

Docket Item #5
BAR CASE #2008-0044

BAR Meeting
May 7, 2008

ISSUE: Alterations
APPLICANT: Thomas Byrne
LOCATION: 1219 Prince Street
ZONE: CD/Commercial

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: Staff recommends approval of the application with the following conditions:

1. That the applicant work with Staff to determine if any historic wood siding exists beneath the Masonite and vinyl siding;
2. That if historic siding exists and is in good condition, it must be repaired and retained. If the condition of the siding is poor, the applicant should install the same type of wood siding that was originally on the house;
3. That a vertical trim board be used to separate the subject property from its twin townhouse at 1217 Prince Street. This can be achieved by either maintaining the existing vertical board or installing a new wood trim board;
4. That the new windows on the rear elevation be one-over-one, double-insulated aluminum clad windows; and,
5. That the proposed casement window on the west elevation be replaced with a double-hung, six-over-six simulated divided light, aluminum clad window with an interior spacer bar.

BOARD ACTION, APRIL 16, 2008: On a motion by Mr. Keleher, seconded by Ms. Neihardt, the Board deferred the application for restudy. The vote on the motion was 6-0.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: Staff recommends approval of the application with the following conditions:

1. That the applicant work with Staff to determine if any historic wood siding exists beneath the Masonite and vinyl siding; and
2. That if historic siding exists and is in good condition, this be repaired and retained. If the condition of the siding is poor, the applicant should install the same type of wood siding that was originally on the house; and
3. That a vertical trim board be used to separate the subject property from its twin townhouse at 1217 Prince Street. This can be achieved by either maintaining the

- existing vertical board or installing a new wood trim board;
4. That the new windows on the rear elevation be one-over-one, double-insulated aluminum clad windows; and
 5. That the proposed casement window on the west elevation be replaced with a double-hung, six-over-six simulated divided light, aluminum clad window with an interior spacer bar.

Insert sketch map here.

Update: At the April 16, 2008 BAR hearing, the Board asked the applicant to provide more accurate drawings which clearly show the details of the proposal. The applicant has submitted additional drawings, including existing and proposed elevations, as well as manufacturer's specifications for the proposed windows. The applicant has also amended the application to include the replacement of the existing door on the west elevation of the addition with a double-hung window and to include spacer bars in the simulated divided light windows. One Board member also raised the possibility of replacing the brick mold trim on the front windows with a more historically appropriate trim, however, the applicant's intention is to leave the existing window trim configuration in place.

I. ISSUE:

The applicant is requesting approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness for alterations at 1219 Prince Street. The alterations include changes to both the historic portion of the property and the rear addition. The alterations include:

Siding

The Masonite and vinyl siding on the front and side of the historic portion of the property will be replaced with 6" reveal wood siding. The vinyl siding on the addition will be replaced with 6" reveal Hardiplank fiber cement siding.

Windows

Front (historic)

The applicant proposes no changes to the windows on the historic building, with the possible exception of removing the existing storm windows. The existing wood windows have a six-over-six or six-over-nine light configuration. The applicant intends to leave the existing windows trim in place.

North addition elevation

The applicant proposes to replace and enlarge the existing second floor window on the north elevation and install a new matching window to the west. Both windows will be six-over-six, simulated divided light, aluminum clad wood windows by Marvin. The fixed muntins will measure 7/8" and the windows will have a spacer bar between the two panes of glass. No changes are proposed for the bottom two windows or door.

West addition elevation

The existing second floor windows will be replaced and a third window will be added. The southernmost of the three windows will be a casement window with 12 lights. The other two windows will be slightly smaller than the casement window and will have a six-over-six, double-hung configuration. The existing six-over-six wood window on the first floor of the addition will be retained, however, the door will be replaced with a double hung window matching the double-hung windows on the second floor. All of the windows are proposed to be simulated

divided lights by Marvin.

Other Alterations

The 9" overhang on the second floor of the addition will be removed so that the addition elevations will be flush.

II. HISTORY:

1219 Prince Street is a two story, flat roofed Italianate style frame duplex dating from ca. 1870 with a significant bracketed and dentiled cornice. It is a twin with the adjacent rowhouse at 1217 Prince Street, which retains its original detailed door surround. Although originally constructed as a residence, the building was converted to commercial uses some time ago. Staff could locate no prior Board approvals for this property, nor could staff indentify the exact age of the addition, although it was likely constructed in the 1970s or 1980s. In 2002, the Board approved replacement wood siding at the adjacent townhouse (BAR Case # 2001-0299, February 6, 2002), although the project was never undertaken.

