



DOCKET ITEM #11

Text Amendment #2009-0002
Outdoor Display of Rental Bicycles

13
 6-13-09

Issue: Consideration of an amendment to the zoning ordinance to allow outdoor display of rental bicycles.	Planning Commission Hearing:	June 2, 2009
	City Council Hearing:	June 13, 2009
Description: An amendment to add Section 7-2400 to permit rental bicycles to be displayed outside a business, and to allow the display to be located in the right of way, subject to an approved outdoor display plan.		
Staff: Faroll Hamer, Director, Planning and Zoning		
<p><u>PLANNING COMMISSION ACTION, JUNE 2, 2009:</u> On a motion by Mr. Dunn, seconded by Mr. Jennings, the Commission voted to recommend <u>denial</u> of the text amendment on a vote of 3-3, which is deemed a recommendation for denial. Ms. Lyman was absent. The Commission was concerned that if the bike rental display program were adopted, there would not be adequate sidewalk area for pedestrians. It was also concerned about the precedent this program would set for other outdoor display requests. A motion by Mr. Wagner to recommend approval of the zoning amendment, but to defer the city code amendment allowing display areas to encroach into the public right of way was unsuccessful.</p> <p><u>Speakers:</u></p> <p>Amy Slack spoke against the proposal. She argued that the proposal would be unfair to different businesses who wish to include outdoor display, and cited discussions with Planning and Zoning about enforcement against shops that violate the outdoor display prohibition on Mount Vernon Avenue. She suggested that if the program were adopted, the text include a requirement for a minimum 4 foot wide pedestrian pathway in all cases.</p> <p>Poul Hertel, Old Town Civic Association, spoke in opposition to the proposal, citing the need for pedestrians as a priority, the potential clutter from outdoor display and about the proposal being a slippery slope which could eventually have to be broadened to include the outdoor display of other goods.</p> <p>Zach Petry, Store Manager, Bike and Roll, spoke in support of the text amendment and indicated that its store's location near the Potomac River and the Mount Vernon trail makes it ideal spot from which to attract potential bicyclists.</p> <p>Dave Levy, BikeWalk Alexandria, spoke in support of the proposal.</p> <p><u>COUNCIL OPTIONS:</u> City Council has three options. It may disapprove the text amendment by simple majority vote. It may approve the text amendment, but must do so by a super majority vote (six members). Finally, it may refer the matter back to the Planning Commission by simple majority vote.</p>		

Staff is recommending that the Zoning Ordinance be amended to permit the outdoor display of bicycles. The attached new language to both the zoning ordinance and to the city code will allow this small change in how the City promotes bicycle transportation and permit what is prohibited now.

I. BACKGROUND

Existing prohibition of outdoor display.

As a general rule, the typical retail store in Alexandria is not permitted to display goods outside a building. The Zoning Ordinance now includes as a “Use Limitation” which prohibits outdoor display, except under very limited circumstances. See section 4-107 (A) as an example and similar language is included in all of the nonresidential zones. Under those zoning provisions, only occasional outdoor sales, such as seasonal Christmas tree sales are permitted. Even for the occasional or seasonal sales, a permit is required and the display may not be located on the public right of way, such as the sidewalk.

When the Mount Vernon Avenue Overlay Zone was adopted, the issue of outdoor display was addressed by permitting it with an administrative permit which limits the display to occurring four times a year. The more recently adopted Small Business Administrative SUP program continues the outdoor display previously permitted for Mount Vernon Avenue, but only subject to the strictures of the administrative SUP process.

II. PROPOSAL

Proposed amendment to allow outdoor display for rental bicycles.

Under the text amendment proposed here, there will be one use in the City that is allowed to display products outdoors under less restrictive circumstances: bicycles for rent. Under the terms of the proposed section 7-2400, a rental bicycle business may seek an outdoor display permit for the area immediately adjacent to the building from which it operates. It will be the Director of Planning and Zoning who reviews the application and the proposed location of the outdoor display, including the size, the number of bicycles, and the circumstances, and determines whether the display will be appropriate at the chosen location. For example, the Director will review the plan to ensure that there is adequate room for the display without obstructing pedestrian access along a sidewalk.

