

*******DRAFT MINUTES*******

Alexandria Board of Architectural Review
Old & Historic Alexandria District

Wednesday, September 15, 2010
7:30pm, City Council Chambers, City Hall
301 King Street, Alexandria, Virginia 22314

Members Present: Tom Hulfish, Chairman
Chip Carlin
Oscar Fitzgerald
Arthur Keleher
Wayne Neale
John von Senden
Peter Smeallie

Staff Present: Planning & Zoning
Michele Oaks, Historic Preservation Planner
Al Cox, FAIA, Historic Preservation Manager

The meeting was called to order at 7:35 p.m. by Chairman Hulfish.

I. MINUTES

Consideration of the minutes of the public hearing of September 1, 2010.

BOARD ACTION: Approved, as submitted 7-0

On a motion by Mr. Keleher, seconded by Mr. von Senden, the minutes were unanimously approved as submitted.

II. CONSENT CALENDAR

Items on the Consent Calendar are those where the applicant has agreed to all conditions of approval shown in the staff reports. Without objection, the staff recommendation for these cases will be approved as a group by unanimous consent of the Board at the beginning of the meeting. When announced by the Chairman, any member of the Board or of the public may ask that one of these cases be removed for full discussion.

1. CASE BAR2010-0217

Request for HVAC screening at **600 S. Washington St**, zoned CL Commercial. (CM)

APPLICANT: Soonja Purdy

BOARD ACTION: This item was deferred for lack of neighbor notification. The Board noted the deferral.

III. DISCUSSION ITEMS

2. CASE BAR2010-0235

Request for demolition/encapsulation at **620 S. Saint Asaph St**, zoned RM Residential. (CM)

APPLICANT: Neil & Ruth McCray by Scott McBroom for Adams Architects

BOARD ACTION: **Approved 5-2 by roll call vote**

This item was combined with item #3, CASE BAR2010-0236, for discussion purposes.

3. CASE BAR2010-0236

Request for the construction of an addition and alterations at **620 S. Saint Asaph St**, zoned RM Residential. (CM)

APPLICANT: Neil & Ruth McCray by Scott McBroom for Adams Architects

BOARD ACTION: **Approved 5-2 by roll call vote**

SPEAKERS

Bud Adams, Architect, presented the application. He noted that the neighbors were in support of the proposal.

Murney Keleher, representing the HAF, spoke in opposition. She noted the scale of the other houses in the area were smaller and recommended that the additions be reduced in size and somewhat simpler.

BOARD DISCUSSION

Mr. Neale stated that the architect did a terrific job with the massing and recommended approval.

Mr. Keleher was concerned with the height of the tower and asked if it could be lowered.

Mr. Adams responded that the elevator tower was set back from the street approximately 38' from the curb and was sandwiched between the existing dwelling and the very large house to the south. He noted that the owner was restoring the interior as well and they did not want to install the elevator within the historic envelope of the house.

Mr. Smeallie asked about the elevator mechanism. He noted that population trends indicated an older population that wanted to age in place. He believed the tower was too tall on a vernacular building but said it was a beautiful design overall and he would support it. However, he cautioned that this should not be a precedent for elevator towers throughout the district.

Mr. Fitzgerald agreed that it was a very elegant design but asked whether it could be shorter.

Mr. von Senden said he was OK with the encroachment of the elevator tower in to the side yard and the proposed changes to the dormer. He said that perspectives would have mitigated much of the Board's concern and noted that it is not possible to view the

elevations presented by the architect because of the adjacent houses. He said he would rather have the side tower than destroy historic interior space. However, he asked whether the proposed height was absolutely necessary for engineering reasons.

Mr. Adams responded that they studied shorter towers but the proportions looked squat and were not as attractive.

Mr. Carlin said this was a very elegant design but that the tower was too high style for a vernacular farmhouse. He believed it looked like it belonged on a church or civic building. He believed the additions should defer to the original building and that alteration of the existing additions in the rear, which expressed changes to this dwelling over time, were not appropriate.

Mr. Keleher made a motion to defer for restudy of a shorter elevator tower, seconded by Mr. Carlin. The motion failed 2-5.

Mr. von Senden moved the staff recommendation, which was seconded by Mr. Neale and approved 5-2 by roll call vote. Mr. Keleher and Mr. Carlin were opposed.

