

\*\*\*\*\***DRAFT MINUTES**\*\*\*\*\*

Alexandria Board of Architectural Review  
Old & Historic Alexandria District

**Wednesday, December 1, 2010**

7:30pm, City Council Chambers, City Hall  
301 King Street, Alexandria, Virginia 22314

Members Present: Tom Hulfish, Chairman  
Chip Carlin  
Oscar Fitzgerald  
Arthur Keleher  
John von Senden  
Peter Smeallie

Members Absent: Wayne Neale

Staff Present: Planning & Zoning  
Catherine Miliaras, Historic Preservation Planner  
Al Cox, FAIA, Historic Preservation Manager

The meeting was called to order at 7:35 p.m. by Chairman Hulfish.

---

**I. MINUTES**

Consideration of the minutes of the public hearing of November 3, 2010.

**BOARD ACTION: Approved, as submitted, 6-0**

On a motion by Mr. Keleher, seconded by Mr. Smeallie, the minutes were unanimously approved, as submitted.

---

**II. CONSENT CALENDAR**

Items on the Consent Calendar are those where the applicant has agreed to all conditions of approval shown in the staff reports. Without objection, the staff recommendation for these cases will be approved as a group by unanimous consent of the Board at the beginning of the meeting. When announced by the Chairman, any member of the Board or of the public may ask that one of these cases be removed for full discussion.

**BOARD ACTION: On a motion by Mr. von Senden, seconded by Mr. Fitzgerald, the Consent Calendar consisting of items #1, 2, 3, 4 & 9 was unanimously approved, as submitted.**

**1. CASE BAR2010-0217**

Request for HVAC screening at **600 S. Washington St**, zoned CL Commercial

**APPLICANT: Soonja Purdy**

**BOARD ACTION: Approved, as amended, on the Consent Calendar, 6-0**

**2. CASE BAR2010-0317**

Request for light installation at **212 Wolfe St**, zoned RM Residential

APPLICANT: C. Horne

**BOARD ACTION: Approved, as submitted, on the Consent Calendar, 6-0**

**3. CASE BAR2010-0318**

Request for light installation at **201 N. Washington St**, zoned OCM (50) Office Commercial Medium.

APPLICANT: Military Officers Association of America

**BOARD ACTION: Approved, as amended, on the Consent Calendar, 6-0**

**4. CASE BAR2010-0324**

Request for HVAC screening at **120 S Fairfax St**, zoned CD Commercial.

APPLICANT: Burke & Herbert

**BOARD ACTION: Approved, as amended, on the Consent Calendar, 6-0**

**5. CASE BAR2010-0316**

Request for door replacement at **111 Pommander Walk St**, zoned RM Residential

APPLICANT: Mimi Volberg

**BOARD ACTION: Approved, as submitted, 6-0**

**SPEAKERS**

Mr. Hynan, representing the HAF, noted that the Foundation only supports wood to replace wood within the Historic District, regardless of the age of the structure.

Mr. Luke Mayer, represented the applicant and described the difficulty maintaining a modern wood door with a southern exposure.

**BOARD DISCUSSION**

Mr. Fitzgerald agreed that modern wood does not hold up well and said he was ok with a policy that allowed the use of modern materials any time after the date they were commercially available, even if they were not originally used on that particular structure.

Mr. Keleher moved approval of the application, as submitted. Mr. Carlin seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

**REASON**

The Board agreed with the staff report and supported the policy recently approved for windows and roofing that allows the use of modern materials any time after the date they were commercially available, even if they were not originally used on that particular structure.

**6. CASE BAR2010-0322**

Request for signage at **114 S. Patrick St**, zoned CD Commercial.

APPLICANT: Izalia by Old Town Sign Company

BOARD ACTION: **Approved, as submitted, 6-0**

**SPEAKERS**

Mr. John Hynan, representing the HAF, asked whether the sign complied with the special advertising provisions of the zoning ordinance. Staff explained that the applicant had provided supplemental information confirming that “laser hair removal & rejuvenation” was part of the legal name of the company. This had been updated in the Staff recommendations but not in the body of the Staff report. Mr. Hynan was satisfied.

