Docket Item #8 BAR CASE# 2005-0048

BAR Meeting April 27, 2005

ISSUE: Demolition/capsulation

APPLICANT: Tracey & Rita Winbourne

LOCATION: 126 North Patrick Street

ZONE: CD/Commercial

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends approval of the Permit to Demolish as submitted.

<u>NOTE</u>: This docket item requires a roll call vote.

I. ISSUE:

The applicant is requesting approval of a Permit to Demolish in order to raise the height of the second floor of the rear flounder section. The existing roof structure of the flounder will be removed and the walls will be raised to a full two stories. The new section will abut and capsulate the west wall of the second story sunporch at 126 North Patrick Street and a section of the north wall of the adjacent house at 124 North Patrick Street.

In addition, the small storage shed abutting the rear wall of the house will be shortened. The rearmost section of the shed will be demolished and a new wall will be built approximately 2' in from its current location.

The front (east) and north elevations of the house are visible from Patrick Street. The north and portions of the rear (west) elevations are also visible from Cameron Street in views through the adjacent parking lot.

II. **HISTORY**:

The two and a half story, two bay wide brick house was constructed as a pair with 124 North Patrick Street. According to Ethelyn Cox in <u>Historic Alexandria</u>: Street by Street, Charles Bladen purchased the land upon which the two houses stand in 1847 and had the houses built prior to 1858, when he sold the house at 126 North Patrick Street to Barbara Bennett (P. 101). As built, the houses had a dumbell shaped footprint with an indentation in the center. The front section was two and a half stories and the rear section one and one half stories.

The original massing of the house at 126 North Patrick Street can still be seen although several later additions partially obscure it. Between 1907 and 1912, a one story rectangular brick addition was inserted in the indented part of the dumbell footprint on the north side of the house. Between 1921 and 1941, the one story frame porch was added to the north side and the frame sunporch enclosure was added on top of the earlier brick addition. A 1937 building permit for 126 North Patrick Street refers to "new window sash throughout and some new doors" (Permit #2479, 11/30/1937).

The matching house at 124 North Patrick Street acquired a number of small additions to the side and rear over the years. However, these and the original flounder section were removed in 1975 when the existing two story brick addition was added at the back of the indented section (Permit #9560, 8/17/1975). This addition was not reviewed by the Board of Architectural as it was not within the Old and Historic District and the Parker-Gray District had not yet been established.

III. ANALYSIS:

In considering a Permit to Demolish/Capsulate, the Board must consider the following criteria set forth in the Zoning Ordinance, Sec. 10-205(B):

- (1) Is the building or structure of such architectural or historical interest that its moving, removing, capsulating or razing would be to the detriment of the public interest?
- (2) Is the building or structure of such interest that it could be made into a historic house?
- (3) Is the building or structure of such old and unusual or uncommon design, texture and material that it could not be reproduced or be reproduced only with great difficulty?
- (4) Would retention of the building or structure help preserve and protect an historic place or area of historic interest in the city?
- (5) Would retention of the building or structure promote the general welfare by maintaining and increasing real estate values, generating business, creating new positions, attracting tourists, students, writers, historians, artists and artisans, attracting new residents, encouraging study and interest in American history, stimulating interest and study in architecture and design, educating citizens in American culture and heritage, and making the city a more attractive and desirable place in which to live?
- (6) Would retention of the building or structure help maintain the scale and character of the neighborhood

In the opinion of Staff, the proposed demolition does not meet any of the above Criteria. While Staff finds any loss of mid-19th century fabric regrettable, the proposed demolition/capsulation is confined to the rearmost section of the house and is modest in scale. Staff has no concern over the demolition of a portion of the rear shed. This structure appears to have been constructed in the late 20th century.

IV. STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Therefore, Staff recommends approval of the Permit to Demolish as submitted.

CITY DEPARTMENT COMMENTS

Legend: C - code requirement R - recommendation S - suggestion F- finding

Code Enforcement:

C-1 Prior to the issuance of a demolition permit or land disturbance permit, a rodent abatement plan shall be submitted to Code Enforcement that will outline the steps that will taken to prevent the spread of rodents from the construction site to the surrounding community and sewers.

Historic Alexandria:

"No comment."