Docket Item # 8 BAR CASE # 2008-0252

BAR Meeting March 4, 2009

ISSUE:	Addition
APPLICANT:	Stephanie Dimond for Constance M. Locke and David Kiernan
LOCATION:	209 South Fairfax Street
ZONE:	RM/Residential

**<u>STAFF RECOMMENDATION</u>**: Staff recommends approval of the application with the condition that if the windows proposed along the north elevation are not permitted by Code Administration that the applicant revise the design to provide recessed brick panels to simulate closed window openings in place of the proposed windows.

**BOARD ACTION, JANUARY 21, 2009**: The case was deferred prior to the public hearing in order to allow the easement holder, the Alexandria Historical Restoration and Preservation Commission, time to provide comment on the proposed project.

**<u>STAFF RECOMMENDATION</u>**: Staff recommends approval of the application as submitted.



<u>Update</u>: The case was deferred prior to the January 21, 2009 Board meeting in order to allow the easement holder, the Alexandria Historical Restoration and Preservation Commission, time to provide comment on the proposed project. On February 11, 2008, the Commission determined that the proposed addition did not infringe on the terms of the open space and front facade easement.

**Note:** Docket item **#7** must be approved before this item may be considered.

### I. <u>ISSUE</u>:

The applicant is requesting approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness for a second story rear addition at 209 South Fairfax Street.

The proposed second story addition will be constructed above the existing one story gable roof addition located at the rear of the house. The addition runs perpendicular to the rear ell. The addition will also have a gable roof, with the exception of the area along the north elevation where the new roof will be flat in order to tie into the existing flounder form roof of the rear ell. The addition will measure approximately 21' on the east elevation, 22' on the south elevation, 36' on the west elevation and 22' on the north elevation.

The east elevation of the addition will contain two through-the-cornice gabled dormers with wood trim. The six-over-six double hung dormer windows will be wood. The new south elevation will consist of the existing chimney which will be extended to accommodate the additional height, and two double-hung windows on either side. The second story of the south elevation will be set back approximately 3" in order to comply with the required 5' side yard setback. This 3" setback will be created by inserting a molded brick row between the first and second floors. The west elevation of the addition will incorporate three, equally spaced through-the-cornice gabled dormers with wood trim and six-over-six wood windows. The north elevation of the addition will have two casement style wood windows on the second floor.

The windows on the addition, with the exception of the two casement windows on the north elevation, will be manufactured by Loewen and will be double-hung, with simulated divided lights, <sup>3</sup>/<sub>4</sub>" muntins and an interior spacer bar. The casement windows will also have simulated divided lights and <sup>3</sup>/<sub>4</sub>" muntins to mimic the muntin width of the new windows being installed. The roof of the addition and the individual dormer roofs will be clad with hand crimped copper to match the copper roofing on the remainder of the house. The dentiled cornice on the new second story addition will match the existing wood cornice on both the addition and the main house. The addition will be constructed of brick to match the existing brick on the house, and the trim will be painted the same color as the trim on the existing house.

### II. HISTORY:

According to Ethelyn Cox in <u>Historic Alexandria, Street by Street</u>, the house at 209 South Fairfax Street was in existence as of 1787 when John Kempff occupied the house. In May 1866, the single house was converted into two residences (207 and 209 South Fairfax Street). According to the Sanborn Fire Insurance maps, between 1885 and 1902 the rear ell of the semidetached house was extended and two one-story porches were added, as well as a one story addition at the rear. Between 1941 and 1958, the existing one-story addition was added and the rear ell was extended once again, this time to two stories in height. The one story porch along the south elevation of the ell was also added at this time.

Staff was unable to locate any BAR approvals for the property. It appears as if no significant exterior alterations have been made since the 1950s.

# III. ANALYSIS:

The proposed addition complies with zoning ordinance requirements. Staff does not object to the 3" setback of the second story on the south elevation in order to meet the required 5' side yard setback. The setback will not be readily perceivable and the molded brick row adds some architectural interest to this elevation.

In the opinion of Staff, the proposed second story addition is modest in size and scale and does not overwhelm the existing historic house at 209 South Fairfax Street, as recommended in the *Design Guidelines* for residential additions. The addition is set back significantly from the front property line – approximately 93' – and will not be readily visible from South Fairfax Street beyond the brick wall at the front of the property. The rear and north elevations of the second story addition will be more visible from South Royal Street and the City owned Armory Tot Lot playground.

In the opinion of Staff, a second story gable roof addition on this simple Williamsburg style onestory addition creates a more cohesive and compatible addition for the historic house. The use of a gable roof helps to limit the mass of the new addition (the new cornice height is just  $5 \frac{1}{2}$ ' higher than the existing cornice) and the simple style of the addition makes it a good background building for this late  $18^{th}$  century townhouse, "...allow[ing] historic structures to maintain the primary visual importance" (*Design Guidelines*). In has been noted that the north elevation of the addition does not maintain the gable roof form, thereby making the mass of the addition larger on this elevation. In order to alleviate future drainage problems and an awkward roof form (both of which currently exist with the one story gable roof addition), the applicant chose to tie into the existing 1950s rear ell with a flat roof.

