

Docket Item #12  
BAR CASE #2003-0261

BAR Meeting  
November 19, 2003

**ISSUE:** Permit to Demolish/Capsulate  
**APPLICANT:** Stephen and Eileen Quatannens  
**LOCATION:** 217 South Alfred Street  
**ZONE:** CL/Commercial

---

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends approval of the application as submitted.

NOTE: This docket item requires a roll call vote.

DISCUSSION:

Applicant s Description of the Undertaking:

We seek to demolish the rear of the existing structure and add a two story addition. The plans as proposed also seek an addition of second story to existing one-story wing.

Issue:

The applicant is requesting approval of a Permit to Demolish to remove the existing one story rear ell, to demolish/capsulate most of the west (rear) wall of the existing main block and to demolish/capsulate a portion of the rear slope of the roof on the main block. In addition, a small section of the south wall of the main block will be demolished/capsulated by the new second story addition.

History and Analysis:

217 South Alfred Street is a two story, three bay frame residence built prior to 1877. According to the building permit record, it was extensively renovated in 1936 (Permit #1960, 9/28/1936). The permit and accompanying plans call for the demolition and reconstruction of the one story kitchen wing at the rear of the house and for the application of brick veneer on the front, south side and rear sides. A subsequent permit from 1948 also calls for the application of brick siding to the frame dwelling at 217 South Alfred Street (Permit #8056, 2/2/1948). This request was approved by the Board of Architectural Review on 2/19/1948. The existing one story frame section on the south side appears to be the outgrowth of a concrete porch shown in the 1936. The 1941 Sanborn Fire Insurance map shows a one story frame addition in this same location. Thus, the present appearance and form of the building is seems to date to the period circa 1936 - 1948.

On October 4, 2000, the Board approved the demolition of a mid-20th century frame garage at the rear of 217 South Alfred Street (BAR Case #2000-210). On November 11, 2001, the Board approved plans for demolition/capsulation and a new two story rear addition (BAR Case #2001-163 & 164). That addition was not built and the applicants have now returned to the Board with entirely new plans.

In considering a Permit to Demolish/Capsulate, the Board must consider the following criteria set forth in the Zoning Ordinance, Sec. 10-105(B):

- (1) Is the building or structure of such architectural or historical interest that its moving, removing, capsulating or razing would be to the detriment of the public interest?
- (2) Is the building or structure of such interest that it could be made into a historic house?
- (3) Is the building or structure of such old and unusual or uncommon design, texture and material that it could not be reproduced or be reproduced only with great difficulty?
- (4) Would retention of the building or structure help preserve the memorial character of

the George Washington Memorial Parkway?

(5) Would retention of the building or structure help preserve and protect an historic place or area of historic interest in the city?

(6) Would retention of the building or structure promote the general welfare by maintaining and increasing real estate values, generating business, creating new positions, attracting tourists, students, writers, historians, artists and artisans, attracting new residents, encouraging study and interest in American history, stimulating interest and study in architecture and design, educating citizens in American culture and heritage, and making the city a more attractive and desirable place in which to live?

Staff does not believe the above criteria are met. The extent of demolition and capsulation proposed is reasonable and the mid-20<sup>th</sup> century alterations to the house somewhat reduce concerns about loss of historic fabric. The rear addition which will be removed dates to circa 1936. The rear wall of the main block which will be capsulated and/or demolished has been clad in brick veneer and partially capsulated by the existing addition. The second story addition on the south side will entail the capsulation and/or demolition of a relatively small portion of the south wall of the main block which has been clad in brick veneer. Lastly, Staff notes that in 2001 the Board approved even more extensive demolition/capsulation for the two story addition then proposed for 217 South Alfred Street. Therefore, Staff recommends that the Permit to Demolish be granted.

## CITY DEPARTMENT COMMENTS

Legend: C - code requirement R - recommendation S - suggestion F - finding

### Code Enforcement:

C-1 Prior to the issuance of a demolition permit or land disturbance permit, a rodent abatement plan shall be submitted to Code Enforcement that will outline the steps that will taken to prevent the spread of rodents from the construction site to the surrounding community and sewers.

### Historic Alexandria:

No comment.

### Alexandria Archaeology

F-1 A G.M. Hopkins insurance map indicates that a structure was present on this property by 1877. The demolition therefore has the potential to expose archaeological resources which have the potential to provide insight into domestic activities in nineteenth-century Alexandria.

R-1 Call Alexandria Archaeology immediately (703-838-4399) if any buried structural remains (wall foundations, wells, privies, cisterns, etc.) or concentrations of artifacts are discovered during development. Work must cease in the area of discovery until a City archaeologist comes to the site and records the finds.

R-2 The above statement must appear in the General Notes of the site plan so that on-site contractors are aware of the requirement.