

Docket Item #13
BAR Case #2003-0239

BAR Meeting
November 5, 2003

ISSUE: Addition and alterations
APPLICANT: Michael Margiotta
LOCATION: 217 North Saint Asaph Street
ZONE: RM/Residential

BOARD ACTION, OCTOBER 15, 2003: On a motion by Mr. Keleher, seconded by Ms. Nekhardt the Board deferred the application for restudy. The vote on the motion was 6-0.

REASON: The Board agreed with the Staff analysis and believed that the windows on the historic main block should be true divided light 6-over-6 wood windows; that the skylight should not be on the flounder section but should be on the new addition; that the windows on the addition should be differentiated from those on the historic main block; that a standing seam metal roof should be installed on the flounder; that asphalt shingle for roofing was appropriate for the new addition; and that reuse of the original wood siding on the front of the historic main block was appropriate.

SPEAKERS: Charles Moore, Moore Architects, project architect, spoke in support
Michael Margiotta, homeowner, spoke in support

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends approval of the application for addition and alterations with the following conditions:

1. That the alterations to the ell in the area of the side entry be eliminated;
2. That the skylight have integral shades to be used at night; and,
3. That the following statement must appear in the General Notes of the site plan so that on-site contractors are aware of the requirement:

Call Alexandria Archaeology immediately (703-838-4399) if any buried structural remains (wall foundations, wells, privies, cisterns, etc.) or concentrations of artifacts are discovered during development. Work must cease in the area of the discovery until a City archaeologist comes to the site and records the finds.

NOTE: Docket item #12 must be approved before this docket item can be considered.

Update: The applicant has revised the plans to address several of the Board's concerns. The windows on the first story front elevation will be six-over-six configuration rather than nine-over-nine. The windows in the main block and rear ell (flounder) are to be single-glazed, true-divided-light wood windows with interior storms. The windows in the new addition will be insulated simulated divided light. The roof of the main block and rear ell will be standing seam metal, painted. The applicant continues to request removal of the existing recessed entryway to the rear ell and enclosure of that area with a new wall. However, instead of being flush with the rest of the south wall of the ell, as previously proposed, the new wall will be held back 1'. The applicant is again requesting the installation of a skylight on the rear ell roof.

DISCUSSION:

Applicant's Description of the Undertaking:

Proposal to remove rear portion of house. Construct new 2-story addition/porch. Remove existing exterior faux-stone coating. Replace with restored/new wood siding. Replace vinyl windows with wood windows.

Issue:

The applicant is requesting approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness for a new rear addition and alterations to the existing house as described below:

Addition

The proposed two story rear addition will take the place of the existing rear one-and-a-half story addition. The existing addition has a footprint of 180 square feet. The proposed new addition will have a 487 square foot footprint. The new addition will have a gable roof similar in pitch to the existing main block and, like it, oriented with the ridgeline parallel to the street. The gable of the new addition will be 4 ½' lower than the gable of the existing main block at its highest point. A gable roofed, two story sunroom section will extend from the rear of the addition and a one story rear porch will extend from the sunroom addition. The addition will rest on a brick foundation, be clad in painted wood siding and will have a black asphalt shingle roof. All the

windows will be wood, simulated divided light windows.

The south side elevation of the addition will have a pair of nine-light casement windows centered in the first story and three evenly spaced six-over-six double hung windows in the second story. There will be a small four-light window in the attic story. At the east end of the addition will be the two story sunroom section, projecting six feet beyond the end of the addition. The sunroom will be composed of windows with painted wood panels below. According to the plans, the wood panels will be trimmed, but this level of detail is not depicted. The south side of the sunroom will have a pair of eight-light casement windows on each story. The sunroom section will cover the southernmost two thirds of the rear (east) elevation of the addition. The northern bay will have a small four-light casement in the first story and a narrow four-over-four double hung window in the second story. The sunroom section will have multi-light doors on either end with a pair of nine-light casement windows between them and wood panel below. The second story of the sunroom section will have four casement windows ganged together. The outer two will be six-light will the center two will be nine-light. The north elevation of the addition will be clad in wood siding and will be blind. The sunroom section will have a pair of eight-light windows in the first story and a pair of six-light windows in the second story. These are not shown as casement and are presumed to be fixed. A shed roof porch, slightly wider than the sunroom section will project from the rear wall of the addition and extend beyond the sunroom by approximately 2'4". It will be supported on wood columns and will rest on a 1 1/2' high wood deck which will extend well beyond the porch into the back yard.

Alterations to Existing House

The faux-stone stucco finish will be removed from all but the north side of the house. Existing wood siding will be salvaged and reinstalled on the front facade of the house. Elsewhere, new painted wood siding will be installed to match the original. The stucco will be removed from the original brick foundation and it will be repointed and painted. The existing c. 1938 front stoop will be replaced with a new, slightly deeper, brick stoop with a simple metal handrail with lambs tongue return. The brick stoop is to be painted to match the foundation. The chimneys will also have the stucco removed and will be repointed and painted. The chimney at the east end of the rear ell will be extended as necessary to meet code. It is assumed that the addition to the chimney will match the brickwork of the existing. The existing asphalt roof is to be removed and replaced with a painted standing seam metal roof. New half round gutters will be installed as needed. A 27" by 21" Velux skylight is proposed for the south sloping roof of the rear ell. All existing windows in the house, which are modern vinyl windows with sandwich muntins, are proposed to be replaced with single-glazed, true-divided-light double hung wood windows with interior storm panels. Nearly all the windows will be six-over-six. At the Board's suggestion, the larger first story front windows which had been shown as nine-over-nine on the previous plans are now six-over-six. The window trim, which is currently wrapped in vinyl, will be replaced with new wood trim and sills.

