

*****DRAFT MINUTES*****

Alexandria Board of Architectural Review
Old & Historic Alexandria District

Wednesday, February 2, 2011
7:30pm, City Council Chambers, City Hall
301 King Street, Alexandria, Virginia 22314

Members Present: Tom Hulfish, Chairman
Chip Carlin
Oscar Fitzgerald
Arthur Keleher
Wayne Neale
Peter Smeallie

Member Absent: John von Senden

Staff Present: Planning & Zoning
Michele Oaks, Historic Preservation Planner
Al Cox, FAIA, Historic Preservation Manager

The meeting was called to order at 7:35 p.m. by Chairman Hulfish.

I. MINUTES

Consideration of the minutes of the public hearing of January 19, 2011.

Approved as submitted, 6-0

On a motion by Mr. Keleher, seconded by Mr. Carlin, the minutes were unanimously approved, as submitted.

II. DISCUSSION ITEMS

1. CASE BAR2011-0006

Permit to Demolish a portion of rear roof at **427 N Lee St**, zoned CD Commercial.

APPLICANT: Ancona and Associates for Joel Rhoades

BOARD ACTION: **Approved, as amended, by a roll call vote, 6-0**

This item was combined with item #2 for discussion purposes.

2. CASE BAR2011-0007

Request for alterations to existing windows at **427 N Lee St**, zoned CD Commercial.

APPLICANT: Ancona and Associates for Joel Rhoades

BOARD ACTION: **Approved, as amended, by a roll call vote, 6-0**

SPEAKERS

Mr. Antonia Ancona, structural engineer, represented the applicant
Mr. Joel Rhoades, owner of the building

BOARD DISCUSSION

Mr. Ancona summarized the elevator project which would require an increase in the roof height. A shed dormer would be designed on the east, parking lot side, of the roof slope.

Mr. Keleher made a motion to approve the staff report as submitted. Mr. Smeallie seconded the motion.

Prior to a vote, Mr. Ancona expressed that he also wanted to discuss the staff recommendation for the entrance door finish. He preferred a bright brass door finish, as he felt it would bring elegance to the building. Additionally, the applicant did not feel that the window and door materials needed to match, as staff had recommended.

Mr. Smeallie withdrew his support of the motion, as he believed that the shiny brass doors were not compatible with this simple warehouse structure, and was more appropriate for the entrance to a fancy hotel.

Mr. Carlin stated that in 1979 he was the project architect for the renovation of this building. He stated that the building is a simple industrial building from Alexandria's past, and at one time there were two other buildings like it Alexandria, yet this was the only survivor. He pointed out that the developer, DRI, intentionally selected the low key bronze anodized color metal window and door systems. He supported the staff recommendation.

Mr. Fitzgerald agreed that brass is a high-style and elegant material but also agreed with Mr. Carlin that it was not appropriate for this former warehouse building.

Mr. Rhoades disagreed with the assessment in the Staff report. He explained that the building is currently used for offices and felt that the materials should reflect the current use.

Staff clarified that the material recommendation outlined in the report is for an oiled bronze finish, which is also a high-quality, high-style material but is darker brown and more subtle color that would blend with the existing frames of the surrounding windows.

Mr. Rhoades agreed to work with staff on the finish.

Mr. Carlin made a motion to approve the application with the Staff recommendation. Mr. Fitzgerald seconded the motion.

The application was approved, 6-0.

REASON

The Board felt that the proposed shiny, brass doors were inappropriate for a former industrial/warehouse building.

III. DEFERRED CASES

CASE BAR2010-0373

Request for roof replacement at 917 Prince St, zoned CL Commercial.

APPLICANT: Mark Stevenson and John Schmidt

Deferred prior to hearing due to lack of notice.

IV. OTHER BUSINESS

Waterfront Informational Presentation

SPEAKERS

Faroll Hamer, Director, Department of Planning and Zoning

James McCall, Chairman, Alexandria Waterfront History Plan Committee, (formed by the Alexandria Archaeological Commission)

Karl Moritz, Deputy Director, Department of Planning and Zoning

DISCUSSION

Director Hamer opened the presentation regarding the *Waterfront Small Area Plan* (Waterfront Plan), stating that the Waterfront Plan will be released shortly and explaining that it was important for us to know what we want as a City. She indicated that the Waterfront Plan:

- Should contain continuous public access to and along the waterfront
- Should have a really great public space at the foot of King Street
- Should bring history back to the waterfront by restoring the Beachcomber restaurant, providing public access to new uses in the historic warehouses on Union Street, reestablishing the historic pattern of east-west alleys, and recalling the historic architectural character of the waterfront warehouses in the design and orientation of the new buildings

Would help guide development that is presently allowed under zoning for the Cummings/Turner site and under zoning and settlement agreements for the Robinson Terminal sites. Mr. McCall outlined the goals of the *Alexandria Waterfront History Plan* (History Plan), stating that it was intended to be a comprehensive history of the entire waterfront. It is broken down into theme areas, with the intention that these interpretive themes be integrated into the parks and buildings along the waterfront walk. He explained that the report recommends that the Waterfront Plan should reflect numerous

time periods and not focus on one chronological segment of the waterfront's history. He also noted that there are many buildings that are currently inland that were once directly connected to the waterfront. He mentioned that the History Plan identifies a need for a public-private funding partnership. He also indicated that the History Plan is meant to be a basis for further planning – a springboard.

