

Docket Item #16
BAR CASE# 2005-0174

BAR Meeting
July 27, 2005

ISSUE: Alterations to previously approved plans

APPLICANT: John Hutton

LOCATION: 326 North Patrick Street

ZONE: RB/Residential

****EXPIRATION OF APPROVALS NOTE:** In accordance with Sections 10-106(B) and 10-206(B) of the Zoning Ordinance, any official Board of Architectural Review approval will expire 12 months from the date of issuance if the work is not commenced and diligently and substantially pursued by the end of that 12-month period.

****BUILDING PERMIT NOTE:** Most projects approved by the Board of Architectural Review require the issuance of one or more construction permits by the Code Enforcement Bureau (including signs). The applicant is responsible for obtaining all necessary construction permits after receiving Board of Architectural Review approval. Contact Code Enforcement, Room 4200, City Hall, 703-838-4360 for further information.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends denial of the application.

NOTE: Docket item #15 must be approved before this docket item can be considered..

I. ISSUE:

The applicant is requesting approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness for the replacement of the existing roof as well as the exterior siding of the two story frame house at 326 North Patrick Street. The roof framing is proposed to be rebuilt with the same configuration as currently exists. The siding will be removed and replaced with new siding of the same type.

II. HISTORY:

According to Ethelyn Cox in Historic Alexandria, Virginia: Street by Street, the paired houses at 324 and 326 North Patrick Street date to the mid-19th century. The two story, gable roofed houses share an areaway to the back. They appear to be shown on the 1877 Hopkins Atlas and have no rear additions at that date. Although quite small and simple, the paired houses are distinguished by their corner pilasters, an architectural embellishment popular in the Greek Revival period. Regrettably, the cornice has been obscured by a shingled pent roof, probably dating to the mid to late 20th century.

The Board approved demolition and capsulation of the rear of the house in 2004 to allow construction of the new rear addition (BAR Case #2004-0145, 7/28/04).

III. ANALYSIS:

The reason that is given for the request to demolish and rebuild the roof truss system is that is deteriorated and should be replaced. In the opinion of Staff, there are many ways that a roof system can be successfully repaired and reused without resulting in wholesale demolition and replacement. For example, in most instances throughout both historic districts when roof trussing needs repair it is “sistered” with new framing timbers to provide the required new strengthened system. Staff clearly would prefer that such an approach be undertaken in this instance. Complete replacement would appear to be unnecessary judging by the photographs supplied by the applicant. Thus, it is the strong recommendation of Staff that the existing framing system be strengthened and reused.

During the 2004 hearing on the renovation of the house, the applicant preferred that the existing siding would be retained and repaired as needed. The current proposal is to remove the existing siding entirely and replace it with new siding. Based upon the existing structure, Staff sees no compelling reason to approve wholesale replacement of the exterior siding. Retention of as much of the existing siding as possible



Figure 1 East elevation

contributes to the patina of age of the existing structure and ties it firmly to the historic district.

Based upon these factors, Staff does not recommend approval of the application, but rather retention and reuse of the existing historic fabric.

IV. STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Therefore, Staff recommends denial of the application.

CITY DEPARTMENT COMMENTS

Legend: C - code requirement R - recommendation S - suggestion F- finding

Code Enforcement:

- C-1 New construction must comply with the current edition of the Uniform Statewide Building Code (USBC).
- C-2 Alterations to the existing structure must comply with the current edition of the Uniform Statewide Building Code (USBC).
- C-3 Construction permits are required for this project. Plans shall accompany the permit application that fully detail the construction as well as layouts and schematics of the mechanical, electrical, and plumbing systems.

Historic Alexandria:

Replacement in kind, wood or what?