ISSUE: Alterations

APPLICANT: Paul and Deborah Kaplan

LOCATION: 109 Franklin Street

ZONE: RM/Residential

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: Staff recommends approval of the application with the following conditions:

1. That the existing six-over-six windows be replaced with one-over-one or two-over-two, double-hung wood windows;
2. That the existing six panel front door is replaced with a four panel wood door or other appropriate late Victorian style door.

**EXPIRATION OF APPROVALS NOTE:** In accordance with Sections 10-106(B) and 10-206(B) of the Zoning Ordinance, any official Board of Architectural Review approval will expire 12 months from the date of issuance if the work is not commenced and diligently and substantially pursued by the end of that 12-month period.

**BUILDING PERMIT NOTE:** Most projects approved by the Board of Architectural Review require the issuance of one or more construction permits by Building and Fire Code Administration (including signs). The applicant is responsible for obtaining all necessary construction permits after receiving Board of Architectural Review approval. Contact Code Administration, Room 4200, City Hall, 703-838-4360 for further information.
I. ISSUE:
The applicant is requesting approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness for alterations at 109 Franklin Street. The applicant intends to replace the six existing windows, bow window and front door on the main (historic) portion of the townhouse. The applicant has stated that the windows and door are in poor condition.

The six existing double-hung wood windows will be replaced with new double-insulated, simulated divided light wood windows. The six-over-six windows will have 7/8 inch muntins and an interior spacer bar. The entire bow window on the front elevation will also be replaced with a new wood bow window in the existing opening. The windows in the new bow will have simulated divided lights in a four-over-four configuration, similar to the existing light pattern, with 7/8 inch muntins and an interior spacer bar.

The applicant also proposes to replace the existing six panel wood door with glass in the upper panels with a new door in the same configuration.

II. HISTORY:
The two story, two bay, late Victorian style townhouse at 109 Franklin Street dates from between 1896 and 1902, when it is first shown on the Sanborn Fire Insurance maps. The City’s real estate records indicate the building was constructed in 1880, which the applicant believes may be more accurate. According to the Sanborn maps, 109 Franklin Street was originally part of a duplex. The adjoining townhouse to the west appears to have been demolished and the commercial building was constructed in its place. The date of the demolition was not found by Staff.

Staff has identified two Board approvals for the subject property. The first was in 1970 when the Board approved the first floor bow window (September 2, 1970). On March 20, 2002, the BAR also approved the partial demolition of an existing rear addition and the construction of a new larger rear addition at 109 Franklin Street (BAR Case #2002-0039&0040).

III. ANALYSIS:
The proposed alterations comply with zoning ordinance requirements.

Although the applicant is proposing to retain the same colonial revival style door and windows, Staff believes that the new double-hung windows and front door should reflect the buildings late Victorian vernacular style (the door surround and cornice are original features of the c. 1900 townhouse, in Staff’s opinion). It appears that the existing windows - true divided light wood windows with exterior storms, along with the shutters - are not original to the house and are likely to have been installed when the bow window was installed in the early 1970s. Given the age and style of the townhouse, Staff suggests that the applicant install the historically appropriate window configuration - either one-over-one or two-over-two double-hung wood windows - instead of the proposed colonial revival style six-over-six windows. While the applicant intends to keep the non-operable shutters, Staff notes that the Design Guidelines recommend that shutters be operable. Furthermore, while there is some precedent, in general shutters are not common on late Victorian style townhouses.
Although the Design Guidelines recommend that all windows on historic properties be single glazed (one pane of glass) with true divided lights, the Board has in the past approved the installation of double-glazed windows on historic buildings where the existing windows are not historic, provided that the muntin width and profile is historically appropriate. Because the existing windows are not historic, Staff can support the use of simulated divided lights in either a one-over-one or two-over-two configuration.

Similarly the six panel wood door is also a colonial revival feature and Staff recommends that a more appropriate late Victorian style door be installed, such as a four panel wood door.

Although it is likely the house original had a pair of double hung windows on the first floor, the applicant wishes to retain the BAR approved bow window and Staff does not object.

IV. **STAFF RECOMMENDATION:** Staff recommends approval of the application with the following conditions:

1. That the existing six-over-six windows be replaced with one-over-one or two-over-two, double-hung wood windows;
2. That the existing six panel front door is replaced with a four panel wood door or other appropriate late Victorian style door.
V. CITY DEPARTMENT COMMENTS

Legend: C - code requirement  R - recommendation  S - suggestion  F - finding

Code Administration:
No comments received.

Historic Alexandria:
R-1  Approve.
VI. IMAGES

Figure 1. Front and side (east) elevation.
Figure 2. Front elevation.
**SALES & INSTALLATION AGREEMENT**

109 Franklin Street  
Alexandria, VA 22314

The Window and Door Showplace, the "Contractor" and "the owner" hereby agree to the following terms and conditions for the following products and services for the improvement of the property at the above address.