In addition to the zoning ordinance, staff also proposes to amend the City Code to permit the bicycle display to be located on public right of way. Under section 5-2-29 of the City Code, certain features, such as stoops, steps, benches, and canopies are allowed to encroach into the city right of way, subject to several requirements, such as the provision of liability insurance and the City’s right to require the removal of the encroachment from its property. The proposed amendment would allow bicycles offered for rent to be included in the list of permitted encroachments. In this case, the outdoor display would have to be approved and retained as consistent with the requirements of section 7-2400, the proposed new zoning provision for outdoor display.

Staff Analysis

The very limited, small change to the zoning ordinance proposed here supports the City's efforts with regard to alternative transportation. In the spirit of Bike to Work Day (May 15, 2009) and the City's bronze designation under the League of American Bicyclists' Bicycle Friendly Community program, allowing the rental of bikes from outside a building should encourage bicycle use.

The City now has five bicycle stores located throughout the City:

- Big Wheels Bikes, 2 Prince Street
- Wheel Nuts, 302 Montgomery Street
- Bike and Roll, 1 Wales Alley
- Spokes, 1545 North Quaker Lane
- Bicycle Pro Shop, 3240 Duke Street

In addition, the proposed new rules will also apply to larger stores such as Target or Sears. While not all of them are now in the bicycle rental business, some are. In addition, the City hopes that there will be more bike rental businesses in the future.

Although the zoning change could have been drafted to apply to more bicycle businesses, such as including bicycle sales as well as rental, staff fears that such a change would lead to pressure for outdoor display of all goods, including furniture, rugs, appliances and other products that would be clearly inappropriate. It has long been the policy of the City not to allow such activity, in order to avoid clutter of sidewalks and interference with appropriate streetscape design. Therefore, staff has purposely carved out a very limited set of circumstances that will be appropriate – rental bicycles – under the new provisions.

Staff has met with the owners and/or managers of the City's existing bicycle stores to explain the new program and received their input on the proposed text amendment.

III. STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends that the Planning Commission recommend approval of the text amendment.

STAFF:

Faroll Hamer, Director, Planning and Zoning

Stephen Milone, Division Chief, Land Use Services, Planning and Zoning

Yon Lambert, Pedestrian/Bicycle Coordinator, Transportation and Environmental Services

ALEXANDRIA ZONING ORDINANCE/Article VII Supplemental Regulations
Sec. 7-2400 Outdoor Display of Rental Bicycles. Notwithstanding any regulation in this ordinance to the contrary, the outdoor display of bicycles for rent is permitted within the City to the following extent, and pursuant to the following guidelines:

(a) A business which rents bicycles may display those bicycles directly outside the building in which its business is located if a permit by the Director is approved subject to this section 7-2400.

(b) An application under this section for outdoor display of bicycles shall be accompanied by a plan showing the proposed display and, at a minimum, the following:

- (1) the location of the display;
- (2) the arrangement of bicycles within the display;
- (3) the number of bicycles proposed to be displayed;
- (4) any barriers proposed or required to surround the display area;
- (5) any additional features proposed to be part of the display.

(c) The display must, at a minimum, comply with the following:

- (1) The display must be consistent with this section 7-2400 and with the plan approved pursuant to section 7-2400 (b), including any conditions that are made part of the approval.
- (2) All bicycles must be maintained in an orderly arrangement;
- (3) All bicycles must be retained within the area permitted for the display, which may not include a flower or tree bed, the area within two feet of the curb where vehicle parking is permitted, or the area adjacent to the display where a clear, safe and adequate pedestrian passageway must be maintained.
- (4) The bicycle display may not block a doorway or fire hydrant.
- (5) No signs are permitted as part of the display except as permitted on the building by the zoning ordinance for the business.
- (6) All improvements used in an outdoor display area on the public right of way must be readily removable without damage to the surface of the right of way.
- (7) Within a historic district, the design of the area shall comply with any Board of Architectural Review approved design guidelines for such displays.

(c) The rental of bicycles is permitted from the display area.

(d) The display may be located on the public right of way, if permitted in the approved plan and subject to the requirements for encroachments under section 5-2-29 of the City Code.

(e) Bicycle means a device propelled solely by human power, upon which a person may ride either on or astride a regular seat attached thereto, having two or more wheels in tandem, including children's bicycles, except a toy vehicle intended for use by young children.

ALEXANDRIA CITY CODE

Sec. 5-2-29 Street encroachments.

