Docket Item # 8 BAR CASE # 2008-0164

BAR Meeting October 15, 2008

Alterations
Robert Bentley Adams & Associates
315 South Columbus Street
RM/Residential

<u>STAFF RECOMMENDATION:</u> Staff recommends approval of the application with the following conditions:

- 1. That the exterior muntins be constructed of wood without metal cladding; and
- 2. That the brick stoop and stairs be deleted and that a new stoop and stairs be constructed of iron, similar to the one shown in the applicant's submitted photograph.



I. <u>ISSUE</u>:

The applicant is requesting approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness for a new front railing and replacement rear windows and doors at 315 South Columbus Street.

The existing front metal railing will be replaced with a Late Victorian style iron railing, which will be attached to the existing brick stoop.

The applicant also proposes to replace the existing windows and single French door on the rear elevation with a pair of double insulated two-over-two wood windows on the second floor and double French doors on the first floor. The Jeld-wen windows will have a two-over-two light configuration with an interior spacer bar and 1 ¹/₂" muntins. The double-insulated wood French doors will also be manufactured by Jeld-Wen and will have a six-light pattern. The Jeld-Wen materials submitted by the applicant show that the muntins will be metal clad.

II. HISTORY:

The two story, two bay wide, frame house at 315 South Columbus Street was constructed as a pair with the house at 317 South Columbus Street. The Italianate style houses do not appear on the 1877 Hopkins Atlas, but are present by 1885 when Alexandria was first mapped by the Sanborn Fire Insurance Company. As originally constructed, the house appears to have had a shorter rear ell. By 1902, the rear ell had been extended to its present footprint. By 1921, a two story porch, no longer extant, had been added to the rear elevation. The property is located in the DIP Urban Renewal Area, which was the focus of much renovation and renewal starting in the mid 1970s. The house was extensively renovated between 1982 and 1984 (Permit #38466, December 29,1982 and Certificate of Occupancy #8993, April 30, 1984).

More recently, on May 18, 2005, the BAR approved a one story rear addition which was never constructed (BAR Case #2005-0098 & 0099), and in 2006 and 2007 BAR Staff administratively approved replacement windows and doors.

III. ANALYSIS:

The proposed alterations comply with zoning ordinance requirements.

Staff commends the applicant for installing a more appropriate Late Victorian decorative iron railing at 315 South Columbus Street. Although all of the houses in this block which were renovated as part of the DIP urban renewal project have either simple iron railings or wood railings, Staff supports the change in railing because it is more historically appropriate to this late 19th century townhouse. After Staff raised concerns about the lack of precedence for an iron railing with a brick stoop, the applicant indicated a willingness to replace the existing brick stoop with a metal stoop and stairs similar to the one shown in the photograph that accompanies the application. Staff strongly supports this modification which meets the recommendations contained in the *Design Guidelines* for Stoops, Stairs and Railings.

The *Design Guidelines* recommend that: "...replacement windows should be appropriate to the historic period of the architectural style of the building". The *Guidelines* also state that single-glazed, true divided light windows with interior storm sash are the preferred replacement window type. The *Guidelines* continue by saying that other acceptable window types are "double-glazed, true divided

light wood windows...Windows with fixed or applied muntins have been approved for the rear elevation of a structure which has minimal visibility from a public right of way." In this particular case, given the lack of historic fabric on the rear elevation and the more appropriate window light pattern proposed on the second floor, Staff does not object to the installation of the proposed double-insulated windows and doors.

After Staff raised concerns over the use of metal clad muntins, the applicant clarified that wood muntins would be installed.

IV. STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends approval of the application with the following conditions:

- 1. That the exterior muntins be constructed of wood without metal cladding; and
- 2. That the brick stoop and stairs be deleted and that a new stoop and stairs be constructed of iron, similar to the one shown in the applicant's submitted photograph.

V. <u>CITY DEPARTMENT COMMENTS</u>

Legend: C - code requirement R - recommendation S - suggestion F- finding

Code Enforcement:

- C-1 Alterations to the existing structure must comply with the current edition of the Uniform Statewide Building Code (USBC).
- C-2 Alterations to the existing structure and/or installation and/or altering of equipment therein requires a building permit. Five sets of plans, bearing the signature and seal of a design professional registered in the Commonwealth of Virginia, must accompany the written application. The plans must include all dimensions, construction alterations details, kitchen equipment, electrical, plumbing, and mechanical layouts and schematics.
- C-3 Construction permits are required for this project. Plans shall accompany the permit application that fully details the construction as well as layouts and schematics of the mechanical, electrical, and plumbing systems.
- C-4 Permission from adjacent property owners is required if access to the adjacent properties is required to complete the proposed construction. Otherwise, a plan shall be submitted to demonstrate the construction techniques utilized to keep construction solely on the referenced property.

<u>Historic Alexandria:</u> No comments received.

VI. <u>IMAGES</u>



Figure 1: Site plan



Figure 2: Existing photos



Figure 3: Proposed demolition



Figure 4: Proposed elevations



Figure 5: Window details



Figure 6: Window details



Figure 7: Window details