Docket Item #4 BAR CASE #2002-0300

BAR Meeting February 2, 2005

ISSUE:	Alterations and replacement windows
APPLICANT:	Miles Properties, Inc.
LOCATION:	718, 722, 820A, 820B, 906 & 922 South Washington Street and 719 South St. Asaph Street
ZONE:	RCX/Residential

BOARD ACTION, FEBRUARY 5, 2003: On a motion by Dr. Fitzgerald, seconded by Mr. Wheeler the Board deferred the application for restudy. The vote on the motion was 6-0.

REASON: The Board believed that consideration should be given to repairing rather than replacing the windows. Mr. Wheeler noted that the exterior wood trim is in very good shape, but that the windows needed attention. He also noted that the buildings face onto the George Washington Memorial Parkway. The Chairman asked that, if replacement windows are proposed, a full sized window should be displayed rather than a window sample.

SPEAKERS: Richard Downs, apartment manager, Archstone- Smith, spoke in support Kevin Gallagher, Professional Maintenance Management, spoke in support Paul Mansour, contractor, spoke in support

BOARD ACTION, DECEMBER 18, 2002: The chairman called the question on the Staff recommendation which was: deferral of the application for restudy. The vote on the motion was 7-0.

REASON: Mr. Downs noted that windows would be replaced in a total of 122 units, not the 158 noted in the Staff report. The Board believed that consideration should be given to repairing rather than replacing the windows and that exterior muntins were more appropriate than the internal grids proposed by the applicant.

SPEAKERS: Richard Downs, apartment manager, Archstone- Smith, spoke in support Kevin Gallagher, Professional Maintenance Management, spoke in support <u>Update</u>: This case was last heard by the Board in February 2002. Since that time the properties have been sold and are being converted to condominiums. This application concerns upgrades and alterations to the buildings for this conversion.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends approval of the application as submitted.

I. <u>ISSUE</u>:

The applicant is requesting approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness for alterations and replacement windows for the multi-family residential buildings located at 718, 722, 820A, 820B, 906 & 922 South Washington Street and 719 S. St. Asaph Street which are being converted to condominiums.

Replacement Windows

The applicant is requesting approval to replace the existing wood windows at 718, 722, 906 and 922 South Washington Street and at 719 South St. Asaph Street. These windows currently are double hung, true divided light wood windows and most have a six-over-six configuration. It is likely that many are the original windows. The windows now proposed will be single light cellular composite windows. The windows will have a white finish. A sample window will be available at the hearing for Board inspection. The proposed replacement project includes wrapping the existing wood window frames in aluminum.

The applicant has installed a number of proposed replacement windows types in the courtyard of 906 South Washington Street and members are urged to view these installed window types.

Replacement Roofing

The existing roofs at 718, 722, 820A, 820B, 906 and 922 South Washington Street and at 719 South St. Asaph Street are proposed to be replaced with new architectural asphalt shingles.

New Mechanical Units for Heating and Air Conditioning

New through the wall mechanical units are proposed to be installed below the windows at the buildings at 906 and 922 South Washington Street.

II. HISTORY:

Now known as the Boulevard of Old Town Apartments, the complex consists of seven multifamily rental apartment buildings in the 700, 800 and 900 blocks of South Washington Street with a leasing office located at 906 South Washington Street that date from the late 1940s. The buildings at 820A and 820B South Washington Street (actually located on Green Street) were renovated in the 1980s with beige aluminum windows.

While all of the buildings in the Boulevard Apartment complex are set back from the street, they form a significant and highly visible component of lower Washington Street.

The Boulevard Apartments are among a number of garden apartment complexes constructed in

Alexandria at the north and south ends of Washington Street from the late 1930s through approximately 1950. Although initially constructed as three separate developments, each group of buildings composing the Boulevard shares attributes common to Alexandria's early garden apartments, including generous setbacks and low red brick buildings with Colonial Revival detailing.

At the December 4, 2002 hearing, the Board approved refacing the existing signs at the Boulevard Apartments (BAR Case #2002-0056). Staff was unable to locate records of prior BAR decisions for the buildings composing the Boulevard Apartments. In 1996, the Board did approve the replacement of multi-light wood windows at the Monticello Courts Apartments at 800 A, B, C & D South Washington Street with one-over-one aluminum windows (BAR Case #96-52, 3/20/96).

The proposed window replacement complies with zoning ordinance requirements.

III. ANALYSIS:

Replacement Windows

As noted in the Design Guidelines, windows are a principal character-defining feature of a building and thus particular care must be taken to ensure that their treatment is appropriate to the character of the building. In large and relatively unornamented buildings such as these, the windows have even greater importance. The Guidelines discourage the use of aluminum windows (as well as vinyl, vinyl-clad and metal-clad windows) for new or replacement windows in the historic district. The preferred window type is true divided light wood windows. Although "panning" or covering wood window frames and trim in another material not specifically addressed in the Design Guidelines, it can be inferred that this treatment is discouraged. In this instance, however, Staff, after viewing the sample windows that have been installed, believes that the proposed cellular composite windows are relatively wood windows, especially since all of these buildings have generous street setbacks and the windows can only be viewed at a distance from the public right-of-way. Further, Staff believes that this type of replacement windows is not inappropriate for mid-20th multi-family purpose built buildings which were normally constructed with off-the-shelf products for the reasons of both speed of construction and cost. The Board approved one-over-one replacement windows at a similar garden apartment complex, the Monticello-Lee Apartments, in the 800 block of South Washington Street. In the opinion of Staff, this type of window is acceptable for mid-20th century garden apartment complexes. Therefore, Staff finds the proposed replacement windows acceptable.

Replacement Roofing

Staff has not objection to replacing the existing roofs at 718, 722, 820A, 820B, 906 and 922 South Washington Street and at 719 South St. Asaph Street with architectural asphalt shingles. This type of roofing material is historically appropriate to the period of construction of these buildings.

New Mechanical Units for Heating and Air Conditioning

Staff also has no objection to the through the wall mechanical units at 906 and 922 South Washington Street. With garden style apartment such as these, this type of unit is often the only available means to provide or upgrade the existing heating and air conditioning system. Thus, the Board has approved the installation of such units at a number of these complexes on Washington Street during the last fifteen years including at Hunting Towers, Old Town Gardens and Potowmack Crossing. In this instance, the applicant has examined a number of other options for heating and air conditioning requirements for individual units but has found that other methods are more intrusive than the through the wall units being proposed.

IV. STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Thus, Staff recommends approval of the application as submitted.

CITY DEPARTMENT COMMENTS

Legend: C - code requirement R - recommendation S - suggestion F - finding

<u>Code Enforcement:</u> No comments.

Office of Historic Alexandria: Prefer wood not vinyl.