

Docket Item # 9
BAR CASE # 2006-0282

BAR Meeting
March 21, 2007

ISSUE: Alterations
APPLICANT: Boyd Walker
LOCATION: 200 Commerce Street
ZONE: CL/Commercial

STAFF RECOMMENDATION, MARCH 21, 2007: Staff recommends approval of the replacement canopy, new windows and doors, replacement roof and new skylights, with the following conditions:

1. That construction of the replacement canopy be completed within 6 months;
2. That the roof of the replacement canopy be flat seam metal, rather than standing seam metal as proposed;
3. That the new skylights have integral shades to be used at nighttime to reduce seepage of light visible from the exterior;
4. That the flashing around the skylights match the color of the roofing material;
5. That the material of the skylight should be non-reflective but may be tinted bronze or gray depending upon the color of the roofing material; and
6. That the applicant must obtain a building permit from Code Enforcement.

BOARD ACTION, FEBRUARY 21, 2007: The Board combined the discussion of docket item #'s 5 & 6. On a motion by Dr. Fitzgerald, seconded by Ms. Neihardt, the Board deferred the applications for restudy. The vote on the motion was 4-0.

REASON: The Board believed that additional information and clarification was needed on the drawings including specifications of materials in order to make an informed decision regarding the proposed rebuilding and alterations. Further, the Board believed that additional time was needed to understand the staff's recommendations regarding the appropriate amount of fines for the unauthorized demolition.

SPEAKER: Boyd Walker, applicant, spoke in support

STAFF RECOMMENDATION, FEBRUARY 21, 2007: Staff recommends approval of the replacement canopy, new windows and doors, replacement roof and new skylights, and deferral of the signage, with the following conditions:

1. That construction of the replacement canopy be completed within 6 months;
2. That the new skylights have integral shades to be used at nighttime to reduce seepage of light visible from the exterior;
3. That the flashing around the skylights match the color of the roofing material;
4. That the material of the skylight should be non-reflective but may be tinted bronze or gray depending upon the color of the roofing material; and
5. That the applicant must obtain a building permit from Code Enforcement.

BOARD ACTION, JANUARY 17, 2007: Deferred because the demolition was not approved.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION, JANUARY 17, 2007: Staff recommends approval of the application with the following conditions:

1. That the replacement canopy match the original canopy in respect to size and proportions, structure, and materials, and the applicant submit revised drawings reflecting such for staff approval;
2. That construction of the replacement canopy be completed within 6 months;
3. That the new skylights have integral shades to be used at nighttime to reduce seepage of light visible from the exterior;
4. That the flashing around the skylights match the color of the roofing material; and
5. That the material of the skylight should be non-reflective but may be tinted bronze or gray depending upon the color of the roofing material.

BOARD ACTION, JANUARY 3, 2007: Deferred prior to the public hearing due to lack of public notice.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION, JANUARY 3, 2007: Staff recommends approval of the application with the following conditions:

1. That construction of the replacement canopy be completed within 6 months;
2. That the new skylights have integral shades to be used at nighttime to reduce seepage of light visible from the exterior;
3. That the flashing around the skylights match the color of the roofing material; and
4. That the material of the skylight should be non-reflective but may be tinted bronze or gray depending upon the color of the roofing material.

BOARD ACTION, DECEMBER 20, 2006: Deferred prior to the public hearing due to lack of public notice.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION, DECEMBER 20, 2006: Staff recommends deferral for the applicant to revise the submittal.

(Insert sketch here)

NOTE: Docket Item #8 must be approved before this docket item may be considered.

Update: The Board deferred the item for restudy. The Board believed that the drawings needed to be revised to be accurate and provide more information, including material specifications. The Board also wanted more information from staff regarding how to determine what would be an appropriate fine for the unauthorized demolition of the prior canopy. The applicant has revised the drawings to reflect the comments of the Board and staff. The applicant has deleted the prior request for signage at the time.

I. ISSUE:

The applicant is requesting approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness for alterations to the Ice House located at 200 Commerce Street.

The alteration consists of replacing a front canopy that was demolished without approval from the Board. The applicant is also requesting additional alterations including new doors, skylights, roofing, and new windows,

Canopy:

The applicant has responded to the Board and staff's comments to incorporate elements that were reflected in the original design of the canopy shown in construction drawings from 1931. As revised, the new canopy will project 5' from the face of the building. The existing iron bolt chains will be used to anchor the canopy to the building. The chains will be attached to the new canopy with bolt through saddle plate with 4x4 x 1/4" steel fin welded to the saddle, with a 1" diameter hole at fin for chain support attachment. As proposed, the new canopy will have a standing seam metal roof on 3/4 plywood sheathing and will be sloped towards the front to drain. The applicant has deleted the previously shown applied gutter and will have a 1'2" cornice at the fascia consisting of wood blocking, a pre-fabricated metal fascia to match the profile of the original profile in the 1931 drawings, and a 1" diameter half round bead at the bottom. Staff had requested the applicant to provide a narrative explaining why this design approach was chosen, rather than the previously shown gutter. However, the applicant did not provide the narrative but will address the approach at the public hearing. 2x10 rafters will be used under the new canopy, placed in the existing rafter openings of the front of the building. Double 2x10 rafters will be located at the chain supports. The exterior of the canopy will be 1/2" painted plywood, with a 2x2 pressed metal soffit. Water on top of the canopy will drain over the front due to slope of the new metal roof.

