Docket Item #7 BAR CASE #2005-0298

BAR Meeting January 18, 2006

ISSUE:	Alterations
APPLICANT:	James & Megan Sipes
LOCATION:	112 Quay Street
ZONE:	RM/Residential

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends approval of the application as submitted

<u>NOTE</u>: Docket item #6 must be approved before this docket item may be considered.

I. <u>ISSUE</u>:

The applicant is requesting approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace the existing glass and metal "cupola" or dormer and balcony at the rear in the attic story with a new frame gable roofed dormer and to make various minor alterations on the flat portion of the roof. The three story brick faced house appears to have a gable roof, but the roof actually has sloped faces at the front and rear and a flat center portion. The alterations are described below:

Dormer

The proposed new dormer is located on the rear slope and extends into the flat center portion of the roof. The proposed dormer will be 16' wide, 11' deep and 9.5' high. The footprint and location of the new dormer is similar to the existing except that it is approximately 3' deeper, extending farther down the sloped portion and back into the flat portion of the roof. While the existing dormer projects approximately 3'8" above the roofline, the proposed dormer will only project approximately 2' above. The dormer will have a bank of three paired casement wood windows across its front with a triangular casement at each side. The windows will be wood, French Casemaster by Marvin. The trim and exterior cladding will be wood and synthetic wood. The cladding, trim and window sash will be painted a cream color to match the existing. The flat roof of the dormer will be clad in rubber membrane roofing and will not be visible. A projecting cornice will be located on the front of the dormer at the roofline. A pre-finished aluminum gutter will be located on the front of the dormer with a downspout left hand side. The existing slate on the sloped section of the roof will remain.

Other alterations

The existing roof hatch, located on the flat center portion of the roof will be closed in and a new roof hatch/skylight will be installed several feet closer to the center of the roof.

The rear of the house and the proposed dormer will be at least partially visible from Quay, Union and Queen Streets. Although no sight lines were provided, it appears that the dormer will not be visible when standing directly in front of the house. The skylight/roof hatch will not be visible.

II: HISTORY:

As discussed in docket item #6, the three story, interior end unit dwelling at 112 Quay Street is a one of a group of 86 three-story brick townhouses bounded by North Union, North Lee, Queen and Oronoco Streets which were constructed in 1971. This area was not included in the Old and Historic Alexandria District between the late 1960s and June of 1984. Therefore, a number of alterations were made to individual townhouses during this period without B.A.R. review. Many of these changes would not be considered architecturally appropriate today. The prefabricated, glass and metal "dormer" at the rear of 112 Quay Street was added in 1984 and was not reviewed by the B.A.R. (Permit #39810, 4/24/84).

Since the inclusion of the area in the historic district, the Board has reviewed many cases in the development, including several on Quay Street, where the subject property is located. The Board has expressed concern about the impact of the rooftop alterations, but has also approved a number of substantial alterations and additions to the properties within this development. These alterations have included rear additions, several roof top decks, as well as new dormers. These are not historic buildings, but are compatible with the overall character of the historic district and the additions, alterations and roof decks have generally had limited visibility from the public right-of-way.

On September 3, 2003, the Board approved a Permit to Demolish and Certificate of Appropriateness for the removal of the existing dormer and balcony and construction of a new dormer and roof deck (BAR Case #s 2003-176 & 177). The project was never undertaken and the applicant is seeking re-approval of the previously approved applications. The current application differs from the 2003 submission in that it does not include the roof deck and that the dormer extends slightly further down the rear slope of the roof, resulting in additional area beneath the windows.

III. ANALYSIS:

The proposed rear dormer complies with zoning regulations.

Staff believes the rear dormer and alterations are acceptable. The currently proposed dormer is nearly identical to that approved in 2003 and is visually more compatible with the house and neighborhood than the existing dormer. Lastly, the dormer will have very limited visibility from the public right-of-way.

IV. STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff recommends approval of the application as submitted

CITY DEPARTMENT COMMENTS

Legend: C - code requirement R - recommendation S - suggestion F - finding

Code Enforcement:

- C-1 New construction must comply with the current edition of the Uniform Statewide Building Code (USBC).
- C-2 Alterations to the existing structure must comply with the current edition of the Uniform Statewide Building Code (USBC).
- C-3 Construction permits are required for this project. Plans shall accompany the permit application that fully detail the construction as well as layouts and schematics of the mechanical, electrical, and plumbing systems.

Historic Alexandria:

Design of the dormer windows might be re-considered; they seem to dominate the rear elevation and also include window lights installed on each side.