ] No

How large will the addition be? **787 net** square feet.

18. What will the total area occupied by the proposed use be? **See Exhibit B FAR and Open Space Computation Worksheet.**

\[29548 \text{ sq. ft. (existing)} + 787 \text{ sq. ft. (addition if any)} = 30335 \text{ sq. ft. (total)}\]
19. The proposed use is located in: (check one)

[ ] a stand alone building      [ ] a house located in a residential zone      [ ] a warehouse

[ ] a shopping center. Please provide name of the center: ____________________________

[ ] an office building. Please provide name of the building: ____________________________

[X] other, please describe: Four church buildings forming the St. Paul’s curtilage.
PARKING REDUCTION SUPPLEMENTAL APPLICATION

Supplemental information to be completed by applicants requesting special use permit approval of a reduction in the required parking pursuant to section 8-100(A)(4) or (5).

1. Describe the requested parking reduction. (e.g. number of spaces, stacked parking, size, off-site location)

   St. Paul's is requesting a special use permit to waive the required offstreet parking requirement of one hundred twenty (120) spaces required as a result of a substantial renovation of the church's buildings pursuant to Section 8-200(f) of the Ordinance.

2. Provide a statement of justification for the proposed parking reduction.

   St. Paul's Episcopal Church is a 248 year old downtown urban church with an active and engaged congregation. Its four buildings are the location of worship, education and fellowship for the community. As a downtown urban church, St. Paul's relies upon existing parking facilities as the area around the church has changed over its history and available parking has diminished and increased demand has been generated through the growth of the community. It is unrealistic to assume that any downtown church can meet the church's zoning parking requirements, and to do so creates an unreasonable and unnecessary burden and restriction on St. Paul's and its members.

3. Why is it not feasible to provide the required parking?

   The property is located in the fully developed downtown urban Old Town area of the City where little land, if any, is available for surface parking. As such, it is impossible to provide onstreet parking. Additionally, the property is zoned RM and is located in the Old & Historic District. As such, parking facilities for both required and non-required may only be accessed from an interior court or alley. There is no alley or interior court which provides access to the property. Therefore, as a technical issue, even if there was available land for offstreet parking and even if it were desired to dedicate land for parking, it is technically not permitted under the Ordinance.

4. Will the proposed reduction reduce the number of available parking spaces below the number of existing parking spaces? [ ] Yes. [X] No.

5. If the requested reduction is for more than five parking spaces, the applicant must submit a Parking Management Plan which identifies the location and number of parking spaces both on-site and off-site, the availability of on-street parking, any proposed methods of mitigating negative affects of the parking reduction.

   See Attached.

Supplemental Application

Parking Reduction
6. The applicant must also demonstrate that the reduction in parking will not have a negative impact on the surrounding neighborhood.

The requested parking reduction would not have a negative impact upon the current parking conditions in the neighborhood surrounding St. Paul's. The parking reduction is technical in nature as it effectually recognizes the status quo.

The purpose of the project is to renovate existing buildings and to provide an accessible and comfortable working environment for the church staff and comfortable educational meeting and fellowship space for its members. It is not anticipated that the renovations will be a springboard for new growth and development.
PARKING MANAGEMENT PLAN

St. Paul’s is committed to maintaining its longstanding voluntary parking program with APCOA, Inc., the operation of the City owned garage in the Franklin Backus Courthouse Building on the 100 block of South Pitt Street. The program is a voucher system which allows St. Paul’s parishioners to present a coupon at the garage for free parking during Sunday services. APCOA, Inc. redeems the coupons at St. Paul’s for a dollar. St. Paul’s has paid approximately $3,000.00 for each of the past two years to APCOA for redeemed vouchers.

