

*****DRAFT MINUTES*****

Alexandria Board of Architectural Review
Old & Historic Alexandria District

Wednesday, June 15, 2011

7:30pm, City Council Chambers, City Hall
301 King Street, Alexandria, Virginia 22314

Members Present: Tom Hulfish, Chairman
Arthur Keleher
Wayne Neale
Chip Carlin
John von Senden

Members Absent: Oscar Fitzgerald
Peter Smeallie

Staff Present: Planning & Zoning
Michele Oaks, Historic Preservation Planner
Al Cox, FAIA, Historic Preservation Manager

The meeting was called to order at 7:35 p.m. by Chairman Hulfish.

I. MINUTES

Consideration of the minutes of the public hearing of June 1, 2011.

BOARD ACTION: Approved, as submitted, 5-0

On a motion by Mr. von Senden, seconded by Mr. Keleher the minutes were unanimously approved, as submitted, 5-0.

II. CONSENT CALENDAR

Items on the Consent Calendar are those where the applicant has agreed to all conditions of approval shown in the staff reports. Without objection, the staff recommendation for these cases will be approved as a group by unanimous consent of the Board at the beginning of the meeting. When announced by the Chairman, any member of the Board or of the public may ask that one of these cases be removed for full discussion.

1. **CASE BAR2011-0123**
Request for fence installation at **802 Green St**, zoned RM Residential.
APPLICANT: Elizabeth Lee
BOARD ACTION: Approved, as amended, 5-0.

This item was moved to the Discussion Items.

III. DISCUSSION ITEMS

1. **CASE BAR2011-0123**
Request for fence installation at **802 Green St**, zoned RM Residential.
APPLICANT: Elizabeth Lee

BOARD ACTION: Approved, as amended, 5-0.

CONDITIONS

1. That the metal fence posts will be replaced with wood, fence posts.
2. That the wood fence will be painted or stained a solid color.

SPEAKERS

Elizabeth Lee, owner spoke in support of the project

BOARD DISCUSSION

Mr. Carlin inquired if the owner was proposing to stain the fence to match the existing rear fence. The owner clarified that it was their intent to paint or utilize a solid white stain on the new picket fence.

REASON

The Board found that the proposed fence was appropriate and compatible with the existing streetscape.

2. **CASE BAR2011-0132**

Request for fence removal and reconsideration of window installation at **426 N Columbus St**, zoned CL Commercial.

APPLICANT: William Cromley

BOARD ACTION: Approved, as amended, 5-0.

CONDITIONS

1. That the sash be a 4/4 muntin pattern;
2. That the profile of the exterior window trim be slightly differentiated from the historic windows; and
3. That the window balance mechanisms are modern and do not utilize a weight and chain system.

SPEAKERS

William Cromley, owner, supports the staff recommendation to differentiate the original windows from the new windows. However, he indicated a desire to utilize a more subtle differentiation and to retain the 4/4 sash. The owner offered that the new windows could be differentiated utilizing 1x6 trim without the bead, modifying the sill detail and a modern type track system.

BOARD DISCUSSION

Mr. Neal expressed support for a 4/4 sash and the applicant's proposal for differentiation.

Mr. von Senden noted that he concurred with Mr. Neale.

Mr. Neale made a motion to approve the application with the staff recommended conditions and a revision to condition number one, which states "That the sash be a 4/4 muntin pattern."

Mr. von Senden seconded the motion. The motion was approved, 5-0.

REASON

The Board felt that installing windows which utilize a slightly different trim profile, sills and window balance system are consistent with the *Design Guidelines*.

3. **CASE BAR2011-0125**

Request for demolition/encapsulation at **317 S Lee St**, zoned RM Residential.

APPLICANT: Maria Hopper by Scot McBroom

BOARD ACTION: **Approved, as amended, 5-0.**

This item was combined with item #4 for discussion purposes.

4. **CASE BAR2011-0126**

Request for front stoop alterations at **317 S Lee St**, zoned RM Residential.

APPLICANT: Maria Hopper by Scot McBroom

BOARD ACTION: **Approved, as amended, 5-0.**

CONDITIONS

1. That the front stoop project no more than three (3) feet into the South Lee Street public right-of-way; and,
2. That the statements in the archaeology conditions below appear in the General Notes of all site plans and on all site plan sheets that involve demolition or ground disturbance (including Basement/Foundation Plans, Demolition, Erosion and Sediment Control, Grading, Landscaping, Utilities, and Sheeting and Shoring) so that on-site contractors are aware of the requirements:
 - a. The applicant/developer shall call Alexandria Archaeology immediately (703-838-4399) if any buried structural remains (wall foundations, wells, privies, cisterns, etc.) or concentrations of artifacts are discovered during development. Work must cease in the area of the discovery until a City archaeologist comes to the site and records the finds.
 - b. The applicant/developer shall not allow any metal detection to be conducted on the property, unless authorized by Alexandria Archaeology.

