

Docket Item #8
BAR Case #2003-0265

BAR Meeting
December 3, 2003

ISSUE: Alterations to rear porch

APPLICANT: Jeffrey & Kathryn Wainscott

LOCATION: 423 North Columbus Street

ZONE: RM/Residential

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends approval of the application with the following conditions:

1. That the nails not show in the installation of the fiber cement siding;
2. That smooth (not wood grain) fiber cement siding be installed; and,
3. That Staff review and approved the solid PVC shutters prior to installation.

NOTE: Docket item #7 must be approved before this docket item may be considered.

DISCUSSION:

Applicant s Description of the Undertaking:

This porch involves enclosing an existing 2 story covered porch. The 1st floor is enclosed with screen panels, the second floor enclosed with walls/windows. The roof is existing.

Issue:

The applicant is requesting approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness for alterations to the rear porch. The existing footprint and gable roof of the two story porch will remain. On the first story, the wooden railings will be removed and the porch will be enclosed on three sides with screen panels on wooden frames. A double leaf screen door will be located in the center of the east (alley) elevation. The second story will be clad in fiber cement lap siding with a 7" exposure. The north and south sides will each have a pair of PVC shutters set in a wood trimmed frame, to appear as if they are shuttered openings. The east (alley) elevation will have three pairs of casement windows. The windows will be vinyl clad and will be fully glazed. The applicant has explained to Staff that the rear of the house is subject to moisture problems and thus maintenance free materials have been proposed for the porch alteration.

The rear of the house at 423 North Columbus Street is visible from a public alley behind the property. Views of the porch and back of the house on the first story are for the most part blocked by an existing wood fence, while the second story is more visible.

History and Analysis:

The two story brick house at 423 North Columbus Street was constructed circa 1884 and the existing rear addition with two story wood porch was constructed circa 1986.

The proposed porch alterations comply with the zoning ordinance requirements.

Staff regrets the loss of the existing porch which is attractive. However, Staff believes the proposed alteration is compatible with the rear elevations of the adjacent properties and generally complies with the *Design Guidelines*. The proposed second story enclosure will be clad in fiber cement siding. The Board has adopted the following policy with respect to the product:

1. That fiber cement siding not be installed on an historic structure;
2. That historic materials should not be removed to install fiber cement siding;

3. That fiber cement siding replace other artificial or composite siding;
4. That the nails not show in the installation of the siding; and,
5. That smooth siding be installed.
6. That BAR Staff may administratively approve the installation of fiber cement siding on *non-historic* buildings (those constructed in 1975 or later).

As discussed above, the rear addition and porch were constructed in 1986 and thus the use of fiber cement siding is appropriate as long as conditions 4 & 5 are adhered to in the installation of the siding. The Board generally discourages the use of vinyl clad windows. However, Staff believes vinyl clad windows are acceptable in this situation as they are not readily visible to the public, located on the second floor at the rear of a modern addition on a dead end alley. Lastly, the Board discourages the use of shutters made of synthetic materials. However, the Board previously determined that *solid* PVC shutters *may* be acceptable for use on new construction. Staff believes solid PVC shutters would be acceptable in this application but requests an opportunity to review and approve a cut sheet or a sample shutter before installation. To conclude, Staff recommends approval of the application with the following conditions:

1. That the nails not show in the installation of the fiber cement siding;
2. That smooth (not wood grain) fiber cement siding be installed; and,
3. That Staff review and approved the solid PVC shutters prior to installation.

CITY DEPARTMENT COMMENTS

Legend: C - code requirement R - recommendation S - suggestion F- finding

Code Enforcement:

- C-1 All exterior walls within 3 feet from an interior property line shall have a fire resistance rating of 1 hour, from both sides, with no openings permitted within the wall. As alternative, a 2 hour fire wall may be provided. This condition is applicable to porches with roofs and skylights within the setback distance.
- C-2 New construction must comply with the current edition of the Uniform Statewide Building Code (USBC).
- C-3 Alterations to the existing structure must comply with the current edition of the Uniform Statewide Building Code (USBC).
- C-4 Construction permits are required for this project. Plans shall accompany the permit application that fully detail the construction as well as layouts and schematics of the mechanical, electrical, and plumbing systems.

Historic Alexandria:

No comment.