---

**This quote is for the supply and installation of:**

**MARVIN WOOD ULTIMATE INSERT DOUBLE HUNG WINDOWS**
- 6 UNITS

**MARVIN WOOD ULTIMATE DOUBLE HUNG BOW WINDOW**
- 1 FOUR WIDE UNIT DH/VST/ST/DH CONFIGURATION

On all windows:
- Primed Pine Interior / Primed Pine Exterior
- Low E II Argon Gas Insulating Glass
- White hardware
- 7/16" Simulated Divided Lites with spacer bars
- Colonial Grid pattern
- Full Insect Screens

Also on Bow Window:
- Cable support system
- Copperthine or aluminum roof
- Insulated head and seat
- New interior and exterior trim

**SIMPSON FIR EXTERIOR DOOR**
MODEL 4226 IN FIF-PRE HUNG IN NEW FRAME
- Six panel door with top two panels in insulating glass
- 4 9/16 inch frame and jamb
- Bright Brass hinges
- Modified drip lip sill
- New trim interior and exterior
- Primed for painting, door frame, and trim
- Homeowner hardware installed

---

### Table: Window Specifications

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Location</th>
<th>Qty</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Marvin Showplace of McLean  
682 Old Dominion Dr.  
McLean, VA 22101  
Office 703-566-3650  
Fax 703-566-3680  
03/10/09 14:17:46 | 1 | Marvin Products - Include a 20/10 Warranty. See manufacturer's written warranty for details |

---

**Figure 3. Window specifications.**
BAR CASE #2009-0072
May 6, 2009

Version 6.21

MARVIN WINDOW QUOTE

Sean McClellan - WindowSmith
7249 Arlington Blvd  Falls Church, VA  22042
703-980-5588

*** CAUTION: IT IS RECOMMENDED THAT A MINIMUM OF 1/4 INCH BE ADDED ***
*** TO THE ROUGH OPENING HEIGHT WHEN USING MARVIN STILLGUARD ***
*** UNIT AVAILABILITY AND PRICE SUBJECT TO CHANGE ***
*** LIST PRICE (in USD) ***

PROJECT: kaplan marvin dh bow

QUOTE: 00000001

QTY: 6  MARK UNIT -
    W INDH
    IO 31 3/4" X 45 1/4"
    IG - 1 LITE
    LOW E II W/ARGON
    1/8" RECT SEL - W/SPACER BAR - SPC CUT 3W2H
    PR PINE EXT. - PR PINE INT.
    EXISTING SILL ANGLE - 8 DEG.
    UNIT WILL BE BUILT WITH 8 DEG FRAME BEVEL.
    WH SASH LOCK
    SCREEN ***SHIP SEPARATE
    STONE WHITE SURROUND
    CHARCOAL FIBERGLASS MESH
    4 9/16" JAMES
    PR PINE INTERIOR
    PR PINE EXTERIOR

AS VIEWED FROM THE EXTERIOR

NON-MARVIN: NON-SYSTEM GENERATED PRICING

QUOTE: 00000003

QTY: 1  MARK UNIT - Simpson Fir Door
    4226 4 panel 2 lites, primed both sides/ 4 9/16 inch jamb / brass
    hinges / homeowner hardware installed/

NON-MARVIN: NON-SYSTEM GENERATED PRICING

QUOTE: 00000004

QTY: 1  MARK UNIT - coppertone roofing material
    bay window coppertone / front door roof coppertone

QUOTE: 00000005

QTY: 1  MARK UNIT -

CONTINUED ON NEXT PAGE

Figure 4. Window specifications.
Figure 5. Window specifications.

**A1

W UDH
CN 1624
IG - 1 LITE
LOW E II W/ARGON
7/8" RECT SDL - W/SPACER BAR - STD CUT 2W2H
PR PINE EXT. - PR PINE INT.
TP SASH LOCK
SCREEN
STONE WHITE SURROUND
CHARCOAL FIBERGLASS MESH

**A2

W UDHP - 1 5/8 SASH
RO 22 3/8" X 57 1/2"
STD CN 54 HEIGHT
IG - 1 LITE
LOW E II W/ARGON
7/8" RECT SDL - W/SPACER BAR - SPC CUT 2W4H
PR PINE EXT. - PR PINE INT.

**A3

W UDHP - 1 5/8 SASH
RO 22 3/8" X 57 1/2"
STD CN 54 HEIGHT
IG - 1 LITE
LOW E II W/ARGON
7/8" RECT SDL - W/SPACER BAR - SPC CUT 2W4H
PR PINE EXT. - PR PINE INT.

**A4

W UDH
CN 1624
IG - 1 LITE
LOW E II W/ARGON
7/8" RECT SDL - W/SPACER BAR - STD CUT 2W2H
PR PINE EXT. - PR PINE INT.
TP SASH LOCK
SCREEN
STONE WHITE SURROUND
CHARCOAL FIBERGLASS MESH
LOOSE INSTALLATION BRACKETS
4 9/16" JAMBS
PR PINE INFERIOR
PR PINE EXTERIOR
BMC

QUOTE CONTINUED ON NEXT PAGE.
Figure 6. Window specifications.
Figure 7. Door specifications.