Mr. Carlin stated that detailed architectural design guidelines for the waterfront were needed to insure that future development looks similar to the model. He cautioned that new buildings should be compatible with the historic context without replicating specific historic buildings. Mr. Smeallie asked whether the BAR would have jurisdiction over the design of the extended jetties and docks if they were within DC's boundaries. Staff responded that this would be included in future discussions with the District of Columbia.

Mr. Keleher was concerned that the proposed restaurant building in Waterfront Park did not have adequate parking and would block views of the existing Strand buildings behind. He agreed with Ms. Hamer that a plan was needed for this area, particularly to clarify the City's expectations on the Robinson Terminal sites.

Mr. Moritz then provided a PowerPoint presentation of the updated Waterfront Plan. He stated that the History Plan is woven into the overall Waterfront Plan to insure that the result is unique to Alexandria.

Mr. Neale was concerned that buildings shown in the historic fill area were in the floodplain and that this would cause the lower levels of the buildings to have blank street elevations.

Mr. Carlin supported restoration of the Beachcomber as a restaurant but noted that the restaurant buildings in Waterfront Park were contentious within the community. He believed the proposed development density in the Waterfront Plan overall was appropriate, if it stayed within the existing 50' height limit. He urged simplicity in the design of the parks, using high quality materials and thought the existing park plan was too busy for this size space. He suggested having living history events to interpret the waterfront and referenced the seaport museum in Beaufort, NC, as an example of a Lyceum-type museum of waterfront history that could be located in one of the historic warehouses. He supported the restoration of Ralph's Gutt using native plant materials.

Mr. Hulfish believed that the proposed flood mitigation was a waste of money, noting that the flood water now comes up the storm drains, not over the bulkhead. He questioned the office building parking ratio.

Mr. Smeallie said that, while use was not within the BAR's purview, he felt that the plan was too heavy on hotel uses in the south end and that taxis, such as those in front of the Hotel Monaco on King Street, would be disruptive here.

Mr. Hulfish commented that a large modern hotel had ruined the character of the waterfront in Savanna. He asked where the water was in this waterfront and how will residents enjoy it.

Mr. Fitzgerald questioned who the proposed plan was designed to serve. He believed the tourists would have no interaction with the locals. He was concerned with the implications of this development for Alexandria tax payers.

Mr. Carlin encouraged a balance of public and private uses throughout the plan.

V. ADJOURNMENT

Chairman Hulfish adjourned the meeting at approximately 9:25 pm.

VI. ADMINISTRATIVE APPROVALS

CASE BAR2011-0017

Request for a pin mounted sign and a hanging sign at **1309 King St**, zoned KR Retail.
APPLICANT: Le Taste Vin / Fine Wines

CASE BAR2011-0018

Request for window replacement at **1302 Michigan Ave**, zoned RB Residential.
APPLICANT: Paul Ruggles and Miriam Moore

CASE BAR2011-0019

Request for roof replacement at **513 Prince St**, zoned RM Residential.
APPLICANT: Robert Pearson

CASE BAR2011-0020

Request for hanging sign, bracket installation and vents at **123 N Washington St**, zoned CD Commercial.
APPLICANT: Richard Ylasat

CASE BAR2011-0021

Request for a wall and decal sign at **712 N Washington St**, zoned CDX Commercial.
APPLICANT: J. Pascazio

CASE BAR2011-0023

Request for brick removal for ventilation at **108 S Fayette St**, zoned RM Residential.
APPLICANT: R.L. Kane

CASE BAR2011-0024

Request for signage at **130 S Union St**, zoned CD Commercial.

APPLICANT: Susan Gerock

CASE BAR2011-0025

Request for front door replacement at **415 S St. Asaph St**, zoned RM Residential.

APPLICANT: Barbara Bodine

CASE BAR2011-0026

Request for window, siding and roof replacement on sunroom addition at **710 Chetworth Pl.**, zoned RB Residential.

APPLICANT: Edwin Kraffur

Minutes submitted by,

Al Cox, FAIA, Historic Preservation Manager
Boards of Architectural Review