Docket Item # 3 BAR CASE # 2008-0249

BAR Meeting January 21, 2009

ISSUE:	Addition and alterations
APPLICANT:	Robert Bentley Adams & Associates
LOCATION:	702 South Fairfax Street
ZONE:	RM/Residential

<u>STAFF RECOMMENDATION</u>: Staff recommends approval of the application with the following conditions:

- 1. The applicant shall work with Staff to determine if there is historic wood siding under the existing Masonite and whether it can be retained and repaired. If there is no historic wood siding, or if the wood siding is determined to be beyond repair, the applicant shall work with Staff for final approval of appropriate new wood siding.
- 2. The nails shall not show in the installation of the fiber cement siding on the addition and only smooth (non-simulated wood grain) fiber cement siding shall be installed on the addition.
- 3. The applicant shall install a vertical wood trim board on the south elevation to differentiate the historic house from the addition and provide a clear break between the wood and fiber cement siding.
- 4. *The applicant/developer shall call Alexandria Archaeology immediately (703-838-4399) if any buried structural remains (wall foundations, wells, privies, cisterns, etc.) or concentrations of artifacts are discovered during development. Work must cease in the area of the discovery until a City archaeologist comes to the site and records the finds.
- 5. *The applicant/developer shall not allow any metal detection to be conducted on the property, unless authorized by Alexandria Archaeology.
- 6. The statements in archaeology conditions above marked with an asterisk "*" shall appear in the General Notes of all site plans and on all site plan sheets that involve demolition or ground disturbance (including Basement/Foundation Plans, Demolition, Erosion and Sediment Control, Grading, Landscaping, Utilities, and Sheeting and Shoring) so that on-site contractors are aware of the requirements.



Note: Docket Item #2 must be approved before this item may be considered.

I. <u>ISSUE:</u>

The applicant is requesting approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness for an addition and alterations at 702 South Fairfax Street.

Addition

The applicant proposes to construct a two-story rear addition measuring approximately 8.3' by 12.35' on the side (east) elevation of the existing house which currently measures approximately 40.7' in length by 14.7' in width at the main block and 12.7' in width at the rear ell. On the south side of the proposed addition will be a 1.65' x 8.3' one-story cantilevered addition. Adjacent to the existing rear ell, located within the "notch" where the ell steps back, is a proposed one-story cantilevered addition measuring 1.65' x 4.75'. The one-story components will be cantilevered approximately 6" from the ground. The proposed addition will be clad in painted fiber cement siding with a standing seam metal roof to match the existing.

On the south side elevation, an existing multi-light door will be removed and that portion of the wall enclosed by the smaller of the two one-story additions. The rear (east) elevation will be two bays. On the first story will be an eight-over-eight, double-hung, single-glazed, true divided light wood window and a nine-light, single-leaf wood door. The second story will have two six-over-six, double-hung, single-glazed, true divided light wood windows. The muntin width of the proposed windows is 7/8". The proposed windows will be fitted with coordinating storm windows. There will be a brick foundation and brick stoop at the new rear door.

Alterations

The applicant is proposing alterations to the exterior of the existing townhouse.

The applicant is proposing to remove the existing Masonite siding. The applicant has noted that they will examine the exterior to see if wood siding exists under the Masonite and whether it can be retained. If possible, the applicant will retain and repair wood siding where possible and, as needed, replace with new wood siding to match. On the south side elevation, an existing, non-historic, one-over-one wood window will be replaced with a six-over-six, double-hung, single-glazed, true divided light wood window.

The applicant is proposing to construct a wood fence with gates and a new wood arbor at the rear of the property. The fence and gates will replace an existing wood fence at the rear of the property on the north property line. The fence, gates and arbor will be painted. The fence will be board on board and will measure 5'4"in height. The gate will have a rounded top and measure 6' in height. The proposed arbor will be 80% open and measure approximately 9'6" at its highest point.

II. HISTORY:

The residential structure at 702 South Fairfax Street is a two-story, two-bay frame townhouse which City real estate records dates to 1880. The G.M. Hopkins *City Atlas of Alexandria* depicts a building, similar in configuration to the existing dwelling, at this location in 1877. The building appears on the *Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps* from 1896 (the first year which covers

this area). Only the main block is depicted on the 1896 map. The rear ell first appears on the *Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps* from 1907. The existing one-story rear shed addition (attached to the rear ell) was constructed after 1958, according to *Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps* from that year.

In 1959, the Board approved the installation of white aluminum siding to the building. In 1979 the Board approved alterations to the building.

III. <u>ANALYSIS</u>:

The proposed rear addition, fence, gate, and arbor comply with Zoning Ordinance regulations.

