

Docket Item # 11
BAR CASE # 2007-0187

BAR Meeting
October 3, 2007

ISSUE: Alterations
APPLICANT: P. Margaret Wylie
LOCATION: 320 North Alfred Street
ZONE: RB/Residential

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: Staff recommends approval of the application with the following conditions:

1. That the windows be replaced with wood windows, with staff reviewing cut sheets of the windows prior to purchase and installation;
2. That the existing masonite and bricktec be removed;
3. That the original wood siding be retained and repaired and in consultation with staff replacement of any deteriorated sections to match the existing wood siding.

(Insert sketch here)

I. ISSUE:

The applicant is requesting approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness for replacement siding and windows at 320 North Alfred Street. The applicant is proposing to remove the existing Masonite and bricktec siding and replace with hardiplank siding on the sides and rear of the house. The existing windows are proposed to be replaced with new one over one or two over two vinyl clad windows. Manufacturer cut sheets on the proposed windows have not been provided.

II. HISTORY:

320 North Alfred Street appears on the 1891 and 1896 Sanborn maps, but not the 1885 map.

The Bricktec siding was installed in 1936 (Building permit #1827). Building permits also show that the windows and doors were replaced in 1961 (Building permit #17665).

The Board reviewed an application by the current homeowner for replacement wood windows and hardiplank siding in 2006 (BAR CASE #2006-0106, 6/7/06). The Board approved the application with the following conditions:

1. That the front windows may be replaced with Kolbe and Kolbe windows, with staff reviewing cut sheets of the new windows; and
2. That the Masonite and bricktec be removed on the front and north side elevations, and the existing wood be retained and repaired in kind; and
3. That the Masonite and bricktec be removed on the rear and south elevations, with the applicant to contact staff to look at the condition of the wood then determine whether to come back before Board to seek approval of Hardiplank; and
4. That once Masonite and other layers are moved, determine condition of existing windows on the sides and rear elevations, and determine proposed replacement windows.

The approved alterations were not undertaken during the one year approval period and the approval has subsequently expired.

III. ANALYSIS:

The subject property is zoned RB, residential and a lot of record as of February 10, 1953. The proposed replacement siding and windows comply with Zoning Ordinance requirements.

The applicant is proposing to install new vinyl clad windows. As mentioned above in the history section, the current windows were installed in 1961. While staff has no objection to the replacement of the non-historic windows, the *Design Guidelines* state that vinyl clad windows are a discouraged type of window (Windows – Page 2). Staff recommends that the windows be either one over one or two over two true divided light wood windows.

Regarding the proposed use of fiber cement, the Board has adopted the following policy for the use of fiber cement siding:

1. That fiber cement siding not be installed on an historic structure;
2. That historic materials should not be removed to install fiber cement siding;
3. That fiber cement siding replace other artificial or composite siding;
4. That the nails not show in the installation of the siding; and
5. That smooth, (non simulated wood grain) siding be installed, and

6. That BAR Staff may administratively approve the installation of fiber cement siding on non-historic building (those constructed in 1975 or later).

The applicant in consultation with staff previously removed several sections of the Masonite on the front and side elevations which revealed a layer of bricktec over wood siding. The existing wood siding appeared to be in good condition. With that in mind, the proposed replacement of the Masonite with fiber cement (Hardi-plank) does not meet the Board's policy for use of fiber cement since probable historic wood siding is intact underneath the Masonite. Staff would support the removal of the Masonite and bricktec sidings and encourage the retention of the wood siding. Any damaged or compromised wood components should be repaired and replaced with in-kind wood in consultation with staff.

IV. STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends approval of the application with the following conditions:

1. That the windows be replaced with either one over one or two over two true divided light wood windows, with staff reviewing cut sheets of the windows prior to purchase and installation;
2. That the existing masonite and bricktec be removed;
3. That the original wood siding be retained and repaired and in consultation with staff replacement of any deteriorated sections to match the existing wood siding.

CITY DEPARTMENT COMMENTS

Legend: C - code requirement R - recommendation S - suggestion F- finding

Code Enforcement:

- C-1 All windows must comply with IRC section R613 (residential) or IBC section 1714.5 (commercial). Specifically they must be listed as per the requirements of AAMA/NWWDA 101/ I.S.2 and/ or AAMA/NWWDA 101/ I.S.2/ NAFS, respectively.
- C-2 Structures requiring restoration of an existing window in which the structure is deemed Historic by the BAR staff will be reviewed for compliance with the building code on an individual basis.

Historic Alexandria:

- R-1 Approval with wood clapboard and 2/2 wood double hung windows.