

*******DRAFT MINUTES*******

Alexandria Board of Architectural Review
Old & Historic Alexandria District

Wednesday, October 20, 2010
7:30pm, City Council Chambers, City Hall
301 King Street, Alexandria, Virginia 22314

Members Present: Tom Hulfish, Chairman
Chip Carlin
Oscar Fitzgerald
Arthur Keleher
Wayne Neale
John von Senden

Members Absent Peter Smeallie

Staff Present: Planning & Zoning
Michele Oaks, Historic Preservation Planner
Stephanie Sample, Historic Preservation Planner
Al Cox, FAIA, Historic Preservation Manager

The meeting was called to order at 7:35 p.m. by Chairman Hulfish.

I. MINUTES

Consideration of the minutes of the public hearing of October 6, 2010.

BOARD ACTION: Approved, as submitted, 6-0.

II. CONSENT CALENDAR

Items on the Consent Calendar are those where the applicant has agreed to all conditions of approval shown in the staff reports. Without objection, the staff recommendation for these cases will be approved as a group by unanimous consent of the Board at the beginning of the meeting. When announced by the Chairman, any member of the Board or of the public may ask that one of these cases be removed for full discussion.

On a motion by Mr. Keleher, seconded by Mr. Neale, Items 2 through 6 on the consent calendar were approved, as submitted.

1. CASE BAR2010-0276

Request for window replacement at **812 South Royal Street**, zoned RM Residential.

Applicant: Steve Moller by Old Town Windows and Doors

BOARD ACTION: Deferred due to lack of notice.

2. CASE BAR2010-0277

Request for window replacement at **109 Princess Street**, zoned RM Residential.

Applicant: James and Karen Lloyd

BOARD ACTION: **Approved, as submitted, on the consent calendar, 6-0.**

3. CASE BAR2010-0281

Request for window replacement at **207 South Payne St**, zoned RM Residential.

APPLICANT: Erin Germany by Old Town Windows and Doors

BOARD ACTION: **Approved, as submitted, on the consent calendar, 6-0.**

4. CASE BAR2010-0282

Request for window replacement at **622 South Lee St**, zoned RM Residential.

APPLICANT: John Murphy by Old Town Windows and Doors

BOARD ACTION: **Approved, as submitted, on the consent calendar, 6-0.**

5. CASE BAR2010-0283

Request for window replacement at **602 South Lee St**, zoned RM Residential.

APPLICANT: Kelly Abramson by Old Town Windows and Doors

BOARD ACTION: **Approved, as submitted, on the consent calendar, 6-0.**

6. CASE BAR2010-0255

Request for construction of a portico at **506 S Columbus St**, zoned RB Residential.

APPLICANT: Marc Beauchemin

BOARD ACTION: **Approved, as amended, on the consent calendar, 6-0.**

III. DISCUSSION ITEMS

7. CASE BAR2010-0279

Request for front stoop reconstruction and window replacement at **600 South Royal St**, zoned RM Residential.

APPLICANT: John and Mirella Belshe

BOARD ACTION: **Approved, as amended, 6-0.**

SPEAKERS

Mr. Belshe, owner, presented the application and believed a precedent was set on this block when another house was allowed to use this style window.

Mr. John Hyman, representing the HAF, supported the staff recommendation.

BOARD DISCUSSION

Mr. Fitzgerald said times have changed since the other windows were approved and a window policy was now underway which will provide consistency in the future.

Mr. Keleher said he was sympathetic with the owner but that the new window policy research has provided more clear criteria for window approval.

Mr. von Senden said that the Board had consistently not supported vinyl or vinyl clad windows in the three years he had participated. He moved the staff recommendation, which was seconded by Mr. Carlin and approved 6-0.

REASON

The Board believed that vinyl clad windows were inappropriate for this age house but supported painted wood simulated divided light replacement windows, based on the recommendations in the proposed Windows Policy.

8. CASE BAR2010-0280

Request for demolition of portions of rear wall at **429 South Lee St**, zoned RM Residential.

APPLICANT: Susan Ginsburg

BOARD ACTION: **Approved, as submitted, by roll call vote, 6-0.**

SPEAKERS

Ms. Ginsburg, owner, presented the application.

Mr. John Hynan, representing the HAF, spoke in support of the application.

BOARD DISCUSSION

The Board members had no discussion. On a motion by Mr. Keleher, seconded by Mr. Neale, the application was unanimously approved, as submitted, by roll call vote.

REASON

The Board generally agreed with the analysis in the Staff report.

9. CASE BAR2010-0284

Request for window replacement at **333 Green St**, zoned RM Residential.

APPLICANT: Paul and Amy O'Sullivan

BOARD ACTION: **Approved, as amended, 5-1.**

SPEAKERS

Paul and Amy O'Sullivan, owners, presented the application. They described the previous addition as a study in contrast.

Mr. John Hynan, representing the HAF, spoke in opposition to the application and supported the Staff recommendation. He said approval of the addition was a mistake and should not be imitated by changing the style of the windows in the original house.

Mr. Poul Hertel agreed with Mr. Hynan and said approval of this application would go against the new window policy.

BOARD DISCUSSION

Mr. Carlin supported the application. He noted that the Board's views are not static and opinions of Modernism have changed. He believed that the proposed windows blended much better with the addition.

