Docket Item #6 BAR CASE # 2007-0002

BAR Meeting September 5, 2007

ISSUE:	Addition and alterations
APPLICANT:	Amy & Brien Biondi
LOCATION:	833 South Lee Street
ZONE:	RM/Residential

<u>STAFF RECOMMENDATION, SEPTEMBER 5, 2007</u>: Staff recommends approval of the application with the following conditions:

- 1. Call Alexandria Archaeology immediately (703-838-4399) if any buried structural remains (wall foundations, wells, privies, cisterns, etc.) or concentrations of artifacts are discovered during development. Work must cease in the area of the discovery until a City archaeologist comes to the site and records the finds;
- 2. The applicant must not allow metal detection to be conducted on the property, unless authorized by Alexandria Archaeology; and,
- 3. The above statements must appear in the General Notes of all site plans and on all site plan sheets that involve demolition or ground disturbance (including sheeting and shoring and grading) so that on-site contractors are aware of the requirement.

BOARD ACTION, MARCH 21, 2007: The Board combined the discussion of docket item #'s 11 & 12. On a motion by Dr. Fitzgerald, seconded by Mr. Wheeler the Board deferred the applications for restudy. The vote on the motion was 6-0.

REASON: The Board had concerns regarding the size of the proposed additions to the house including extending the front of the house and the increased height. The Board also expressed reservations about a number of design details. The Board concluded that the overall composition of the reworking of the house needed to be reconsidered.

SPEAKER: Rebecca Bostick, project architect, spoke in support

STAFF RECOMMENDATION, MARCH 21, 2007: Staff recommends deferral of the application for restudy of the massing approach to the additions and the design details.

BOARD ACTION, FEBRUARY 7, 2007: Deferred at the request of the applicant.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION, FEBRUARY 7, 2007: Staff recommends deferral of the application for restudy of the massing approach to the additions and the design details.

(Insert sketch here)

<u>NOTE:</u> Docket item #5 must be approved before this docket item can be considered.

UPDATE: Since the March 21, 2007 hearing, the applicant has revised the proposal to address the concerns of the Board.

I. <u>ISSUE</u>:

The applicant is requesting approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness for a new third story and a new side addition for the end unit residential rowhouse at 833 South Lee Street.



Figure 1 – Previously proposed east elevation



Figure 2 - Currently proposed east elevation



Figure 3 – Previously proposed south elevation



Figure 4 - Currently proposed south elevation



Figure 5 – Previously proposed west elevation



Figure 6 - Currently proposed west elevation

Additions

A new third story will be added to the existing house. The south elevation facing Green Street functions as the main entrance to the residence. A new gable third story element will be constructed facing Green Street, with a recessed shed roof intersecting to the western side of the roofline. The roof peak will be raised approximately 6', with a new front roof pitch of 12/11. With the addition, the total height of the house will be $37' 3 \frac{1}{2}''$ at the peak of the roof line.

The new gable roof element will be clad in brick to match the existing brick, and will have corner trim boards of Hardiplank, painted white, to define the gable. The ends will have a dentil molding cornice that wraps, connecting to the other roof elements. One six-over-six, double-hung, double-glazed wood window with simulated divided lights, by Pella, will be installed in the gable, with a small round accent window above.

The recessed raised roof will slope westward from the peak of the new front gable with a slope of 3.5/12. This southern side facing Green Street will be clad in smooth finish Hardiplank siding, with nails concealed, and painted white. There will be one six-over-six double-hung, double-glazed wood window with simulated divided lights, by Pella installed in this section.

On the eastern side of the extended roof, two dormer windows will be installed, with arched windows by Pella. The sides of the dormers will be sheathed in smooth finish Hardiplank. The new roof will be a prefinished aluminum standing seam metal in dark gray, with Hardiplank rake boards and trim, painted white.

The west face of the new third floor will also be clad in smooth-finish Hardiplank, with concealed nails, and painted white. There will be one six-over-six double-hung, double-glazed wood window, with simulated divided lights, by Pella.

Eastern addition facing South Lee Street:

Also proposed is an addition for the east elevation facing South Lee Street. The addition will extend approximately 6'4" from the face of the existing rowhouse and project 2' from the front

façade of the townhouse immediately to the north. The side addition will be indented approximately 1'4" from the corner ends of the original rowhouse so as not to extend across the full width of the house. The basement level will be constructed of brick veneer to match the existing brick. The remainder of the addition will be sheathed in smooth finish Hardiplank with a 6 ¹/₂" reveal, and concealed nails. On the ground level there will be two six-over-six windows; on the second level three ganged double-hung six-over-six windows with transoms, and on the third level will be two six-over-six double hung windows. All the windows will be double-glazed wood windows, painted white, with simulated divided lights manufactured by Pella. All wood shutters will be painted black, and operable, with shutter dogs. This addition will have a very slight sloping shed roof, with single ply EPDM membrane roofing, and a 2" dentil molding at the cornice.

All gutters and downspouts will be copper.

Alterations:

A new wood door surround with Doric style pilasters and copper flashing will be added to the front door.

II. HISTORY:

833 South Lee Street is a two story, three bay residential rowhouse that was constructed as part of the Yates Garden subdivision in ca. 1954. It is an end unit rowhouse, one of a continuous row of 2 and 3 bay townhouses with alternately projecting and set back facades. The facade is distinguished from its neighbors primarily by its slightly projecting bay window at the first level. The construction of these rowhouses was approved by the Board on 3/12/1953. A garden wall was approved for this house by the Board on 11/12/1958.

III. ANALYSIS:

The proposed addition and alterations comply with zoning ordinance requirements.

