Docket Item # 7 BAR CASE # 2009-0081

BAR Meeting May 20, 2009

ISSUE:	Alterations
APPLICANT:	Jennifer Barnes
LOCATION:	10 Irving Court
ZONE:	CL / Commercial

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: Staff recommends that the application be approved with the condition that replacement windows (complete sash replacement) be used instead of replacement window inserts, with final window specifications to be approved by Staff prior to the applicant ordering the replacement windows.

**EXPIRATION OF APPROVALS NOTE: In accordance with Sections 10-106(B) and 10-206(B) of the Zoning Ordinance, any official Board of Architectural Review approval will expire 12 months from the date of issuance if the work is not commenced and diligently and substantially pursued by the end of that 12-month period.

**BUILDING PERMIT NOTE: Most projects approved by the Board of Architectural Review require the issuance of one or more construction permits by Building and Fire Code Administration (<u>including signs</u>). The applicant is responsible for obtaining all necessary construction permits after receiving Board of Architectural Review approval. Contact Code Administration, Room 4200, City Hall, 703-838-4360 for further information.



I. ISSUE:

The applicant is requesting approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness for replacement window inserts at 10 Irving Court. The existing windows are true divided light, singled-glazed wood windows. The proposed replacement windows are simulated divided light wood window inserts to match the existing in light configuration. The proposed windows will have a 7/8 inch muntin with an interior spacer bar and exterior applied wood muntins.

The applicant also proposed replacement wood siding and trim at the dormers and in-kind replacement skylights with the application submission. Staff administratively approved these alterations finding them historically appropriate and compatible.

II. <u>HISTORY</u>:

10 Irving Court is a one and one-half story stucco residence with the general character of a carriage house. At the north elevation is a recessed entrance and three windows on the first door with three gable dormers at the roof. The south elevation has several asymmetrical openings. While buildings with a similar footprint have been located on this property since at least 1885, a visual inspection and research indicate that the existing building is not historic.

According to the Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps from 1885, a two-story building was identified at this location as one of a row of three shanties. In 1891, according to the Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps, the building was described as a tenement and had a frame porch on the south elevation. In 1896, the Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps indicate two, two-story dwellings at this site. In the ensuing years, the two dwellings had one-story additions and frame porches on the south elevation. In 1921, the Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps depict this site as having three dwelling units, each with a one-story addition and one-story porch. The 1958 Sanborn Fire Insurance Map continues to show three two-story dwelling units. The 1989 Sanborn Fire Insurance Map indicates a building with the same footprint at this location but significantly altered with the majority of the building being a one-story warehouse and a small portion being a concrete garage.

The Board has approved several alterations to this property under the address 907-909 Duke Street. In 1963, the Board approved three cinder block garages to be erected with the condition that they be painted white. In 1980, the Board approved alterations and an addition at three separate hearings. In 1981, the Board denied an application to change the roof materials. And in 1982, the Board approved a sign at 909 Duke Street. In 1991, the Board approved projecting sign at 10 Irving Court.

III. <u>ANALYSIS</u>:

The proposed alterations comply with zoning ordinance requirements.

The *Guidelines* state that single-glazed, true divided light windows with interior storm sash are the preferred replacement window type. In addition, the *Guidelines* note that "windows with fixed or applied muntins have been approved for the rear elevation of a structure which has minimal visibility from a public right of way." Although this building is not historic and therefore has no historic fabric, it does have single-glazed true divided light wood windows. Recognizing that this is not a historic building, Staff finds that simulated divided light wood windows, with interior spacers and applied muntins would be generally acceptable. The building is located entirely on a public alley and has minimal visibility from public streets. However, Staff is concerned that the proposed replacements are window inserts rather than complete sash replacements. Window inserts, or the installation of a new frame and window inside an existing frame, significantly alter the existing fenestration as they decrease the size of the daylight opening and increase the area of frame. In circumstances where window inserts have been used, the fenestration becomes reduced in size and out of proportion. Staff finds that simulated divided light, double-glazed wood windows are acceptable but recommends that they be a complete sash replacement rather than replacement window inserts.

IV. <u>STAFF RECOMMENDATION</u>:

Staff recommends that the application be approved with the condition that replacement windows (complete sash replacement) be used instead of replacement window inserts, with final window specifications to be approved by Staff prior to the applicant ordering the replacement windows.

V. <u>CITY DEPARTMENT COMMENTS</u>

Legend: C - code requirement R - recommendation S - suggestion F- finding

Code Administration:

- C-1 Alterations to the existing structure must comply with the 2006 edition of the Uniform Statewide Building Code (USBC).
- C-2 Alterations to the existing structure and/or installation and/or altering of equipment therein requires a building permit. Five sets of plans, bearing the signature and seal of a design professional registered in the Commonwealth of Virginia, must accompany the written application. The plans must include all dimensions, construction alterations details, kitchen equipment, electrical, plumbing, and mechanical layouts and schematics.

Historic Alexandria:

R-1 Approve.

VI. <u>IMAGES</u>



Figure 1. North elevation, 10 Irving Court, indicating location of windows proposed for replacement.



Figure 2. South elevation, 10 Irving Court, indicating window proposed for replacement.







Figure 4. Proposed window specifications.



Figure 5. Proposed window specifications.



Figure 6. Proposed window specifications, divided light options. Application is proposing insulated glass with 7/8" SDL and spacer bar.