

Docket Item # 2
BAR CASE# 2007-0127

BAR Meeting
March 5, 2008

ISSUE: New garage
APPLICANT: Mike Margiotta
LOCATION: 217 North St. Asaph Street
ZONE: RM/Residential

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: Staff recommends deferral of the application for restudy. In the alternative, if the Board determines to approve the application, staff recommends the following conditions:

1. Recommend approval of the design conditional upon any necessary approval by the Board of Zoning Appeals;
2. The Board approve all materials proposed for the construction of the garage;
3. The applicant/developer shall call Alexandria Archaeology immediately (703-838-4399) if any buried structural remains (wall foundations, wells, privies, cisterns, etc.) or concentrations of artifacts are discovered during development. Work must cease in the area of the discovery until a City archaeologist comes to the site and records the finds.
4. The applicant/developer shall not allow any metal detection to be conducted on the property, unless authorized by Alexandria Archaeology.
5. The statements above shall appear in the General Notes of all site plans and on all site plan sheets that involve demolition or ground disturbance (including Erosion and Sediment Control, Grading, Landscaping, and Sheeting and Shoring) so that on-site contractors area aware of the requirements.

BOARD ACTION, FEBRUARY 6, 2008: On a motion by Dr. Fitzgerald, seconded by Ms. Neihardt the Board deferred the application for restudy. The vote on the motion was 7-0.

REASON: The Board believed that additional consideration of the design of the proposed garage was necessary. Members expressed concern about the style of the building and believed that the garage should clearly not compete with the architecture of the house. Members also believed that the proposed shed dormer was not appropriate.

SPEAKERS: Mike Margiotta, homeowner, spoke in support
John Hynan, representing the Historic Alexandria Foundation, spoke in opposition

STAFF RECOMMENDATION, FEBRUARY 6, 2008: Staff recommends deferral of the application for restudy. In the alternative, if the Board determines to approve the application, Staff recommends the following conditions:

1. The Board approve all materials proposed for the construction of the garage;
2. The applicant/developer shall call Alexandria Archaeology immediately (703-838-4399) if any buried structural remains (wall foundations, wells, privies, cisterns, etc.) or concentrations of artifacts are discovered during development. Work must cease in the area of the discovery until a City archaeologist comes to the site and records the finds.
3. The applicant/developer shall not allow any metal detection to be conducted on the property, unless authorized by Alexandria Archaeology.
4. The statements above shall appear in the General Notes of all site plans and on all site plan sheets that involve demolition or ground disturbance (including Erosion and Sediment Control, Grading, Landscaping, and Sheeting and Shoring) so that on-site contractors area aware of the requirements.

BOARD ACTION, SEPTEMBER 19, 2007: On a motion by Dr. Fitzgerald, seconded by Mr. Smeallie the Board deferred the application for restudy. The vote on the motion was 6-0.

REASON: The Board believed that the overall design of the garage was generally supportable, but was concerned about the shed dormers on the east and west elevations. The Board suggested that other styles of dormers be considered.

SPEAKERS: Mike Margiotta, homeowner, spoke in support
William Cromley, project designer, spoke in support

STAFF RECOMMENDATION, SEPTEMBER 19, 2007: Staff recommends approval of the application with the following conditions:

1. The applicant/developer shall call Alexandria Archaeology immediately (703-838-4399) if any buried structural remains (wall foundations, wells, privies, cisterns, etc.) or concentrations of artifacts are discovered during development. Work must cease in the area of the discovery until a City archaeologist comes to the site and records the finds.
2. The applicant/developer shall not allow any metal detection to be conducted on the property, unless authorized by Alexandria Archaeology.
3. The statements above shall appear in the General Notes of all site plans and on all site plan sheets that involve demolition or ground disturbance (including Erosion and Sediment Control, Grading, Landscaping, and Sheeting and Shoring) so that on-site contractors area aware of the requirements.

BOARD ACTION, JULY 18, 2007: On a motion by Mr. Smeallie, seconded by Ms. Neihardt, the Board voted to defer the application for restudy, on a vote of 4-0.

REASON: The Board expressed concerns about the proposed two-story height of the new garage and the impact of the height to the adjacent properties.

