Docket Item #10 BAR CASE #2005-0244

BAR Meeting November 2, 2005

ISSUE: Replacement windows and new storm door

APPLICANT: John Bernard Murphy

LOCATION: 622 South Lee Street

ZONE: RM/Residential

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends approval of the application with the following conditions:

- 1. That the existing second story windows either be restored or replaced with new true divided light wood windows;
- 2. That any replacement windows be approved by Staff prior to installation; and,
- 3. That the storm door be deferred for restudy.

I. ISSUE:

The applicant is seeking approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness for alterations to the residential house at 622 South Lee Street. The alterations include replacing the three second level windows on the front elevation as well as the second story window on the south side elevation. The windows are proposed to be replaced with new double hung six-over-six simulated divided light wood windows with 7/8" muntins and spacer bars.

The applicant is also requesting approval of a new storm door at the front entrance. The proposed door is a louvered wood door constructed of poplar and painted black to match the color of the front door and shutters.

II. HISTORY:

622 South Lee Street is a three bay brick residential rowhouse constructed in 1968. It has a two story height on South Lee Street and three stories on the rear because of a change in the topography.

In 1997, the Board approved a number of alterations to the building including the addition of louvered shutters on the front elevation, a new six panel front door with a new door surround and transom (BAR Case #97-94/95, 5/7/97).

III. ANALYSIS:

Windows are character defining features of buildings within the historic district. This mid 20th century property was constructed with true divided light windows. The *Design Guidelines* recommend that windows have true divided lights. The *Guidelines* further state that "windows with fixed or applied muntins have been approved for the rear elevation of a structure which has minimal visibility from the public right of way" (Windows - Page 2). In several cases, the Board has approved the use of simulated divided lights, but in cases where the property was well set back from the street. In this case, the windows are close to the street and if approved, will not match the first story windows. Staff suggests that the applicant explore repair and weatherstripping of the original windows. Since 622 South Lee Street is not a historic building, Staff can support the installation of new true divided light windows to match the existing windows if they cannot be repaired.

The *Design Guidelines* recommend that storm doors be very simple and open (Exterior Doors - Page 3). However, louvered doors are found throughout the Old & Historic Alexandria District. While Staff has no objection to the use of a louvered door on this property, Staff believes that the actual design should be restudied. The proposed single louvered door is not prevalent in Alexandria's architectural design vocabulary.

The louvered doors found throughout the district are generally double doors in various designs. The various configurations include a combination of louvers and solid panels, alternating sections of vertical and horizontal louvers, and a variety of different heights with some doors extending over their transoms. Due to the large number of different design solutions for the louvered doors, Staff believes that the doors should be deferred for restudy. Staff suggests that the applicant take a look at the 100 to 300 blocks of South Lee Street to witness the different possibilities.

IV. STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Therefore, Staff recommends approval of the application with the following conditions:

- 1. That the existing second story windows either be restored or replaced with new true divided light wood windows;
- 2. That any replacement windows be approved by Staff prior to installation; and,
- 3. That the storm door be deferred for restudy.

CITY DEPARTMENT COMMENTS

Legend: C - code requirement R - recommendation S - suggestion F- finding

<u>Code Enforcement</u>:

No comments.

<u>Historic Alexandria</u>: "Would prefer true divided lite"