The existing side entrance in the inset portion of the rear ell on the first story will be removed and the wall will be brought forward to within 1' of the rest of the south wall of the ell. There will be a paneled wood door with two lights in the east side of the new wall section and a small four-light window at the west side. The wood and masonry porch formerly proposed for this location has been eliminated. Instead there will be a flat stoop with step between the entry and

the side yard. An existing side door at the west end of the ell will be replaced with a six-over-six window to match the other windows on the ell.

Site

New HVAC units will be located on the north side of the new sunroom section, where they will not be visible from the public right-of-way. As explained above, a low wooden deck will extend into the rear yard. A brick planter and wooden trellis will extend along the south wall of the addition. It will have wooden columns and will be 10' high. The existing 6' high fence along the south property line adjoining the parking lot and the arched wooden gate at the front will remain.

The south side and rear (east) of the house at 217 North Saint Asaph Street is highly visible due to the open parking lot which extends from the south property line to Cameron Street. The rear of the house is also visible from Pitt Street through a short east-west alley at the end of the property.

History and Analysis:

As discussed in docket item #12, the Greek Revival influenced, two story, gable roofed, frame house with flounder form rear ell is thought to date to the early to mid-19th century. It has had little change to its basic form through the years. However, it has been subject to a number of superficial alterations in the 20th century, including the application of stucco siding, replacement of the metal roof with asphalt and replacement of the wood windows with vinyl. There is no record of Board review of alterations to the property.

The proposed addition and alterations comply with the zoning ordinance requirements.

As stated in the previous report, Staff believes the proposed addition conforms to the *Design Guidelines* and is generally acceptable. It is respectful of the historic building in its size, massing and materials. Staff also commends the proposed renovation project, which will enhance the historic character of the existing house. For the most part, the applicant has complied with the Board's comments at the October 15, 2002 hearing. The windows on the first story front elevation will now be six-over-six rather than nine-over-nine. The windows in the main block and rear ell (flounder) are to be single glazed true divided light wood windows with interior storms, while those in the new addition will be insulated simulated divided light. This will ensure that the historic portion of the house has historically appropriate windows and should provide a subtle distinction between the new and historic parts of the building. The roof of the main block and rear ell now is to be standing seam metal, in accordance with the Board's policy on replacement roofs for historic buildings.

While the applicant did not relocate or eliminate the skylight as the Board had suggested at the previous hearing, Staff does not oppose its installation on the roof of the flounder. It is located on the side of the house. It is the smallest available size and will be in a finish to match the roof. As noted by at least one Board member, skylights were not unheard of in the 19th century. Staff does recommend that the skylight have integral shades to limit the amount of light emitted at night.

Thus, Staff has only one remaining concern. As discussed in docket item #12, Staff continues to believe that the existing side entranceway is an original early to mid-19th century entrance and that it should be retained in place and the proposed alterations in this area omitted. While Staff appreciates that the revised design leaves a 1' recess in this area as a nod to the original footprint, Staff does not believe this compromise is particularly effective in communicating what was there and it will still entail the removal of a presumed original mid-19th century entrance.

To conclude, Staff recommends approval of the application with the following conditions:

1. That the skylight have integral shades to be used at night;
2. That the alterations to the ell in the area of the side entry be eliminated; and,

Lastly, Staff notes the comments of Alexandria Archeology and recommends that they be included as a condition of the approval.

CITY DEPARTMENT COMMENTS

Legend: C - code requirement R - recommendation S - suggestion F- finding

Code Enforcement:

- C-1 All exterior walls within 3 feet from an interior property line shall have a fire resistance rating of 1 hour, from both sides, with no openings permitted within the wall. As alternative, a 2 hour fire wall may be provided.
- C-2 Prior to the issuance of a demolition permit or land disturbance permit, a rodent abatement plan shall be submitted to Code Enforcement that will outline the steps that will taken to prevent the spread of rodents from the construction site to the surrounding community and sewers.
- C-3 Roof drainage systems must be installed so as neither to impact upon, nor cause erosion/damage to adjacent property.
- C-4 A soils report must be submitted with the building permit application.
- C-5 New construction must comply with the current edition of the Uniform Statewide Building Code (USBC).
- C-6 Alterations to the existing structure must comply with the current edition of the Uniform Statewide Building Code (USBC).
- C-7 Construction permits are required for this project. Plans shall accompany the permit application that fully detail the construction as well as layouts and schematics of the mechanical, electrical, and plumbing systems.
- C-8 Permission from adjacent property owners is required if access to the adjacent properties is required to complete the proposed construction. Otherwise, a plan shall be submitted to demonstrate the construction techniques utilized to keep construction solely on the referenced property.
- C-9 A wall location plat prepared by a land surveyor is required to be submitted to this office prior to requesting any framing inspection.

Historic Alexandria:

Generally I am extremely pleased to see this project removal of faux stone, windows, general upgrade of appearance.

Alexandria Archaeology:

- F-1 According to Ethelyn Cox s *Historic Alexandria, Virginia, Street by Street, A Survey of Existing Early Buildings*, a structure was built on this lot during the 19th century. The property is also adjacent to the McVeigh Hospital lot, which was utilized by the Union

Army during the Civil War. The property therefore has the potential to yield archaeological resources which could provide insight into domestic and military activities in 19th-century Alexandria.

- R-1 Call Alexandria Archaeology immediately (703-838-4399) if any buried structural remains (wall foundations, wells, privies, cisterns, etc.) or concentrations of artifacts are discovered during development. Work must cease in the area of the discovery until a City archaeologist comes to the site and records the finds.
- R-2 The above statement must appear in the General Notes of the site plan so that on-site contractors are aware of the requirement.