

Docket Item #4
BAR CASE# 2005-0045

BAR Meeting
March 23, 2005

ISSUE: Replacement windows

APPLICANT: Brian Maday

LOCATION: 403 North Fayette Street

ZONE: RB/Residential

****EXPIRATION OF APPROVALS NOTE:** In accordance with Sections 10-106(B) and 10-206(B) of the Zoning Ordinance, any official Board of Architectural Review approval will expire 12 months from the date of issuance if the work is not commenced and diligently and substantially pursued by the end of that 12-month period.

****BUILDING PERMIT NOTE:** Most projects approved by the Board of Architectural Review require the issuance of one or more construction permits by the Code Enforcement Bureau (including signs). The applicant is responsible for obtaining all necessary construction permits after receiving Board of Architectural Review approval. Contact Code Enforcement, Room 4200, City Hall, 703-838-4360 for further information.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends approval of the window replacement with one-over-one *wood* windows and no wrapping of trim.

I. ISSUE:

The applicant is requesting approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness for the installation of 11 one-over-one vinyl windows by Dream Vue. The windows will replace the existing front and rear wood windows in the basement, first and second stories. The windows in the first and second stories are horizontally aligned two-over-two windows. These will be replaced with one-over-one windows. The type of window currently used in the basement is not specified and they are not readily visible. The basement windows will be replaced with hopper type windows. In addition, the window frames will be wrapped with either vinyl or aluminum. As the new windows will have insulated glass, the existing storm windows will be unnecessary and will be removed.

Both the front and rear of the house is visible from Fayette Street and Princess Street. The house is set back from the street a substantial distance.

II. HISTORY:

The three, attached, two story, brick houses at 401, 403 and 405 North Fayette Street were constructed circa 1961 by F. H. Broyhill Construction Co. Inc. The plans for the houses show a higher level of architectural detailing than was apparently constructed. The center unit, 403 North Fayette Street, was to have had a higher cornice. All three units were to have had six over six windows, paneled shutters and molded cornices at the roof line. As built, the houses are largely devoid of architectural embellishment. Today, most of the windows in the three houses appear to have horizontally aligned two-over-two wood sash with aluminum storm windows.

There is no record of Board of Architectural Review for any of the three houses in the row. While a number of houses on both sides of the 400 block of North Fayette Street have replacement windows, Staff was able to locate records for the review of only three:

417 North Fayette Street (BAR Case #2000-145, 6/27/2001) - As part of a larger renovation project, the Board approved aluminum clad wood windows for the 1940 house. The Board specified that the front windows must replicate the six-over-one configuration of the original windows.

426 North Fayette Street (BAR Case #96-64, 3/28/1996) - The Board approved wood one-over-one windows to replace the same in the existing pre-1920 house and for the proposed new addition.

411 North Fayette Street (BAR Case #96-265, 11/13/1996) - The Board approved one-over-one aluminum clad wood windows, rather than the vinyl windows that had been requested to replace six-over-six wood windows in the circa 1949 house.

Some window replacements in the area may pre-date 1986, the beginning of Board review for the

Parker-Gray District. Others may have been done without approval.

III. ANALYSIS:

The proposed window replacement complies with the zoning ordinance requirements.

Staff would prefer to see the wood windows be replaced with wood windows. Vinyl windows are discouraged in the historic districts (*Design Guidelines, Windows* -page 2). The Board often cites the inferior quality of vinyl windows as a practical reason for avoiding them. As indicated above, in the history section, the Board has been more inclined to approve aluminum clad wood windows than vinyl clad or vinyl windows.

As the horizontally aligned two-over-two windows had not been part of the original design concept and are unlikely to be available today, Staff does not believe it is necessary to replicate this configuration. Thus the proposed one-over-one configuration for the front and back replacement windows on the first and second stories is acceptable. As the basement windows are barely visible, the configuration is not important and the hopper type windows proposed by the applicant will be acceptable.

Staff strongly recommends against the request to wrap the window trim in vinyl or aluminum. This practice gives the windows an unattractive, bulky appearance and can actually promote rot in the wood underneath.

IV. STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends approval of the window replacement with one-over-one *wood* windows and no wrapping of trim

CITY DEPARTMENT COMMENTS

Legend: C - code requirement R - recommendation S - suggestion F- finding

Code Enforcement:

C-1 As long as the replacement windows do not require modifications to the existing openings, no construction permit is required.

Office of Historic Alexandria:

Would prefer wood.