

Docket Item # 9
BAR CASE # 2007-0027

BAR Meeting
March 7, 2007

ISSUE: After-the-fact Replacement Roof

APPLICANT: Alleyne A.M.E. Zion Church

LOCATION: 1419 King Street

ZONE: KR/King Street Urban Retail

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: Staff recommends deferral of the application for restudy of a more appropriate roofing material.

(Insert sketch here)

I. ISSUE:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for an after-the-fact replacement roof at the Alleyne AME Zion Church at 1419 King Street. The roof has been approximately 60% completed with new starwhite colored Certainteed asphalt shingles.

On September 16, 2006 the Alleyne AME Zion Church received a stop work order from Code Enforcement for installing a replacement roof without a building permit. On September 19, 2006 the church applied for a permit for replacement asphalt shingles (BLD2006-03955). BAR staff reviewed the permit and determined that the original roofing material was tin shingles. BAR staff explained to the applicant that the asphalt shingles could not be approved by staff and that either tin shingles would need to be installed or an application to the Board would need to be filed.

The roof is highly visible from King Street and North Peyton Street.

II. HISTORY:

1419 King Street was constructed in 1914 as the Second Baptist Church, and around 1941 was converted to the Alleyne AME Zion Church.

In 1981, the Alleyne AME Zion Church received a building permit to remove the existing tin shingles and install new asphalt shingles (Building Permit #37646, 12/9/81). At this time, 1419 King Street was not within the boundaries of the Old & Historic District.

In 2003, the Board denied a request for replacement vinyl windows for the church building at 1417 King Street (BAR Case #2003-0158, 10/1/03).

In 2004, the Board denied a request for an asphalt shingle roof on the Beulah Baptist Church at 320 South Washington Street (BAR CASE #2004-0176, 9/1/04).

III. ANALYSIS:

The proposed roof replacement complies with zoning ordinance requirements.

Roofs of historic buildings are one of the dominant visual elements in the historic districts. According to the *Design Guidelines*, “new and replacement roofs should be made of material appropriate to the period of significance of the structure. For example, fiberglass and asphalt shingles are not appropriate on the 18th and 19th century buildings, though they are appropriate on late 20th-century structures.”

The asphalt shingles are not a historically appropriate roofing material for the Church which was constructed c. 1914 as the 2nd Baptist Church. While asphalt shingles were available as a roofing material in the United States at the end of the 19th century, historic research has indicated that this type was not widely used in Alexandria until the middle of the 20th century.

As a general policy, the Board discourages the use of asphalt shingles for roofing material. The Board also strongly discourages light colored composition shingles such as white or light blue (Roofing Materials – Page 3).

The Board has adopted the following policy for the determination of appropriate and compatible roofing materials:

1. The age of the structure and its architectural style;
2. The historic, cultural and architectural importance of the structure to the City of Alexandria;
3. The location of the structure within the Old & Historic Alexandria District or along the George Washington Memorial Parkway; and,
4. The visibility of the roof surface from a public street, way, pathway, easement or waterway.

Based on the Board's policy for replacement roofing materials, staff cannot support the use of asphalt shingles.

IV. STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends deferral of the application for restudy of a more appropriate roofing material.

CITY DEPARTMENT COMMENTS

Legend: C - code requirement R - recommendation S - suggestion F- finding

Code Enforcement:

F-1 Approval from the Board of Architectural Review (Old and Historic Alexandria District) shall be received prior to issuance of the building permit.

C-1 A Building Permit is required for this project.

Historic Alexandria:

This building was constructed in 1914 as the Second Baptist Church, and about 1941 was converted to the Alleyne AME Zion Church.

Asphalt shingles would be appropriate for a later 20th-century building but for a structure of this earlier date should be discouraged and a more suitable roofing material selected.