SPEAKERS

Bud Adams, architect/principal of Robert Bentley Adams, introduced Scott McBroom to the Board.

Scott McBroom, project architect, summarized the scope of work and noted that the owners support the reduction of the depth of the front stoop to 3', as recommended by staff.

John Hynan, Historic Alexandria Foundation (HAF), said that the Foundation was concerned with the addition of railings on the proposed stoop, though they supported squaring off of the existing semi-circular step.

The owner of the adjacent house at 319 S. Lee expressed concerns about the proposed flashing and acoustics between the homes and requested that the design team and the contractors work with her to ensure that her property is not damaged during construction.

BOARD DISCUSSION

Mr. Carlin commended the design of the stoop and rail system and questioned the detail for the brick stoop and the materials being utilized for the ball detail on the balusters.

Mr. McBroom responded that the stoop will be constructed of a row-lock brick and the railings will be fabricated from black iron with black iron balls on the balusters.

Mr. von Senden questioned whether the depth of the railings will be reduced from 2'-8" to 2'-4" to accommodate the staff recommendation.

Mr. McBroom confirmed that these dimensions will be revised as a result of the BAR condition.

Mr. von Senden made a motion to approve the application with the staff recommended conditions. Mr. Carlin seconded the motion. The motion was approved by roll call vote, 5-0.

REASON

The Board supported the small portion of demolition/encapsulation of the existing kitchen ell noting that this addition dates to the mid-20th century. They also stated that the minor revisions to the front stoop were simple and subtle and would not compromise the integrity of the vernacular townhouse or the streetscape.

5. **CASE BAR2011-0128**

Request for demolition/encapsulation at **910 S Fairfax St**, zoned RM Residential.

APPLICANT: Sandra & Theodore Sullivan

BOARD ACTION: **Approved, as amended, 5-0.**

This item was combined with item #6 for discussion purposes.

6. **CASE BAR2011-0129**

Request for addition at **910 S Fairfax St**, zoned RM Residential.

APPLICANT: Sandra & Theodore Sullivan

BOARD ACTION: **Approved, as amended, 5-0.**

CONDITIONS

1. That the previously approved BAR Case 2010-0331/0339 is null and void.
2. That the dormers are clad in HardiPlank horizontal lap siding with a smooth finish.
3. That the roof will be architectural grade, composition shingles per BAR's roofing policy.
4. That the windows specifications will be in accordance with BAR's window policy.
5. That the applicant will work with staff to re-study the dormers to address the Board's concerns about design and placement.

SPEAKERS

Rebecca Bostick, owner's architect, summarized the scope of work.

Mr. Hynan, Historic Alexandria Foundation, requested that the first floor window be enlarged. Ms. Bostick noted the scope of work does not include modifications to existing windows in the masonry walls and that a change to this window would affect the layout of the existing kitchen.

BOARD DISCUSSION

Mr. von Senden inquired whether the brick “patch” to be inserted above the existing, second floor windows will be toothed-in to match the existing brick bond pattern. The owner’s architect confirmed the specification.

Mr. Neale expressed concern with the proposed detailing on the dormer windows. He noted that the mouldings, as proposed, lack depth. He recommended that the applicant and their architect work with staff to re-study these details.

Mr. Keleher commended the architect on a sympathetic third floor addition which only required a ridge height increase of about three feet.

Mr. Carlin questioned whether the existing pilasters in the front door surround were fluted and inquired about the size of the dormer windows. He noted that dormer windows were historically the same or smaller than the second floor windows and that the pitch of a dormer’s gable roof should be increased.

Ms. Bostick confirmed that the door surround contained fluted pilasters and that the intent was to reference but not replicate the details on the existing entry surround.

Mr. Neale encourages the design to be altered so that the base of the dormer is recessed from the building wall and made a motion to approve the application with the staff recommended conditions and the added condition that “the applicant will work with staff to re-study the dormers to address the Board’s concerns about design and placement.

Mr. Keleher seconded the motion. The motion was approved by roll call vote, 5-0.