In addition, the Church rents six (6) spaces from St. Mary’s Church on the surface parking lot on the 300 block of South Pitt Street on week days for staff parking.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type</th>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Num</th>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Memo</th>
<th>Split</th>
<th>Amount</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>FFF · OTHER</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7620 · Sunday Parking</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Check</td>
<td>2/24/2004</td>
<td>33223</td>
<td>APCOA, Inc.</td>
<td>January Services</td>
<td>1041 · Operatin...</td>
<td>230.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Check</td>
<td>6/11/2004</td>
<td>33506</td>
<td>APCOA, Inc.</td>
<td>Feb. Services</td>
<td>1041 · Operatin...</td>
<td>305.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Check</td>
<td>6/11/2004</td>
<td>33506</td>
<td>APCOA, Inc.</td>
<td>March Services</td>
<td>1041 · Operatin...</td>
<td>295.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Check</td>
<td>6/11/2004</td>
<td>33806</td>
<td>APCOA, Inc.</td>
<td>April Services</td>
<td>1041 · Operatin...</td>
<td>335.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Check</td>
<td>6/11/2004</td>
<td>33806</td>
<td>APCOA, Inc.</td>
<td>May Services</td>
<td>1041 · Operatin...</td>
<td>227.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Check</td>
<td>6/26/2004</td>
<td>33551</td>
<td>APCOA, Inc.</td>
<td>June Services</td>
<td>1041 · Operatin...</td>
<td>149.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Check</td>
<td>7/23/2004</td>
<td>33754</td>
<td>APCOA, Inc.</td>
<td>July Services</td>
<td>1041 · Operatin...</td>
<td>136.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Check</td>
<td>9/17/2004</td>
<td>33933</td>
<td>APCOA, Inc.</td>
<td>August Services</td>
<td>1041 · Operatin...</td>
<td>102.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Check</td>
<td>9/24/2004</td>
<td>33990</td>
<td>APCOA, Inc.</td>
<td>Sept. Services</td>
<td>1041 · Operatin...</td>
<td>214.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Check</td>
<td>10/29/2004</td>
<td>34118</td>
<td>APCOA, Inc.</td>
<td>Oct. Services</td>
<td>1041 · Operatin...</td>
<td>348.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>General Journal</td>
<td>12/31/2004</td>
<td>2004</td>
<td>APCOA, Inc.</td>
<td>2004 A/P</td>
<td>6951 · Building</td>
<td>290.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>General Journal</td>
<td>12/31/2004</td>
<td>2004</td>
<td>APCOA, Inc.</td>
<td>2004 A/P</td>
<td>6951 · Building</td>
<td>302.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total 7620 · Sunday Parking</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>2,934.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total FFF · OTHER</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>2,934.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTAL</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>2,934.00</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
St. Paul's Episcopal Church
Standard Parking
January through December 2005

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type</th>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Num</th>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Memo</th>
<th>Split</th>
<th>Amount</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>FFF · OTHER</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7620 · Sunday Parking</td>
<td>1/28/2005</td>
<td>34514</td>
<td>APCOA, Inc.</td>
<td>Nov. Services (adj.)</td>
<td>1041 · Operatin...</td>
<td>290.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Check</td>
<td>1/28/2005</td>
<td>34514</td>
<td>APCOA, Inc.</td>
<td>Dec. Services (adj.)</td>
<td>1041 · Operatin...</td>
<td>302.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Check</td>
<td>2/25/2005</td>
<td>34637</td>
<td>APCOA, Inc.</td>
<td>Jan. Services</td>
<td>1041 · Operatin...</td>
<td>172.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Check</td>
<td>3/29/2005</td>
<td>34777</td>
<td>APCOA, Inc.</td>
<td>Feb. Services</td>
<td>1041 · Operatin...</td>
<td>270.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Check</td>
<td>4/26/2005</td>
<td>34890</td>
<td>APCOA, Inc.</td>
<td>Mar. Services</td>
<td>1041 · Operatin...</td>
<td>362.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Check</td>
<td>5/24/2005</td>
<td>34992</td>
<td>APCOA, Inc.</td>
<td>Apr. Services</td>
<td>1041 · Operatin...</td>
<td>290.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Check</td>
<td>6/28/2005</td>
<td>1095</td>
<td>APCOA, Inc.</td>
<td>May Validations</td>
<td>1056 · Operatin...</td>
<td>200.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Check</td>
<td>7/26/2005</td>
<td>1188</td>
<td>APCOA, Inc.</td>
<td>June Validations</td>
<td>1056 · Operatin...</td>
<td>159.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Check</td>
<td>9/27/2005</td>
<td>1424</td>
<td>APCOA, Inc.</td>
<td>August Validations</td>
<td>1056 · Operatin...</td>
<td>233.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Check</td>
<td>10/28/2005</td>
<td>1545</td>
<td>APCOA, Inc.</td>
<td>September Validations</td>
<td>1056 · Operatin...</td>
<td>143.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Check</td>
<td>11/29/2005</td>
<td>1641</td>
<td>APCOA, Inc.</td>
<td>October Validations</td>
<td>1056 · Operatin...</td>
<td>188.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Check</td>
<td>12/30/2005</td>
<td>1791</td>
<td>APCOA, Inc.</td>
<td>November Validations</td>
<td>1056 · Operatin...</td>
<td>336.00</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Total 7620 · Sunday Parking: 2,945.00

