Docket Item #7 BAR CASE # 2006-0291

BAR Meeting April 18, 2007

ISSUE:	After-the-fact shed
APPLICANT:	Christopher Campagna
LOCATION:	816 Duke Street
ZONE:	RM/Residential

STAFF RECOMMENDATION, APRIL 18, 2007: Staff recommends approval of the application with the east side to be Hardiplank and all the other sides to have painted wood German siding.

BOARD ACTION, MARCH 21, 2007: The Board took no action on this docket item because there was no public notice. However, the Board heard from Ms. Mills regarding her view on the shed.

SPEAKER: Carollee Mills, 814 Duke Street, spoke concerning the shed and said that she had concerns regarding the fire separation between her garage and the shed and asked the Board to consider a somewhat smaller shed.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION, MARCH 21, 2007: Staff recommends approval of the application with the east side to be Hardiplank and all the other sides to have painted wood German siding.

BOARD ACTION, FEBRUARY 21, 2007: On a motion by Dr. Fitzgerald, seconded by Ms. Neihardt, the Board deferred the application for restudy. The vote on the motion was 4-0.

REASON: The Board noted the request from the adjacent neighbor to defer the public hearing until she could be present and believed that that was sufficient reason to defer the application. In addition, the Board believed that consideration should be given to using different materials than had been proposed to prevent rotting of the wood.

SPEAKER: Chip Carlin, project architect, spoke in support

BAR CASE #2006-0291 April 18, 2007

STAFF RECOMMENDATION, FEBRUARY 21, 2007: Staff recommends approval of the application with the condition that the siding on the east side be replaced with painted wood German siding to match that on the other three elevations.

BAR CASE #2006-0291 April 18, 2007

(Insert sketch here)

<u>Update:</u> There have been no changes to the application. Staff therefore repeats the staff report from the March 21, 2007 hearing.

In response to questions raised during discussion at the February 7, 2007 hearing, Staff investigated the circumstances of the construction of the open carport at the neighboring property at 814 Duke Street. On April 14, 1977, the Board of Zoning appeals approved side and rear yard variances, an open space reduction and a Floor Area Variance (then permissible), for a "detached garage" at the rear of 814 Duke Street (BZA Case #1615). According to BAR minutes, the Board approved a "garage" at 814 Duke Street on November 30, 1977. The BZA microfiche records did not include a drawing of the proposed structure. BAR case files do not survive for this period and the minutes provide no detail regarding the construction of the "garage." Lastly, the City Archives could not locate the building permit record for this project. Therefore, Staff is unable to determine how the existing carport was built and whether or not it was approved as a an open structure.

I. <u>ISSUE</u>:

The applicant is requesting after-the-fact approval of a frame shed located in the back yard of the house at 816 Duke Street. According to the applicant, the shed will function as a combination play house and storage shed. Staff became aware of the shed through a citizen complaint filed on November 16, 2006 and subsequently notified the applicant of the need to apply for BAR approval. The applicant has been working with Staff to provide the necessary information to demonstrate compliance with the zoning requirements and to allow BAR review.

The shed measures 8' by 12' and is located against the east side property line, and 8.33' from the rear property line. It has a shed roof sloping down toward the east. At its highest point, the shed is 9' and 8' at its lowest point. The shed will be clad in 6" wide German wood siding painted to match the house. The roof will be clad in painted standing seam metal. The trim, including corner boards and fascia, will be wood painted white. On the north elevation, which faces the house and will not be visible to the public, there will be a wood, Dutch door with two panels below and four lights above and a true divided light wood casement window with four lights. The long west elevation will have a six panel painted wood door on the north end and a true divided light wood casement window with four lights. The long east elevation, which is not shown in the plans and which abuts the existing carport at 814 Duke Street, is already sided in unpainted T-111 has no openings.

The shed is visible from the public alley at the rear of the house above the 6' rear fence. (Please note that the rear fence is a flat board fence, not a stockade fence as shown in the notes on the plan.)

II. <u>HISTORY</u>:

The two story, Victorian Second Empire style frame residence at 816 Duke Street was constructed in 1870 according to the tax records and is noted on the 1877 Hopkins map.

BAR CASE #2006-0291 April 18, 2007

The Board approved an addition and alterations to this property including replacement fencing on 11/18/1992 (BAR Case #92-209). On 3/17/1993, the Board approved revisions to the plans for the addition (BAR Case #93-46).

III. <u>ANALYSIS</u>:

The existing shed meets the requirements of the zoning ordinance, including open space and side and rear yard requirements for the RM zone.

Staff believes the shed, as it is proposed to be finished, will comply with the *Design Guidelines* for Accessory Structures (Pages 1-4). The simple design and traditional form of the shed is appropriate for the Vernacular Victorian main structure. The proposed exterior materials, including German siding and standing seam metal will complement the main building.

Staff's only concern is with the east elevation which is already sided in unpainted T-111 siding. T-111 is a 20th century product and not of the same quality or traditional appearance as the German lap wood siding proposed for the other elevations. In addition, as noted in the *Design Guidelines*, "unpainted siding is generally not appropriate in an urban setting" (Siding – Page 2). Due to concerns about maintenance on the east side, staff recommends that the Hardiplank siding may be used.

IV. STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Therefore, Staff recommends approval of the application with the east side to be Hardiplank and all the other sides to have painted wood German siding.

CITY DEPARTMENT COMMENTS

Legend: C - code requirement R - recommendation S - suggestion F- finding

Code Enforcement: "No comments."

Historic Alexandria: No comments received.