

Docket Item #10
BAR CASE #2003-0158

BAR Meeting
October 1, 2003

ISSUE: Replacement windows
APPLICANT: Lowell Williams
LOCATION: 1417 King Street
ZONE: CD/ Commercial Downtown

BOARD ACTION, AUGUST 6, 2003: On a motion by Dr. Fitzgerald, seconded by Mr. Keleher the Board deferred the application for restudy. The vote on the motion was 5-0.

REASON: Pastor Williams said that the Church proposed to use vinyl windows for replacement because of the price difference between wood windows. The Board believed that vinyl windows on King Street were inappropriate, but suggested that perhaps a compromise could be developed whereby the windows on King Street would be retained as wood and then an alternative window could be used on the side and rear of the house. The Board asked the applicant to work with Staff to develop a compromise solution.

SPEAKER: Lowell Williams, Pastor, spoke in support
Charles Jefferies, Chairman, Building Committee, spoke in support

JULY 16, 2003: Deferred for lack of public notification.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends denial of the application.

DISCUSSION:

Update:

On September 4, 2003 Staff inspected the windows at 1417 King Street, finding all except one window on the west side to be in good condition. In addition, subsequent to the site visit, the applicant informed Staff that the vinyl replacement windows had already been purchased and provided a copy of a sales contract which is included in the Board packet. The applicant now proposes to retain the front windows and replace those on the rear and both sides of the detached building.

Applicant's Description of the Undertaking:

Replace windows.

Issue:

The applicant proposes to retain, repair and repaint the windows at the front of the building, facing King Street and requests approval of a certificate of appropriateness for the installation of vinyl replacement windows on the rear and west and east sides. The applicant proposes to install Napco Window System's Premium Series 2000 windows. According to the applicant the vinyl windows will be six-over-one sash like the existing wood windows. The materials provided do not indicate whether the muntins are internal or exterior grids. As stated above, Staff found the windows to be in surprisingly good condition. One first story window on the west side has already been replaced with an inappropriate vinyl slider. One second story window on the west side had suffered water damage and was deteriorated.

History and Analysis:

1417 King Street is a 2 1/2 story brick, semi-detached rowhouse which was constructed between 1921 and 1941, according to the Sanborn Insurance maps, and has elements of the Craftsman style in its design.

In 1993, the Board approved a sign for the Alleyne AME Zion Church (BAR Case #93-31, 3/3/93). In 1992, Code mandated alterations to the entrances of the building at 1417 King Street were approved by the Board (BAR #92-198, 10/21/92).

The proposed replacement windows comply with zoning ordinance requirements.

Windows are a principal character defining feature of a building and serve both functional and aesthetic purposes. A central tenet of the philosophy of historic preservation is that original historic material should be retained and repaired rather than replaced. In the opinion of Staff, the original wood windows at 1417 King Street remain functional and add to the integrity and interest of the early 20th century building. While pleased that the applicant has agreed to retain the wood windows on the front, Staff is unable to recommend replacement of the other wood

windows which are original and in good condition. In addition, the west side and rear windows are readily visible from King Street and from the alley behind the building. Finally, Staff notes that the proposed vinyl windows are inappropriate for the early twentieth century building, when only wood or metal windows would have been available, and that the *Design Guidelines* discourage the use of vinyl windows in the historic districts in general (Windows - page 2).

Therefore, Staff recommends that the application for replacement windows be denied.

CITY DEPARTMENT COMMENTS

Legend: C - code requirement R - recommendation S - suggestion F - finding

Code Enforcement:

No comments

Office of Historic Alexandria:

Wood is preferable