Total FFF · OTHER: 2,945.00

TOTAL: 2,945.00
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type</th>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Num</th>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Memo</th>
<th>Split</th>
<th>Amount</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CCC - PERSONNEL</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6255 - Staff Parking</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Check</td>
<td>1/1/2004</td>
<td>33059</td>
<td>St. Mary's Parking</td>
<td>6 Spaces</td>
<td>1041 - Operati...</td>
<td>300.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Check</td>
<td>2/1/2004</td>
<td>33146</td>
<td>St. Mary's Parking</td>
<td>6 Spaces</td>
<td>1041 - Operati...</td>
<td>300.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Check</td>
<td>3/1/2004</td>
<td>33241</td>
<td>St. Mary's Parking</td>
<td>6 Spaces</td>
<td>1041 - Operati...</td>
<td>300.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Check</td>
<td>4/1/2004</td>
<td>33357</td>
<td>St. Mary's Parking</td>
<td>6 Spaces</td>
<td>1041 - Operati...</td>
<td>300.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Check</td>
<td>5/1/2004</td>
<td>33474</td>
<td>St. Mary's Parking</td>
<td>6 Spaces</td>
<td>1041 - Operati...</td>
<td>300.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Check</td>
<td>6/1/2004</td>
<td>33563</td>
<td>St. Mary's Parking</td>
<td>6 Spaces</td>
<td>1041 - Operati...</td>
<td>300.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Check</td>
<td>7/1/2004</td>
<td>33689</td>
<td>St. Mary's Parking</td>
<td>6 Spaces</td>
<td>1041 - Operati...</td>
<td>300.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Check</td>
<td>8/1/2004</td>
<td>33790</td>
<td>St. Mary's Parking</td>
<td>6 Spaces</td>
<td>1041 - Operati...</td>
<td>300.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Check</td>
<td>9/1/2004</td>
<td>33887</td>
<td>St. Mary's Parking</td>
<td>6 Spaces</td>
<td>1041 - Operati...</td>
<td>300.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Check</td>
<td>10/1/2004</td>
<td>33993</td>
<td>St. Mary's Parking</td>
<td>6 Spaces</td>
<td>1041 - Operati...</td>
<td>300.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Check</td>
<td>10/28/2004</td>
<td>34102</td>
<td>St. Mary's Parking</td>
<td>6 Spaces</td>
<td>1041 - Operati...</td>
<td>300.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Check</td>
<td>11/30/2004</td>
<td>34232</td>
<td>St. Mary's Parking</td>
<td>6 Spaces</td>
<td>1041 - Operati...</td>
<td>300.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>3,600.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total 6255 - Staff Parking</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>3,600.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total CCC - PERSONNEL</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>3,600.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTAL</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>3,600.00</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# St. Paul's Episcopal Church
## St. Mary's Parking
### January through December 2005