Any encroachment into a public street, alley, sidewalk or other right-of-way may be authorized only by a special ordinance adopted by city council, unless the encroachment is authorized pursuant to one of the following exceptions or is otherwise authorized by this code or the City of Alexandria Zoning Ordinance:

(a) **Steps.** Steps not more than 12 feet in length, including the required landings, may project beyond the street lot line up to five feet on streets with a right-of-way width of 100 feet or more, up to four feet on streets with a right-of-way width between 66 and 100 feet, up to three feet on streets with a right-of-way width between 50 and 66 feet and, notwithstanding the above, up to 20 inches on Union Street and on King Street between the Potomac River and the R.F.&P. railroad right-of-way. The term "steps" in this subsection includes ramps and similar structures necessary to provide access to the handicapped.

(b) **Architectural decorations.** Belt courses, lintels, sills, architraves, pediments and similar architectural decorations may project up to four inches beyond the street lot line when less than 10 feet above the curb level, and up to 10 inches beyond the street lot line when 10 feet or more above the curb level.

(c) **Signs.** A sign may be erected or displayed flat against a building wall or at an angle thereto, so long as the sign does not project more than four feet from the building wall or within one foot of an established curb line and the bottom of the sign is at least eight feet above a sidewalk or parking area and at least 14.5 feet above an alley.

(d) **Canopies, awnings and marquees.** Canopies, awnings and marquees suspended from a building or structure with no ground supports, having a clearance of at least eight feet above a sidewalk, extending no more than four feet beyond the front property line, and extending to no more than one foot from the established curb line, may be erected.

(e) **Nonpermanent planters.** Planters which are nonpermanent may be located in a right-of-way subject to the following:

(1) A permanent planter is one which is attached in any permanent manner to a public right-of-way or to a building, building appurtenance or any other structure, or which rests on a foundation or substructure other than a sidewalk. A permanent planter requires a building permit and an encroachment ordinance. Above-grade permanent planters located in an historic district also require approval by the board of architectural review.

(2) A nonpermanent planter is a portable container that is light enough to be transported by two people when empty of soil and plants.

(3) A nonpermanent planter may not project into a public right-of-way more than steps would be allowed to project under subsection (a) above and may not exceed 30 inches in height. There is no limit to the number of planters permitted as long as the conditions of this subsection (e) are complied with and the planters are maintained in good condition.

(4) A nonpermanent planter must be located so as to maintain a path for public travel at least five feet in width at all points, along any adjacent sidewalk.

(5) A permit for a nonpermanent planter must be obtained from the department of transportation and environmental services. The permit application shall include the address of the planter, adequate location drawings, and a sketch, photo or dimensions of the planter. Visual inspection by the director of transportation and environmental services or his designee may be substituted for drawings if the location and description of the planter are recorded on the permit application.

After a permit has been granted, it may be revoked and the planter removed from the right-of-way by the director or his designee whenever the applicant fails to comply with any permit conditions. A permit application will be reviewed to determine compliance with the following:

- a. The location of the planter shall not unduly obstruct the public right-of-way.
- b. The planter shall be of such design and construction, and the contents shall be of such nature, so as not to constitute a nuisance or public hazard.
- c. The planter shall be of a design, material and color which are generally recognized as intended for and suitable for the display of plant materials on the public right-of-way in an urban environment and, if located in an historic district, are compatible with the streetscape in the district and are consistent with the applicable design guidelines adopted by the board of architectural review.
- d. The owner of the planter shall agree to move the planter whenever the city requires access to the planter location.

(f) Benches. Benches and similar street furniture may be placed in a public right-of-way, subject to the following:

- (1) The bench or street furniture shall be located immediately adjacent to the closest building wall, shall touch the wall along the length of the bench or street furniture, and shall not project from the wall more than 30 inches.
- (2) The bench or street furniture shall not be used as part of a business for advertising, or for making sales or providing services to customers, and shall be available for use by the general public.
- (3) The director of transportation and environmental services or his designee shall review any bench or street furniture proposed for a right-of-way and its location, and approve it if he finds that it will not interfere with pedestrian access and safety, will not be an attractive nuisance and will promote the health, safety and welfare of the city.
- (4) The director of planning and zoning or his designee shall review any bench or street furniture proposed for a right-of-way and shall approve it if he finds that its design is compatible with the character of the surrounding area.

