

Docket Item # 7  
BAR CASE # 2006-0299

BAR Meeting  
January 24, 2007

**ISSUE:** After-the-fact alterations  
**APPLICANT:** Nicole Byrd  
**LOCATION:** 414 North Patrick Street  
**ZONE:** RB/Residential

---

**STAFF RECOMMENDATION:** Staff recommends approval of the application with the following conditions:

1. That the front windows be replaced with wood windows, either one-over-one or two-over-two according to the owner's preference, and that if two-over-two, they be true divided light;
2. That the front and rear doors be replaced with wood four panel doors and that the transom over the front door be restored to its original size and configuration;
3. That the rear fence be a wood board fence no higher than 6', stained or painted and installed completely on the applicant's property;
4. That the applicant consult with BAR Staff on the restoration of the transom prior to the commencement of that project and provide Staff an opportunity to review cut sheets, or other specific materials to confirm that the new windows, door and fence will be appropriate prior to purchase of these items and;
5. That all of the above work be completed within four months from the date of approval.

**\*\*EXPIRATION OF APPROVALS NOTE:** In accordance with Sections 10-106(B) and 10-206(B) of the Zoning Ordinance, any official Board of Architectural Review approval will expire 12 months from the date of issuance if the work is not commenced and diligently and substantially pursued by the end of that 12-month period.

**\*\*BUILDING PERMIT NOTE:** Most projects approved by the Board of Architectural Review require the issuance of one or more construction permits by the Code Enforcement Bureau (including signs). The applicant is responsible for obtaining all necessary construction permits after receiving Board of Architectural Review approval. Contact Code Enforcement, Room 4200, City Hall, 703-838-4360 for further information.

(Insert sketch here)

NOTE: Docket item # 6 must be approved before this item may be considered.

**I. ISSUE:**

The applicant is requesting approval of a certificate of appropriateness for after-the-fact alterations to the two story, detached, brick house at 414 North Patrick Street. As discussed in docket item #6, BAR Staff reviewed and approved a permit for interior work at 414 North Patrick Street on May 3, 2006 (BLD2006-02042). In mid-November Staff learned that exterior alterations had been completed without approval. At that time, the applicant was advised to apply to the BAR for all exterior work.

Based on the applicant's description and Staff's observations, the following alterations were made:

Roof – The flat roof, structural system and exterior surface, was replaced with another flat roof. The flashing for the roof will be the only aspect of this work that will be visible from the public right-of-way.

Windows – The existing windows, which appear to have been double-hung, multi-light wood windows dating from a renovation in the mid- to last quarter of the 20<sup>th</sup> century, were removed and replaced with new double-hung, multi-light wood windows. The new windows have insulated glass and simulated divided lights. According to the applicant, the work did not include the creation of additional window openings or any change in the size of the window openings.

Doors – The front and rear doors were removed and replaced with a metal paneled door with a fanlight window. The type and age of the previous doors is not known. The transom over the front door has been filled in. In discussions with Staff, the applicant expressed a willingness to replace the metal doors with four panel wood doors and to restore the transom to its original size and appearance.

Exterior light fixtures – A black finished carriage type light fixture was installed at the front and rear doors.

HVAC – A new HVAC unit was installed at the back of the house. As there is currently no rear fence, the unit is not screened and is readily visible from the public alley at the rear.

Fence – The applicant has stated that the intent is to replace the rear fence. The applicant provided a photograph of a fence and gate at another property and indicated that something similar will be installed at the rear of 414 North Patrick Street.

**II. HISTORY:**

As explained in docket item #6, the semi-detached house at 414 North Patrick Street appears to have been constructed between 1877 and 1891.

**III. ANALYSIS:**

The after-the-fact alterations comply with the zoning ordinance requirements.

Staff regrets that the work before the Board was completed without the benefit of staff guidance and BAR review. Unfortunately, several items of work are not compatible with the late 19<sup>th</sup> century house and the *Design Guidelines* and, in the opinion of staff, must be addressed:

Windows – The new windows are problematic for two reasons; they are a type that is inappropriate for the period and style of the house and they have simulated divided lights. First, the *Design Guidelines* clearly speak to the importance of windows in defining the historic architectural style of the building (Windows – Page 1). The multi-pane windows that were installed are a type more appropriate for the Colonial and Federal styles of the late 18<sup>th</sup> and early 19<sup>th</sup> century and for the Colonial Revivals of the 20<sup>th</sup> century. As the technology of glass manufacturing advanced, window glass got larger and muntins were reduced. In the last quarter of the 19<sup>th</sup> century in Alexandria, when this house was constructed, houses of this type most frequently have either two-over-two or one-over-one windows. The *Design Guidelines* recommend using simulated divided light windows only for the rear elevation of a structure which has minimal visibility from the public right-of-way (Windows – Page 2). The new windows have simulated divided lights and the front windows are highly visible as the house fronts directly on the sidewalk. Therefore, Staff recommends that the applicant replace the front windows with wood windows, either one-over-one or two-over-two according to the applicant's preference, and that, if two-over-two, they be true-divided-light.

Doors – The new metal doors are inappropriate in their material and design. They are a door type that is clearly of the late 20<sup>th</sup> and early 21<sup>st</sup> century rather than the last quarter of the 19<sup>th</sup> century. Like windows, doors and door surrounds constitute a prominent visual detail of the main façade (*Design Guidelines*, Exterior Doors – Page 1). The applicant has indicated a willingness to replace both the front and rear doors with wood four panel doors. This door type is appropriate for the period and style of the house. In addition, the applicant has indicated a willingness to restore the transom to its original appearance and size. This will require further coordination with staff.

Fence – Through the submission of a photograph of a fence elsewhere in the district, applicant has indicated a willingness to install a wood board fence of an appropriate type. The fence should be no higher than 6' and must be installed completely on the applicant's property as shown on an official survey plat. In accordance with the *Design Guidelines*, the fence should be stained or painted (Fences – Page 3). If installed, the rear fence will serve as screening for the HVAC unit. The *Design Guidelines* do recommend that prominently visible HVAC equipment be screened (HVAC Equipment – Page 3).

#### **IV. STAFF RECOMMENDATION:**

Therefore, Staff recommends approval of the application with the following conditions:

1. That the front windows be replaced with wood windows, either one-over-one or two-over-two according to the owner's preference, and that if two-over-two, they be true divided light;
2. That the front and rear door be replaced with wood four panel doors and that the transom over the front door be restored to its original size and configuration;

3. That the rear fence be a wood board fence no higher than 6', stained or painted and installed completely on the applicant's property;
4. That the applicant consult with BAR Staff on the restoration of the transom prior to the commencement of that project and provide Staff an opportunity to review cut sheets, or other specific materials to confirm that the new windows, door and fence will be appropriate prior to purchase of these items and;
5. That all of the above work be completed within four months from the date of approval.

CITY DEPARTMENT COMMENTS

Legend: C - code requirement R - recommendation S - suggestion F- finding

Code Enforcement:

F-1 Applicant has provided insufficient information as to the nature and extent of renovations and demolition. Applicant shall submit detailed information describing the renovations and demolition performed.

Historic Alexandria:

The nature of these after-the-fact alterations is not clear. Not enough information is provided.