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type</th>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Num</th>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Memo</th>
<th>Split</th>
<th>Amount</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CCC · PERSONNEL</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6255 · Staff Parking</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Check</td>
<td>1/4/2005</td>
<td>34396</td>
<td>St. Mary's Parking</td>
<td>6 Spaces @ ...</td>
<td>1041 · Operati...</td>
<td>300.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Check</td>
<td>1/28/2005</td>
<td>34513</td>
<td>St. Mary's Parking</td>
<td>6 Spaces @ ...</td>
<td>1041 · Operati...</td>
<td>300.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Check</td>
<td>2/25/2005</td>
<td>34636</td>
<td>St. Mary's Parking</td>
<td>6 Spaces @ ...</td>
<td>1041 · Operati...</td>
<td>300.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Check</td>
<td>3/25/2005</td>
<td>34756</td>
<td>St. Mary's Parking</td>
<td>6 Spaces @ ...</td>
<td>1041 · Operati...</td>
<td>300.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Check</td>
<td>5/1/2005</td>
<td>34905</td>
<td>St. Mary's Parking</td>
<td>6 Spaces @ ...</td>
<td>1041 · Operati...</td>
<td>300.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Check</td>
<td>5/27/2005</td>
<td>35008</td>
<td>St. Mary's Parking</td>
<td>6 Spaces @ ...</td>
<td>1041 · Operati...</td>
<td>300.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Check</td>
<td>7/1/2005</td>
<td>1085</td>
<td>St. Mary's Parking</td>
<td>6 Spaces @ ...</td>
<td>1056 · Operati...</td>
<td>300.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Check</td>
<td>8/1/2005</td>
<td>1208</td>
<td>St. Mary's Parking</td>
<td>6 Spaces @ ...</td>
<td>1056 · Operati...</td>
<td>300.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Check</td>
<td>9/1/2005</td>
<td>1340</td>
<td>St. Mary's Parking</td>
<td>6 Spaces @ ...</td>
<td>1056 · Operati...</td>
<td>300.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Check</td>
<td>10/1/2005</td>
<td>1426</td>
<td>St. Mary's Parking</td>
<td>6 Spaces @ ...</td>
<td>1056 · Operati...</td>
<td>300.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Check</td>
<td>11/1/2005</td>
<td>1537</td>
<td>St. Mary's Parking</td>
<td>6 Spaces @ ...</td>
<td>1056 · Operati...</td>
<td>300.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Check</td>
<td>12/2/2005</td>
<td>1646</td>
<td>St. Mary's Parking</td>
<td>6 Spaces @ ...</td>
<td>1056 · Operati...</td>
<td>300.00</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Total 6255 · Staff Parking

Total CCC · PERSONNEL

**TOTAL**

<p>| | | | | | | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>3,600.00</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Page 1
City of Alexandria, Virginia

MEMORANDUM

DATE: JUNE 2, 2006

TO: CHAIRMAN AND MEMBERS OF THE PLANNING COMMISSION

FROM: RICH JOSEPHSON, DEPUTY DIRECTOR, DEPARTMENT OF PLANNING AND ZONING

SUBJ: AMENDED CONDITION # 2 FOR ST. PAUL’S CHURCH, SUP 2006-0038

Please note that Condition # 2 in the staff report for the above referenced case should be amended to delete the reference to underage sales of alcohol. The condition should read as follows:

“The applicant shall conduct employee training sessions on an ongoing basis, including as part of any employee orientation, to discuss all SUP provisions and requirements”

Thank you.
APPLICATION for SPECIAL USE PERMIT #

PROPERTY LOCATION: St. Paul's Episcopal Church Alexandria, Virginia

TAX MAP REFERENCE: 074.02 05 01 ZONE: RM/Residential Medium

APPLICANT Name: St. Paul's Episcopal Church Alexandria, Virginia
Address: 228 South Pitt Street, Alexandria, Virginia 22314

PROPERTY OWNER Name: The Trustees of St. Paul's Episcopal Church, Alexandria, Virginia
Address: 228 South Pitt Street, Alexandria, Virginia 22314

PROPOSED USE: Special Use Permit to Section 8-100(A)(4) to waive required parking for the existing church use of the property.

THE UNDERSIGNED hereby applies for a Special Use Permit in accordance with the provisions of Article XI, Section 11-500 of the 1992 Zoning Ordinance of the City of Alexandria, Virginia.

THE UNDERSIGNED, having obtained permission from the property owner, hereby grants permission to the City of Alexandria to post placard notice on the property for which this application is requested, pursuant to Article XI, Section 11-30(b)(B) of the 1992 Zoning Ordinance of the City of Alexandria, Virginia.

THE UNDERSIGNED hereby attests that all of the information herein provided and specifically including all surveys, drawings, etc., required to be furnished by the applicant are true, correct and accurate to the best of their knowledge and belief. The applicant is hereby notified that any written materials, drawings or illustrations submitted in support of this application and any specific oral representations made to the Planning Commission or City Council in the course of public hearings on this application will be binding on the applicant unless those materials or representations are clearly stated to be non-binding or illustrative of general plans and intentions, subject to substantial revision, pursuant to Article XI, Section 11-207(A)(10), of the 1992 Zoning Ordinance of the City of Alexandria, Virginia.

