Docket Item # 2 BAR CASE #2010-0239

BAR Meeting October 6, 2010

ISSUE:	Window Replacement
APPLICANT:	Alan Windsor (TJ Moon, Old Town Windows and Doors)
LOCATION:	426 1/2 North St Asaph Street
ZONE:	RM/Residential

**<u>STAFF RECOMMENDATION</u>**: Staff recommends approval of the application for aluminum clad wood replacement windows with the following conditions:

- 1. That the applicant use full frame replacement windows or sash replacement kits in the existing frame rather than insert or pocket replacements;
- 2. That the replacement windows be an aluminum clad wood window;
- 3. That the replacement windows have fixed grills on the interior and exterior;
- 4. That the glazing be tint free (certain types of low e glass meet this recommendation);
- 5. That the screens be a dark color and not white.
- 6. That the dimensions of the replacement windows match the existing windows including the rails, stiles, and muntins (7/8");
- 7. That the replacement windows be constructed with a wood jamb liner rather than a vinyl jamb liner, or that the visual portion of the vinyl jamb be very minimal;
- 8. That the replacement windows have spacer bars between the glass and that they be a medium dark color rather than reflective silver or gold metallic; and
- 9. That the applicant submit final window manufacturer spec sheets to staff for approval prior to application of a building permit.

\*\*EXPIRATION OF APPROVALS NOTE: In accordance with Sections 10-106(B) and 10-206(B) of the Zoning Ordinance, any official Board of Architectural Review approval will expire 12 months from the date of final approval if the work is not commenced and diligently and substantially pursued by the end of that 12-month period.

\*\*BUILDING PERMIT NOTE: Most projects approved by the Board of Architectural Review require the issuance of one or more construction permits by Building and Fire Code Administration (<u>including signs</u>). The applicant is responsible for obtaining all necessary construction permits after receiving Board of Architectural Review approval. Contact Code Administration, Room 4200, City Hall, 703-746-4200 for further information.

#### BAR CASE #2010-0239 October 6, 2010



# BAR CASE #2010-0239

### I. <u>ISSUE</u>

The applicant is requesting approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness for five (5) wood replacement windows at 426 ½ North St. Asaph Street (one facing N. St. Asaph St and two (2) sets of double windows which face the courtyard.) The existing six-over-six and eight-over eight single-glazed wood windows with storm sash are all located on the first floor and will be replaced with Marvin Clad Ultimate wood windows in the same configuration. The new double-hung, simulated-divided light, double-glazed clad wood windows will have 7/8" muntins, a dark interior spacer bar, and permanent exterior aluminum muntins and interior wood muntins. The windows will be fabricated with clad wood frame, trim and sashes.

#### II. HISTORY

Based on City Tax Assessment records, the subject property was built in **1976**, as part of the Lee Mews Condominium development. The subject unit occupies the first floor of the three-story condominium building. This Colonial Revival building detailed with brick segmental arches over the first story windows, cast lintels above the second and third story windows and operable paneled, louvered shutters. The unit's front door faces North St Asaph Street and is a raised panel door flanked by paneled louvered shutters.

Staff did not locate any previous BAR approvals for the subject property.

#### III. ANALYSIS

The proposed window replacement complies with Zoning Ordinance requirements.

The *Design Guidelines* recommend that: "...replacement windows should be appropriate to the historic period of the architectural style of the building". The *Guidelines* also state that single-glazed, true divided light windows installed with an interior storm sash are the preferred replacement window type. The *Guidelines* continue by noting other acceptable window types are "double-glazed true divided light wood windows...."

As discussed at the September 15th BAR public hearing, Staff is working on the Window Replacement Policy which identifies dates that modern window components where invented and subsequently commercially available. The current *Draft Window Replacement Policy*, as presented to the Board, outlines: "Recent buildings and additions (post 1932) may use insulating glass wood windows throughout, as insulating glass was invented in 1930." and "Single family homes constructed after aluminum clad wood windows became widely available in 1969...may use appropriately detailed aluminum clad replacement windows."

In this particular case, double-glazed windows, which were commercially available when this development was constructed in 1976 are appropriate replacement windows and significantly more attractive than the existing single glazed windows covered by aluminum storm panels. Staff further believes that the appearance of modern simulated divided light windows is virtually indistinguishable from true divided light sash and allows the profile of the muntins to be thinner and more historically accurate. The proposed aluminum clad wood windows are high quality, paintable and have generally proven themselves to be durable -- criteria used by the Board to evaluate

appropriate replacement materials in the past.

Therefore, in this instance, and noting the age of the building, aluminum-clad wood windows may be an appropriate option for this condominium building. The existing 6/6 and 8/8 light pattern and muntin profile and size will be retained. Additionally, the majority of the windows are facing a courtyard – only one window is being proposed at street level facing North St. Asaph Street. Finally, the OHAD Board has recently approved aluminum-clad windows on early 20<sup>th</sup> century commercial construction and new residential additions.

Staff supports the use of the Marvin Clad Ultimate simulated-divided light wood double hung replacement windows with dark colored interior spacer bars and finds the proposed replacement windows appropriate and compatible with nearby buildings of historic merit. Staff notes that use of aluminum clad wood windows to replace single glazed wood windows on a late 20<sup>th</sup> century building is not yet a policy formally adopted by the Board. However, based on the feedback on the *Draft Policy*; we are comfortable with supporting aluminum-clad windows on this 1970s condominium dwelling since aluminum-clad wood windows were widely available at the time of construction and we would recommend their approval on these particular buildings if they were constructed today.

Staff reminds the applicant that, as of June 1, 2010, window replacement requires a building permit within the historic districts.

#### **STAFF**

Michele Oaks, Historic Preservation Planner, Planning & Zoning Al Cox, FAIA, Historic Preservation Manager, Planning & Zoning

#### IV. <u>CITY DEPARTMENT COMMENTS</u>

Legend: C - code requirement R - recommendation S - suggestion F- finding

Code Administration:

No comments received to date.

Historic Alexandria:

No comments received to date.

## **IMAGES**



Figure 1. View from Right of Way



Figure 2. Lower Level Paired window - Courtyard



Figure 3. Lower Level Paired window - Courtyard



Figure 4. North St. Asaph Street Window







BAR CASE #2010-0239 October 6, 2010