Mr. von Senden supported a wide range of architectural styles in the district. He said the 1979 addition was an honest expression of its time, while the 1952 phony colonial original house was an imitation of an earlier period. He distinguished the present proposal from the window application in the previous docket item and said this project should be celebrated as a unique building in the district.

Mr. Fitzgerald agreed that the present application was in contradiction to the proposed window policy but that the reason the Board existed was to make these unique value determinations. He said the proposal just looked better than the existing windows. He pointed out that the existing windows are themselves replacements but that examples of original mid 20th century windows exist all over Yates Gardens, so no original fabric or material with a high degree of craftsmanship is being lost.

Mr. Keleher agreed with the staff recommendation because it supported the proposed window policy.

Mr. Neale pointed out that the building massing and the original wall openings were being preserved, so the original building would still be visually compatible with its neighbors.

Mr. Keleher moved the Staff recommendation which failed for lack of a second.

Mr. von Senden moved approval of the application with only Staff recommendation #3. Mr. Carlin seconded the motion, which passed 5-1, with Mr. Keleher in opposition.

REASON

The Board believed that the single light windows were visually more compatible with the 1979 addition and that the original building would still be visually compatible with its neighbors

10. CASE BAR2010-0268

Request for new construction at **1126 & 1128 Prince St**, zoned RM Residential.
APPLICANT: Sean & Helen Vermillion by Stephen Kulinski for Kulinski Group Architects, P.C.

BOARD ACTION: **Approved, as amended, 6-0.**

SPEAKERS

Mr. Kulinski, project architect, presented the application. He said that the Board's recommendations helped refine and improve the design. He presented samples of smooth red brick for the front and rough red brick for the sides. He said the mortar on the front would be red and approximately 1/4" tall.

Mr. Hynan, representing the HAF, said this demonstrated that a good design can be made even better. He said the basement windows improved it enormously.

BOARD DISCUSSION

Mr. Fitzgerald complimented the overall project but suggested using Victorian period dormers, similar to those seen on this style structure on Washington Street, rather than the Free Classic style shown.

Mr. Neale confirmed the location of the smooth brick on the front and rough, common style brick on the sides and said he felt comfortable with the dormer as now presented.

Mr. Carlin complimented the revisions and recommended a butter joint on the front and a standard 3/8" mortar joint on the sides. He also suggested a vertical control joint on the side at the transition between the two brick types and mortar joint thicknesses.

Mr. Neale said he supported the front façade with or without a butter (1/4" tall) joint and noted how difficult it could be to get modern mortar to look good in a 1/4" joint. He offered that standard joints could be used on the façade, at the architect's option. Mr. Carlin and Mr. von Senden agreed.

Mr. Fitzgerald moved approval with deletion of the pilasters on the face of the dormer which failed for lack of a second.

On a motion by Mr. von Senden, seconded by Mr. Neale, the Staff recommendation was approved 6-0, with the mortar color and joint height on the front façade to be the architect's option, in consultation with Staff.

REASON

The Board generally agreed with the analysis in the staff report and believed that the proportions of the new house were more important than the overall height of the new building relative to its neighbor.

IV. DEFERRED ITEMS

CASE BAR2010-0217

Request for HVAC screening at **600 S. Washington St**, zoned CL Commercial

APPLICANT: Soonja Purdy

Deferred pending receipt of additional materials.

VI. OTHER BUSINESS

Roof Materials Policy

Staff presented the proposed policy.

Mr. Fitzgerald noted an inconsistency between items #B4 and #B2c. He said that the Board had reversed its original opinion that Staff should not approve an “upgrade” to a composition shingle roof but that this appeared to be in conflict in these two items. He asked Staff to remove or amend item #B4 to say that composition shingles may be replaced with “any other stylistically appropriate roofing material.”

Mr. Fitzgerald On a motion by Mr. Keleher, seconded by Mr. von Senden, the Board unanimously approved the policy, with a change to item #B4 to make it consistent with item #B2c.

Window Policy

Staff presented the policy and answered questions from the Board.

On a motion by Mr. von Senden, seconded by Mr. Fitzgerald, the policy was unanimously adopted, as submitted.

VII. ADJOURNMENT

Chairman Hulfish adjourned the meeting at approximately 9:30 pm.

VIII. ADMINISTRATIVE APPROVALS

CASE BAR2010-0292

Request for approval of a replacement door at **106 Princess Street**, zoned RM Residential.

APPLICANT: Richard Walker

CASE BAR2010-0301

Request for approval of roof replacement at **120 Princess Street**, zoned RM Residential.

APPLICANT: Cindy Kierscht

CASE BAR2010-0302

Request for approval of window replacement on the addition at **207 S. Fairfax Street**, zoned RM Residential.

APPLICANT: Betty Foster

CASE BAR2010-0303

Request for approval of a new slate roof at **907 S. St. Asaph Street**, zoned RM Residential.

APPLICANT: Karen Zent

CASE BAR2010-0304

Request for approval of window replacement at **1105 Powhatan Street**, zoned RM Residential.

APPLICANT: Elizabeth Roloff

CASE BAR2010-0305

Request for approval of trim repair, window glass replacement, paint at **801 S. Washington Street**, zoned CRMU/L Commercial.

APPLICANT: W.R.I.T

Minutes submitted by,

Al Cox, FAIA, Historic Preservation Manager
Boards of Architectural Review