CONDITIONS

1. That the applicant work with Staff to determine the condition of the historic wood siding underneath the aluminum siding, and if the siding is in good condition that it be retained and repaired rather than replaced. If the siding is not salvageable, then replacement wood siding must match the historic siding.
2. That the applicant either relocate the HVAC units so that they are no closer than five feet to the side property line, or obtain a waiver from the adjoining neighbor to place units within the required side yard.
3. That the following archaeology conditions appear in the General Notes of all site plans and on all site plan sheets that involve demolition or ground disturbance (including Basement/Foundation Plans, Demolition, Erosion and Sediment Control, Grading, Landscaping, Utilities, and Sheeting and Shoring) so that on-site contractors are aware of the requirements.
 - a. The applicant/developer shall call Alexandria Archaeology (703/838-4399) two weeks before the starting date of any ground disturbance so that a monitoring and inspection schedule for city archaeologists can be arranged.
 - b. The applicant/developer shall call Alexandria Archaeology immediately (703-838-4399) if any buried structural remains (wall foundations, wells, privies, cisterns, etc.) or concentrations of artifacts are discovered during development. Work must cease in the area of the discovery until a City archaeologist comes to the site and records the finds.
 - c. The applicant/developer shall not allow any metal detection or artifact collection to be conducted on the property, unless authorized by Alexandria Archaeology.

REASON

The Board generally agreed with the analysis in the staff report and believed that the tower was a good solution to disguise the elevator and that it would not be prominently visible from the street.

4. CASE BAR2010-0237

Request for window replacement at **1208 Prince St**, zoned CL Commercial. (MO)

APPLICANT: Cory Donovan by Old Town Windows and Doors

BOARD ACTION: **Approved 7-0, as amended**

SPEAKERS

Butch Jones presented the application for Old Town Windows & Doors and confirmed that they agreed with staff recommendations.

BOARD DISCUSSION

The Chairman called the question on the staff recommendation which was approved unanimously.

CONDITIONS

1. That the new windows on the street façade be single-glazed, true divided light wood windows with a separate storm panel;
2. That the applicant may use true divided light or simulated divided light windows on the side elevation;
3. That the applicant use either full frame replacement windows or sash replacement kits in the existing frame rather than insert or pocket replacements;
4. That the replacement windows be solid wood, including the muntin bars;
5. That the glazing on the glass be tint free (certain types of low e glass meet this recommendation);
6. That the width of the muntins in the replacement windows be 5/8” wide with a putty glaze profile on the exterior;
7. That the frame for the screens match the color of the window frame and that the screens be a medium dark color and not white;
8. That the replacement window sash corners be constructed with mortise and tenon style, butt joinery rather than mitered, picture frame joinery;
9. That the replacement windows be constructed with a wood jamb liner rather than a vinyl jamb liner, or that the visual portion of the vinyl jamb be very minimal;
10. That the existing shutters and historic hardware be retained and reinstalled; and
11. That the applicant submit final window manufacturer spec sheets to staff for approval prior to application of a building permit.

REASON

The Board agreed with the analysis in the staff report.

5. CASE BAR2010-0243

Request for window replacement at **413 Franklin St**, zoned RM Residential. (SS)

APPLICANT: Joan Manley by Old Town Windows and Doors

BOARD ACTION: **Approved 7-0, as amended**

SPEAKERS

Butch Jones presented the application for Old Town Windows & Doors.

BOARD DISCUSSION

Mr. von Senden moved approval based on staff recommendations. Mr. Smeallie seconded the motion which passed unanimously.

CONDITIONS

1. That the dimensions of the muntins on the replacement windows match the muntins on the existing windows.

REASON

The Board agreed with the analysis in the staff report.

6. CASE BAR2010-0245

Request for window replacement at **718 Gibbon St**, zoned RB Residential. (SS)

APPLICANT: Rick Faulkner by Old Town Windows and Doors

BOARD ACTION: **Approved 7-0 as submitted**

SPEAKERS

Butch Jones presented the application for Old Town Windows & Doors.

BOARD DISCUSSION

The Chairman called the question on the staff recommendation which was approved unanimously.

REASON

The Board agreed with the analysis in the staff report.

7. CASE BAR2010-0246

Request for re-approval of a rear addition at **615 S. Fairfax St**, zoned RM Residential. (AC)

APPLICANT: Kathryn McGrath by Ray Lewis and Associates

BOARD ACTION: **Approved 7-0 as amended**

SPEAKERS

Mr. Ray Lewis, Architect, presented the application and confirmed that they agreed with staff recommendations.