**BOARD DISCUSSION**

On a motion by Mr. von Senden, seconded by Mr. Smeallie, the application was approved, as submitted by unanimous vote.

**REASON**

The Board agreed with the analysis in the staff report.

**7. CASE BAR2010-0321**

Request for light and canopy installation at **123 N. Washington St**, zoned CD Commercial.

APPLICANT: Circe Salon and Day Spa by Maginnis/DelNinno Architects

BOARD ACTION: **Approved, as submitted, 6-0**

**SPEAKERS**

Mr. Ben Helwig, representing the National Park Service, supported the canopy and the overall design but suggested that two lights were sufficient and that they should be a simpler design.

Ms. Theresa DelNinno, architect for the applicant, described the light fixtures and design concept for the storefront which tried to clearly distinguish between the original Colonial Revival building design and the simple, modern storefront alterations.

**BOARD DISCUSSION**

Mr. Smeallie thanked Mr. Helwig for the Park Service’s input but believed the light fixtures were quite small relative to the overall building façade and did not think they would detract from the memorial character of the GW Parkway.

Mr. von Senden agreed and moved to approve the application, as submitted. Mr. Smeallie seconded the motion which passed unanimously.

**REASON**

The Board agreed with the analysis in the staff report and believed the proposed design maintained the memorial character of the GW Parkway.

**8. CASE BAR2010-0320**

Request for door replacement at **708 Duke St**, zoned RM Residential.

APPLICANT: Jan Scott

BOARD ACTION: **Approved, as amended, 6-0**

**CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL:** Approval of the Certificate of Appropriateness application with the condition that:

The new fiberglass doors are a pair of four-panel doors ordered unfinished and painted on site.

**SPEAKERS**

Mr. Tom McQueen, former President of Condominium, presented testimony that he was the acting President of the condo association at the time the vote on the subject case was rendered. He noted that it was a 4-0 vote by the condo board in favor of the application.

Jan Scott, applicant, spoke in support of the staff recommendation.

Mr. Hynan, representing the HAF, noted that the Foundation only supports wood to replace wood within the Historic District, regardless of the age of the structure.

**BOARD DISCUSSION**

Staff entered into the record three (3) letters of opposition that the Board had received from neighbors who live within the condominium and noted that the item was in compliance with the City's noticing requirements.

The Board members noted the letters.

Mr. Smeallie moved to approve the application with the Staff recommended condition. Mr. Kelleher seconded the motion. The vote was unanimous in favor of the application.

**REASON:** The Board found the proposed fiberglass replacement entry doors to be appropriate for the age of the addition to this building.

**9. CASE BAR2010-0319**

Request for signage at **601 N. Washington St**, zoned CRMU/X Commercial.

APPLICANT: Talbots by H & M Signs

BOARD ACTION: **Approved, as submitted, on the Consent Calendar, 6-0**

---

**III. DISCUSSION ITEMS**

**10. CASE BAR2010-0327**

Request for partial demolition/encapsulation at **113 S Lee St**, zoned RM Residential.

APPLICANT: Rich & Lois Rawson

BOARD ACTION: **Approved, as amended, by roll call vote 6-0**

This case was combined with item #11 for discussion.

**11. CASE BAR2010-0328**

Request for new front stoop and waiver of HVAC screening requirement at **113 S Lee St**, zoned RM Residential.