SPEAKER: Mike Margiotta, applicant, spoke in support
Nancy Macklin, 512 Queen Street, spoke in opposition

STAFF RECOMMENDATION, JULY 18, 2007: Staff recommends approval of the application with the following conditions:

1. Call Alexandria Archaeology immediately (703-838-4399) if any buried structural remains (wall foundations, wells, privies, cisterns, etc.) or concentrations of artifacts are discovered during development. Work must cease in the area of the discovery until a City archaeologist comes to the site and records the finds; and,
2. The above statement must appear in the General Notes of all site plans and on all site plan sheets that involve demolition or ground disturbance (including sheeting and shoring and grading) so that on-site contractors are aware of the requirement.

(Insert sketch here)

Update: Since the public hearing of February 6, 2008, the applicant has revised the design of the garage and the dormers proposed. The form and overall size of the garage have not changed.

I. ISSUE:

The applicant is requesting approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness contingent upon BZA approval of variance for the construction of a garage behind the freestanding house at 217 North St. Asaph Street.

The garage will be two stories in height and approximately 21' in width and 23'10" in overall length with a gable roof.

East Elevation

The east elevation on the alley will have a pair of triple cross buck garage doors with multi-light transoms surmounted by full length panels. The material of the garage doors has not been specified.

On the second level there will be a two hipped style dormers each with a pair of four light wood casement windows. Each dormer is approximately 7'6" in length, 5'7" in width and approximately 5'6" in height. The dormers will have standing seam metal roofs.

West Elevation

The rear (west) elevation will have an entry door with multi-lights on the first level and one multi-light window. The entry door materials have not been specified. On the second level there will be a pair of hipped dormers with multi-light double casement windows. These dormers are approximately the same size as those proposed for the west elevation, but are set lower on the roof slope.

There is a 5' x 5'10" vestibule extension on the first floor to accommodate stairs to the second level.

South Elevation

There will also be an entry door with multi-lights on the south elevation. A set of steps with a railing will provide access to the entry door. A roof vent at the gable peak is proposed for this elevation.

North Elevation

A roof vent at the gable peak is also proposed for this elevation.

The garage is proposed to be clad in fiber cement siding with a 6" exposure on the first level and a 4" exposure on the gable ends. No information has been provided as to the type of fiber cement proposed.

The windows and doors have not been specified.

A standing seam metal roof is proposed.

No colors have been specified.

Access to the garage will be from an alley with access from North Pitt Street.

Brick Wall

A brick wall is proposed to be constructed on the south side of the new garage. This wall is to be, according to the plans provided, approximately 5' in height. The brick wall will extend from the previously approved brick wall on the north side of the surface parking lot on North St. Asaph Street.

II. HISTORY:

The location of the proposed garage is currently vacant land.

The Board approved the demolition of the garage that previously stood at this location in 2006 (BAR Case #2006-0007, 2/15/06).

The Board originally approved substantial renovation and a new addition to the existing house in 2003. This was subsequently re-approved by the Board in 2006 (BAR Case #2006-008, 2/15/06)

III. ANALYSIS:

The design of the garage as currently proposed does not comply with zoning ordinance requirements and requires approval of a zoning variance in order to be constructed. This is because the entry extension on the west side of the proposed building crosses over a lot line. Staff is proposing Board review of the garage design ahead of review by the Board of Zoning Appeals. If the Board approves the design, the B.A.R. decision will be forwarded to B.Z.A. for their information and assistance in formulating a decision.

The new garage will be visible across the surface parking lot at the corner of Cameron and North St. Asaph Street as well as from North Pitt Street down an alley.

The applicant has supplied a series of photographs of roof and dormer details of residential houses in the historic district to illustrate sources of aspects of the garage design .

Staff continues to be concerned about the design proposed for the garage. As evidenced by the photographs provided by the applicant, the design of the garage is clearly intended to emulate residential buildings in the historic district. This is what concerns staff regarding the design proposed. Garages are, by their very nature, secondary, utilitarian structures that serve to accommodate the car and ancillary activities. The proposed design is quite outside the parameters one would normally associate with a secondary, utilitarian structure. Staff believes that a thorough re-thinking of this secondary structure is needed so that it appears as a garage and not a second residence on the lot.

