

Docket Item # 19
BAR CASE #2006-0106

BAR Meeting
June 7, 2006

ISSUE: Alterations
APPLICANT: P. Margaret Wylie
LOCATION: 320 North Alfred
ZONE: RB/Residential

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: Staff recommends approval of the window replacement and approval of the removal of the Masonite siding and retention and repair of historic wood siding.

(Insert sketch here)

I. ISSUE:

The applicant is requesting approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace the existing front windows with new windows manufactured by Kolbe and Kolbe and to remove the existing Masonite siding and replace with fiber cement board (Hardi-plank) for 320 North Alfred Street

The current front windows are not historic and appear to have been replacement windows from the 1960s. The proposed windows are two-over-two, single-glazed, double-hung wood windows which will be installed in the existing openings.

320 North Alfred Street currently has Masonite siding. The applicant has removed three sections of the Masonite on the front and side elevations which revealed a layer of brick tec over wood siding. The applicant is proposing removing all the Masonite and other exterior siding and replace with Hardi-plank.

II. HISTORY:

320 North Alfred Street appears on the 1891 and 1896 Sanborn maps, but not the 1885 map.

According to early building permits, Mable Bolden received a building permit for 320 North Alfred Street in 1926 , which could have been for a rear addition

Building permits show the windows and doors were replaced in 1961(Building permit #17665). A building permit was issued on December 29, 1982, which may have been for the use of Masonite.

Staff could not locate any approvals by the Board for 320 North Alfred Street.

III. ANALYSIS:

The proposed replacement siding and windows comply with zoning ordinance requirements.

The applicant is only proposing to replace the windows on the front facade at this time. The proposed two-over-two, double-hung, single-glazed wood window are appropriate for this house and era. According to the guidelines, preferred window types are “single glazed true divided light wood windows with interior storm sash.”

Regarding the proposed use of fiber cement, the Board has adopted the following policy for the use of fiber cement siding:

1. That fiber cement siding not be installed on an historic structure;
2. That historic materials should not be removed to install fiber cement siding;
3. That fiber cement siding replace other artificial or composite siding;
4. That the nails not show in the installation of the siding; and

5. That smooth, (non simulated wood grain) siding be installed, and
6. That BAR Staff may administratively approve the installation of fiber cement siding on non-historic building (those constructed in 1975 or later).

As stated in the issue section, the applicant has removed three sections of the Masonite on the front and side elevations which reveals a layer of brick-tec over wood siding. Staff visited the site and met with the applicant. The wood siding underneath the layers of Masonite and brick-tec appears to be in good condition. With that in mind, the proposed replacement of the Masonite with fiber cement (Hardi-plank) does not meet the Board's policy for use of fiber cement since probable historic wood siding is intact underneath the Masonite. Staff would support the removal of the Masonite and brick-tec sidings and encourage the retention of the wood siding. Any damaged or compromised wood components should be repaired and replaced with in-kind wood.

IV. STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends approval of the window replacement and approval of the removal of the Masonite siding and retention and repair of historic wood siding.

CITY DEPARTMENT COMMENTS

Legend: C - code requirement R - recommendation S - suggestion F - finding

Code Enforcement:

No comments.

Historic Alexandria:

The request seems appropriate.