Docket Item # 7 BAR CASE # 2006-0229

BAR Meeting October 25, 2006

ISSUE:	Alterations
APPLICANT:	Sheryl W. Jahns
LOCATION:	1006 Pendleton Street
ZONE:	CSL/Commercial

<u>STAFF RECOMMENDATION:</u> Staff recommends approval of the application with the following conditions:

- 1. That the windows be wood, not clad;
- 2. That the windows be true divided light on the front with simulated divided lights on the side and rear;
- 3. The four panel door at the front be wood;
- 4. The vents on the west side be painted to match the siding;
- 5. The HVAC certification form must be completed before the Certificate of Appropriateness set of plans can be released;
- 6. The rear door be wood;
- 7. The statement below must be included in General Notes of all site plans and on all site plan sheets that involve demolition or ground disturbance so that on-site contractors are aware of the requirements:

Call Alexandria Archaeology immediately (703-838-4399) if any buried structural remains (wall foundations, wells, privies, cisterns, etc.) or concentrations of artifacts are discovered during development. Work must cease in the area of the discovery until a City archaeologist comes to the site and records the finds.

**EXPIRATION OF APPROVALS NOTE: In accordance with Sections 10-106(B) and 10-206(B) of the Zoning Ordinance, any official Board of Architectural Review approval will expire 12 months from the date of issuance if the work is not commenced and diligently and substantially pursued by the end of that 12-month period.

**BUILDING PERMIT NOTE: Most projects approved by the Board of Architectural Review require the issuance of one or more construction permits by the Code Enforcement Bureau (<u>including signs</u>). The applicant is responsible for obtaining all necessary construction permits after receiving Board of Architectural Review approval. Contact Code Enforcement, Room 4200, City Hall, 703-838-4360 for further information.

(Insert sketch here)

NOTE: Docket item #6 must be approved before this item may be considered.

I. <u>**ISSUE**</u>: The applicant is proposing a number of alterations to the front (north), west side and rear (south) facades. The alterations are described in detail below:

<u>Windows</u> – All existing windows will be replaced. All replacement windows and windows in new openings will be white aluminum clad wood windows by Pella (Architect Series). The windows will have simulated divided lights and will have a two-over-two configuration, except for two, four-light casements. Except where noted, the replacement windows will be sized to fit the existing openings.

<u>Siding</u> – Due to budget constraints, the applicant does not intend to replace the existing aluminum siding. Aluminum siding will be salvaged from the area where the new bay window opening is being cut and will be reused as necessary in areas that require infill. Also for budgetary reasons, the aluminum wrapping on the window and door openings will remain as is. Any new openings will be trimmed in wood to match the appearance of the wrapped openings.

<u>Front</u> – In addition to the replacement windows, the applicant proposes several other minor alterations for the front. First is the addition of dentils under the hood over the front door. The adjacent house at 1004 Pendleton Street has dentils and impressions in the paint or "ghosts" remain at 1006 Pendleton Street showing that the dentils were once present. The applicant plans to match the dentils at 1004 Pendleton Street. The dentils will be wood and painted. The existing shutters, which are vinyl and inoperable, will be removed. The existing door is a wood six panel door with aluminum storm door. The plans show the storm door removed and a new four panel door. The material for the door is not noted on the plans. The project designer mentioned to Staff that the front steps may not meet code and may need to be rebuilt. No further information is available at this time. If the steps are to be rebuilt of a material other than brick or if there will be a new railing, the applicant would need to return to the Board for review of this alteration.