III. ANALYSIS:

The proposed alterations comply with the zoning ordinance.

Staff is pleased that the applicant is renovating this historic property and improving the appearance of what is a stark and very utilitarian addition. While generally supportive of the application, staff has a few concerns regarding some of the details discussed below.

Siding/Trim

The *Design Guidelines* recommend retaining and preserving historic material whenever possible, especially when it is such a character defining element like siding. Staff has not yet been able to inspect the house to determine whether any historic siding exists under the Masonite and vinyl siding on the historic townhouse. If original siding exists and is in good condition, staff recommends that this be repaired and retained. If the condition of the siding is poor, staff recommends that the applicant install the same type of wood siding that was originally on the house. The applicant should work closely with staff to determine the most appropriate course of action once the Masonite and vinyl siding is removed. Regardless of type of siding material, there should be a vertical trim board between the subject property and its twin at 1217 Prince Street in order to differentiate the two townhouses. The application could either maintain the existing vertical board or install a new wood trim board.

The rear addition is clearly a later addition and staff does not object to the use of Hardiplank siding on the addition. Staff believes that the Hardiplank will be a vast improvement over the existing vinyl siding.

Windows

The *Design Guidelines* recommend that all windows on historic properties be single glazed (one pane of glass) with true divided lights. However, the Board typically approves the use of double insulated windows with exterior mullions and interior spacer bars on later, non-historic

additions. Likewise, aluminum clad windows are also acceptable for the addition in this particular case given the age of the addition.

Because the historic portion of the house has multi-paned windows and the first floor of the west elevation of the addition has an existing six-over-six window, staff finds the multi-pane window style acceptable on this elevation of the addition. However, staff does not support the mixing of window types on the rear elevation (six-over-six windows on the second floor and one-over-one windows on the first floor). Although the applicant has indicated that he may change the exceptionally large first floor windows (roughly 6' in height) to French doors at some point in the future, staff believes the mix of window types would be incongruous on this elevation which is quite visible from the public alley in the rear.

Staff also does not support the installation of the casement style window on the second floor of the addition's west elevation, unless it becomes necessary to meet fire code egress requirements as the applicant believes. In the opinion of staff, all three windows on the second floor of the west elevation should be double-hung.

Other Alterations

Staff has no objection to the removal of the 9" overhang on the addition. Its removal will improve the appearance of the west elevation of the addition.

IV. STAFF RECOMMENDATION: Staff recommends approval of the application with the following conditions:

1. That the applicant work with Staff to determine if any historic wood siding exists beneath the amazonite and vinyl siding;
2. That if historic siding exists and is in good condition, it must be repaired and retained. If the condition of the siding is poor, the applicant should install the same type of wood siding that was originally on the house;
3. That a vertical trim board be used to separate the subject property from its twin townhouse at 1217 Prince Street. This can be achieved by either maintaining the existing vertical board or installing a new wood trim board;
4. That the new windows on the rear elevation be one-over-one, double-insulated aluminum clad windows; and,
5. That the proposed casement window on the west elevation be replaced with a double-hung, six-over-six simulated divided light, aluminum clad window with an interior spacer bar.

CITY DEPARTMENT COMMENTS

Legend: C - code requirement R - recommendation S - suggestion F- finding

Code Enforcement:

- C-1 Alterations to the existing structure must comply with the current edition of the Uniform Statewide Building Code (USBC).
- C-2 Alterations to the existing structure and/or installation and/or altering of equipment therein requires a building permit. Five sets of plans, bearing the signature and seal of a design professional registered in the Commonwealth of Virginia, must accompany the written application. The plans must include all dimensions, construction alterations details, kitchen equipment, electrical, plumbing, and mechanical layouts and schematics.
- C-3 Construction permits are required for this project. Plans shall accompany the permit application that fully details the construction as well as layouts and schematics of the mechanical, electrical, and plumbing systems.
- C-4 Permission from adjacent property owners is required if access to the adjacent properties is required to complete the proposed construction. Otherwise, a plan shall be submitted to demonstrate the construction techniques utilized to keep construction solely on the referenced property.

Historic Alexandria:

- R-1 Approve.