(g) Rental Bicycles. Bicycles offered for rent may be displayed and rented from areas of right of way pursuant to Section 7-2400 of the Zoning Ordinance and this section 5-2-29.

(h) Encroachment requirements. In addition to any other restrictions or requirements imposed by this code or the City of Alexandria Zoning Ordinance, the owner of any sign, canopy, awning or marquee, nonpermanent planter, bench, bicycle display or similar street furniture that encroaches into a public right-of-way pursuant to this section shall also comply with the following:

(1) **Liability insurance.** The owner shall obtain and maintain a policy of general liability insurance in the amount of \$1,000,000 which will indemnify the owner (and all successors in interest), and the city as an additional named insured, against all claims, demands, suits and related costs, including attorneys' fees, arising from any bodily injury or property damage which may occur as a result of the encroachment.

(2) **Removal of encroachment.** The owner or any successor in interest shall remove the encroachment if the city determines that the encroachment interferes with public access or is otherwise inconsistent with the public welfare. In such case, the city shall provide the owner or successor in interest with written notice of the need to remove the encroachment at least 10 days

prior to the date on which the removal must be completed. If the owner or successor in interest cannot be found, or fails to remove the encroachment within the time specified, the city shall have the right to remove the encroachment, at the expense of the owner or successor, and shall not be liable for any loss or damage to the encroaching structure that may occur as a result of the removal. (Ord. No. 3864, 5/18/96, Sec. 1; Ord. No. 3995, 5/16/98, Sec. 1)

Sec. 5-2-19 Sale of articles of commerce from vehicles prohibited or limited while parking on city streets.

It shall be unlawful for any person to offer for sale or sell any goods, wares, merchandise, foodstuffs or similar items from a vehicle or trailer that is parked, placed or stopped on a city street alongside of or next to a parking meter. It shall also be unlawful for any person to offer for sale or sell any goods, wares, merchandise, foodstuffs or similar items from a vehicle or trailer that has been parked, placed or stopped for longer than 20 minutes in any one place on a city street that does not contain parking meters. Notwithstanding this prohibition, a display of bicycles offered for rent from the public right of way pursuant to section 7-2400 of the Zoning Ordinance and section 5-2-29(g) is permitted. (Code 1963, Sec. 33-20; Ord. No. 3368, 4/15/89, Sec. 1)

Sec. 5-2-16 Placing merchandise on or otherwise obstructing sidewalks and other public rights-of-way.

(a) No person shall place any goods, wares, merchandise, foodstuffs or similar items on, or in any way obstruct, any street, sidewalk, walkway of the city or occupy or use any of such sidewalks or walkways or other public right-of-way or use any such public right-of-way for the display or sale of any goods, wares, merchandise, foodstuffs or similar items, except either pursuant to a permit issued in accordance with section 7-2400 of the zoning ordinance and section 5-2-29(g) ~~7-6-44(1)~~ of this code or when receiving or delivering such items, in which case the items may remain on the public right-of-way only so long as is reasonably necessary for the delivery of same. (Code 1963, Sec. 33-17, as amended by Ord. No. 2545, 2/10/81, Sec. 1; Ord. No. 2609, 7/8/81, Sec. 1; Ord. No. 3368, 4/15/89, Sec. 1)



Faroll Hamer/Alex
05/26/2009 01:23 PM

To Kendra Jacobs/Alex@Alex, Barbara Ross/Alex@ALEX
cc
bcc

Subject Fw: Public Display of Bicycles

----- Forwarded by Faroll Hamer/Alex on 05/26/2009 01:23 PM -----



"Zach Petry"
<zach@biketbsites.com>

05/26/2009 12:43 PM

Please respond to
zach@biketbsites.com

To <faroll.hamer@alexandriava.gov>
cc

Subject Public Display of Bicycles

Ms. Hamer,

I am writing to convey Bike and Roll's support of the Planning and Zoning initiative to change public ordinance to allow bike rentals to be displayed on public property. We are new to Alexandria, but we brought our passion for bike advocacy with us from our 7 years of providing rental and tour services in DC. Being that Alexandria was recently awarded the Bronze level of Bicycle Friendly Communities by the League of American Bicyclists shows the dedication to ensuring cyclists welfare. We want to assist in any way possible to advance the city's commitment.

