Docket Item # 8 BAR CASE # 2009-0150

BAR Meeting September 2, 2009

Alterations
Scott Management Inc.
620 Jefferson Street
RCX

**<u>STAFF RECOMMENDATION</u>**: Staff recommends denial of the application.

\*\*EXPIRATION OF APPROVALS NOTE: In accordance with Sections 10-106(B) and 10-206(B) of the Zoning Ordinance, any official Board of Architectural Review approval will expire 12 months from the date of issuance if the work is not commenced and diligently and substantially pursued by the end of that 12-month period.

\*\*BUILDING PERMIT NOTE: Most projects approved by the Board of Architectural Review require the issuance of one or more construction permits by Building and Fire Code Administration (<u>including signs</u>). The applicant is responsible for obtaining all necessary construction permits after receiving Board of Architectural Review approval. Contact Code Administration, Room 4200, City Hall, 703-838-4360 for further information.

#### BAR CASE #2009-0150 July 29, 2009



**<u>Note</u>**: The Permit to Demolish/Encapsulate, BAR Case #2009-0176, must be approved before this item may be considered.

### I. ISSUE:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for the installation of through-the-wall HVAC units at the Monticello-Lee Condominium complex located at 620 Jefferson Street and along South Washington Street. For the purpose of installation the proposed wall units will require that a 17 <sup>1</sup>/<sub>4</sub> inch by 27 <sup>1</sup>/<sub>4</sub> inch hole be cut into the masonry of all 325 condominium units. The HVAC units will extend 9/16 of an inch from the exterior wall of the building. The applicant has indicated the intention of painting the exterior grills to match the masonry. The total area of proposed demolition for all 325 units is 1,054 square feet.

### II. HISTORY:

The Monticello Lee Condominium complex was designed by Evan Conner for the Atlantic Development Company and was constructed in late 1939 and early 1940. The garden style condominium buildings are three stories in height and constructed of brick. The buildings have undergone minimal exterior alterations in their seventy year history.

The Monticello-Lee Condominiums are among a number of garden apartment complexes constructed in Alexandria at the north and south ends of Washington Street from the late 1930s through approximately 1950. Each of these garden-style apartment developments utilized Colonial Revival detailing, had large setbacks and open space, and are emblematic of garden-style apartments throughout the Washington, D.C. region.

The only prior BAR case for this property was heard before the Old and Historic Board on March 20<sup>th</sup> of 1996, at which time the Board approved replacement of 752 non original windows.

#### III. ANALYSIS:

The proposed alterations comply with Zoning Ordinance requirements.

According to the *Design Guidelines*, "Through-the-wall air conditioning units are discouraged because of their adverse visual impact as well as the loss of historic building material that results from their installation." The Monticello Lee Condominium complex currently has window AC units that can either be repaired or replaced upon failure without any impact on the historic building. It is the opinion of Staff that due to ever-progressive HVAC technology it is inappropriate to remove historic fabric in order to install new HVAC units that will eventually loose relevancy. Additionally, the Monticello-Lee Condominium complex spans one block of South Washington Street which is part of the George Washington Memorial Parkway and thus subject to the Washington Street Design Guidelines which state that, "construction shall be compatible with and similar to traditional building character particularly mass, scale, design, and style, found on Washington Street on commercial or residential building of historic architectural merit." Through-the-wall HVAC units are neither compatible with nor

similar to traditional building character and therefore Staff recommends denial of the application.

IV. <u>STAFF RECOMMENDATION</u>: Staff recommends denial of the application.

# **STAFF**:

Meredith Kizer, Historic Preservation Planner, Planning & Zoning Lee Webb, Historic Preservation Manager, Planning & Zoning

#### V. <u>CITY DEPARTMENT COMMENTS</u>

Legend: C - code requirement R - recommendation S - suggestion F- finding

Code Administration:

- C-1 Installation of the mechanical units must comply with the current edition of the Mechanical Code.
- C-2 Alterations to the existing structure must comply with the 2006 edition of the Uniform Statewide Building Code (USBC).
- C-3 Alterations to the existing structure and/or installation and/or altering of equipment therein requires a building permit. Five sets of plans, bearing the signature and seal of a design professional registered in the Commonwealth of Virginia, must accompany the written application. The plans must include all dimensions, construction alterations details, kitchen equipment, electrical, plumbing, and mechanical layouts and schematics.
- C-4 Construction permits are required for this project. Plans shall accompany the permit application that fully details the construction as well as layouts and schematics of the mechanical, electrical, and plumbing systems.

<u>Historic Alexandria:</u> No comments received.

# VI. <u>IMAGES</u>



Figure 1. Photograph of building from S. Washington St.



Figure 2. Photograph of building with existing HVAC units.



Figure 1. Proposed HVAC Units.