

Docket Item #8
BAR CASE# 2007-0118

BAR Meeting
September 5, 2007

ISSUE: Alterations
APPLICANT: Ford's Landing Homeowners Association
LOCATION: Ford's Landing (99 Franklin Street)
ZONE: CD/Commercial

STAFF RECOMMENDATION, SEPTEMBER 5, 2007: Staff recommends approval with the following conditions:

- 1) That each individual property owner receive staff administrative approval for the proposed replacement, in concurrence with approved materials matrix;
- 2) That the materials matrix will be reevaluated and updated, and brought back to the Board for re-approval five years from the date of initial approval;
- 3) That on a bi-annual basis, the applicant and staff will provide information to the Board of the number and nature of approvals for Ford's Landing community.

BOARD ACTION, JULY 18, 2007: On a motion by Ms. Neihardt, seconded by Mr. Smeallie, the Board voted to defer the application for restudy with a vote of 4-0.

REASON: The Board felt that issues raised by the members of the public, including legal precedent for similar approvals, granting of authority, public notifications, and proposed use of new materials for replacement, needed input from the City Attorney and additional staff investigation before the Board would consider the application.

SPEAKERS: Douglas Scott, Ford's Landing Homeowners Association, spoke in support.
John Hynan, Historic Alexandria Foundation, spoke in opposition.
Charles Trozzo, 209 Duke Street, spoke in opposition.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION, JULY 18, 2007: Staff recommends approval of the application as submitted.

(Insert sketch here)

UPDATE: Since the July 18, 2007 hearing, the applicant has revised the material matrix and staff has received information from the City Attorney's office regarding the legal questions posed by the public and members of the Board.

I. ISSUE:

The applicant is requesting approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness for a replacement materials matrix to assist in guiding future maintenance requests from residences in the Ford's Landing complex. These residences were originally approved by the Board in 1996 and since that time there has been both normal maintenance requirements of exterior elements as well as unexpected deterioration for others.

The Homeowners Association Architectural Control and Covenants Committee (ACCC) is proposing a proactive solution to a number of common maintenance and replacement problems involving exterior elements and finish materials. The ACCC has prepared a matrix that sets out the problems encountered with expected normal deterioration as well as problems with specific exterior architectural elements that have been encountered together with proposed solutions and replacement materials to solve these problems. The matrix has been revised since the July 18, 2007 hearing to include language that any changes in materials detailed in the list would require BAR Staff approval.

In the matrix, the applicant has included alternate materials as visually compatible substitutes for the materials originally used for construction in 1996. Replacement windows may be either wood or clad from Marvin, Kolbe and Kolbe, or Pella Architect series. Any replacement windows must match the original style and configuration. Front doors may be wood or a synthetic/composite that mimics the appearance of wood. Atrium and French doors may be wood or a clad door from the same window manufacturers.

Regarding exterior siding, the applicant is proposing replacement siding to be wood or smooth finish Hardiplank or beaded lap siding to match the original style. Trim may be either wood, PVC, AZEK, Koma trimboards, or fypon.

Exterior shutters may be wood or a custom solid PVC product. Garage doors may be wood or composite material that matches the visual appearance of the original.

It is the intention of the Homeowners Association as well as staff that the proposed matrix will be used to provide guidance to the residents and the Association to what materials are appropriate for replacement. However, each individual request for replacement will need a staff administrative approval based on the decision and approval of the materials matrix by the Board.

II. HISTORY:

The Ford's Landing complex was approved by the Board in a series of meetings in 1996 (BAR Case #96-0030).

III. ANALYSIS:

Miscellaneous proposed renovations comply with zoning ordinance requirements.

Staff has had a series of meetings with representatives of the Homeowners Association to develop the proposal that is now before the Board. Staff wishes to thank the members of the Association for their cooperation, thoroughness and thoughtful approach to dealing with the problems that are the genesis for this application.

Since the last hearing, the applicant has revised the matrix to include language that BAR staff approval is required for any changes in approved materials listed within the matrix. In addition, Staff has consulted with the City Attorney's office. Rather than being perceived as giving a blanket approval should the Board agree with the materials listed within the matrix, the aim is to provide guidance to the Homeowner's Association and the residents as to what replacement materials are appropriate for this late 20th century development. As is the current policy with the Board and Staff, each individual appropriate request for replacement would require a staff administrative approval, which allows the applicant to forego an appearance before the Board. However, it should be noted that staff has the discretion to take any request to the Board for review and approval, in cases where there may be uncertainty if the proposed replacement material is appropriate.

- 1) Staff believes that the proposal before the Board is well thought out and should, over the course of the next several years, save the Board and the individual homeowners countless hours in dealing with the problems that have been outlined. Staff believes that the materials specified in the matrix as satisfactory replacement materials are all appropriate to a mid-1990s housing development. The Board has approved many of these alternate composite materials such as AZEK, fypon, and clad windows on other projects in the Old and Historic Alexandria District.

IV. STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends approval of the application with the following conditions:

- 1) That each individual property owner receive staff administrative approval for the proposed replacement, in concurrence with approved materials matrix;
- 2) That the materials matrix will be reevaluated and updated, and brought back to the Board for re-approval five years from the date of initial approval;
- 3) That on a bi-annual basis, the applicant and staff will provide information to the Board of the number and nature of approvals for Ford's Landing community.

CITY DEPARTMENT COMMENTS

Legend: C - code requirement R - recommendation S - suggestion F- finding

Code Enforcement:

No comments.

Office of Historic Alexandria:

No comments were received