APPLICANT: Rich & Lois Rawson

BOARD ACTION: **Approved, as amended, by roll call vote 6-0**

**CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL:** Approval of the Certificate of Appropriateness and Permit to Demolish/Encapsulate, and a waiver of the rooftop HVAC screening requirement with the following conditions:

1. The following archaeology conditions shall appear in the General Notes of all site plans and on all site plan sheets that involve demolition or ground disturbance (including Basement/Foundation Plans, Demolition, Erosion and Sediment Control, Grading, Landscaping, Utilities, and Sheeting and Shoring) so that on-site contractors are aware of the requirements.
  - a. The applicant/developer shall call Alexandria Archaeology (703/838-4399) two weeks before the starting date of any ground disturbance so that a monitoring and inspection schedule for city archaeologists can be arranged.
  - b. The applicant/developer shall call Alexandria Archaeology immediately (703-838-4399) if any buried structural remains (wall foundations, wells, privies, cisterns, etc.) or concentrations of artifacts are discovered during development. Work must cease in the area of the discovery until a City archaeologist comes to the site and records the finds.
  - c. The applicant/developer shall not allow any metal detection or artifact collection to be conducted on the property, unless authorized by Alexandria Archaeology.
2. That the round oculus window be an elliptical shape, to be approved by Staff at the building permit application.

**SPEAKERS**

Mr. Patrick Camus, architect, presented the application and supported the Staff recommendation, except that he believed the proposed round window was more appropriate than the elliptical window suggested in the Staff report.

Mr. John Hynan, representing the HAF, said they believed that too much historic fabric was being lost or encapsulated in this application and was concerned about the amount of sidewalk left when the new steps are constructed.

Mr. Carpie, next door neighbor, supported the application. He noted that the steps recently installed at their own house project more than the present request and that they seemed to work fine.

Ms. Murney Keleher had visited the site and was concerned about the projection of the proposed front stoop and steps and asked how much they differed from the existing. Mr. Camus responded that the proposed steps are 4' from building line but only 3' from the property line, as allowed by City Code for a street this width. They, therefore, project one foot more than the existing steps. Ms. Keleher said this should be adequate, as the steps were sufficiently offset from a nearby tree well to provide convenient passage.

### **BOARD DISCUSSION**

Mr. Smeallie moved approval of the application, with staff recommendations, seconded by Mr. Fitzgerald.

Mr. Carlin confirmed that the 5'-6" width of the steps shown on the plan was correct and asked whether the architect had considered curved steps with a spiral volute at the newel. Mr. Camus said that they had considered that style but had used that same design recently next door and believed the straight steps were a more appropriate solution here. Mr. Carlin noted the importance of the curve on the ell and believed that it was still visible in this proposal.

Mr. Rawson, owner, said that they loved the curve of the brick wall at the ell and proposed a minimal addition here to maintain the view of that curve from the exterior.

Mr. Keleher asked about the proposed form of the stair window – round or elliptical. Mr. Camus preferred round.

Mr. Fitzgerald noted other Federal Style elliptical windows in the district and moved to amend the motion to include the elliptical window. Mr. Smeallie seconded the amendment, which passed by unanimous roll call vote.

### **REASON**

The Board generally agreed with the analysis in the staff report.

#### **12. CASE BAR2010-0331**

Request for a Permit to Demolish exterior walls for new front and rear dormers at **910 S. Fairfax St**, zoned RM Residential.

APPLICANT: Ted & Sandra Sullivan by Adams Architects

BOARD ACTION: **Approved, as amended, by roll call vote 6-0**

This case was combined with item #13 for discussion.

#### **13. CASE BAR2010-0339**

Request for new side egress window and construction of new front and rear dormers at **910 S. Fairfax St**, zoned RM Residential.

APPLICANT: Ted & Sandra Sullivan by Adams Architects

BOARD ACTION: **Approved, as amended, by roll call vote 6-0**

**CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL:** Approval of the Certificate of Appropriateness and Permit to Demolish/Encapsulate with the condition that the dormers are clad in HardiPlank horizontal lap siding with staff to review the final details during building permit application.

### **SPEAKERS**

Mr. Bud Adams, architect, presented the application and supported the recommendation in the staff report.

Mr. John Hynan, representing the HAF, said they had three concerns:

1. That only the materials used during the original period of construction be used on an addition or alteration;
2. They do not favor shed dormers, even on the rear; and
3. They do not support the loss of historic fabric to create the third floor addition.

### **BOARD DISCUSSION**

Mr. von Senden agreed with the staff recommendation to locate the majority of the third floor addition on the rear where it was less visible to the public but was still concerned with the shed form of the dormer.