Land, Clark, Carroll, Mendelson & Blair, P.C.
Duncan W. Blair, Esquire
Print Name of Applicant or Agent

524 King Street
Mailing/Street Address

(703) 836-1000
(703) 549-3335
Telephone # Fax #
dblair@landClark.com

Alexandria, Virginia 22314
City and State Zip Code

April 18, 2006
Date

DO NOT WRITE BELOW THIS LINE - OFFICE USE ONLY

Application Received: ______________________ Date & Fee Paid: ______________________ $____________________

ACTION - PLANNING COMMISSION: Recommended Approval as Amended 5-0-1 6/6/06
ACTION - CITY COUNCIL: 6/17/06 - CC approved the PC recommendation 6-0 (see attachment)
bicycle rack in front of the building.

(b) Daisy Birch, 2305 Mount Vernon Avenue, requested that Council remove condition #13 from the SUP, requiring the installation of a bicycle rack in front of the building.

A motion was made by Vice Mayor Pepper to approve the special use permit with the removal of the condition #13 concerning the installation of a bicycle rack. The motion failed for lack of a second.

WHEREUPON, upon motion by Councilman Krupicka, seconded by Councilman Smedberg and carried unanimously, City Council closed the public hearing and approved the Planning Commission recommendation. The voting was as follows:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Krupicka</th>
<th>&quot;aye&quot;</th>
<th>Pepper</th>
<th>&quot;aye&quot;</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Smedberg</td>
<td>&quot;aye&quot;</td>
<td>Gaines</td>
<td>&quot;aye&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Euille</td>
<td>&quot;aye&quot;</td>
<td>Macdonald</td>
<td>&quot;aye&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Woodson</td>
<td>absent</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

13. SPECIAL USE PERMIT #2006-0038
228 SOUTH PITT STREET
ST. PAUL'S EPISCOPAL CHURCH
Public Hearing and Consideration of a request for a special use permit for a parking reduction; zoned RM/Residential. Applicant: St. Paul's Episcopal Church by Duncan Blair, attorney

PLANNING COMMISSION ACTION: Recommend Approval as Amended 5-0-1

(A copy of the Planning Commission report dated June 6, 2006, is on file in the Office of the City Clerk and Clerk of Council, marked Exhibit No. 1 of Item No. 13; 06/17/06, and is incorporated as part of this record by reference.)

The following persons participated in the public hearing on this item:

(a) Van Van Fleet, 26 Wolfe Street, President of the Old Town Civic Association (OTCA), stated that the OTCA were in agreement with the parking reduction as long as St. Paul's Episcopal Church continues the arrangement with the parking garage.

(b) Duncan Blair, 524 King Street, spoke in support of the SUP and agreed to notify the City and OTCA if the church's parking arrangement changes.

WHEREUPON, upon motion by Councilman Krupicka, seconded by Councilman Smedberg and carried unanimously, City Council closed the public hearing and approved the Planning Commission recommendation, with the addition of the condition if the church's parking arrangement changes, the City and Old Town Civic Association
must be notified and an alternative plan be formulated. The voting was as follows:

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Krupicka</td>
<td>&quot;aye&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Smedberg</td>
<td>&quot;aye&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Euille</td>
<td>&quot;aye&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pepper</td>
<td>&quot;aye&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gaines</td>
<td>&quot;aye&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Macdonald</td>
<td>&quot;aye&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Woodson</td>
<td>absent</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

14. ENCROACHMENT #2006-0001
228 SOUTH PITT STREET (400 BLOCK OF DUKE STREET FRONTAGE)
Public Hearing and Consideration of a request for an encroachment into the public right-of-way for installation of an ADA complaint access ramp, stairs and landing, zoned RM/Residential. Applicant: St. Paul's Episcopal Church by Duncan Blair, attorney

PLANNING COMMISSION ACTION: Recommend Approval 6-0

(A copy of the Planning Commission report dated June 6, 2006, is on file in the Office of the City Clerk and Clerk of Council, marked Exhibit No. 1 of Item No. 14; 06/17/06, and is incorporated as part of this record by reference.)

The following person participated in the public hearing on this item:

(a) Duncan Blair, 524 King Street, spoke in support of the SUP and responded to questions from City Council.

WHEREUPON, upon motion by Councilman Macdonald, seconded by Vice Mayor Pepper and carried unanimously, City Council closed the public hearing and approved the Planning Commission recommendation. The voting was as follows:

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Macdonald</td>
<td>&quot;aye&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pepper</td>
<td>&quot;aye&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Euille</td>
<td>&quot;aye&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gaines</td>
<td>&quot;aye&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Krupicka</td>
<td>&quot;aye&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Smedberg</td>
<td>&quot;aye&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Woodson</td>
<td>absent</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*****