Windows and Doors:

The applicant is requesting new doors to be installed in the existing door openings. The door on the left side of the loading dock will be a custom solid wood door with case iron hinges, modeled on the door found on the Ice House located on South Lee Street. The other door to the right on the loading dock will be a wood door with glass inserts. A small glass and wood window will be installed in the existing "window pass through" on the front façade.

Fixed wood windows are requested to be installed in the existing openings on the east side addition of the building. Wood awning windows are proposed for the existing openings on the west elevation.

Roof and Skylights:

The applicant is also requesting a replacement roof and four new skylights. The roof of the Ice House is relatively flat with a 1/4" slope to the rear. The parapet obscures views of the roof from the public rights-of-way. The four new Velux skylights will have flat-profiles and will measure 24"x48", and will have self flashing. The new roofing will be EPDM on new roof framing. A new 5" copper gutter and downspout will be located on the south side of the roof.

II. HISTORY:

The one story brick building at 200 Commerce Street was constructed as a retail ice station for the Mutual Ice Company around 1931. According to the City Real Estate Records, the building was originally 344 square feet, on a 1377 square foot lot.

Staff could not locate any record of prior BAR reviews for this property.

III. ANALYSIS:

After-the-fact alterations/demolition complies with zoning ordinance requirements conditional upon BAR approval.

The canopy of the Ice House is a character-defining feature of this industrial use building. While it is unfortunate that the existing canopy was demolished prior to staff having the opportunity to examine its condition, staff believes that this feature should be replaced to closely match the original canopy as shown on building permit drawings from 1931. The applicant has revised the drawings for the replacement canopy to reflect the comments of the Board and staff and incorporated detailing from the 1931 building permit drawings. Staff supports the revised design for the replacement canopy. However, staff would recommend that the new roof of the canopy be flat seam metal rather than a standing seam metal roof as proposed by the applicant. Staff would recommend that the construction of the new canopy be completed within 6 months.

Staff also supports the request for the new doors and windows in the existing openings. This will add tremendously to the appearance of the building and assist in restoring the integrity of the building's design.

Staff supports the replacement roof and the new skylights, with the following conditions:

1. That the new skylights have integral shades to be used at nighttime to reduce seepage of light visible from the exterior;
2. That the flashing around the skylights match the color of the roofing material; and
3. That the material of the skylights should be non-reflective but may be tinted bronze or gray depending upon the color of the roofing material.

IV. STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends approval of the replacement canopy, new windows and doors, replacement roof and new skylights, with the following conditions:

1. That construction of the replacement canopy be completed within 6 months;
2. That the roof of the replacement canopy be flat seam metal, rather than standing seam metal as proposed;
3. That the new skylights have integral shades to be used at nighttime to reduce seepage of light visible from the exterior;
4. That the flashing around the skylights match the color of the roofing material;
5. That the material of the skylight should be non-reflective but may be tinted bronze or gray depending upon the color of the roofing material; and
6. That the applicant must obtain a building permit from Code Enforcement.

CITY DEPARTMENT COMMENTS

Legend: C - code requirement R - recommendation S - suggestion F- finding

Code Enforcement:

Updated comments are in **BOLD**.

- C-1 New construction must comply with the current edition of the Uniform Statewide Building Code (USBC).
- C-2 Alterations to the existing structure must comply with the current edition of the Uniform Statewide Building Code (USBC).
- C-3 **Additions and alterations to the existing structure and/or installation and/or altering of equipment therein requires a building permit (USBC 108.1). Five sets of plans, bearing the signature and seal of a design professional registered in the Commonwealth of Virginia, must accompany the written application (USBC 109.1).**
- C-4 **Wall letters / signs must comply with USBC [H103-H111] Please indicate the method to be used for anchoring the letters to the wall.**
- C-5 Construction permits are required for this project.
- C-6 **The following code requirements apply where food preparation results in the development of grease laden vapors:**
 - (a) **All cooking surfaces, kitchen exhaust systems, grease removal devices and hoods are required to be protected with an approved automatic fire suppression system.**
 - (b) **A grease interceptor is required where there is drainage from fixtures and equipment with grease-laden waste located in food preparation areas of restaurants. Food waste grinders can not discharge to the building drainage system through a grease interceptor.**
- C-7 **A rodent control plan shall be submitted to this office for review and approval prior to occupancy. This plan shall consist of the following:**
 - (a) **Measures to be taken to control the placement of litter on site and the trash storage and pickup schedule.**
 - (b) **How food stuffs will be stored on site.**
 - (c) **Rodent baiting plan.**
- C-8 **Required exits, parking, and accessibility for persons with disabilities must be provided to the building.**
- C-9 **The proposed use is a change in use group classification; a new Certificate of Occupancy is required (USBC 116.1).**

- C-10** Prior to the application for new Certificate of Occupancy, the applicant shall submit a building permit for a change of use. Drawings prepared by a licensed architect or professional engineer shall accompany the permit application. These plans shall show provide existing conditions, construction type data, and a plot plan. In addition, these plans shall show proposed conditions and provide data by the design professional which details how the proposed use will comply with the current edition of the Virginia Uniform Statewide Building Code for the new use in the area of structural strength, means of egress, passive and active fire protection, heating and ventilating systems, handicapped accessibility and plumbing facilities.
- C-11** Fixed awnings must be designed and constructed to withstand wind or other lateral loads and live loads required by the USBC. Structural members must be protected to prevent deterioration (USBC 3105.3).
- C-12** A fire prevention code permit is required for the proposed operation. An egress plan showing fixture location, aisles and exit doors shall be submitted for review with the permit application.

Historic Alexandria:

Revised request meets staff recommendation of 1/17/07.