Positioned at a great location a block from Union and King, we can do a lot to promote this environmental and health friendly way for locals and tourists to take advantage of Alexandria's well maintained trails and share lanes. Allowing rental bicycles to be on display in the public domain would go a long way to put this alternative transportation into the minds of those passing by. We offer specials to locals as an incentive to change their habits, and hopefully transition them to commuting by bike.

We have marked our calendars for the June 2nd Planning and Zoning hearing, and the City Council meeting following. Please let us know if we can do anything to assist this initiative.

Thank you for your time and efforts,
Zach Petry
Manager
Bike and Roll Alexandria
t: 703.548.7655
f: 703.548.7665
www.Biketbsites.com

Visit BikeandRoll.com for info on Bike and Roll Chicago, San Francisco, Miami, and New York City

DOCKET ITEM# ,
TA 2009-0002

Old Town Civic Association, Inc.
P.O. Box 1213
Alexandria, Virginia 22313

RE: Outdoor Display of Bicycles

Dear Chairman Komoroske and Members of the Planning Commission

The Old Town Civic Association Board, although very grateful for the City Staff taking time to come to our board meeting in order to discuss the program is nevertheless, against the implementation of this proposal.

The board objection is based on the adverse effects on economic fairness, esthetics and safety that are built into the proposal.

The rationale evoked for the allowance of this particular business to display is arbitrary and conducive to others demanding equal treatment. Bicycling is no more green than walking, yet shoe stores are not allowed to display. The celebratory genesis of the proposal and desire for a more valuable metallic symbol will promulgate other equally laudable endeavors to follow suit.

OTCA has adopted a Statement of Constraints that refers to the narrowness of scale in the Old Town. On that basis, we must strongly discourage the view that the city can continue to add more items onto the public view or right of way without incurring the scourge of clutter.

The most important and significant alternative mode of transportation is the common pedestrian. Yet, this healthy alternative that is the most inclusive option is diminished as the City continues to hand over public right of way to private enterprise. Furthermore, bicycles and pedestrians do not mix; in fact, pedestrians need to be protected from bicyclists as much as from cars especially since the majority of pedestrian accidents occur in Old Town.

For these reasons we must urge you to oppose this text amendment for Old Town.

Sincerely

Poul Hertel
President OTCA

Statement of Constraints:

Properly addressing motor-coach and other issues as they have arisen in Old Town Alexandria requires the recognition of certain physical constraints in and near Old Town. Additionally, Old Town contains a substantial number of older, irreplaceable structures which give Old Town its unique historical character that attracts permanent residents to Old Town as well as businesses and visitors, including tourists. These constraints include:

1. **Old Town occupies a finite physical land area lying within the Old and Historic District.**
2. **Within the Old Town area, there are a finite number of street lane miles over which motor-coaches and other vehicles can travel, there are a finite number of motor-coach and other parking places, and there is a finite amount of sidewalk space on which pedestrians can walk, window-shop, and dine.**
3. As a practical matter, it is impossible to increase the number street lane-miles, on-street parking places, and sidewalk square footage within Old Town.
4. Due to the physical constraints cited in the preceding sentence, Old Town has a finite capacity at any one time of motor-coaches and other vehicles moving and parking and of people walking, window-shopping, or dining on Old Town sidewalks.
5. The presence of an excess number of motor-coaches, other types of vehicles, and pedestrians in Old Town has a deleterious impact on the ambiance and quality-of-life, particularly for Old Town residents, and the physical integrity Old Town's historic structures.
6. Large motor-coaches have difficulty traveling on Old Town streets, they add to and impede traffic, and they often experience difficulty in turning onto narrow streets, especially when automobiles are parked on the street close to a corner.
7. Restricting parking near street intersections to make it easier for large motor-coaches to turn a corner reduces the number of parking spaces in Old Town, further trimming an already tight supply of on-street parking places in Old Town.
8. There are few, if any, places in Old Town where additional off-street parking can be constructed.
9. There are few places in or near Old Town which are suitable for building parking facilities for motor-coaches waiting to pick up tourists they previously dropped off in Old Town.

