

*****DRAFT MINUTES*****

Alexandria Board of Architectural Review
Parker-Gray District

Wednesday, February 23, 2011
7:30 P.M., Room 2000, City Hall
301 King Street, Alexandria, Virginia 22314

Members Present: William Conkey, Chairman
Philip Moffat
Christina Kelley
Deborah Rankin

Members Absent: Robert Duffy
Richard Lloyd
Doug Meick

Staff Present: Planning and Zoning:
Stephanie Sample, Historic Preservation Planner
Al Cox, FAIA, Historic Preservation Manager

The meeting was called to order at approximately 7:35 p.m. by Chairman Conkey.

I. MINUTES

Consideration of the minutes of the public hearing of February 9, 2011.

BOARD ACTION: Approved as submitted 4-0.

On a motion by **Ms. Kelly, seconded by Ms. Rankin**, the minutes were approved 4-0.

II. CONSENT CALENDAR

Items on the Consent Calendar are those where the applicant has agreed to all conditions of approval shown in the staff reports. Without objection, the staff recommendation for these cases will be approved as a group by unanimous consent of the Board at the beginning of the meeting. When announced by the Chairman, any member of the Board or of the public may ask that one of these cases be removed for full discussion.

1. CASE BAR2011-0004

Request for trash enclosure screening at **1400 Princess St**, zoned RB Residential.

APPLICANT: Alexandria Redevelopment and Housing Authority

BOARD ACTION: Approved, as amended, 3-1.

This item was removed for discussion at the request of a member of the public.

CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

That the enclosures be painted or stained a color to complement the brick buildings at Jefferson Village, in consultation with Staff.

SPEAKERS

Mr. Ralph Timmons, resident of 309 N. West St. since 1993, spoke in opposition to the trash screening. He said the screening was installed in response to his complaint about the appearance of the dumpster and the trash often left around the dumpster until picked up by ARHA staff. He said the screen had already been tagged but that the graffiti had now been largely removed. He recommended that the dumpster be put within a larger brick building and rolled out for service.

Mr. Leroy Jennings, ARHA staff, responded that the two dumpsters were part of the original site plan for Jefferson Village and that there were no other practical locations for them. He said that ARHA staff would diligently monitor and maintain these and recommended that the head of ARHA facilities, Mr. Chaba Josa, be contacted directly if there were additional problems with trash or graffiti.

BOARD DISCUSSION

Ms. Rankin stated that this was an improvement of the previous unfenced dumpster. She stated that the other issues related to maintenance and management, which was outside the purview of the BAR.

Mr. Cox noted that the Police should be contacted directly, at the non-emergency number, for graffiti complaints and that Code Administration is the proper contact for rodent abatement, should that become a problem.

Mr. Moffat observed that the dumpster was fundamentally at odds with the district's Design Guidelines.

Ms. Kelly also observed that this was an operational issue more than anything. She suggested that ARHA be vigilant about keeping the gates closed and put pressure on the collection company to do so as well. She made a motion to approve the screen, as submitted.

The motion was seconded by Ms. Rankin and passed 3 – 1, with Mr. Moffat opposed.

REASON

The Board agreed with the staff analysis, found that the installed screen was a satisfactory solution to enclose the dumpster, and believed that the operational and management issues of trash removal referenced by the neighbors were outside their purview.

III. DISCUSSION ITEMS

2. CASE BAR2011-0027

Permit to Demolish at **411 North West Street**, zoned RB Residential.

APPLICANT: Brendan Owens, Contract Purchaser

BOARD ACTION: Approved as amended by a roll call vote, 3-1.

This item was combined with item #3, Case BAR2011-0028, below for discussion purposes.

3. CASE BAR2011-0028

Addition and alterations at **411 North West Street**, zoned RB Residential.

APPLICANT: Brendan Owens, Contract Purchaser

BOARD ACTION: Approved as amended by a roll call vote, 3-1.

CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

Approval of the Permit to Demolish and Certificate of Appropriateness for the Addition/Alterations with the following conditions related to the historic portion of the house:

