

*******APPROVED MINUTES*******

Alexandria Board of Architectural Review
Old & Historic Alexandria District

Wednesday, January 20, 2010
7:30pm, City Council Chambers, City Hall
301 King Street, Alexandria, Virginia 22314

Members Present: Tom Hulfish, Chairman
Oscar Fitzgerald
Arthur Keleher
Wayne Neale
John von Senden
Peter Smeallie

Staff Present: Planning & Zoning
Michele Oaks, Historic Preservation Planner
Al Cox, Architect, Historic Preservation Manager
Stephen Milone, Division Chief, Land-Use Services

The meeting was called to order at 7:33 p.m. by Chairman Hulfish.

1. Consideration of the minutes of the public hearings of December 16, 2009 and January 6, 2010.

BOARD ACTION: Approved as submitted, 6-0.

2. Consideration of a Consent Calendar of items to be approved without discussion. A list of these items will be read at the beginning of the meeting.

BOARD ACTION: Approved docket item #3 on the Consent Calendar, 6-0.

On a motion by Mr. Smeallie, seconded by Mr. Keleher, the Board voted to approve docket item #3 on the Consent Calendar as amended, with a vote of 6-0.

CONSENT CALENDAR:

3. **CASE BAR2009-0310**

Request for approval of alterations at **731-735 N Columbus St**, zoned RB Residential.

APPLICANT: Saint Joseph Catholic Church.

BOARD ACTION: Approved as amended on the Consent Calendar, 6-0.

END CONSENT CALENDAR

DISCUSSION ITEMS:

4. **CASE BAR2009-0293**

Request for approval of new construction at **634 S Pitt St**, zoned RM Residential.

APPLICANT: Stephanie Dimond for George & Maria Charuhas

BOARD ACTION: Approved as amended, 6-0.

On a motion by Mr. Neale, seconded by Mr. Keleher, the Board voted to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for new construction with the conditions that:

1. That the applicant submit specifications for the aluminum-clad windows, front picket fence, light fixtures and brick selection for final approval by Staff.
2. That the shed roofs on the front porch and entry portico have an overhang extending beyond the columns to be more in keeping with traditional porch design and reflecting the eaves of the main house roof.
3. *The applicant/developer shall call Alexandria Archaeology immediately (703-838-4399) if any buried structural remains (wall foundations, wells, privies, cisterns, etc.) or concentrations of artifacts are discovered during development. Work must cease in the area of the discovery until a City archaeologist comes to the site and records the finds.
4. *The applicant/developer shall not allow any metal detection or artifact collection to be conducted on the property, unless authorized by Alexandria Archaeology.
5. *The statements in archaeology conditions above marked with an asterisk "*" shall appear in the General Notes of all site plans and on all site plan sheets that involve demolition or ground disturbance (including Basement/Foundation Plans, Demolition, Erosion and Sediment Control, Grading, Landscaping, Utilities, and Sheeting and Shoring) so that on-site contractors are aware of the requirements.

The vote on the motion was 6-0.

REASON: The Board agreed with the Staff analysis and found the new construction to be a sympathetic design which evokes the Victorian era. The Board expressed that since this was a new infill house; they supported the proposed aluminum clad wood windows, noting that a new house should be constructed from quality, modern building materials.

SPEAKERS: Stephanie Dimond, representing the applicant, spoke in support of the application, and agreed to the proposed conditions.

John Hynan, representing the Historic Alexandria Foundation, spoke in support of staff recommendation #2, but noted concerns with the proposed aluminum clad windows.

5. CASE BAR2009-0308

Request for approval of demolition/encapsulation at **206 Duke St**, zoned RM Residential.

APPLICANT: Harry & Maria Hopper.

BOARD ACTION: Approved as amended, by a roll call vote, 5-1.