<u>West side</u> – The applicant proposes to add a bay window on the first story of this façade. The bay window will be located toward the middle of the façade, taking the place of the third window from the front. The bay will project approximately 18" from the face of the building and will have two short sides and a wide center section. The short sides will have narrow two-over-two windows. The center section will have a single fixed window. The trim will be wood and there will be wood panels below the windows. The roof will be clad in asphalt shingles. The second window on the first story will be shifted two feet closer to the front. On the second story, a smaller casement window will replace the existing full size window that is third from the front. There will be a new full size double hung window added to the rear of this in the fourth position which is currently blank. According to the drawings, four new vents will serve bathrooms and the dryer. Code requires that the gas meter be relocated from inside the house. It will be located on the west side almost at the rear corner. An HVAC condenser unit will be relocated from the rearmost window on the first story. There will be located between the new bay and the rearmost window on the first story. There will be a 3' tall wood lattice screen surrounding the HVAC unit on the

<u>Rear</u> – The applicant proposes to remove the non-historic bay window in the first story. In its place there will be a small four–light casement window adjacent to the door and, adjacent to the small window, a full-size two-over-two window. These two new windows will be ganged together. The existing non-historic door will be replaced with a new fully glazed aluminum clad wood door by Pella. There will be a three-light transom above.

<u>Fence</u> – The front fence and gate will remain in place. There is no rear fence at present. If the applicant wishes to install a rear fence, it will be necessary to come back to the Board for approval.

II. HISTORY:

As discussed in docket item #6, the two story frame house at 1006 Pendleton Street appears to be a twin to the house at 1004 Pendleton Street but was constructed several years after it in 1907. The house retains its original footprint and much of its original appearance.

III. ANALYSIS:

The property is located in a CSL (Commercial Service Low) zone. The zone requires a side yard of at least 8 foot in width (zoning ordinance Section 4-306(A)(2)(a)). A bay window is permitted in the required yard as long as it does not project more than 20" into required for the side yard (zoning ordinance Section 7-202(A)(3)). Pursuant to Section 7-202(B)(5) of the zoning ordinance, the applicant must certify that the HVAC unit placed in the required side yard will not exceed a noise level of 55 decibels.

In the opinion of Staff, the proposed work will improve the appearance of the property and return the house to a more historically authentic appearance. However, Staff does have several concerns and comments:

Windows - According to the Design Guidelines, single glazed true divided light wood windows are the "preferred" window type while double glazed true divided light wood windows are "acceptable." Clad windows and those with other than true divided light are "discouraged" (Windows – pages 2 &3). The applicant is proposing aluminum clad windows with simulated divided lights. Staff strongly recommends that the windows be wood and that they have true divided lights. The applicant has mentioned that the project is under budgetary constraints and that the true divided light windows would be more expensive. Staff would be less opposed to the use of simulated divided light windows on the side and rear elevations as these are less visible and not accessible to the public in the same way that the front windows are. As an alternative that would eliminate the question of true or simulated divided lights, the project designer has asked Staff if one-over-one windows would be acceptable. While Staff prefers the two-over-two windows from an aesthetic standpoint, we do not know for certain what the original window type was. The neighboring house at 1004 Pendleton Street does have two-over-two windows. However as noted above, this house predated 1006 Pendleton Street by a several years. A vernacular Italianate house of this period in Alexandria could have had either two-over-two or one-over-one windows.

To conclude, Staff recommends that the windows be two-over-two true divided light wood windows on the front and two-over-two (or four-light casement windows in the two locations

noted on the plan) on the side and rear. Alternatively and less enthusiastically, Staff would be willing to accept one-over-one wood windows.

<u>Siding</u> – While it is disappointing that the aluminum siding will not be replaced with wood siding as part of this project, the applicant can not be compelled to remove the existing siding and may patch small areas as needed with reclaimed siding. However, if more substantial replacement is found to be necessary as the project progresses, the applicant must return to Staff for further evaluation of the situation. A more substantial replacement project would require consideration of a more historically appropriate siding. Perhaps even more unfortunate than the retention of the aluminum siding is the retention of the aluminum wrapping on the window trim. The wrapped trim alters the character of the window openings. In an effort to harmonize with the existing trim pattern, the new window openings will be trimmed in wood with wide boards on the side and no headers. Hopefully, the siding and trim situation will be rectified in the future.

