Docket Item # 3 BAR CASE #2010-0219

BAR Meeting September 1, 2010

ISSUE:	Alterations
APPLICANT:	Lois Ember (Old Town Windows and Doors, Agent)
LOCATION:	904 Green Street
ZONE:	RM/Residential

**<u>STAFF RECOMMENDATION</u>**: Staff recommends denial of the application for aluminumclad wood replacement windows and approval of painted wood windows, with the following conditions:

- 1. That the applicant use full frame replacement windows or sash replacement kits in the existing frame rather than insert or pocket replacements;
- 2. That the replacement windows be solid wood, including the muntin bars;
- 3. That the replacement windows have fixed grills on the interior and exterior;
- 4. That the glazing on the glass be tint free;
- 5. That the dimensions of the replacement windows match the existing windows including the rails, stiles, and muntins;
- 6. That the muntins maintain a faux putty glaze profile on the exterior;
- 7. That the replacement window sash corners be constructed with mortise and tenon style, butt joinery rather than mitered, picture frame joinery;
- 8. That the replacement windows be constructed with a wood jamb liner rather than a vinyl jamb liner, or that the visual portion of the vinyl jamb be very minimal;
- 9. That the replacement windows have spacer bars between the glass and that they be a medium dark color rather than reflective silver or gold metallic; and
- 10. That the applicant submit final window manufacturer spec sheets to staff for approval prior to application of a building permit.

\*\*EXPIRATION OF APPROVALS NOTE: In accordance with Sections 10-106(B) and 10-206(B) of the Zoning Ordinance, any official Board of Architectural Review approval will expire 12 months from the date of final approval if the work is not commenced and diligently and substantially pursued by the end of that 12-month period.

\*\*BUILDING PERMIT NOTE: Most projects approved by the Board of Architectural Review require the issuance of one or more construction permits by Building and Fire Code Administration (<u>including signs</u>). The applicant is responsible for obtaining all necessary construction permits after receiving Board of Architectural Review approval. Contact Code Administration, Room 4200, City Hall, 703-746-4200 for further information.

BAR CASE #2010-0219 September 1, 2010



## I. ISSUE

The applicant is requesting approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness for aluminum-clad wood replacement windows at 904 Green Street.

The applicant is requesting approval to replace a total of seven (7) windows; four (4) on the front of the home facing Green Street, and three (3) on the rear elevation facing the public alley. The existing windows are c1980s replacement, single-glazed, double-hung, six-over-six, wood windows with exterior storm windows. The applicant is requesting approval of Marvin, aluminum-clad, double-hung, double-glazed windows with 7/8" muntins. The proposed windows will be simulated divided light with an interior spacer bar, permanent exterior and interior grills, and an identical light pattern to the windows being replaced. The windows will be fabricated with a wood frame, wood sashes, and an interior wood muntin bar. The exterior of the window will be clad in aluminum with an exterior aluminum muntin bar.

## II. HISTORY

According to Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps subject townhouse was built in between 1941-1958. There are no previous BAR cases for this property.

#### III. ANALYSIS

The proposed alterations comply with Zoning Ordinance requirements.

Although the house dates to the mid-20<sup>th</sup> century, the existing windows on 904 Green Street are clearly not original and date from the 1980s. It is a central tenant of Historic Preservation that historic materials be maintained and repaired rather than replaced, however in this case due to the fact that the existing windows are not original to the house's date of construction, Staff does not find their replacement problematic.

The *Design Guidelines* recommend that: "…replacement windows should be appropriate to the historic period of the architectural style of the building". The *Guidelines* state that single-glazed, true divided light windows with interior storm sash are the preferred replacement window type. The *Guidelines* continue by saying other acceptable window types are "double-glazed true divided light wood windows…."

In this particular case, Staff finds that the use of double glazed replacement windows to be appropriate, as this is a mid-20<sup>th</sup> century building and double-glazed windows were commonly available in USA in the 1950s. Many of the other dwellings on the street also have double glazed windows. Furthermore, staff finds the appearance of modern simulated divided light windows in a six-over-six light pattern, preferable to six-over-six, true divided light, double glazed windows because it allows the profile of the muntins to be thinner and more historically accurate and allows removal of the unattractive aluminum storm windows.

However, the *Design Guidelines* state that: "In order to help safeguard the visual and architectural quality of the districts, the provisions of the zoning ordinance encourage the use of appropriate materials when maintenance work requires the repair and replacement of exterior features of a building," furthermore the windows chapter of the *Guidelines* clearly states that

plastic, vinyl, and metal clad windows are discouraged. While Staff believes there are, in fact, some appropriate locations in the district for high quality aluminum clad wood windows, Staff believes that the use of aluminum-clad windows is inappropriate and inconsistent with the guidelines in the case of mid 20<sup>th</sup> century single family dwellings. Staff will bring a more clear window replacement policy recommendation to the Board in October.

Staff does understand the homeowners concern with wood window maintenance, yet believes that consistency in regulatory review is very important for the overall process. The Marvin Window Company has both a factory primed and factory painted wood window option which requires significantly less initial maintenance than field painted windows. Therefore, Staff recommends denial of the application for aluminum-clad wood replacement windows and approval of painted wood windows.

## **STAFF**

Michele Oaks, Historic Preservation Planner, Planning & Zoning Al Cox, FAIA, Historic Preservation Manager, Planning & Zoning

## IV. <u>CITY DEPARTMENT COMMENTS</u>

Legend: C - code requirement R - recommendation S - suggestion F- finding

#### **Code Administration**

No comments received.

## Transporation and Environmental Services (T & ES)

No comments received.

#### Historic Alexandria

No comments received.

# V. <u>IMAGES</u>



Figure 1. Front facade of 904 Green St

BAR CASE #2010-0219 September 1, 2010

1





Figure 2. Existing Windows