The *Design Guidelines* also note that "the style of the dormer should be appropriate to the architectural style of the existing structure." Staff finds that the proposed through-the-cornice dormers, though not common, are appropriate in this circumstance because they help to maintain an overall lower roof height. Through-the-cornice dormers are also occasionally found on Colonial Revival buildings, as evidenced in historic examples in the district, and are not inappropriate in this case given the Williamsburg style of the existing addition. Staff was initially concerned that the second story dormers were not centered above the first floor windows and doors; however, given the limited visibility and the fact that the dormers themselves are appropriately spaced, Staff supports the location of the proposed dormers.

While single-glazed, true-divided-light windows are preferable, the *Design Guidelines* and the Board generally allow for double-insulated, simulated-divided-light wood windows and doors on new construction or in areas with limited visibility. Staff also does not object to the use of casement windows on the north elevation. However, Staff notes that these two windows are

proximate to the north property line in violation of building code requirements. The applicant intends to secure an easement from the adjacent property owner to prevent construction within three feet of these windows and will seek approval from Code Administration to permit the proposed windows. If the windows are not permitted, the wall design will need to be revised to eliminate the windows. Staff recommends that if the windows proposed along the north elevation are not permitted by building regulation that the applicant revise the design to provide recessed brick panels to simulate closed window openings in place of the proposed windows.

Staff notes that the Alexandria Historical Restoration and Preservation Commission determined on February 11, 2009 that the proposed addition did not infringe on the terms of the open space and architectural façade easement.

Staff recommends approval of the application with the condition that if the windows proposed along the north elevation are not permitted by Code Administration that the applicant revise the design to provide recessed brick panels to simulate closed window openings in place of the proposed windows.

# IV. <u>STAFF RECOMMENDATION</u>:

Staff recommends approval of the application with the condition that if the windows proposed along the north elevation are not permitted by Code Administration that the applicant revise the design to provide recessed brick panels to simulate closed window openings in place of the proposed windows.

# V. <u>CITY DEPARTMENT COMMENTS</u>

#### Legend: C - code requirement R - recommendation S - suggestion F- finding

#### Code Enforcement:

- C-1 All exterior walls within 5 feet from an interior property line shall have a fire resistance rating of 1 hour, from both sides of the wall. As alternative, a 2 hour fire wall may be provided. This condition is also applicable to skylights within setback distance. Openings in exterior walls between 3 and 5 feet shall not exceed 25% of the area of the entire wall surface (This shall include bay windows). Openings shall not be permitted in exterior walls within 3 feet of an interior lot line.
- C-2 Prior to the issuance of a demolition permit or land disturbance permit, a rodent abatement plan shall be submitted to Code Enforcement that will outline the steps that will taken to prevent the spread of rodents from the construction site to the surrounding community and sewers.
- C-3 Roof drainage systems must be installed so as neither to impact upon, nor cause erosion/damage to adjacent property.
- C-4 A soils report must be submitted with the building permit application.
- C-5 Additions and Alterations to the existing structure must comply with the 2006 edition of the Uniform Statewide Building Code (USBC).
- C-6 Additions and Alterations to the existing structure and/or installation and/or altering of equipment therein requires a building permit. Five sets of plans, bearing the signature and seal of a design professional registered in the Commonwealth of Virginia, must accompany the written application. The plans must include all dimensions, construction alterations details, kitchen equipment, electrical, plumbing, and mechanical layouts and schematics.
- C-7 Construction permits are required for this project. Plans shall accompany the permit application that fully details the construction as well as layouts and schematics of the mechanical, electrical, and plumbing systems.
- C-8 Permission from adjacent property owners is required if access to the adjacent properties is required to complete the proposed construction. Otherwise, a plan shall be submitted to demonstrate the construction techniques utilized to keep construction solely on the referenced property.
- C-9 A wall location plat prepared by a land surveyor is required to be submitted to this office prior to requesting any framing inspection.

Historic Alexandria:

R-1 Approve.

Alexandria Archaeology: F-1 There is low poten

There is low potential for significant archaeological resources to be disturbed by this project. No archaeological action is required.

#### VI. <u>IMAGES</u>



Figure 1: Plat



Figure 2: Existing Front/East Elevation



Figure 3: Existing North Elevation Showing Rear Ell and One Story Addition



Figure 4: East Elevation of 1950s Addition



Figure 5: Existing Interior Garden and South Elevation of Main House



Figure 6: Rear (West) Elevation of 1950s Addition



Figure 7: Existing Floor Plan - 1st & 2nd Floor







**Figure 9: Existing East and South Elevations** 



Figure 10: Existing West and North Elevations



Figure 11: Proposed Floor Plans - 1st & 2nd Floor



Figure 12: Proposed Floor Plan - 3rd Floor



Figure 13: Proposed East and South Elevations



Figure 14: Proposed West and North Elevations



Figure 15: Window Specifications



Figure 16: Window Specification