On a motion by Mr. von Senden, seconded by Mr. Keleher, the Board voted to approve the application for a Permit to Demolish/Encapsulate, Certificate of Appropriateness, and waiver of HVAC screening requirement as amended, by a roll call vote, with the following conditions:

1. That the synthetic trim be solid-through-the-core and paintable;

2. That the following statements shall appear in the General Notes of all site plans and on all site plan sheets that involve demolition or ground disturbance (including Basement/Foundation Plans, Demolition, Erosion and Sediment Control, Grading, Landscaping, Utilities, and Sheeting and Shoring) so that on-site contractors are aware of the requirements:
 - A. The applicant/developer shall call Alexandria Archaeology (703/838-4399) two weeks before the starting date of any ground disturbance so that a monitoring and inspection schedule for city archaeologists can be arranged.
 - B. The applicant/developer shall call Alexandria Archaeology immediately (703-838-4399) if any buried structural remains (wall foundations, wells, privies, cisterns, etc.) or concentrations of artifacts are discovered during development. Work must cease in the area of the discovery until a City archaeologist comes to the site and records the finds.
 - C. The applicant/developer shall not allow any metal detection or artifact collection to be conducted on the property, unless authorized by Alexandria Archaeology.

The vote on the motion was 5-1, with Mr. Fitzgerald in opposition.

REASON: The Board generally agreed with the Staff analysis and found the proposed demolition, addition and alterations, and waiver of HVAC screening to be appropriate. The Board supported the enclosed sleeping porch in this location and the small amount of demolition/encapsulation for the addition because it was toward the rear in the newest portion of the historic structure and faced a large amount of open space. The Board also supported the use of synthetic trim because it was an addition.

SPEAKERS: Bud Adams, architect for the project, discussed the details of the design, noted letters of support the Board received from the neighbors and documented the owners support the staff recommendations.

John Hynan, representing Historic Alexandria Foundation, had concerns with the staff report's lack of historic analysis of previous occupants. He also expressed the Foundation's position against the utilization of synthetic trim and simulated divided light windows on additions within the historic district.

Mary Seed, property owner at 309 S. Lee Street, asked the architect about the future construction traffic and wanted to ensure that it would not have an adverse impact on the access to the rear private alley.

Bert Ely, representing Old Town Civic Association, expressed the Association's opposition to rooftop AC units, if an opportunity exists to put them on the ground, because of their potential noise impacts.

Glen Stone, property owner at 307 S. Lee Street, spoke in support of the project as proposed.

Laura Garcia, property owner at 208-210 Duke Street, spoke in support of the project as proposed, noting that her property is the closest to the subject roof top AC units.

6. CASE BAR2009-0309

Request for approval of addition/alterations at **206 Duke St**, zoned RM Residential.

APPLICANT: Harry & Maria Hopper.

BOARD ACTION: **Approved as amended, by a roll call vote, 5-1.**

The Board combined docket item #'s 5, 6 and 7 for discussion.

7. CASE BAR2010-0002

Request for approval of a waiver of HVAC screening requirement at **206 Duke St**, zoned RM Residential.

APPLICANT: Harry & Maria Hopper

BOARD ACTION: **Approved as amended, by a roll call vote, 5-1.**

The Board combined docket item #'s 5, 6 and 7 for discussion.

END DISCUSSION ITEMS

DEFERRED ITEMS:

8. CASE BAR2009-0311

Request for approval of alterations at **105 N Union St**, zoned CD Residential.

APPLICANT: Torpedo Factory Artist Association.

This item was deferred pending submission of additional materials.

9. OTHER BUSINESS:

Mrs. Murney Keleher, testified before the Board requesting that they re-examine their current window policy for mid-20th century structures within the historic district. She expressed concern that these original building materials are being lost and replaced with non-historically appropriate materials, thus diminishing the integrity of the entire historic district. The Board thanked her for her concern and noted that some Board members have already had some preliminary discussions with staff on how to proceed with this issue.

10. ADJOURNMENT

The Chairman adjourned the meeting at approximately 8:28 pm.

Minutes submitted by,

Michele Oaks, Staff
Boards of Architectural Review