Mr. Fitzgerald supported the shed dormer in this case because it was in the rear and minimally visible from any public way.

Mr. von Senden moved approval of the staff recommendation with the additional condition that Staff review the dormer details at building permit submission.

### **REASON**

The Board agreed with the analysis in the staff report and had no objection to the rear shed dormer because of its limited visibility from a public way.

#### **14. CASE BAR2009-0301**

Request for alterations at **626 S. Lee St**, zoned RM Residential.

APPLICANT: S. Lee & Debra Parker by Lewis & Associates LTD

This item was deferred for restudy by the applicant prior to the meeting.  
The Board noted the deferral.

#### **15. CASE BAR2010-0011**

Request for Permit to Demolish for construction of new dormers and renovations at **626 S. Lee St**, zoned RM Residential.

APPLICANT: S. Lee & Debra Parker by Lewis & Associates LTD

This item was deferred for restudy by the applicant prior to the meeting.  
The Board noted the deferral.

---

#### **IV. DEFERRED ITEMS**

##### **CASE BAR2010-0293**

Request for signage at **500 South Washington Street**, zoned CD Commercial.

APPLICANT: Capital One Bank

Deferred by the applicant for further study.

##### **CASE BAR2010-0325**

Request for signage at **1 Cameron St**, zoned CD Commercial.

APPLICANT: CHLN, Inc. (Chart House Restaurant)

Deferred by the applicant for further study.

---

#### **V. OTHER BUSINESS**

1. Board election of Chairman and Vice Chairman

On a motion by Mr. Keleher, seconded by Mr. von Senden, Mr. Hulfish was elected Chairman and Dr. Fitzgerald was elected Vice-Chair, 6-0.

2. Staff provided an update on the Chapel at the Virginia Theological Seminary.

---

#### **VI. ADJOURNMENT**

Chairman Hulfish adjourned the meeting at approximately 8:35 pm.

---

#### **VII. ADMINISTRATIVE APPROVALS**

##### **CASE BAR2010-0302**

Request for window replacement at **207 South Fairfax St**, zoned RM Residential.

APPLICANT: Betty Foster

##### **CASE BAR2010-0305**

Request for trim repair, window glass replacement and painting at **801 South Washington St**, zoned CRMU/L Commercial.

APPLICANT: WRIT

##### **CASE BAR2010-0300**

Request for after-the-fact roof replacement at **418 South Royal St**, zoned RM Residential.

APPLICANT: John Bramer

##### **CASE BAR2010-0315**

Request for signage at **621 South Washington St**, zoned CD Commercial.

APPLICANT: Tiny Dancers, LLC

##### **CASE BAR2010-0323**

Request for wood siding replacement at **613 South St. Asaph St**, zoned RM Residential.

APPLICANT: J. Benbow



**CASE BAR2010-0330**

Request for replacement of a door to a window at **318 Duke St**, zoned RM Residential.

APPLICANT: John Lepore

**CASE BAR2010-0334**

Request for window replacement at **119 South Fayette St**, zoned CL Commercial.

APPLICANT: Monica Parry

**CASE BAR2010-0336**

Request for window replacement at **713 South Royal St**, zoned RM Residential.

APPLICANT: Leonora Guarraia

**CASE BAR2010-0340**

Request for chimney repair at **611 Queen St**, zoned RM Residential.

APPLICANT: Center Milton

**CASE BAR2010-0341**

Request for roof replacement at **115 South Columbus St**, zoned CD Commercial.

APPLICANT: Patrick Camus

**CASE BAR2010-0344**

Request for window and door replacement at **511 Jefferson Ct**, zoned RM Residential.

APPLICANT: Joan and Tom Moser

**CASE BAR2010-0347**

Request for window replacement at **1107 Powhatan St**, zoned RB Residential.

APPLICANT: Maria Placht

Minutes submitted by,

Al Cox, FAIA, Historic Preservation Manager  
Boards of Architectural Review