

Docket Item # 16  
BAR CASE # 2007-0225

BAR Meeting  
November 14, 2007

**ISSUE:** Alterations  
**APPLICANT:** Edward Semonian  
**LOCATION:** 409 Green Street  
**ZONE:** RM/residential

---

**STAFF RECOMMENDATION:** Staff recommends approval of the application with the following conditions:

1. That the windows are wood windows;
2. That the windows have wood simulated divided lights; and,
3. That the muntins bars be no greater than 7/8" in width; and,
4. That the new all-wood windows be approved by Staff prior to ordering.

(Insert sketch here)

**I. ISSUE:**

The applicant is requesting approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace the existing single glazed windows with new thermal wood windows by Marvin. The house is semi-detached and has windows on three sides. Of the 28 existing windows to be replaced, 26 are six-over-six, double hung, but 2 dormer windows are four-over-four, double hung. The dormer windows date to circa 1992 alterations. Some of the six-over-six are original to the 1942 house while others date to a 1992 addition. According to the applicant, the replacement windows will fit the existing openings and replicate the configuration of the existing window sash. The specification sheets provided by the applicant are for the Marvin wood "Ultimate" window. This wood window is available with an aluminum clad exterior, but the applicant has confirmed to staff that the window will have a wood exterior. Moreover, the applicant has confirmed that the windows will have simulated divided lights with spacer bars and exterior wood muntins no greater than 7/8" wide.

**II. HISTORY:**

The semi-detached, two story brick, Colonial Revival style residence at 409 Green Street was constructed in 1941/1942. It has a slate hip roof with dormers on both the east and west sides. The house is the west end unit of a group of three houses constructed within the original Yates Garden subdivision, consisting of two full and two partial blocks bounded by Franklin (north), Green (south), S. Royal (east) and S. Pitt (west) streets. 409, 411 and 413 Green Street were designed by Kirkhuff & Bagley and were constructed under Building Permit #3179, dated September 11, 1941.

The Yates Garden development was constructed by Edward R. Carr in the southern section of Alexandria. In 1939, Carr purchased land in the block behind the former Yeates residence (ca. 1826) at 414 Franklin Street, with the intention of erecting rowhouses that would be complementary in style to the city's early buildings while conforming to contemporary housing patterns. Known as "Yates Gardens," the subdivision was originally projected to include 100 lots. The development was highly successful, popular with homebuyers and architectural critics alike. By 1942, private home building slowed dramatically due to the material and manpower demands of World War II. The area did not experience significant construction again until circa 1948. Eventually the entire section of town south of Franklin between S. Lee and S. St. Asaph streets became known as Yates Gardens.

An addition was approved for the rear of 409 Green Street on January 2, 1991 and March 6, 1991 (BAR Case #91-7). An after-the-fact skylight was approved in 1992 (BAR Case #92-66, 4/1/92). There have been no recent BAR cases for this property. In 2002, the Board approved replacement windows for 411 Green Street. The approved windows were Kolbe & Kolbe wood windows with simulated divided lights with 7/8" muntins (BAR Case #2002-0246, October 2, 2002).

**III. ANALYSIS:**

The proposed alterations comply with the zoning ordinance requirements.

According to the *Design Guidelines*, the Board prefers single glazed windows with true divided lights. Thermal windows with simulated divided lights are considered acceptable only under

specific circumstances (Windows – Page 2). Staff believes that simulated divided light thermal are acceptable in this instance as the house dates to the 1940s and is well removed from the public right-of-way. Staff notes that the Board has previously approved thermal windows with simulated divided lights for houses in the Yates Garden subdivision, including the house at 411 Green Street.

Staff believes the proposed windows would be acceptable provided that they are wood, not clad, on the exterior and that they have simulated divided lights with wood muntin bars no more than 7/8” wide. The applicant has confirmed to Staff that this is his intention.

**IV. STAFF RECOMMENDATION:**

Staff recommends approval of the application with the following conditions:

1. That the windows are wood windows;
2. That the windows have wood simulated divided lights; and,
3. That the muntins bars be no greater than 7/8” in width; and,
4. That the new all-wood windows be approved by Staff prior to ordering.

CITY DEPARTMENT COMMENTS

Legend: C - code requirement R - recommendation S - suggestion F- finding

Code Enforcement:

- C-1 A construction permit will be required for the proposed project.
- C-2 Alterations to the existing structure must comply with the current edition of the Uniform Statewide Building Code (USBC).
- C-3 Additions and alterations to the existing structure and/or installation and/or altering of equipment therein requires a building permit (USBC 108.1). Five sets of plans, bearing the signature and seal of a design professional registered in the Commonwealth of Virginia, must accompany the written application (USBC).

Historic Alexandria:

- R-1 Approval
- S-1 Double glazed true divided lights wood windows.