Docket Item #7 BAR CASE #2004-0197

BAR Meeting November 17, 2004

ISSUE: After-the-fact review of shed, trellis and fencing

APPLICANT: Gary Smith

LOCATION: 321 Queen Street

ZONE: RM/Residential

BOARD ACTION, SEPTEMBER 23, 2004: On a motion by Ms. Neihardt, seconded by Mr. Smeallie the Board deferred the application for restudy for a redesign of the trellis, shed and fencing that were not as tall as the existing.

The vote on the motion was 5-0.

REASON: The Board did not agree with the Staff analysis. The Board agreed with the neighbors that all elements of the application - the trellis, the shed and the fencing – were too tall and needed to be reduced in size. The Board believed that the project should be rethought and accommodations with the neighbors reached regarding the various elements of the project.

SPEAKERS: Mary Jean Smith, homeowner, spoke in support

Gary Smith, homeowner, spoke in support

Michael Myback, 325 Queen Street, spoke in opposition Gebe Johnson, 309 North Royal Street, spoke in opposition Kevin Johnson, 309 North Royal Street, spoke in opposition

Becky Squires, 313 Queen Street, spoke in opposition

Dennis Jamison, 311 North Royal Street, spoke in opposition Lawrence O'Connor, 207 South Lee Street, spoke in opposition

Michael Hobbs, President, Old Town Civic Association, spoke in opposition

<u>Update</u>: The applicant has revised the design of the existing shed, fence and trellis to reduce their overall visibility.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends approval of the application as submitted.

I. Issue:

The applicant is requesting approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness for after-the-fact construction of a wood shed, trellis and fencing at the rear of the residential property at 321 Queen Street.

Shed

The wood shed that has been constructed is one story and measures 10.25' x 6.25'. Its overall height is proposed to be reduced by approximately 2'9" from an existing height of 10.25' to a new height of 7.5'. The roof form has been revised and instead of a gable a sloping flat roof is proposed. It will continue to have standing seam metal roof. The shed has multi-light wood windows and a board on board wood door. The shed siding will be stained a gray color.

Trellis

The wood rafters of the existing trellis will be removed and replaced with steel wire to facilitate plant growth. Thus, the overall height of the wood trellis will be reduced by approximately 8". The trellis will be stained a gray color.

Fencing

The new wood board on board fencing replaced deteriorated stockade fencing. The fence is constructed of 8' sections of 1x6 cedar boards between 6x6 wood posts. The southern section of the will be reduced in height by approximately 1', reducing the height of this section of the fence to just over 5' in height. The fence is proposed to be stained with an opaque white stain.

II. History

321 Queen Street is one of four attached two story, three bay townhouses (along with 325, 323 and 319) built in 1818 by Presley Barker and James McGuire (Ethelyn Cox, *Alexandria Street by Street*, p. 142).

III. Analysis

Proposed alterations comply with Zoning Ordinance requirements.

Staff has not located any records of previous Board actions with respect to this property.

Staff believes that the shed, trellis and fencing are appropriate and meet the recommendations of the *Design Guidelines*. In the opinion of Staff, the proposed changes are appropriate and will contribute to a diminution of the overall mass of construction in the rear yard. Staff continues to be aware of the concerns of the surrounding neighbors. However, Staff believes that the changes proposed are a significant compromise that will serve to lessen the visual impact of the construction that has already taken place. Staff continues to believe that the design of the shed,

trellis and fence is appropriate and recommends approval.

IV. <u>Staff Recommendation</u>
Staff recommends approval of the application as submitted.

CITY DEPARTMENT COMMENTS

Legend: C - code requirement R - recommendation S - suggestion F - finding

Code Enforcement:

F-1 A construction permit is required for the Pergola. Construction shall comply with the current addition of the USBC.

Historic Alexandria:

No comment.