Furthermore, staff is troubled by the lack of information regarding materials proposed to be used for the construction of this building. For example, staff believes that information on the type and brand of fiber cement siding proposed; the type and brand of the proposed windows; information

on the doors, roof, light fixtures and railings is needed before the Board can make an informed decision regarding the appropriateness of the design.

Staff notes the comments of Alexandria Archaeology and has included them as a condition, if the Board determines to approve the application.

IV. STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends deferral of the application for restudy.

In the alternative, if the Board determines to approve the application, staff recommends the following conditions:

1. Recommend approval of the design conditional upon any necessary approval by the Board of Zoning Appeals;
2. The Board approve all materials proposed for the construction of the garage;
3. The applicant/developer shall call Alexandria Archaeology immediately (703-838-4399) if any buried structural remains (wall foundations, wells, privies, cisterns, etc.) or concentrations of artifacts are discovered during development. Work must cease in the area of the discovery until a City archaeologist comes to the site and records the finds.
4. The applicant/developer shall not allow any metal detection to be conducted on the property, unless authorized by Alexandria Archaeology.
5. The statements above shall appear in the General Notes of all site plans and on all site plan sheets that involve demolition or ground disturbance (including Erosion and Sediment Control, Grading, Landscaping, and Sheeting and Shoring) so that on-site contractors area aware of the requirements.

CITY DEPARTMENT COMMENTS

Legend: C - code requirement R - recommendation S - suggestion F- finding

Code Enforcement:

- C-1 All exterior walls within 5 feet from an interior property line shall have a fire resistance rating of 1 hour, from both sides of the wall. As alternative, a 2 hour fire wall may be provided. This condition is also applicable to skylights within setback distance. Openings in exterior walls between 3 and 5 feet shall not exceed 25% of the area of the entire wall surface (This shall include bay windows). Openings shall not be permitted in exterior walls within 3 feet of an interior lot line.
- C-2 Prior to the issuance of a demolition permit or land disturbance permit, a rodent abatement plan shall be submitted to Code Enforcement that will outline the steps that will taken to prevent the spread of rodents from the construction site to the surrounding community and sewers.
- C-3 Roof drainage systems must be installed so as neither to impact upon, nor cause erosion/damage to adjacent property.
- C-4 A soils report must be submitted with the building permit application.
- C-5 New construction must comply with the current edition of the Uniform Statewide Building Code (USBC).
- C-6 Alterations to the existing structure must comply with the current edition of the Uniform Statewide Building Code (USBC).
- C-7 Construction permits are required for this project. Plans shall accompany the permit application that fully detail the construction as well as layouts and schematics of the mechanical, electrical, and plumbing systems.
- C-8 Permission from adjacent property owners is required if access to the adjacent properties is required to complete the proposed construction. Otherwise, a plan shall be submitted to demonstrate the construction techniques utilized to keep construction solely on the referenced property.
- C-9 A wall location plat prepared by a land surveyor is required to be submitted to this office prior to requesting any framing inspection.

Office of Historic Alexandria:

“No comments.”

Alexandria Archaeology:

- F-1 According to Ethelyn Cox’s *Historic Alexandria, Virginia, Street by Street, A Survey of Existing Early Buildings*, a structure was built on this lot during the 19th century. The

property is also adjacent to the McVeigh Hospital lot, which was utilized by the Union Army during the Civil War. The property therefore has the potential to yield archaeological resources which could provide insight into domestic and military activities in 19th-century Alexandria.

- R-1 The applicant/developer shall call Alexandria Archaeology immediately (703-838-4399) if any buried structural remains (wall foundations, wells, privies, cisterns, etc.) or concentrations of artifacts are discovered during development. Work must cease in the area of the discovery until a City archaeologist comes to the site and records the finds.
- R-2 The applicant/developer shall not allow any metal detection to be conducted on the property, unless authorized by Alexandria Archaeology.
- R-3 The statements in Conditions R-1 and R-2 above shall appear in the General Notes of all site plans and on all site plan sheets that involve demolition or ground disturbance (including Erosion and Sediment Control, Grading, Landscaping, and Sheeting and Shoring) so that on-site contractors are aware of the requirements.