Docket Item # 11 BAR CASE # 2007-0175

BAR Meeting September 19, 2007

ISSUE: Alterations

APPLICANT: Jay and Judith Turim by Robert Bentley Adams and Associates

LOCATION: 616 S. Royal Street

ZONE: RM/Residential

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: Staff recommends approval of the application with the following conditions:

- 1. Approval of the new deck, new shutters, new front door, new gate to HVAC enclosure and finials; and
- 2. Denial of the removal and replacement of the door surround, new entablature, and new belt course.

(Insert sketch here)

Note: Docket item #10 must be approved before this item may be considered.

I. <u>ISSUE</u>:

The applicant is requesting approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness for alterations to 616 S. Royal Street, including construction of a new rear deck, new rear storm door, new front shutters and door surround, new front door, and a new gate for the front HVAC enclosure.

Deck:

A new rear deck will be constructed off the second floor of the property, with a height of approximately 9'1" from the grade. The new deck will have trex decking, painted metal guardrail at 36" above the porch, with 5" spacing between pickets. New metal stairs with metal railings will replace the existing stairs. A new storm door will replace the existing one on the french doors leading to the deck from the house.

Shutters/Entablature/Door Surround:

New paneled operable wood shutters with working hardware are proposed to be installed on the three windows on the front elevation's second and third floors. A painted wood and composite entablature is proposed to be installed above the large window at the second level.

The applicant is proposing removing the existing door surround, with a pediment and urn design, and replacing it with a new painted wood surround. A new six panel wood door will be installed.

A new painted wood composite belt course is proposed to be installed visually separating the ground and second levels.

Gate:

The existing arched wood gate to the ground HVAC enclosure is proposed to be replaced with a new wood gate matching the existing fence detail, with a lattice design. Ball finials are proposed to be added to the existing fence posts.

II. HISTORY:

616 South Royal Street was built around 1960 as part of the Yates Garden Subdivision. The subdivision is comprised of Colonial Revival townhouses covering approximately 14 blocks of the City.

The most recent approval by the Board for this property includes HVAC screening on February 5, 2003, (BAR Case #2002-0243). Staff could not locate any additional Board approvals for this property, including an approval for the existing deck.

III. ANALYSIS:

Proposed shutters, door and deck alterations comply with zoning ordinance requirements.

In general, Staff is supportive of most of the alterations proposed by the applicant. The new rear deck will only be minimally visible from South Fairfax Street and the painted metal guardrails will provide a more polished design than the existing wood deck. In regards to the proposed alterations on the front elevation, Staff supports the new operable wood shutters, the new gate,

and the doors replacements. However, Staff is concerned about the adding of the other design details such as the entablature above the window, the belt course and the new front door surround. These proposed design elements introduce a new and more formal design vocabulary then has existed on this property and alters the existing design simplicity.

It appears the existing door surround, with the pediment and urn design, would have to be removed in order to install the belt course. Staff would recommend that the existing door surround, which appears to be original, be maintained and the belt course not installed.

IV. STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends approval of the application with the following conditions:

- 1. Approval of the new deck, new shutters, new front door, new gate to HVAC enclosure and finials; and
- 2. Denial of the removal and replacement of the door surround, new entablature, and new belt course.

CITY DEPARTMENT COMMENTS

Legend: C - code requirement R - recommendation S - suggestion F- finding

Code Enforcement:

- F-1 Applicant inadequately refers to Section R-316 Insulation of the 2000 IRC. Please place correct Section R-312.1 Guards of the 2003 IRC on plans.
- C-1 A building permit is required for the proposed project (doors, fence, windows and brick wall).
- C-2 Alterations to the existing structure must comply with the current edition of the Uniform Statewide Building Code (USBC).
- C-3 Permission from adjacent property owners is required if access to the adjacent properties is required to complete the proposed construction. Otherwise, a plan shall be submitted to demonstrate the construction techniques utilized to keep construction solely on the referenced property.
- C-4 Prior to the issuance of a demolition permit or land disturbance permit, a rodent abatement plan shall be submitted to Code Enforcement that will outline the steps that will taken to prevent the spread of rodents from the construction site to the surrounding community and sewers.

Historic Alexandria:

[&]quot;No comments."