Docket Item #5 BAR CASE #2006-0029

BAR Meeting March 1, 2006

ISSUE: Alterations

APPLICANT: Ki Bong Lee

LOCATION: 108 North Patrick Street

ZONE: CD/Commercial

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends deferral of the application for restudy.

I. ISSUE:

The applicant is requesting approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness for replacement windows for the freestanding commercial building at 108 North Patrick Street. The applicant proposes to replace the existing windows with new double hung tilting six-over-six vinyl windows. All windows are proposed to be replaced with the exception of the metal bow window on the front of the building.

In addition, the applicant proposes a number of alterations including replacing the existing shutters with new vinyl shutters and wrapping the corner and rake boards with aluminum. The shutters are not designed to be operable. The aluminum wrap will be roll type metal. The gutters and downspouts are proposed to be replaced with new aluminum gutters and downspouts.

II. **HISTORY**:

The stone veneered, slate roofed, two story Colonial Revival building at 108 North Patrick was probably built between 1902 and 1912 and remodeled or rebuilt between 1921 and 1941, according to the Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps. It has two 8/8 windows at the second floor and a slate pent roof over the storefront bow window.

It is one of two pent roofed Dutch style Colonial Revival structures in the historic district. The other is located at 625 South St. Asaph Street.

In 2003, The Board approved a sign for the previous retail tenant "Verdrigris" (BAR Case #2003-0188, 9/3/2003). In 1997, the Board approved a hanging sign for Studio 108 Beauty Salon (BAR Case#97-0126, 6/18/97) and in 1992, the Board approved window lettering and replacement electric meters for Mrs. E's Sophisticated Hair Salon (BAR Case #92-62, 4/1/92).

III. ANALYSIS:

Proposed alterations comply with Zoning Ordinance requirements.

The only windows on the building that are visible from the public right-of-way and therefore subject to Board review are the front (west) and side (south) windows.

As the *Design Guidelines* note windows are a character defining feature of a property. The change out of all the windows to vinyl will, in the opinion of Staff, thus alter the overall character of the building. It will no longer appear substantially as a mid-20th century Colonial revival, but rather as a building with inappropriate windows. Staff believes that the Boards previous approvals and the *Design Guidelines* are clear that vinyl coated windows are discouraged and that wood windows are preferred. Staff, therefore, recommends deferral of the application for use of a window type that meets the recommendations in the *Design Guidelines*. Similarly, Staff has serious objections to the replacement of the existing operable wood shutters with new inoperable vinyl shutters. This change will further exacerbate the inappropriate alteration of the building.

Wrapping the corner and rake boards with aluminum facing will also alter the overall visual perception of the building. Staff does not believe that such wrapping is appropriate and that the current corner boards should be retained and properly maintained.

Staff has no objection to the use of aluminum gutters and downspouts for replacement.

IV. STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends deferral of the application for restudy.

CITY DEPARTMENT COMMENTS

Legend: C - code requirement R - recommendation S - suggestion F - finding

Code Enforcement:

No comments.

Historic Alexandria:

Proposed vinyl windows should be wood; support material does not indicate whether proposed shutters are wood.