13
6-13-09



Fred Parker
<fredp@hardtimes.com>

06/12/2009 09:03 AM

Please respond to
Fred Parker
<fredp@hardtimes.com>

To william.euille@alexandriava.gov,
timothy.lovain@alexandriava.gov, councilmangaines@aol.com,
council@krupicka.com, delpepper@aol.com,

cc

bcc

Subject COA Contact Us: Bike display issue



Time: [Fri Jun 12, 2009 09:03:23] IP Address: [68.163.70.65]

Issue Type: Mayor, Vice Mayor, and Council Members
First Name: Fred
Last Name: Parker
Street Address: 408 Jackson PI
City: alexandria
State: VA
Zip: 22302
Phone: 703-836-2077
Email Address: fredp@hardtimes.com
Subject: Bike display issue
Comments: I would encourage a vote to allow Bike and Roll to display their bikes.

13
6-13-09

Old Town Civic Association

Statement of Constraints

Best Ely

With regard to the operation of motor-coaches in Old Town Alexandria

(Adopted by the OTCA Board of Directors on October 30, 2008)

Properly addressing motor-coach issues as they have arisen in Old Town Alexandria requires the recognition of certain physical constraints in and near Old Town. Additionally, Old Town contains a substantial number of older, irreplaceable structures which give Old Town its unique historical character that attracts permanent residents to Old Town as well as businesses and visitors, including tourists. These constraints include:

- 1 – Old Town occupies a finite physical land area lying within the Old and Historic District.
- 2 – **Within the Old Town area, there are a finite number of street lane miles over which motor-coaches and other vehicles can travel, there are a finite number of motor-coach and other parking places, and there is a finite amount of sidewalk space on which pedestrians can walk, window-shop, and dine.**
- 3 – **As a practical matter, it is impossible to increase the number street lane-miles, on-street parking places, and sidewalk square footage within Old Town.**
- 4 – **Due to the physical constraints cited in the preceding sentence, Old Town has a finite capacity at any one time of motor-coaches and other vehicles moving and parking and of people walking, window-shopping, or dining on Old Town sidewalks.**
- 5 – The presence of an excess number of motor-coaches, other types of vehicles, and pedestrians in Old Town has a deleterious impact on the ambiance and quality-of-life, particularly for Old Town residents, and the physical integrity Old Town's historic structures.
- 6 – Large motor-coaches have difficulty traveling on Old Town streets, they add to and impede traffic, and they often experience difficulty in turning onto narrow streets, especially when automobiles are parked on the street close to a corner.
- 7 – Restricting parking near street intersections to make it easier for large motor-coaches to turn a corner reduces the number of parking spaces in Old Town, further trimming an already tight supply of on-street parking places in Old Town.
- 8 – There are few, if any, places in Old Town where additional off-street parking can be constructed.
- 9 – There are few places in or near Old Town which are suitable for building parking facilities for motor-coaches waiting to pick up tourists they previously dropped off in Old Town.

13
6-13-09

Percent of Impulse Rentals

Stephen
marks

Count of reservation id referral name	Total	
- AAA	1	0.2532%
- Bike and Roll	3	0.7595%
- Bike Shop	5	1.2658%
- Brochure	8	2.0253%
- Concierge	20	5.0633%
- Employee	4	1.0127%
- Friend or Family	26	6.5823%
- Guide Book	4	1.0127%
- Internet Search	87	22.0253%
- Map	2	0.5063%
- Media	8	2.0253%
- None	69	17.4684%
- Other	16	4.0506%
- Past Participant	16	4.0506%
- Visitor Center	5	1.2658%
- Walk By	121	30.6329%
Grand Total	395	100.0000%

*The data in the table above reflects rentals from
03/21/09 to 6/04/09 at Bike and Roll's Alexandria location.



Old Dominion Boat Club

P. O. Box 1245
Alexandria, Virginia 22313
(703) 836-1900 • Fax: (703) 836-5764

13
6-13-09
Organized 1880

Douglas Meick

June 12, 2009

City of Alexandria
City Hall
301 King Street
Alexandria, VA 22314

To the Honorable Mayor Euille and City Council Members:

This letter is agreed to by the Officers and Governors of the Old Dominion Boat Club. We hereby ask for you to reject the proposal of a text amendment to the City's Zoning Ordinance to allow outdoor display of rental bicycles. The display of bicycles in Wales Alley would severely impede ingress and egress to and from our Club. Therefore, we urge you consider and accept the planning commission's recommendation to reject this proposal.

Sincerely,

Carolyn Bell
President