

Docket Item #11 & 12
BAR CASE# 2005-00047
BAR CASE #2005-00076

BAR Meeting
April 27, 2005

ISSUE: Alterations & Waiver of Rooftop HVAC Screening Requirement
APPLICANT: A. Thomas Vaughan
LOCATION: 307 North Payne Street
ZONE: RB/Residential

****EXPIRATION OF APPROVALS NOTE:** In accordance with Sections 10-106(B) and 10-206(B) of the Zoning Ordinance, any official Board of Architectural Review approval will expire 12 months from the date of issuance if the work is not commenced and diligently and substantially pursued by the end of that 12-month period.

****BUILDING PERMIT NOTE:** Most projects approved by the Board of Architectural Review require the issuance of one or more construction permits by the Code Enforcement Bureau (including signs). The applicant is responsible for obtaining all necessary construction permits after receiving Board of Architectural Review approval. Contact Code Enforcement, Room 4200, City Hall, 703-838-4360 for further information.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends approval of the application with the following conditions:

1. That the main block of the house be clad in wood siding with a 5" or less reveal;
2. That the stucco finish on the addition be maintained;
3. That the first story window on the west elevation not be enlarged;
4. That the window on the west elevation of the addition be one over one; and,
5. That the light fixtures be submitted to Staff for approval prior to installation.

NOTE: Docket item #10 must be approved before this case may be considered.

I. ISSUE:

The applicant is requesting approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness for alterations to the house at 307 North Payne Street.

West (front) elevation

On the front elevation, the existing metal awnings over the windows and porch will be removed. The aluminum siding will be replaced with 8" hardiplank siding painted a taupe color. All of the windows will be replaced with new MW two-over-two double hung wood windows with new wood trim. The windows will be simulated divided light with interior and exterior muntins and spacer bars. The existing first story window adjacent to the front door will be enlarged to 3' by 5'.

A new parapet with a decorative wood cornice is proposed. The cornice with a dentil molding will be similar to the existing cornice at 309 North Payne Street. A new brick stoop will be located on the front elevation with a new iron railing also matching the design of 309 North Payne Street. The existing front door will be replaced by a new four panel wood door. The door located on the addition will remain, but will have new wood trim. The existing electrical box will be painted to match the siding. No information has been provided on the exterior light fixtures.

South elevation

The existing metal awnings over the two second story window will also be removed from this elevation. Two new window openings will be created on the first story, aligning with the existing second story windows. All four windows will be two-over-two simulated divided light wood windows with wood trim. The aluminum siding will be replaced with 8" hardiplank siding.

East (rear)elevation

The proposed alterations to the rear (east) elevation, which are below the fence line are not visible from a public right-of-way and are therefore not under consideration by the Board.

Shed

The roof of the shed will be reconstructed to match the height of the existing roof. The two windows on the west elevation of the shed will be replaced with new wood windows. The door to the shed will be replaced with a new wood door with four lights.

A new rooftop HVAC unit is proposed to be installed on the north east corner of the main block of the house. The condensor is approximately 34" high. The applicant is requesting approval of a waiver of the rooftop screening requirement.

II. HISTORY:

As mentioned in docket item #10, the house at 307 North Payne Street was constructed between 1877 and 1902 as a twin house to 309 North Payne Street.

The building has undergone substantial alterations over the years. In 1957, a large storage shed was constructed (permit #6645, 5/1/57). In 1961 a building permit includes raising the height of the roof, replacement windows, and covering the building in stone-tex (permit #17512, 8/15/61). In 1962 a one story rear porch was added (permit #18591). Aluminum siding was installed in 1979 (Permit #35562, 7/17/79).

In 1996, the Board approved a second story addition and alterations to the property at 307 North Payne Street (BAR Case #96-0120, 5/22/96).

III. ANALYSIS:

The proposed alterations comply with zoning ordinance requirements.

Staff believes that the proposed alterations are generally appropriate and meet the recommendations of the *Design Guidelines*. However, Staff is concerned with the enlargement of the first story window on the front elevation. The enlarged window appears to be out of scale with the house. Staff also believes that the second story window on the west elevation of the addition would be more appropriate as a one-over-one window to further distinguish the addition from the historic house. Similarly, Staff believes that the addition should remain as it is with a stucco finish to distinguish from the historic main block.

With respect to the proposed use of Hardiplank, the Board has reviewed a number of other applications for the use of fiber cement siding and has adopted the following policy with respect to the product:

1. That fiber cement siding not be installed on an historic structure;
2. That historic materials should not be removed to install fiber cement siding;
3. That fiber cement siding replace other artificial or composite siding;
4. That the nails not show in the installation of the siding;
5. That smooth, beaded siding be installed; and,
6. That BAR Staff may administratively approve the installation of fiber cement siding on *non-historic* buildings (those constructed in 1975 or later).

As the main block most likely dates to the latter part of the 19th century Staff would prefer that this section of the house be clad in wood siding. Given the diminutive scale of the house a narrower width of siding would be more appropriate. Siding with an exposure of 5" or less is acceptable.

Staff has no objection to the Waiver of the HVAC Screening Requirement. The rooftop HVAC

unit will only be minimally visible from North Payne Street.

IV. STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Therefore, Staff recommends approval of the application with the following conditions:

1. That the main block of the house be clad in wood siding with a 5" or less reveal;
2. That the stucco finish on the addition be maintained;
3. That the first story window on the west elevation not be enlarged;
4. That the window on the west elevation of the addition be one over one; and,
5. That the light fixtures be submitted to Staff for approval prior to installation.

CITY DEPARTMENT COMMENTS

Legend: C - code requirement R - recommendation S - suggestion F- finding

Code Enforcement:

- C-1 All exterior walls within 5 feet from an interior property line shall have a fire resistance rating of 1 hour, from both sides, with no openings permitted within the wall. As alternative, a 2 hour fire wall may be provided. This condition is also applicable to skylights within setback distance.
- C-2 Prior to the issuance of a demolition permit or land disturbance permit, a rodent abatement plan shall be submitted to Code Enforcement that will outline the steps that will taken to prevent the spread of rodents from the construction site to the surrounding community and sewers.
- C-3 Roof drainage systems must be installed so as neither to impact upon, nor cause erosion/damage to adjacent property.
- C-4 A soils report must be submitted with the building permit application.
- C-5 New construction must comply with the current edition of the Uniform Statewide Building Code (USBC).
- C-6 Alterations to the existing structure must comply with the current edition of the Uniform Statewide Building Code (USBC).
- C-7 Construction permits are required for this project. Plans shall accompany the permit application that fully detail the construction as well as layouts and schematics of the mechanical, electrical, and plumbing systems.
- C-8 Permission from adjacent property owners is required if access to the adjacent properties is required to complete the proposed construction. Otherwise, a plan shall be submitted to demonstrate the construction techniques utilized to keep construction solely on the referenced property.

Historic Alexandria:

“No comment.”