

Docket Item #7
BAR CASE# 2004-0272

BAR Meeting
January 19, 2005

ISSUE: Alterations
APPLICANT: Diana Kuo
LOCATION: 800 South Royal Street
ZONE: RM/Residential

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends approval of the application with the following conditions:

- 1) that the windows are wood, true divided light; and
- 2) that the shutters are omitted.

I. ISSUE:

The applicant is requesting approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness to change the paired french doors on the rear (east) elevation of an 1986 addition to windows. The proposed six-over-six, paired windows will match the existing windows directly above in the second story. Although not indicated on the drawings, the applicant has confirmed that the new double hung windows will be wood and will have true divided lights. As with the existing windows, the window sills will consist of a brick soldier course and the windows will be framed with a single wood panel shutter on each side. It is assumed that the shutters will be fixed, like those on the addition, rather than hinged. The area below the window will be infilled with brick to match the existing. Although it is not indicated on the drawings, it is assumed that the infilled area will be painted to match the rest of the house. The area to be infilled is less than 25 square feet and thus does not require Board approval of a demolition permit.

Although the rear yard and side yard are enclosed with a brick wall, the rear of the house is readily visible from Franklin Street due to the topography of the area.

II. HISTORY:

800 South Royal Street is a two story brick end unit rowhouse that is part of the Yates Garden subdivision and was built in 1952, according to the City's real estate records. The house was designed in a stripped down Colonial Revival style. In 1986 the Board approved the design for a rear addition for the property (BAR Case #86-73, 5/7/1986). In 1993 the Board gave after-the-fact approval for the hot tub gazebo in the rear yard (BAR Case #93-170, 11/3/1993).

III. ANALYSIS:

The proposed alterations comply with zoning ordinance requirements.

Staff believes the proposed alterations are generally acceptable. The alterations will occur at the rear of the 1986 addition. The new paired windows will match the existing windows above and are compatible with the design of the original house and later addition. However, the proposed shutters are non functional in two respects and therefore do not conform to the *Design Guidelines*. According to the *Design Guidelines*, “[w]indow and door shutters should be hinged and operable” and “[d]ecorative window and door shutters that are not operable are strongly discouraged” (Shutters - Page 1). The *Guidelines* go on to state that:

It is not necessary to have shutters on every opening; however, where provided, window and door shutters should be the appropriate size and shape for the opening. For example shutters should be capable of covering the entire door or window opening when closed (Shutters - Page 2).

The shutters on the proposed paired windows are assumed to be fixed and are insufficient to

cover the openings. Hinges could be added to make the shutters operable, but the two additional shutters that would be necessary to cover the opening could not possibly fit at the center of the paired configuration. Staff notes that the existing shutters on the 1986 addition do not conform to the *Guidelines* for the same reasons as the proposed. There were no shutters on the BAR approved plans for this addition and no subsequent approvals were found for the existing shutters. Rather than match the non-complying and apparently unapproved shutters, Staff recommends that the proposed new windows have no shutters.

IV. STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Therefore, Staff recommends approval of the application with the following conditions:

- 1) that the windows are wood, true divided light; and
- 2) that the shutters are omitted.

CITY DEPARTMENT COMMENTS

Legend: C - code requirement R - recommendation S - suggestion F- finding

Code Enforcement:

- C-1 New construction must comply with the current edition of the Uniform Statewide Building Code (USBC).
- C-2 Alterations to the existing structure must comply with the current edition of the Uniform Statewide Building Code (USBC).
- C-3 Construction permits are required for this project. Plans shall accompany the permit application that fully detail the construction as well as layouts and schematics of the mechanical, electrical, and plumbing systems.

Office of Historic Alexandria:

No specifications on the window and trim materials. Will they be wood?