BOARD DISCUSSION

The Chairman called the question on the staff recommendation which was approved unanimously.

CONDITIONS

1. That the statements in the archaeology conditions below shall appear in the General Notes of all site plans and on all site plan sheets that involve demolition or ground disturbance (including Basement/Foundation Plans, Demolition, Erosion and Sediment Control, Grading, Landscaping, Utilities, and Sheeting and Shoring) so that on-site contractors are aware of the requirements:
 - a. The applicant/developer shall call Alexandria Archaeology immediately (703-838-4399) if any buried structural remains (wall foundations, wells, privies, cisterns, etc.) or concentrations of artifacts are discovered during development. Work must cease in the area of the discovery until a City archaeologist comes to the site and records the finds.
 - b. The applicant/developer shall not allow any metal detection to be conducted on the property, unless authorized by Alexandria Archaeology.

REASON

The Board agreed with the analysis in the staff report.

IV. OTHER BUSINESS

1. Staff suggested draft language for a replacement windows policy with the Board. The Board endorsed the proposed language but asked that owners of Early buildings be allowed to "replicate" rather than restore historic windows where the originals were demonstrated to be beyond repair. Staff also confirmed that, as previously discussed with replacement roof materials, there would be a provision in the administrative approval policy where, when staff believes the material proposed by the applicant is not compatible or historically appropriate, review by the Board is required.

2. Dr. Fitzgerald noted the 52nd annual Alexandria Forum would be held September 24 - 25 at the Lyceum with The Reverend Professor Peter J. Gomes of Harvard University as its featured speaker during two days of lectures and workshops exploring the theme of "Coveting, Curating and Collections: The Art of the Public and Personal Museum." Chairman Hulfish urged all to attend this event.

V. ADJOURNMENT

Chairman Hulfish adjourned the meeting at approximately 8:40 pm.

VI. DEFERRED ITEMS

CASE BAR2010-0238

Request for window replacement at **426 N St Asaph St**, zoned RM Residential. (MO)

APPLICANT: Gail Hoffman by Old Town Windows and Doors

Deferred due to improper notice.

CASE BAR2010-0239

Request for window replacement at **426 1/2 N St Asaph St**, zoned RM Residential.

(MO)

APPLICANT: Alan Windsor by Old Town Windows and Doors

Deferred due to improper notice.

CASE BAR2010-0244

Request for window replacement at **682 S Columbus St**, zoned CD Commercial. (CM)

APPLICANT: Marcia Krause by Old Town Windows and Doors

Deferred due to improper notice.

VII. ADMINISTRATIVE APPROVALS

CASE BAR2010-0250

Request for approval of window replacement at **526 South Pitt Street**, zoned RM residential.

APPLICANT: L. Little

CASE BAR2010-0257

Request for approval of roof replacement at **821 South Columbus Street**, zoned RM residential.

APPLICANT: Alexandria Roofing Company for Tom Dougherty

CASE BAR2010-0258

Request for approval to repair and rebuild existing brick wall at **105 Cameron Mews**, zoned RM residential.

APPLICANT: Crawn Masonry for David Pankey

CASE BAR2010-0259

Request for approval to repair and rebuild existing brick wall at **107 Cameron Mews**, zoned RM residential.

APPLICANT: Crawn Masonry for Mark O'Brien

CASE BAR2010-0261

Request for approval to construct brick wall at **709 South Fairfax Street**, zoned RM residential.

APPLICANT: William Cople

CASE BAR2010-0262

Request for approval to construct brick wall at **711 South Fairfax Street**, zoned RM residential.

APPLICANT: James and Christina Wallace

CASE BAR2010-0263

Request for approval for signage at **222 North Lee Street**, zoned CD commercial.

APPLICANT: The Glass Stache

CASE BAR2010-0264

Request for approval for signage at **202 South West Street**, zoned CL commercial.

APPLICANT: Changlin Kim

CASE BAR2010-0265

Request for approval of roof replacement at **430 North Union Street**, zoned RM residential.

APPLICANT: Alexandria Roofing Company for William Montgomery

Minutes submitted by,

Al Cox, FAIA, Historic Preservation Manager
Boards of Architectural Review