In the opinion of Staff, the proposed addition is appropriate and compatible with the two-story townhouse at 702 South Fairfax Street and conforms to the *Design Guidelines* for residential additions. The design of the addition is compatible in scale, mass and design with the frame townhouse and will not overwhelm the existing house. Further, the addition will primarily be visible only from South Fairfax Street through a view through the adjacent driveway.

The *Design Guidelines* state that "the design of an addition should respect the heritage of the historic building to which it is attached as well as adjacent buildings....or which echo the design elements of the existing structure." Staff finds that the proposed addition complements the architectural style of the dwelling. Staff finds that the proposed addition makes use of elements of the existing townhouse but is differentiated from the historic fabric through a step back in the wall plane on the north elevation. Although the two small first-story cantilevered components are not a traditional design, Staff finds that their diminutive size and minimal visibility make them acceptable. The simple shed roofs on these small additions contribute to their compatibility.

Staff is concerned about the transition between the fiber cement siding on the addition and the wood siding on the historic house on the south elevation, where the addition wall is flush with the existing rear ell. Of concern is how to successfully transition from wood siding to fiber cement siding on an uninterrupted wall plane. In order to clearly differentiate the old from the new, as well as the change of materials, it is recommended that a vertical wood trim board be installed on the south elevation.

The new windows and doors, as well as the one replacement window, are appropriate for the building and consistent with the *Design Guidelines*.

Staff finds that the proposed alterations to the existing townhouse are appropriate and consistent with the *Design Guidelines*. Staff notes that the proposed addition and alterations include the removal of a painted exterior metal flue chimney attached to the historic rear ell. The removal of this feature is appropriate.

The proposed fence, gates and arbor are appropriate in regard to materials, design and scale. The fence, gates and arbor will be painted, an appropriate treatment.

Staff also notes the conditions from Alexandria Archaeology.

IV. <u>STAFF RECOMMENDATION</u>: Staff recommends approval of the application with the following conditions:

- 1. The applicant shall work with Staff to determine if there is historic wood siding under the existing Masonite and whether it can be retained and repaired. If there is no historic wood siding, or if the wood siding is determined to be beyond repair, the applicant shall work with Staff for final approval of appropriate new wood siding.
- 2. The nails shall not show in the installation of the fiber cement siding on the addition and only smooth (non-simulated wood grain) fiber cement siding shall be installed on the addition.
- 3. The applicant shall install a vertical wood trim board on the south elevation to differentiate the historic house from the addition and provide a clear break between the wood and fiber cement siding.
- 4. *The applicant/developer shall call Alexandria Archaeology immediately (703-838-4399) if any buried structural remains (wall foundations, wells, privies, cisterns, etc.) or concentrations of artifacts are discovered during development. Work must cease in the area of the discovery until a City archaeologist comes to the site and records the finds.
- 5. *The applicant/developer shall not allow any metal detection to be conducted on the property, unless authorized by Alexandria Archaeology.
- 6. The statements in archaeology conditions above marked with an asterisk "*" shall appear in the General Notes of all site plans and on all site plan sheets that involve demolition or ground disturbance (including Basement/Foundation Plans, Demolition, Erosion and Sediment Control, Grading, Landscaping, Utilities, and Sheeting and Shoring) so that on-site contractors are aware of the requirements.

V. <u>CITY DEPARTMENT COMMENTS</u>

Legend: C - code requirement R - recommendation S - suggestion F- finding

Code Enforcement:

- C-1 All exterior walls within 5 feet from an interior property line shall have a fire resistance rating of 1 hour, from both sides of the wall. As alternative, a 2 hour fire wall may be provided. This condition is also applicable to skylights within setback distance. Openings in exterior walls between 3 and 5 feet shall not exceed 25% of the area of the entire wall surface (This shall include bay windows). Openings shall not be permitted in exterior walls within 3 feet of an interior lot line.
- C-2 Prior to the issuance of a demolition permit or land disturbance permit, a rodent abatement plan shall be submitted to Code Enforcement that will outline the steps that will taken to prevent the spread of rodents from the construction site to the surrounding community and sewers.
- C-3 Roof drainage systems must be installed so as neither to impact upon, nor cause erosion/damage to adjacent property.
- C-4 A soils report must be submitted with the building permit application.
- C-5 Additions and Alterations to the existing structure must comply with the 2006 edition of the Uniform Statewide Building Code (USBC).
- C-6 Additions and Alterations to the existing structure and/or installation and/or altering of equipment therein requires a building permit. Five sets of plans, bearing the signature and seal of a design professional registered in the Commonwealth of Virginia, must accompany the written application. The plans must include all dimensions, construction alterations details, kitchen equipment, electrical, plumbing, and mechanical layouts and schematics.
- C-7 Construction permits are required for this project. Plans shall accompany the permit application that fully details the construction as well as layouts and schematics of the mechanical, electrical, and plumbing systems.
- C-8 Permission from adjacent property owners is required if access to the adjacent properties is required to complete the proposed construction. Otherwise, a plan shall be submitted to demonstrate the construction techniques utilized to keep construction solely on the referenced property.
- C-9 A wall location plat prepared by a land surveyor is required to be submitted to this office prior to requesting any framing inspection.