<u>Front</u> – Staff commends the applicant for replacing the missing dentils below the door hood and removing the false shutters. Similarly, the four panel front door should do much to restore the original character of the early 20^{th} century house. Staff does note that the front door must be wood in accordance with the Design Guidelines (Exterior Doors – page 2).

<u>West Side</u> – Staff does not object to the addition of the bay window on the first story or to the minor rearrangements of the fenestration on this façade. The bay window is a common motif for houses of this period in Alexandria and the Board has approved similar alterations to the side elevations of buildings similar in period and type at 408 North Patrick Street (BAR Case #s 2000 -189 & 190, 9/13/2000) and at 408 North Payne Street (BAR Case #s 2003-0094 & 95, 6/25/2003). The four new vents in the west wall are located toward the rear, reducing their visibility. However to further reduce their visibility, Staff recommends that they be painted to match the siding. As noted above, the HVAC certification form must be completed before the new location in the west side yard can be approved.

<u>Rear</u> – The rear door is to be aluminum clad wood. Staff recommends that the door be wood, per the *Design Guidelines*.

Staff notes the comments of Alexandria Archaeology and recommends that they be included as a condition of the Board's approval.

IV. <u>STAFF RECOMMENDATION</u>:

Therefore, Staff recommends approval of the application with the following conditions:

- 1. That the windows be wood, not clad;
- 2. That the windows be true divided light on the front with simulated divided lights on the side and rear;
- 3. The four panel door at the front be wood;
- 4. The vents on the west side be painted to match the siding;
- 5. The HVAC certification form must be completed before the Certificate of Appropriateness set of plans can be released;

- 6. The rear door be wood;
- 7. The statement below must be included in General Notes of all site plans and on all site plan sheets that involve demolition or ground disturbance so that on-site contractors are aware of the requirements:

Call Alexandria Archaeology immediately (703-838-4399) if any buried structural remains (wall foundations, wells, privies, cisterns, etc.) or concentrations of artifacts are discovered during development. Work must cease in the area of the discovery until a City archaeologist comes to the site and records the finds.

CITY DEPARTMENT COMMENTS

Legend: C - code requirement R - recommendation S - suggestion F- finding

Code Enforcement:

- C-1 Prior to the issuance of a demolition permit or land disturbance permit, a rodent abatement plan shall be submitted to Code Enforcement that will outline the steps that will taken to prevent the spread of rodents from the construction site to the surrounding community and sewers.
- C-2 New construction must comply with the current edition of the Uniform Statewide Building Code (USBC).
- C-3 Alterations to the existing structure must comply with the current edition of the Uniform Statewide Building Code (USBC).
- C-4 Construction permits are required for this project. Plans shall accompany the permit application that fully detail the construction as well as layouts and schematics of the mechanical, electrical, and plumbing systems.
- C-5 Permission from adjacent property owners is required if access to the adjacent properties is required to complete the proposed construction. Otherwise, a plan shall be submitted to demonstrate the construction techniques utilized to keep construction solely on the referenced property.
- C-6 A wall location plat prepared by a land surveyor is required to be submitted to this office prior to requesting any framing inspection.

Historic Alexandria:

The request seems appropriate.

Alexandria Archaeology:

- F-1 Tax records indicate that there was a free African American household on the block bounded by Patrick, Pendleton, Wythe and Henry streets in 1810, but the exact address is not known. The development property was situated within an African American neighborhood during the late 19th and early 20th centuries. The property therefore has the potential to yield archaeological resources that could provide insight into domestic activities, perhaps related to African Americans.
- R-1 Call Alexandria Archaeology immediately (703-838-4399) if any buried structural remains (wall foundations, wells, privies, cisterns, etc.) or concentrations of artifacts are discovered during development. Work must cease in the area of the discovery until a City archaeologist comes to the site and records the finds.

BAR CASE #2006-0229 October 25, 2006

R-2 The above statement must appear in the General Notes of all site plans and on all site plan sheets that involve demolition or ground disturbance (including sheeting and shoring and grading) so that on-site contractors are aware of the requirement.