REASON

The Board concurred with the staff recommendation that the proposed addition was compatible in style, material and fenestration with the existing brick townhouse as well as the surrounding Yates Garden development.

7. **CASE BAR2011-0103**
Request for demolition/encapsulation at **519 Wilkes St**, zoned RM Residential.
APPLICANT: John Butler & Holly Herman by Bud Adams
BOARD ACTION: **Approved, as amended, 5-0.**

This item was combined with item #8 for discussion purposes.

8. **CASE BAR2011-0104**
Request for third floor addition at **519 Wilkes St**, zoned RM Residential.
APPLICANT: John Butler & Holly Herman by Bud Adams
BOARD ACTION: **Approved, as amended, 5-0.**

CONDITIONS

1. That the color of the new composition roof will conform to the Board's adopted *Roof Policy*.
2. That the new window and door specifications will conform to the Board's adopted *Window Policy*.
3. That the existing windows on the front elevation of the building will be replaced with 6/9 and 9/9 windows that conform to the Board's adopted *Window Policy*.

SPEAKERS

Bud Adams, Architect summarized the scope of the project and noted that they support the staff recommendations.

Holly Herman, owner, noted for the record that they are not big party people and are planning landscaping to mitigate and preserve privacy on the roof deck.

BOARD DISCUSSION

Mr. Hulfish asked if the homeowners and architect were aware of the rear, abutting neighbor's opposition to the roof deck.

Mr. Adams responded noting that they have re-designed the proposal to pull the rear deck back from the rear property line. He also stated that the City Surveyor confirmed that the rear alley was private, so the design was not visible from a public way.

Mr. Neale asked the applicant to remove the dormer moulding and substitute a fascia board.

Mr. Carlin noted the neighbor's noise concerns and encouraged the applicant and their architect to work with the neighbor. He believed that the proposed design was skillful and suggested the utilization of a trellis on the roof deck to reduce its visual impact.

Mr. von Senden made a motion to approve the application with the staff recommended conditions. Mr. Carlin seconded the motion. The motion was approved by roll call vote, 5-0.

REASON

The proposed addition conforms to the Design Guidelines and will be integrated into the existing streetscape across from the school play yard without adversely impacting the integrity of the historic district.

9. **CASE BAR2011-0105**
Request for demolition/encapsulation at **713 S Lee St**, zoned RM Residential.
APPLICANT: 713 Lee St LLC by Edgar Henriquez
BOARD ACTION: **Approved, as amended, 5-0.**

This item was combined with item #10 for discussion purposes.

10. **CASE BAR2011-0106**
Request for addition at **713 S Lee St**, zoned RM Residential.
APPLICANT: 713 Lee St LLC by Edgar Henriquez

BOARD ACTION: Approved, as amended, 5-0.

CONDITIONS

1. The statements in archaeology conditions below shall appear in the General Notes of all site plans and on all site plan sheets that involve demolition or ground disturbance (including Basement/Foundation Plans, Demolition, Erosion and Sediment Control, Grading, Landscaping, Utilities, and Sheeting and Shoring) so that on-site contractors are aware of the requirements:
 - a. The applicant/developer shall call Alexandria Archaeology immediately (703-838-4399) if any buried structural remains (wall foundations, wells, privies, cisterns, etc.) or concentrations of artifacts are discovered during development. Work must cease in the area of the discovery until a City archaeologist comes to the site and records the finds.
 - b. The applicant/developer shall not allow any metal detection to be conducted on the property, unless authorized by Alexandria Archaeology.
2. That the applicant provides complete window specifications for the replacement windows and doors in conformance with Alexandria Replacement Window Policy.
3. That the applicant work with BAR Staff to determine the condition of the historic wood siding and if it is salvageable, that the applicant retain and repair the historic wood siding.
4. That the new shutters are sized to fit the window openings and are operable.
5. That the new roof contain snow guards.
6. That the window group on the second floor rear elevation be a triple, 2/2 window.

SPEAKERS

Edgar Henriquez, owner, summarized the project and noted his support of the staff recommendations.

Mr. Hynan, Historic Alexandria Foundation, noted that the Foundation was pleased to see the proposed renovation of this historic house.

Tom Webster, neighbor 711 South Lee Street, spoke in support of the project and expressed his concerns with the amount of windows being proposed on the north elevation. He also noted a concern with the new addition's roof pitch and its potential for winter snow slides.