1. Any new windows should be historically appropriate wood windows in a one-over-one or two-over-two configuration. The windows must meet the *Alexandria Replacement Window Performance Specifications*. Window size must match the original window size.
2. All replacement trim/molding should be wood.
3. The four panel front door should be constructed of solid wood.
4. The applicant must coordinate with BAR Staff to inspect the siding/sheathing underneath the stone veneer and aluminum siding.
5. If the wood siding, or a portion of it, is in good condition and can be retained, the applicant must retain the historic wood siding on the main block of the house. The applicant will be required to retain any wood siding on the areas which are being demolished to use on the main block of the house.
6. If there is the need for new wood siding on the house, it should be German lap wood siding to match the other townhouses in this row.
7. That only a transom and not the proposed door surround, is installed. The door surround should match the original design, as confirmed by Staff in the field when the Formstone is removed.
8. The following archaeology conditions shall appear in the General Notes of all site plans and on all site plan sheets that involve demolition or ground disturbance (including Basement/Foundation Plans, Demolition, Erosion and Sediment Control, Grading, Landscaping, Utilities, and Sheeting and Shoring) so that on-site contractors are aware of the requirements.
 - The applicant/developer call Alexandria Archaeology immediately (703-838-4399) if any buried structural remains (wall foundations, wells, privies, cisterns, etc.) or concentrations of artifacts are discovered during development. Work must cease in the area of the discovery until a City archaeologist comes to the site and records the finds.
 - The applicant/developer shall not allow any metal detection or artifact collection to be conducted on the property, unless authorized by Alexandria Archaeology.
9. Staff may not issue a building permit for this project until the violations are cured on the applicant's previous project.
10. Fiber cement siding, if used on the addition, should be installed per the BAR's adopted policy.

SPEAKERS

Mr. Steve Kulinski, architect, presented the case for the owner. He asked for the option to use wood on the addition.

Ms. Kelly had no problems with the design and moved the staff recommendation.

Mr. Moffat asked about outstanding BAR issues on this applicant's previous house. He said he supports modern materials on an addition but not a historic house.

Staff responded that a contractor had been retained to do the work per previous Board approvals and that a condition of this project could be that the work on the previous project must be complete before a building permit may be issued for the present work.

Ms. Rankin expressed concern that there were not enough material specifications on the historic portion of the building.

Chairman Conkey responded that the proposed materials were routinely approved by this Board and would not affect the overall design. He was comfortable with staff review of the details. He was concerned that replacement windows be the original window size (confirmed by the framing and siding evidence in the field) and not simply a replacement of the existing replacement windows and that the door surround match the original design, as confirmed by staff in the field when the existing Formstone is removed.

Mr. Moffat moved to approve the staff recommendations with the following additions:

- a. That prior violations must be cured prior to issuance of the building permit;
- b. That the windows be the original size, as determined in the field;
- c. That the door surround match the original design or the surrounding, similar buildings;
and
- d. That the fiber cement be installed per BAR policy.

Ms. Kelly seconded the motion.

The motion passed 3-1 by roll call vote, with Ms. Rankin opposed.

REASON

The Board agreed with the analysis in the staff report.

4. CASE BAR2011-0003

Alterations to previously approved plans at **219 N West St**, zoned RB Residential.

APPLICANT: Wanda Carter

BOARD ACTION: Approved, as amended, 4-0.

CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

1. That only smooth fiber cement siding be used.
2. That PVC trim be solid throughout, millable and field painted.

3. Call Alexandria Archaeology immediately (703-838-4399) if any buried structural remains (wall foundations, wells, privies, cisterns, etc.) or concentrations of artifacts are discovered during development. Work must cease in the area of the discovery until a City archaeologist comes to the site and records the finds. The above statement must appear in the General Notes of all site plans and on all site plan sheets that involve demolition or ground disturbance (including sheeting and shoring and grading) so that on-site contractors are aware of the requirement.
4. That the applicant to continue to work with staff prior to approval of the building permit to review the iron railing detail and the Fypon brackets.
5. That the composite material of the terrace deck be a traditional 1x4 tongue and groove pattern.
6. That the height and details of the terrace railing be refined and approved by staff.
7. That the second floor windows on the east elevation may be shorter, as approved by staff.

SPEAKERS

Ms. Carter, the owner, presented the application and described the changes since the previous BAR approval.

BOARD DISCUSSION

Ms. Rankin had no problems with the application.

Mr. Moffat commented that the project was very attractive.

Ms. Kelly believed the alterations to the rear of the building were more interesting and compatible with the neighborhood. She suggested that the railings on the side porches relate to the new porch railing in the front. The applicant agreed and said they would work with staff to do so.

Chairman Conkey confirmed that the front doors were a pair. He stated that the changes were improvements and preferred the new design of the rear.

Ms. Rankin moved the staff recommendation, which was seconded by Ms. Kelly and passed 4-0.

REASON

The Board agreed with the analysis in the staff report.

IV. OTHER BUSINESS

Adoption of Additional BAR Policies for the Parker-Gray District.

BOARD ACTION: Adopted as amended, 4-0.

V. ADMINISTRATIVE APPROVALS

CASE BAR2011-0036

Window Replacement at **518 North Patrick Street**, zoned RB Residential.

APPLICANT: Jeremy Portell by Old Town Windows and Doors

CASE BAR2011-0039

Replacement of an existing fence at **207 North Payne Street**, zoned RB Residential.

APPLICANT: Susan & Michael Sabatian

VI. ADJOURNMENT

Chairman Conkey adjourned the meeting at approximately 9:25 pm

Minutes submitted by:

Al Cox, FAIA
Historic Preservation Manager