Historic Alexandria:

R-1 Approve.

Alexandria Archaeology:

Archaeology Finding

1. Tax records from 1850 note the presence of three free African American households on the block, but the exact addresses are not known. The G.M. Hopkins insurance map shows a structure on the lot in 1877. The property therefore has the potential to yield archaeological resources that could provide insight into domestic activities, perhaps relating to African Americans, in 19th-century Alexandria.

Archaeology Recommendations

*1. The applicant/developer shall call Alexandria Archaeology immediately (703-838-4399) if any buried structural remains (wall foundations, wells, privies, cisterns, etc.) or concentrations of artifacts are discovered during development. Work must cease in the area of the discovery until a City archaeologist comes to the site and records the finds.

*2. The applicant/developer shall not allow any metal detection to be conducted on the property, unless authorized by Alexandria Archaeology.

3. The statements in archaeology conditions above marked with an asterisk "*" shall appear in the General Notes of all site plans and on all site plan sheets that involve demolition or ground disturbance (including Basement/Foundation Plans, Demolition, Erosion and Sediment Control, Grading, Landscaping, Utilities, and Sheeting and Shoring) so that on-site contractors are aware of the requirements.

Transportation and Environmental Services:

FINDINGS

F1. An approved grading plan may be required at the time of building permit application. Insufficient information has been provided to make that determination at this time.

In summary, City Code Section 8-1-22(d) requires that a grading plan be submitted to and approved by T&ES prior to the issuance of building permits for improvements involving:

- the construction of a new home;
- construction of an addition to an existing home where either
 - the addition exceeds the area of the existing building footprint by 100% or more; or
 - the construction of the addition results in less that 50% of the existing first floor exterior walls, in their entirety, remaining;
- changes to existing grade elevation of 1-foot or greater;
- changes to existing drainage patterns;
- land disturbance of 2,500 square feet or greater.

Questions regarding the processing of grading plans should be directed to the T&ES Site Plan Coordinator at (703) 838-4318. Memorandum to Industry No. 02-08 was issued on April 28, 2008 and can be viewed online via the following link.

http://alexandriava.gov/uploadedFiles/tes/info/gradingPlanRequirements.pdf

RECOMMENDATIONS

- R1. The building permit plans shall comply with requirements of City Code Section 8-1-22 regarding the location of downspouts, foundation drains and sump pumps. Refer to Memorandum to Industry dated June 18, 2004. [Memorandum is available online at the City web site under Transportation\Engineering and Design\Memos to Industry.]. (T&ES)
- R2. Applicant shall be responsible for repairs to the adjacent city right-of-way if damaged during construction activity. (T&ES)
- R3. All improvements to the city right-of-way such as curbing, sidewalk, driveway aprons, etc. must be city standard design. (T&ES)
- R4. No permanent structure may be constructed over any existing private and/or public utility easements. It is the responsibility of the applicant to identify any and all existing easements on the plan. (T&ES)
- R5. An erosion and sediment control plan must be approved by T&ES prior to any land disturbing activity greater than 2,500 square feet. (T&ES)
- R5. Compliance with the provisions of Article XIII of the City's zoning ordinance for stormwater quality control is required for any land disturbing activity greater than 2,500 square feet. (T&ES)

VI. <u>IMAGES</u>



Figure 1. Existing (right) and proposed (left) site plan.



Figure 2. Views of front (west) elevation and side (south) elevation from South Fairfax Street.



Figure 3. South elevation of rear ell.



Figure 4. Rear (east) elevation - one-story addition proposed for demolition and rear elevation proposed for encapsulation.



Figure 5. Rear yard, looking eastward.



Figure 6. Existing south elevation (above) and proposed south elevation (below).



Figure 7. Existing east elevation and proposed east elevation.







Figure 9. Existing floor plan.



Figure 10. Proposed floor plan and site plan.



Figure 11. Proposed arbor.



Figure 12. Example of arbor similar to proposed.



Figure 13. Specifications for proposed windows.



Figure 14. Specifications for proposed door.