BOARD DISCUSSION

Mr. von Senden requested that the applicant utilize snow guards on the new roof to address the adjacent neighbor's snow slide concerns.

Chairman Hulfish reminded the applicant that the proposed shutters must be operable, per the Minor Architectural Elements policy.

Mr. Neale inquired about visibility of the rear elevation and recommended that the second floor window on the rear elevation be replaced with a triple, 2/2 window. Staff confirmed that the rear elevation is not visible.

Mr. Carlin made a motion to approve the application with the staff recommended conditions with the added conditions pertaining to the shutters and rear elevation windows. Mr. Keheler seconded the motion. The motion was approved by roll call vote, 5-0.

REASON

The Board found the mass, scale and form, of the addition to be appropriately simple for this very modest frame townhouse.

11. **CASE BAR2011-0127**

Request for demolition/encapsulation at **416 Wolfe St**, zoned RM Residential.

APPLICANT: Kevin & Lisa Connell by Benjamin Ames

BOARD ACTION: **Approved, as amended, 5-0.**

CONDITIONS

1. The statements in archaeology conditions below shall appear in the General Notes of all site plans and on all site plan sheets that involve demolition or ground disturbance (including Basement/Foundation Plans, Demolition, Erosion and Sediment Control, Grading, Landscaping, Utilities, and Sheeting and Shoring) so that on-site contractors are aware of the requirements:
 - a. The applicant/developer shall call Alexandria Archaeology immediately (703-838-4399) if any buried structural remains (wall foundations, wells, privies, cisterns, etc.) or concentrations of artifacts are discovered during development. Work must cease in the area of the discovery until a City archaeologist comes to the site and records the finds.
 - b. The applicant/developer shall not allow any metal detection to be conducted on the property, unless authorized by Alexandria Archaeology.

SPEAKERS

Benjamin Ames, architect spoke in favor of the application and agreed with the staff recommendations.

BOARD DISCUSSION

The Chairman called the question on the proposal, noting that the Board had no comment on the application.

The motion was approved by roll call vote, 5-0.

REASON

The Board found that the proposed demolition/encapsulation did not compromise the integrity of the townhouse, as the areas of demolition and encapsulation area located on a secondary elevation and modest in scope.

IV. DEFERRED ITEMS

12. CASE BAR2011-0124

Request for alterations at **803 Prince St**, zoned RM Residential.

APPLICANT: Nancy Petersen by Joel deLeon

Deferred pending resolution of outstanding issues.

IV. OTHER BUSINESS

None

V. ADJOURNMENT

Chairman Hulfish adjourned the meeting at approximately 8:35 pm.

VI. ADMINISTRATIVE APPROVALS

The following items are shown for information only. Based on the Board's adopted policies, these have been approved by Staff since the previous Board meeting.

CASE BAR2011-0120

Request for window replacement at **218 N Columbus St**, zoned RM Residential.

APPLICANT: Janet Knotts

CASE BAR2011-0133

Request for roofing, siding, and gutter replacement at **316 N Alfred St**, zoned RB Residential.

APPLICANT: Laurel Celeste

CASE BAR2011-0141

Request for roof painting at **306 N Columbus St**, zoned RB Residential.

APPLICANT: Ray Billups

CASE BAR2011-0142

Request for expansion joint at garage and request for repointing at **14 Muirs Ct**, zoned RM Residential.

APPLICANT: Muirs Court HOA

CASE BAR2011-0143

Request for window and door replacement and skylight installation at **518 N Columbus St**, zoned RB Residential.

APPLICANT: Aron Kansal

CASE BAR2011-0144

Request for star anchors and tie-rods at **211 N Patrick St**, zoned RB Residential.

APPLICANT: Patrick St. LLC

CASE BAR2011-0145

Request for roof replacement at **127 S West St**, zoned CD Commercial.

APPLICANT: Catholic Diocese

CASE BAR2011-0146

Request for awning and signage replacement at **600 Franklin St**, zoned CD Commercial.

APPLICANT: Chakra LLC

CASE BAR2011-0151

Request for siding repair at **633 N Columbus St**, zoned RB Residential.

APPLICANT: City of Alexandria

CASE BAR2011-0152

Request for window replacement at **809 Second St**, zoned RB Residential.

APPLICANT: Mara Yaverbaum

CASE BAR2011-0154

Request for signage at **1223 King St**, zoned KR King Street Retail.

APPLICANT: Olio, LLC

Minutes submitted by,

Michele Oaks, Urban Planner, Historic Preservation
Boards of Architectural Review