

Docket Item # 6
BAR CASE #2006-0063

BAR Meeting
May 3, 2006

ISSUE: Addition
APPLICANT: Lisa and Jay McGonigle
LOCATION: 307 South St. Asaph Street
ZONE: RM/Residential

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: Staff recommends approval as submitted.

BOARD ACTION, APRIL 19, 2006: Deferred due to lack of public notice.

(Insert sketch here)

I. ISSUE:

The applicant is requesting approval of an addition at 307 South St. Asaph Street. The addition has recently been completed. The BAR approved the Permit to Demolish/Encapsulate for this project on March 2, 2005 (BAR Case #2005-0029). Prior to its construction, the applicant and staff did not believe that the addition would be visible from the public right-of-way. Once construction was complete and the addition was partially visible from South St. Asaph Street, the applicant agreed to make application before the BAR for formal approval.



Figure 1: View from S St. Asaph Street



Figure 2: View of Addition from Side

The addition is located between the main house and the existing garage and is partially visible from South St. Asaph Street. As constructed, the one-story addition is 136 square feet. The addition has a standing seam copper roof and is recessed behind the existing roofline of an earlier one-story rear addition of the house. Beaded cyprus siding painted white, with a 7 1/2" exposure, clads the exterior of the addition. The door is a custom mahogany door with true divided lights. One six-over-six, single-glazed, double hung wood window is located on the addition's exterior. One exterior dark copper and clear glass light fixture by Genie House is attached to the addition's exterior. Two 1/4 split fiberglass columns flank the addition. Random, irregular 3 cm bluestone is used for the porch floor, with a brick soldier course. Copper half-round gutter and downspouts are used on the addition.

II. HISTORY:

A house was originally constructed on the property in the 1780s by Benjamin Shreve and was part of a pair of twin townhouses together with the property at 305 South St. Asaph (Ethelyn Cox, *Alexandria Street by Street*, p. 166). A third story was added to the property in the 1850s and the building was re-styled in the then fashionable Greek Revival style. Thus, the cornice and molding seen on this building is very similar in ornamented style to other Greek Revival style buildings constructed in Alexandria during the same period such as 304 South St. Asaph Street

and 414, 416 and 418 Duke Street. Between 1959 and 1960 the house was "restored" in a generally unsympathetic manner and much of the Greek Revival detailing including the doorway and surrounds were removed in favor of faux Federal detailing. This re-styling was sanctioned by the Board in their approval of the changeout (Approved by BAR June 8, 1959, Building Permit #15109, July 7, 1959).

The west end of the existing house was enlarged and the garage constructed in 2000 (BAR Case #99-0024, 3/17/99). The BAR approved the demolition/encapsulation to construct this addition in 2005 (BAR Case #2005-0029)

III. ANALYSIS:

The addition complies with zoning ordinance requirements.

According to the Design Guidelines, "an addition to a historic building should be clearly distinguishable from the original structure. An addition should not obscure or dilute the architectural and historic importance of an existing building by creating a false sense of the past. To create a differentiation between the existing building and an addition, different traditional materials can be utilized. For example, a wood addition would be appropriate for an existing brick residential structure. In addition, changes in the same building material can be used to create differentiation."

Staff feels the addition is compatible yet distinguishable from the existing block of the house. Its one-story height and slightly recessed location between the main block and the garage enhances its subtleness and does not compete nor detract from the historic building. The owners have used high quality materials that give architectural interest to the addition's appearance. As previously stated, the addition is only minimally visible from South St. Asaph Street. Staff believes the addition meets the Design Guidelines and recommends approval as submitted.

IV. STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends approval as submitted.

CITY DEPARTMENT COMMENTS

Legend: C - code requirement R - recommendation S - suggestion F - finding

Code Enforcement:

- C-1 All exterior walls within 5 feet from an interior property line shall have a fire resistance rating of 1 hour, from both sides of the wall. As alternative, a 2 hour fire wall may be provided. This condition is also applicable to skylights within setback distance. Openings in exterior walls between 3 and 5 feet shall not exceed 25% of the area of the entire wall surface (This shall include bay windows). Openings shall not be permitted in exterior walls within 3 feet of an interior lot line.
- C-2 Prior to the issuance of a demolition permit or land disturbance permit, a rodent abatement plan shall be submitted to Code Enforcement that will outline the steps that will taken to prevent the spread of rodents from the construction site to the surrounding community and sewers.
- C-3 Roof drainage systems must be installed so as neither to impact upon, nor cause erosion/damage to adjacent property.
- C-4 A soils report must be submitted with the building permit application.
- C-5 New construction must comply with the current edition of the Uniform Statewide Building Code (USBC).
- C-6 Alterations to the existing structure must comply with the current edition of the Uniform Statewide Building Code (USBC).
- C-7 Construction permits are required for this project. Plans shall accompany the permit application that fully detail the construction as well as layouts and schematics of the mechanical, electrical, and plumbing systems.
- C-8 Permission from adjacent property owners is required if access to the adjacent properties is required to complete the proposed construction. Otherwise, a plan shall be submitted to demonstrate the construction techniques utilized to keep construction solely on the referenced property.
- C-9 A wall location plat prepared by a land surveyor is required to be submitted to this office prior to requesting any framing inspection.

Historic Alexandria:

“This home dates from the 1780s, built and lived in by Benjamin Shreve. In 1815, Edward Stabler bought the house and lived there until his death in 1831. Stabler’s son-in-law, Richard Huck bought the house in 1854 and probably enlarged it. It suffered from a fire in the 1860s (Cox, p. 166).