

Docket Item #8
BAR CASE #2003-0160

BAR Meeting
September 17, 2001

ISSUE: Permit to demolish portions of the building

APPLICANT: Heffner Architects

LOCATION: 200 South Peyton Street

ZONE: CD/Commercial

BOARD ACTION, SEPTEMBER 3, 2003: Deferred because of a lack of public notice.

BOARD ACTION, AUGUST 6, 2003: The Board combined the discussion of docket item # s 11& 12. On a motion by Ms.Quill, seconded by Dr. Fitzgerald the Board deferred the application for restudy. The vote on the motion was 5-0.

REASON: The Board believed that more detail on the project elements was needed to make an informed decision about the project. For example, the Board believed that the drawings should clearly show the size of the rooftop condensing units and a cut sheet should be provided. Similarly, the Board believed that a cut sheet on the window mullion details should be provided as well as additional details on the proposed canopy. Additionally, members suggested that the green color proposed for the window mullions be reconsidered in favor of a more background color.

SPEAKERS: Jim Heffner, Heffner Architects, project architect, spoke in support
Stephen Jordan, Land Design, project landscape architect, spoke in support

BOARD ACTION, JULY 16, 2003: The Board combined the discussion of docket item # s 28 & 29. On a motion by Mr. Keleher, seconded by Ms. Quill the Board deferred the application for restudy. The vote on the motion was 5-0.

REASON: The Board believed that the overall design was appropriate and had a texture with many subtle elements. However, the Board believed that addition time was necessary to evaluate the colors for the design which were presented at the meeting; that the rooftop mechanical equipment needed to be explicitly detailed and that consideration should be given to using the roof of the one story section of the building.

SPEAKERS: Jim Heffner, Heffner Architects, project architect, spoke in support
Stephen Jordan, Land Design, project landscape architect, spoke in support

There have been no changes to the Permit to Demolish/Capsulate since the public hearing of August 6, 2003 and Staff here repeats that Staff report.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends approval of the Permit to Demolish with the conditions that physical design detail elements to be determined at the discretion of the Director of the Lyceum are to be removed and deposited in the collections of the Lyceum in consultation with Staff of the Department of Planning & Zoning;

NOTE: This docket item requires a roll call vote.

DISCUSSION:

Applicant s Description of the Undertaking:

Remove existing signage, garage doors and miscellaneous architectural accessories. Remove existing windows and doors, modify existing openings and remove existing wall material. Remove existing mechanical equipment.

Issue:

The applicant is requesting approval of a Permit to Demolish portions of the commercial building at 200 South Peyton Street. The building currently houses the garage and workspace for the Katz automobile repair facility. The portions of the building that are proposed to be demolished include:

- " All existing windows and doors will be removed;
- " The garage doors will be removed;
- " The existing window opening on the second level on the north and south sides will be increased;
- " A section of the wall on the second level on the north end will be removed;
- " A section of the wall on the first level to the north of the garage doors will be removed;
- " A section beneath the window on the second level on the south side of the building will be removed; and,
- " A section beneath the window at the east end of the second story of the garage area will be removed.

History and Analysis:

200 South Peyton Street is a one and two story freestanding brick building that was constructed as and is currently used as an automobile repair facility and is located at the corner of South Peyton and Prince Street. It was originally constructed as an automobile service facility in 1960. The architect for the building was Hamilton Morton.

The Permit to Demolish is requested in conjunction with a proposal to convert the building to office use.

In considering a Permit to Demolish, the Board must consider the following criteria set forth in

the Zoning Ordinance, §10-105(B):

- (1) Is the building or structure of such architectural or historical interest that its moving, removing, capsulating or razing would be to the detriment of the public interest?
- (2) Is the building or structure of such interest that it could be made into a historic shrine?
- (3) Is the building or structure of such old and unusual or uncommon design, texture and material that it could not be reproduced or be reproduced only with great difficulty?
- (4) Would retention of the building or structure help preserve the memorial character of the George Washington Memorial Parkway?
- (5) Would retention of the building or structure help preserve and protect an historic place or area of historic interest in the city?
- (6) Would retention of the building or structure promote the general welfare by maintaining and increasing real estate values, generating business, creating new positions, attracting tourists, students, writers, historians, artists and artisans, attracting new residents, encouraging study and interest in American history, stimulating interest and study in architecture and design, educating citizens in American culture and heritage, and making the city a more attractive and desirable place in which to live?

Given the fact that the building dates from the mid-20th, it is the opinion of Staff, none of the criteria are met and the Permit to Demolish should be granted.

While it is the opinion of Staff that none of the criteria are met, Staff believes that artifacts remaining from the period of its original construction are important to the history of Alexandria and, accordingly, recommends that if such artifacts are remaining that they be donated to the Lyceum.

CITY DEPARTMENT COMMENTS

Legend: C - code requirement R - recommendation S - suggestion F - finding

Code Enforcement:

C-1 Prior to the issuance of a demolition permit or land disturbance permit, a rodent abatement plan shall be submitted to Code Enforcement that will outline the steps that will be taken to prevent the spread of rodents from the construction site to the surrounding community and sewers.

Historic Alexandria:

A very interesting and attractive project.