Since this application was first reviewed by the Board, the applicant has met with staff to attempt to refine the proposal to address the concerns expressed by the Board and staff.

Initially, staff was concerned about the addition facing South Lee Street and its impact on the rhythm found in Yates Garden. However, the current proposal of projecting the addition 2' from the adjacent townhouse façade immediately to the north allows for the interplay of recesses and projections to be maintained along South Lee Street. In addition, by indenting or recessing the eastern addition approximately 1'4" on both corners of the townhouse, the size of the addition has been decreased. Furthermore, the choice of siding as the material on this addition helps distinguish the addition from the brick original section of the house, and assists in the reading of the addition as a secondary element to the main section of the house.

Previously, the Board expressed concerns about the overall design composition of the proposed additions. The applicant has responded to these issues by simplifying the design details on the additions as well as decreasing the amount and types of fenestration proposed. In addressing the design approach of the additions, the applicant reduced the size of the additions so that the additional gross area is well under 50%.

Therefore, staff believes the applicant has successfully reconciled the challenges of this unusual property, the concerns of the Board, with the desire for additional living space. Staff recommends approval.

IV. <u>STAFF RECOMMENDATION</u>:

Staff recommends approval of the application with the following conditions:

- 1. Call Alexandria Archaeology immediately (703-838-4399) if any buried structural remains (wall foundations, wells, privies, cisterns, etc.) or concentrations of artifacts are discovered during development. Work must cease in the area of the discovery until a City archaeologist comes to the site and records the finds;
- 2. The applicant must not allow metal detection to be conducted on the property, unless authorized by Alexandria Archaeology; and,
- 3. The above statements must appear in the General Notes of all site plans and on all site plan sheets that involve demolition or ground disturbance (including sheeting and shoring and grading) so that on-site contractors are aware of the requirement.

CITY DEPARTMENT COMMENTS

Legend: C - code requirement R - recommendation S - suggestion F- finding

Code Enforcement:

- C-1 All exterior walls within 5 feet from an interior property line shall have a fire resistance rating of 1 hour, from both sides of the wall. As alternative, a 2 hour fire wall may be provided. This condition is also applicable to skylights within setback distance. Openings in exterior walls between 3 and 5 feet shall not exceed 25% of the area of the entire wall surface (This shall include bay windows). Openings shall not be permitted in exterior walls within 3 feet of an interior lot line.
- C-2 Prior to the issuance of a demolition permit or land disturbance permit, a rodent abatement plan shall be submitted to Code Enforcement that will outline the steps that will taken to prevent the spread of rodents from the construction site to the surrounding community and sewers.
- C-3 Alterations to the existing structure must comply with the current edition of the Uniform Statewide Building Code (USBC).
- C-4 Additions and alterations to the existing structure and/or installation and/or altering of equipment therein requires a building permit (USBC 108.1). Five sets of plans, bearing the signature and seal of a design professional registered in the Commonwealth of Virginia, must accompany the written application (USBC 109.1).
- C-5 A Construction permit will be required for the proposed project.
- C-6 New construction must comply with the current edition of the Uniform Statewide Building Code (USBC).
- C-7 Permission from adjacent property owners is required if access to the adjacent properties is required to complete the proposed construction. Otherwise, a plan shall be submitted to demonstrate the construction techniques utilized to keep construction solely on the referenced property.

<u>Historic Alexandria:</u> No comments received.

Alexandria Archaeology:

F-1 Tax records indicate that there was a free African American household on this street face by 1810, but the exact address is not known. Quartermaster maps from the Civil War era show that the block bounded by Lee, Green, Fairfax and Jefferson streets was the site of the kitchen, mess room, and barracks for Battery Rogers. While ground disturbance associated with this project is not extensive, particularly in the backyard area where there is greater potential, there is a possibility for development activities to uncover archaeological resources that could provide insight into domestic activities in 19th- century Alexandria, perhaps relating to African Americans, and into military life during the Civil War.

- R-1 Call Alexandria Archaeology immediately (703-838-4399) if any buried structural remains (wall foundations, wells, privies, cisterns, etc.) or concentrations of artifacts are discovered during development. Work must cease in the area of the discovery until a City archaeologist comes to the site and records the finds.
- R-2 The applicant must not allow metal detection to be conducted on the property, unless authorized by Alexandria Archaeology.
- R-3 The above statements in R-2 ad R-3 must appear in the General Notes of all site plans and on all site plan sheets that involve demolition or ground disturbance (including sheeting and shoring and grading) so that on-site contractors are aware of the requirement.

Transportation & Environmental Services

- R-1 The applicant shall submit an annotated house location plat must meet the following criteria:
 - No reduced, enlarged or faxed copies will be accepted.
 - The footprint area of the proposed improvements must be drawn to scale.
 - The additional 10' perimeter, construction access and other areas as described above must be shown to scale.
 - The overall dimensions of the proposed improvements must be shown.
 - The actual square footage of the disturbed area must be shown.

The applicant shall be required to provide this information to the Department of Transportation and Environmental Services, Construction and Inspection Division and/or Engineering Division prior to any applications for building permits. (T&ES)

- R-2 The building permit plans shall comply with requirements of City Code Section 8-1-22 regarding the location of downspouts, foundation drains and sump pumps. Refer to Memorandum to Industry dated June 18, 2004. [Memorandum is available online at the City web site under Transportation/Engineering and Design/Memos to Industry.]
- R-3 Applicant shall be responsible for repairs to the adjacent city right-of-way if damaged during construction activity.
- R-4 All improvements to the city right-of-way such as curbing, sidewalk, driveway aprons, etc. must be city standard design.